International Human Rights Law
International Human Rights Law

Douglas Lee Donoho
Professor of Law
Nova Southeastern University
Shepard Broad College of Law

With Contributions by James Wilets
Professor, Nova Southeastern University, Shepard Broad College of Law
Chair, Inter-American Center for Human Rights

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
## Contents

Introduction and Preface xv

Chapter 1 • What Are International Human Rights? 1
   A. Introduction 1
   B. Historical Antecedents: World War II & the Holocaust 1
      1. The Limited Scope of International Law Prior to World War II 1
      2. The Catalyst for Change: World War II Atrocities 3
         a. Adolf Hitler to His Army Commanders, August 22, 1939 3
         b. Testimony of Hermann Graebe at Nuremberg (German engineer with the Jung, A.G., Construction Company) 3
         c. Visual Reminders of the Holocaust 5
      3. The Complex Nature of “Rights” As a Legal Concept 5
         a. Western Liberal Premises 6
         b. A Broader International Perspective on the Nature of Rights 8
      4. Putting It Together: The Founding Premises of International Human Rights 10
      5. The Grim Reality: “Never Again” Or “Again and Again”? 12

Chapter 2 • Basic Principles of International Law Relevant to Human Right 13
   A. Introduction 13
   B. General Characteristics of the International Legal System 14
   C. Sources of International Law: Treaties, Customary International Law and General Principles of Law 16
      1. Overview 16
      2. Treaties (“Conventional Law”) 17
         a. General Characteristics 17
         b. Rules on Formation — Consent, Signature & Ratification 19
         c. Reservations 20
         d. Interpretation 25
         e. Dispute Resolution and Remedies for Breach 29
         f. Withdrawal, Termination or Denunciation 32
         g. Derogation of Obligations 33
3. Customary International Law 35
   a. General Characteristics 35
   c. Remedies for Violations of Customary Human Rights Obligations 42
4. Jus Cogens 43

Chapter 3 • What Rights Are Humans Entitled to Under International Law? 49
A. Introduction & Overview 49
B. Treaty Based Human Rights 50
   1. U.N. Charter 50
   2. The “International Bill of Rights” 51
      a. Universal Declaration of Human Rights: The Blueprint 51
      b. The 1966 Covenants 54
C. Customary International Human Rights 60

Chapter 4 • International Rights as Domestic Obligations 63
A. Introduction and Overview 63
   1. Incorporation: Traditional Distinctions between Monism and Dualism 64
B. The Critical Role of Incorporation: Domestication of International Norms 65
C. Incorporating Human Rights Obligations into Domestic Legal Orders: The Contrasting European and U.S. Examples 67
   1. The Shining European Example 67
   2. The Not So Shiny Example: The United States’ Failure to Domesticate International Obligations 70
      a. Constitutional Framework 70
      b. Doctrine of Self-Executing Treaties 71
      c. Legal Status of Treaties within the U.S. Hierarchy of Laws 72
      d. Self-Execution and Human Rights Treaties Ratified by the United States 74
      e. Growing Movement Toward Domestic Implementation by Other Nations? 75
      f. The Domestic Legal Status of Customary International Law 76
      g. The Interpretation Angle: The Charming Betsy Doctrine 77
D. Treaties within U.S. Domestic Law: Case Study of Capital Punishment & the Vienna Convention on Consular Relations 79
   1. Interpretation of the 8th Amendment and the Execution of Juveniles 79
   2. Violations of the Vienna Convention on Consular Relations 81
Chapter 5 • Civil Liability as a Method of Domestic Enforcement of International Human Rights

A. Introduction & Overview
1. The “Domestication Gap:” U.S. Failure to Incorporate International Human Rights Treaties
2. Invoking Customary International Human Rights in the United States Courts

B. Methods of Domestic Enforcement of International Human Rights in the United States Generally
1. Overview
2. Civil Suits in American Courts for Foreign Human Rights Violations: ATS & TVPA Litigation Against Individual Foreign Defendants
   a. Facts: CASO QUEMADOS
   b. Statutory Resources
   c. Case Law: Suits against Foreign Government Actors for Violations of Human Rights
3. The Corporate Alien Tort: ATS Litigation against Multinational Corporations
   a. Background & Overview
   b. Kiobel, Extraterritoriality & ATS Claims: What Remains?
   c. Interpretation and Application of Kiobel
   d. Bucking the Kiobel Tide?
   e. Response of Legal Commentators to Kiobel
   f. Common Defenses to ATS and TVPA Claims
   g. Putting It All Together: The Aftermath of Sosa and Kiobel, Claims & Defenses
4. Filartiga-Style Actions Overseas: The Case against Henry Kissinger
5. Domestic Enforcement of Human Rights against U.S. Government Actors
   a. Overview
   b. Civil Suits against U.S. Public Officials for Domestic Violations of Human Rights: A Shocking Lack of International Protections?
   c. The Case for Domestic Accountability of U.S. Officials for Actions Overseas
   d. Domestic Accountability for Human Rights Violations in the War on Terror?

Chapter 6 • Using Domestic Criminal Prosecutions to Enforce International Human Rights

A. Introduction and Overview
B. International Law Limits on Domestic Jurisdiction and the Rise of Universal Jurisdiction
C. Prosecuting Human Rights Crimes in the United States
1. Current U.S. Statutes Criminalizing International Human Rights Violations 171
   a. Genocide 171
   b. Torture 172
   c. Recruitment and Use of Child Soldiers 173
   d. War Crimes 174
   e. Human Trafficking 176
2. Institutional Framework 177
3. Case Study: U.S. v. Charles Taylor, Jr. 178
4. Potential Prosecution of American Actors for Human Rights Violations in the War on Terror 179
   a. The Case against Bush Administration Officials for Torture 179
   b. The War Crimes Case against the Obama Administration: Use of Targeted Drone Assassinations 180
D. U.S. Immigration Based Civil and Criminal Actions Against Human Rights Violators 185
   1. Civil Removal Proceedings 185
      a. Man Linked to Guatemala Massacre Deported 186
      b. Six Nazis Who Will Probably Live Out Their Lives Free in America 188
   2. Immigration Related Criminal Prosecutions 189
      a. Ex-Guatemalan Soldier Will Be Sentenced for Lying 189
E. The Pinochet Paradigm: Use and Limits of Universal Jurisdiction to Prosecute Foreign Based Human Rights Crimes Unrelated to the Forum 190
   1. Overview 190
   2. The Decision: Regina v. Pinochet Ugarte 190
   3. The Aftermath: Exportation of the Pinochet Paradigm Outside of Spain 197
   4. The Case of Henry Kissinger 201
      a. Henry and the Case for Universal Jurisdiction 202
      c. Henry Could Be Wrong 207
F. Domestic Prosecutions Outside of the United States 209
   1. Overview 209
   2. Former Leader of Guatemala Is Guilty of Genocide against Mayan Group 212

Chapter 7 · International Promotion and Enforcement Under the United Nations Charter Based System 215
A. Introduction & Overview 215
B. Human Rights in China: The Suppression of Uyghur & Tibetan Minorities 218
   1. Generally 218
2. Author Nurmuhemmet Yasin 219
3. Professor Ilham Tohti 220
4. China’s Uighurs — Islamic Extremists or Oppressed Minority? 221

C. Principal U.N. Institutions and Their Role in the Protection of Human Rights 221
1. The United Nations Generally 222
2. Principal U.N. Institutions 222
   a. General Assembly 224
   b. U.N. Security Council 227
   c. Economic and Social Council 232
   d. International Court of Justice (a.k.a. “World Court”) 233

D. Charter Based Institutions And Mechanisms with Dedicated Human Rights Mandates 235
1. Overview & Historical Evolution 235
   b. Organizational Structure of U.N. Human Rights Institutions 237
2. Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights 238
3. Human Rights Council 240
   a. Specific Mechanisms & Procedures of the HRC 241

E. Critiquing the Revamped U.N. Charter Based Human Rights System: Evolution, Expediency or Just More of the Same? 253
1. Some Well-Deserved Criticisms: Continuing Hypocrisy & Double Standards 253
   a. Tom Kuntz, Libya’s Late, Great Rights Record, NY Times, March 5, 2011 254
   d. Frida Ghitis, The Human Rights Council is a Tragic Joke, Miami Herald, 6/25/2010 255
   e. Sudan’s Election to ECOSOC 256
   f. The Anti-Israel Obsession 257
   a. Patrick Stewart, The Human Rights Council: Give Credit Where Credit Is Due, Counsel on Foreign Relations, The Internationalist, June 1, 2012 258

Chapter 8 - International Promotion and Enforcement of Rights Through the U.N. Treaty Based System 259
A. Introduction & Overview 259
1. The Treaties 260
Chapter 9 • Regional Systems for the Protection of Human Rights: Introduction and Examination of the European System  327

A. Introduction to Regional Systems of Human Rights Protection  327
   1. Overview  327
   2. James Wilets, Lessons from Kosovo: Towards a Multiple Track System of Human Rights Protection, 6 ILSA J. Int’l & Comp. L. 645  328
   3. Chart of International and Regional Institutions with Significant Human Rights Mandates  331

B. European System for the Protection of Human Rights  332
   1. Overview  332
CONTENTS

2. Historical Evolution of the CoE “European System” 334
3. Nuts & Bolts: How the ECtHR Works 337
   a. Problems with Expansion: The Russian Connection 338
   b. The European Roma 339
4. Critical Jurisprudence: ECtHR Case Law 340
   a. Overview 340
   b. Dudgeon v. UK (Northern Ireland) 340
5. Protocol 14 (entered into force June 1, 2010) 351

C. The Increasing Role of the European Union (“EU”) as an Enforcer of Human Rights Norms 353
   1. Overview: Understanding the EU and its Historical Development Culminating in Charter of Fundamental Rights 353
   2. Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA) 355

D. Somewhere Between International Human Rights Law and Domestic Incorporation: The “Federalization of Human Rights Law” 356

E. OSCE: Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe & the “Human Dimension” 363

Chapter 10 • Regional Human Rights Systems: The Inter-American and African Systems 365

A. Introduction & Overview 365

B. Abuse and Exploitation of Children: Street Children, Child Labor & Child Soldiers 366
   1. Overview 366
   2. Street Children 367
      a. Casa Alianza U.K. Network 367
      b. Video Clip — Street Kids in Guatemala 368
      c. From Human Rights Watch: “Easy Targets: Violence against Children World-Wide” 368
      d. Sexual Exploitation of Children 369
   3. Child Soldiers 370
      a. The Truth About Child Soldiers, Professor Mark Drumbl, March 19, 2015 370
      b. Quotes from Child Soldiers (various sources reported at ChildSoldiers.org and Trip Line, Origin Uncertain) 371
      c. Video Clips 372
   4. Exploitation of Child Labor 372

C. The Inter-American Human Rights System 374
   1. The OAS 374
      a. Overview 374
      b. Evolution of the OAS & Its Promotion of Democracy 374
2. Overview of the Inter-American System for Human Rights 375  
   a. Brief History of the Inter-American Human Rights System 376  
3. Inter-American Commission 377  
   a. Overview of the Commission & Its Functions 377  
   b. Petitioning the Commission 380  
4. Inter-American Court of Human Rights 381  
D. Critiquing the Inter-American System 382  
E. African System for Human Rights Protection 388  
1. Introduction and Overview 388  
2. Evolution of the African Union 388  
3. African Human Rights System 389  
   a. Overview 389  
   b. African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights 390  
   c. African Court on Human and Peoples’ Rights 392  

Chapter 11 • International Criminal Law, Humanitarian Law & Human Rights 395  
A. Introduction & Overview 395  
B. Historical Antecedents: Nuremberg & Tokyo Trials 398  
   1. Nuremberg Trials 398  
   2. The Nuremberg Charter 402  
   3. Tokyo Trials 404  
C. Evolution of International Humanitarian Law: The Geneva Conventions 409  
D. Contemporary International Criminal Processes Involving Humanitarian Law and Human Rights 412  
   1. Ad Hoc International Criminal Tribunals 412  
      a. International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (ICTY) 412  
      b. International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR) 420  
      c. Case Law From the Ad Hoc Tribunals 421  
      d. Completion Strategy & Mechanism for International Criminal Tribunals 433  
E. International Criminal Court (ICC) 434  
   1. Overview 434  
   2. Statute of ICC 435  
   3. Institutional Structure and Process 444  
   4. Situations and Cases under ICC Review 444  
   5. Evaluating the ICC 446  
      b. The ICC Is No Kangaroo Court, Tracy Gurd for the Open Society Blog 447  
      c. Can the International Criminal Court Play Fair in Africa? 449
Chapter 12 • Universal Human Rights, Relativism & the Challenge of Diversity

A. Introduction & Overview

B. Global Diversity: Can the Meaning of Rights Be Relative to Cultural, Social or Religious Circumstances?
   2. When Culture Collides with International Human Rights Norms: The Case of Sandra Lovelace v. Canada
   3. When Culture and International Rights Collide: Female Genital Mutilation
      a. Background
      b. Does FGM Violate International Human Rights: Perspective of Amnesty International
      c. Male Circumcision: Is a Gender Distinction Valid?

Chapter 13 • Gender Rights as Human Rights

A. Introduction & Overview

B. The Circumstances of Women That Necessitate Gender Based Rights
   1. The Condition of Women World-Wide
   2. Education, Marriage, Family Practices: A Question of Culture?

C. Religious Law & Women’s Rights
   2. Nicholas D. Kristof, Religion and Women, Opinion NY Times, January 9, 2010
   3. Sharia Law
      b. Pakistan Hudood Laws
   4. Jewish Rabbinical Law
      a. Women, Religious Law and Religious Courts in Israel—The Jewish Case, by Margit Cohn
      b. Mary F. Radford, Inheritance Rights of Women Under Jewish and Islamic Law
      c. Women in Islam Versus Women in the Judaeo-Christian Tradition: The Myth & the Reality, by Dr. Sherif Abdel Azeem

D. Cultural Practices
   1. “Honor” Killing

1. The Women’s Convention And Its Optional Protocol, Empowering Women To Claim Their Internationally Protected Rights, Laboni Amena Hoq 488

F. Relativism & the Public-Private Distinction: Are Women's Issues Different from Other Human Rights Issues? 491


Chapter 14 • Gender Identity and Sexual Orientation as Subsets of Gender Rights 495

A. Overview 495

B. Treatment of Sexual Minorities World-Wide 495

C. Potential International Human Rights Law Protections for Sexual Minorities 496


D. Sexual Minorities 501

1. Note to Students from Professor Wilets 501


E. Comparative Law in the Interpretation of the Indian Constitution in the Context of Transgendered Persons 504

1. Notes to Students from Professor Wilets 504

2. In the Supreme Court of India, National Legal Services Authority v. Union of India 505

Index 521
Introduction and Preface

This electronic course book provides a student-oriented examination of the law of international human rights. Although human rights are hardly a recent invention, the advent of their international protection is one of the most profound developments of the modern era. For centuries, governments acted with impunity regarding the treatment of their own people. The horrors of World War II, however, germinated a new conception of international law that dramatically altered this legal landscape. How governments treat their own citizens and others is no longer strictly an internal domestic matter but rather the concern of all humankind. This concern now manifests itself not simply through moral approbation but also through legal constraints created through international law and, sometimes, incorporated into domestic legal systems. International law is now a central feature of the effort to progressively achieve human freedom and dignity for all.

Although great progress has been made, clearly all is not good. You will learn that millions still suffer the torment of torture, imprisonment for their ideas, religious persecution, overt discrimination, and even execution at the hands of their own government. Even recently, civil war, genocide, systematic rape, and ethnic cleansing have ruined the lives of millions and created more than 40 million refugees and displaced persons worldwide.¹

The United States itself, although a post-World War II leader in the promotion of human rights,² now faces serious and credible charges of egregious human rights

---

¹ The United Nations currently estimates that there are more than 43 million refugees and displaced persons worldwide. The precise number of refugees and displaced persons is difficult to pin down. The CIA "Fact Book" provides a country specific listing.

² The longer term human rights history of the United States unquestionably also reflects deep flaws, particularly regarding the rights of African-Americans, Native Americans, and women. See, for example, the Report of the Brown University Trustees on their own university’s connections with the slave trade. In the Report, the Trustees note that the United States experience with slavery was unique to world history. As noted by the report of the Brown University Steering Committee on Slavery and Justice (the “Brown Report”). The Brown Report states:

If American slavery has any claims to being historically “peculiar,” its peculiarity lay in its rigorous racialism, the systematic way in which racial ideas were used to demean and deny the humanity of people of even partial African descent. This historical legacy would
INTRODUCTION AND PREFACE

abuses relating to the torture and inhumane treatment of prisoners of war and terrorism suspects. Homelessness, poverty, police brutality, deplorable prison conditions, and many forms of discrimination continue unabated in the United States despite our enormous resources. The advent of DNA evidence has exposed glaring flaws in the American criminal justice system with the exoneration of hundreds of convicted defendants, including those who previously faced execution on death row. Perhaps most startling, all of these injustices exist in a nation whose people profoundly believe in human rights.

The materials which follow explore how international law and institutions work to progressively prevent violations of human rights and improve how national governments treat their own citizens. You will soon find that studying human rights can be both distressing and uplifting. We will examine situations that are disturbing, ugly and depressing. The existing international system for protecting rights un-

make the process of incorporating the formerly enslaved as citizens far more problematic in the United States than in other New World slave societies.

... Few if any societies in history carried this logic further than the United States, where people of African descent came to be regarded as a distinct “race” of persons, fashioned by nature for hard labor. Id. at 8, 84.
INTRODUCTION AND PREFACE

The readings that follow often include web-based materials. When a link to a video clip is provided, use your discretion to skip through parts that you don’t find useful, especially if the clip is long (over 10 minutes). When a website link is to textual materials, review the linked page as carefully as seems appropriate to the task at hand. Some links, as noted in their accompanying text, provide explanations or definitions central to our topic — you should study such material carefully. For added explanations and elaboration, you can follow any related links that the webpage itself provides if you think it will be helpful to you. Other links provided in the course materials provide general background, often describing factual situations or points of potential interest — these you should read, if at all, as carefully as your own interest dictates.

Every chapter provides either a set of questions to answer or a problem (or both). The questions and problems are designed to provide basic guidance to students regarding what they ought to focus on and understand from the materials — the questions are meant to be answered and are not (I hope) esoteric abstractions posed merely for contemplation.

Since this course book is designed primarily for law students, most chapters focus on legal concepts and institutions with an emphasis on the practice of law. I anticipate that many students will have had little or no exposure to international law which is, of course, the core legal foundation for the international human rights system. Consequently, early chapters examine international law basics relevant to the human rights system. While some particular human rights topics are addressed in distinct, separate chapters (such as the rights of women and sexual minorities), many current human rights issues or topic areas are instead presented as illustrations within the chapters, which focus on various legal aspects of the current international system. The chapter headings, with internal hyperlinks provided in the Table of Contents, should provide adequate guidance for finding such specific topic and factually based material.