

Understanding Juvenile Law

Understanding Juvenile Law

FIFTH EDITION

Martin R. Gardner

STEINHART FOUNDATION PROFESSOR OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA, COLLEGE OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS UNDERSTANDING SERIES

- Understanding Administrative Law,**
Sixth Edition
William Fox, Jr.
- Understanding Alternative Dispute Resolution**
Kristen Blankley and Maureen A. Weston
- Understanding Animal Law**
Adam Karp
- Understanding Antitrust and Its Economic Implications, Sixth Edition**
E. Thomas Sullivan and Jeffrey Harrison
- Understanding Bankruptcy, Third Edition**
Jeffrey Ferriell and Edward Janger
- Understanding California Community Property Law**
Jo Carrillo
- Understanding Capital Punishment Law,**
Fourth Edition
Linda Carter, Ellen Kreitzberg,
and Scott Howe
- Understanding Civil Procedure,**
Fifth Edition
Gene Shreve, Peter Raven-Hansen,
and Charles Geyh
- Understanding Civil Procedure:
The California Edition**
Walter W. Heiser, Gene Shreve, Peter Raven-Hansen,
Glen Earl Weston, and Charles Geyh
- Understanding Civil Rights Litigation,**
Second Edition
Howard M. Wasserman
- Understanding Conflict of Laws,**
Fourth Edition
William Richman, William Reynolds,
and Chris Whytock
- Understanding Constitutional Law,**
Fourth Edition
John Attanasio and Joel Goldstein
- Understanding Contracts, Third Edition**
Jeffrey Ferriell
- Understanding Copyright Law,**
Sixth Edition
Marshall Leaffer
- Understanding Corporate Law, Fourth Edition**
Arthur Pinto and Douglas M. Branson
- Understanding Corporate Taxation,**
Third Edition
Leandra Lederman and Michelle Kwon
- Understanding Criminal Law, Eighth Edition**
Joshua Dressler
- Understanding Criminal Procedure:
Vol. 1: Investigation, Seventh Edition**
Joshua Dressler, Alan C. Michaels,
and Ric Simmons
- Understanding Criminal Procedure:
Vol. 2: Adjudication, Fourth Edition**
Joshua Dressler and Alan C. Michaels
- Understanding Disability Law, Second Edition**
Mark C. Weber
- Understanding Election Law
and Voting Rights**
Michael R. Dimino, Bradley A. Smith,
and Michael E. Solimine
- Understanding Employee Benefits Law**
Kathryn Moore
- Understanding Employment
Discrimination Law, Second Edition**
Thomas Haggard
- Understanding Employment Law,**
Second Edition
Jeffrey M. Hirsch, Paul M. Secunda,
and Richard Bales
- Understanding Environmental Law,**
Third Edition
Philip Weinberg and Kevin Reilly
- Understanding Estate and Gift Taxation**
Brant Hellwig and Robert T. Danforth
- Understanding Evidence, Fourth Edition**
Paul Giannelli
- Understanding Family Law, Fourth Edition**
John Gregory, Peter N. Swisher,
and Robin Wilson
- Understanding Federal and
California Evidence**
Paul Giannelli
- Understanding Federal Courts
and Jurisdiction, Second Edition**
Linda Mullenix, Martin H. Redish,
and Georgene Vairo

- Understanding Federal Income Taxation,**
Fifth Edition
J. Martin Burke and Michael Friel
- Understanding The First Amendment,**
Sixth Edition
Russell L. Weaver
- Understanding Immigration Law,**
Second Edition
Kevin R. Johnson, Raquel Aldana, Ong Hing,
Leticia Saucedo, and Enid Trucios-Haynes
- Understanding Insurance Law,**
Sixth Edition
Robert H. Jerry, II and Douglas Richmond
- Understanding Intellectual Property Law,**
Third Edition
Donald Chisum, Tyler T. Ochoa, Shubha
Ghosh, and Mary LaFrance
- Understanding International Business and
Financial Transactions,** Fourth Edition
Jerold Friedland
- Understanding International Criminal
Law,** Third Edition
Ellen S. Podgor and Roger S. Clark
- Understanding International Law,**
Second Edition
Stephen McCaffrey
- Understanding Jewish Law**
Steven Resnicoff
- Understanding Juvenile Law,**
Fifth Edition
Martin Gardner
- Understanding Labor Law,** Fourth Edition
Douglas E. Ray, Calvin William Sharpe,
and Robert N. Strassfeld
- Understanding the Law of Terrorism,**
Second Edition
Erik Luna and Wayne McCormack
- Understanding the Law of Zoning and
Land Use Controls,** Third Edition
Barlow Burke
- Understanding Lawyers' Ethics,**
Fifth Edition
Monroe H. Freedman and Abbe Smith
- Understanding Local Government,**
Second Edition
Sandra Stevenson
- Understanding Modern Real Estate
Transactions,** Fourth Edition
Alex M. Johnson, Jr.
- Understanding Negotiable Instruments
and Payment Systems**
William H. Lawrence
- Understanding Nonprofit and Tax Exempt
Organizations,** Second Edition
Nicholas Cafardi and Jaclyn Cherry
- Understanding Partnership and
LLC Taxation,** Fourth Edition
Jerold Friedland
- Understanding Patent Law,** Third Edition
Amy Landers
- Understanding Products Liability Law,**
Second Edition
Bruce L. Ottley, Rogelio Lasso, and
Terrence F. Kiely
- Understanding Property Law,** Fourth Edition
John Sprankling
- Understanding Remedies,** Third Edition
James Fischer
- Understanding Sales and Leases of Goods,**
Third Edition
William H. Henning, William H. Lawrence,
and Henry Deeb Gabriel
- Understanding Secured Transactions,**
Fifth Edition
William H. Lawrence, William H. Henning,
and R. Wilson Freyeremuth
- Understanding Securities Law,** Sixth Edition
Marc I. Steinberg
- Understanding Taxation of Business Entities**
Walter Schwidetzky and Fred B. Brown
- Understanding Torts,** Sixth Edition
John Diamond, Lawrence C. Levine,
and Anita Bernstein
- Understanding Trademark Law,**
Third Edition
Mary LaFrance
- Understanding Trusts and Estates,**
Sixth Edition
Roger W. Andersen and Susan Gary
- Understanding White Collar Crime,**
Fourth Edition
J. Kelly Strader

Copyright © 2018
Martin Gardner
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Gardner, Martin R., author.

Title: Understanding juvenile law / Martin R. Gardner.

Description: Fifth edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, LLC, [2018] | Series: Understanding series | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017056241 | ISBN 9781531005719 (alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Juvenile justice, Administration of--United States. | Children--Legal status, laws, etc.--United States. | Minors--United States.

Classification: LCC KF9780 .G37 2018 | DDC 345.73/08--dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017056241>

eISBN 978-1-53100-572-6

Carolina Academic Press, LLC
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

In memory of my goodly parents.

Martin R. Gardner

Contents

Acknowledgments	xvii
Preface	xix

PART ONE · INTRODUCTION

Chapter 1 · Minority as a Legal Status	3
§ 1.01 Overview	3
§ 1.02 Distinguishing Minors from Adults	3
[A] Chronological Age Rules	3
[1] Common Law	3
[2] Modern Statutes: Different Ages for Different Contexts	4
[B] Individualized Standards for Assessing Maturity	5
[1] Manifestations of the Individualized Standard	5
[a] The “Mature Minor” and Medical Treatment	5
[b] Waivers of Juvenile Court Jurisdiction	6
[2] Social Science and the Process of Maturation: The Nature of Adolescence	6
Chapter 2 · The Rights of Juveniles	9
§ 2.01 Overview	9
§ 2.02 The Protectionist Theory	11
[A] Theoretical Premises	11
[B] Overview of Private Law	11
[C] The State as <i>Parens Patriae</i>	12
§ 2.03 The Personhood Theory	12
[A] Overview	12
[B] Personhood Rights and Current Law	13
§ 2.04 Accommodation of Protectionist and Personhood Theories	14

PART TWO · OUTSIDE THE JUVENILE JUSTICE SYSTEM

Chapter 3 · The Child and the Family	17
§ 3.01 General Background	17

§ 3.02 Support and Maintenance	18
[A] “Necessary” Support	19
[1] Setting the Amount of Financial Support	19
[2] Education	20
[3] Medical Care	22
[a] Parental Objections on Religious Grounds	22
[b] Objections on Grounds of Parental Autonomy	23
[c] Handicapped Newborns	24
[d] Consent by the Juvenile: The “Mature Minor” Exception	24
[4] Unborn Children	25
[B] Duration of Support	26
[1] Emancipation	26
[2] Disobedience to Parents	28
[3] Death of Parent or Child	28
[C] Theoretical Implications	28
§ 3.03 Parental Neglect	29
[A] Parental Tort Liability	29
[B] State Intervention	30
[1] Criminal Actions	30
[2] <i>Parens Patriae</i> Limitations on Parental Authority	31
[3] Termination of Parental Rights	33
[4] Foster Care	34
§ 3.04 Adoption	37
§ 3.05 Inheritance	38
§ 3.06 Child Custody	39
[A] Disputes Between Natural Parents	40
[1] The Tender Years Presumption	41
[2] Race, Religion, and Sexual Orientation of Parents	41
[3] The Child’s Preference	43
[4] Joint Custody	43
[5] Visitation Rights	44
[B] Disputes Between Parents and Non-Parents	45
[C] Jurisdictional Issues	46
[D] Theoretical Implications	48
Chapter 4 • Child Abuse	49
§ 4.01 Overview	49
§ 4.02 Child Abuse Legislation	50
[A] Defining Child Abuse	50
[1] Constitutional Attacks	53
[2] Policy Implications	54
[B] Duty to Report	55
[1] Persons Obligated to Report	56

[2] Civil Liability for Failure to Report or Investigate	57
[3] Policy Implications	58
§ 4.03 The Judicial Process	59
[A] Expert Testimony	60
[1] Battered Child Syndrome	60
[2] Other “Syndrome” Evidence	61
[a] Munchausen Syndrome by Proxy	63
[b] Battering Parent Syndrome	65
[3] Policy Implications	66
[B] Children’s Testimony	66
[1] Competency to Testify	66
[2] The Traumatic Effects of Testifying	68
[a] Face to Face Confrontation?	68
[b] Hearsay Exceptions	70
[3] Policy Implications	75
[C] Other Evidentiary Issues	77
[1] Testimonial Privileges	77
[2] Admissibility of Prior Acts of Abuse	78
§ 4.04 Criminal or Civil Alternatives?	78
§ 4.05 Abuse and Neglect Outside the Family	79
[A] Child Sex Abuse and Institutions	79
[1] Liability of Organizations	79
[2] Liability of Religious Organizations	79
[B] Statutes of Limitations	80
[C] Liability of Educational Institutions	80
[1] Equality	81
[2] The Right to Receive Information	81
[3] The Right to Be Free from Harassment	82
Chapter 5 • Private Law Issues Outside the Family	85
§ 5.01 Overview	85
§ 5.02 Litigation Issues	85
[A] Parties	85
[B] Statutes of Limitations	86
§ 5.03 Contracts	87
[A] The Common Law Infancy Doctrine	88
[1] The Necessaries Exception	88
[2] Avoidance and Restitution	90
[3] Misrepresentation of Age	91
[4] Ratification	92
[a] Failure to Make a Timely Disaffirmance	92
[b] Express Ratification	92
[c] Conduct	93
[5] Emancipation and Contract Capacity	93

[6] Non-Necessary Medical Expenses	93
[B] Statutory Innovations	94
[C] Policy Implications	96
§ 5.04 Torts	97
[A] Intentional Torts	97
[1] Punitive Damages	98
[2] Parental Liability Statutes	99
[B] Negligence	100
[C] Policy Implications	100
§ 5.05 Property	101
§ 5.06 Making a Will	102
§ 5.07 Employment	102
[A] State Legislation	103
[B] Federal Legislation	105
[C] Policy Implications	107
Chapter 6 · Constitutional Rights	109
§ 6.01 Overview	109
§ 6.02 The Early Cases: <i>Meyer and Pierce</i>	110
§ 6.03 The First Amendment	112
[A] The Religion Clauses	112
[1] The Establishment Clause and the Public Schools	112
[a] School Prayer	112
[b] Accommodating Student Religious Belief	114
[2] The Free Exercise Clause	115
[B] Free Speech	118
[1] In School	118
[2] Outside School	124
§ 6.04 The Fourth Amendment	128
§ 6.05 The Eighth Amendment	136
[A] In School: Corporal Punishment	136
[B] Outside School: Punishment as an Adult	137
§ 6.06 The Fourteenth Amendment	142
[A] Due Process	142
[1] Substantive Rights	142
[a] Reproductive Freedom	142
[b] Education	147
[c] Corporal Punishment	148
[d] Marriage	149
[e] Curfews	149
[2] Procedural Rights	149
[a] School Discipline	149
[b] Mental Health Commitments	151
[B] Equal Protection	154

[1] Childhood as a Suspect Class?	154
[2] Illegitimacy	154
§ 6.07 Summary	158

PART THREE · THE JUVENILE JUSTICE SYSTEM

Chapter 7 · The Juvenile Court Movement	163
§ 7.01 Overview	163
§ 7.02 The Emergence of Juvenile Courts	164
[A] The Common Law	164
[B] Statutory Reform	165
§ 7.03 Supreme Court Oversight	169
[A] The Pre- <i>Gault</i> Era	169
[B] <i>In re Gault</i>	171
[C] <i>Gault's</i> Progeny	174
[D] Summary	178
Chapter 8 · Jurisdiction	179
§ 8.01 Overview	179
§ 8.02 Age	180
[A] Maximum Age	180
[1] Generally	180
[2] Gender Distinctions	180
[3] Age at the Time of Offense or at the Commencement of Proceedings?	181
[B] Minimum Age	182
§ 8.03 Delinquency	184
[A] Exclusive Jurisdiction	184
[B] Concurrent Jurisdiction	185
[C] Waivers of Jurisdiction	186
[1] Judicial Waivers	186
[2] Legislative Waivers	187
[a] Statutes Excluding Gang Activity	188
[b] Policy Considerations	189
§ 8.04 Status Offenses	189
[A] Noncriminal Misconduct	190
[B] Undesirable Status Conditions	191
[C] Constitutional Issues	191
[1] Equal Protection Challenges	191
[a] Discrimination Against Juveniles	191
[b] Discrimination Against Females	192
[2] Void for Vagueness	192
[D] Policy Implications	193

Chapter 9 · The Pre-Adjudication Process	195
§9.01 Overview	195
§9.02 Police Investigation	195
[A] Searches and Seizures	195
[1] Taking into Custody	196
[a] Caselaw	196
[b] Statutes	201
[2] Searches and Seizures of Evidence	202
[3] Consensual Searches and Seizures	203
[a] Consent While in Custody	205
[b] Third Party Consent	205
[4] Policy Implications	205
[B] Interrogations	209
[1] Fourteenth Amendment Due Process	209
[2] Sixth Amendment Right to Counsel	210
[3] Fifth Amendment Privilege Against Self-Incrimination: <i>Miranda</i>	211
[a] <i>Fare v. Michael C.</i>	213
[b] State Law Protections	215
[c] Policy Implications	216
[C] Lineups	217
§9.03 Intake and Diversion	217
§9.04 Detention and Bail	219
[A] Preventive Detention	220
[1] <i>Schall v. Martin</i>	220
[2] Policy Implications	222
[B] Bail	222
§9.05 Judicial Waiver of Jurisdiction	224
[A] Criteria for Waiver	224
[1] Vagueness of the Criteria	224
[2] Applying the Criteria	225
[B] Procedures	226
 Chapter 10 · Adjudication	 229
§10.01 Overview	229
§10.02 Delinquency	229
[A] Procedural Aspects	229
[1] Notice	230
[2] Discovery	232
[3] Counsel	232
[4] Evidentiary Issues	234
[a] Rules of Evidence	234
[b] Standard of Proof	234

[c] Self-Incrimination, Confrontation, and Cross Examination	235
[5] Jury Determinations	235
[6] Speedy Trials	237
[7] Public Trials	237
[a] Rights of Juveniles	237
[b] Rights of the Press	238
[8] Policy Implications	240
[B] Affirmative Defenses	241
[1] Competency to Be Adjudicated	241
[2] The Insanity Defense	243
[3] The Infancy Defense	244
[4] Battered Children and Self-Defense	244
[5] Gang Activity and the Duress Defense	247
[6] Policy Implications	247
§ 10.03 Status Offenses	248
[A] Procedural Aspects	248
[1] Constitutional Protections	248
[2] Notice	250
[3] Discovery	251
[4] Counsel	251
[5] Evidentiary Issues	251
[a] Rules of Evidence	251
[b] Standard of Proof	253
[c] Self-Incrimination	253
[6] Jury Determinations, Open Proceedings	254
[7] Policy Implications	254
[B] Affirmative Defenses	254
Chapter 11 · Dispositions	257
§ 11.01 Overview	257
§ 11.02 Hearing Procedures	258
[A] Right to a Hearing	258
[B] Right to Counsel	258
[C] Rules of Evidence	259
§ 11.03 Delinquency Cases	259
[A] The Traditional Theory: Promoting the Child's Interests	260
[1] Appellate Review of Judicial Discretion	260
[2] The Least Drastic Alternative	262
[B] The New Theory: Social Protection and Punishment	264
[1] Distinguishing Punishment and Rehabilitation	265
[2] Punitive Juvenile Justice Legislation	265
[3] Legal Consequences of Punitive Dispositions	266

[C] Dispositional Alternatives	267
[1] Probation	268
[a] Conditions of Probation	269
[b] Probation Revocation	270
[c] Rehabilitation or Punishment?	271
[2] Restitution	272
[a] Procedural Requirements	273
[b] Rehabilitation or Punishment?	274
[3] Community Service	274
[4] Community-Based Institutionalization	276
[a] Foster Care	276
[b] The Problem of Runaways	278
[5] Secure Confinement	279
[a] The Right to Rehabilitation	279
[b] Cruel and Unusual Punishment	282
[i] General Conditions of Confinement	283
[ii] Disciplinary Regimens	283
[D] Boot Camps	285
[E] “Blended Sentencing”	285
[F] Policy Implications	287
§ 11.04 Status Offenders	287
[A] Non-Incarcerative Dispositions	288
[B] Secure Confinement	288
[1] Initial Disposition	288
[2] Secure Confinement as a Secondary Disposition	290
[3] Segregating Status Offenders and Delinquents	292
[C] The Right to Rehabilitation	293
[D] Unconstitutional Punishment	294
[1] Punishment Violative of Due Process	295
[2] Cruel and Unusual Punishment	296
[a] Punishment in “Nonpunitive” Dispositional Systems	296
[b] Punishment of Status	297
§ 11.05 Appeals	298
Chapter 12 · The Future of the Juvenile Justice System	301
§ 12.01 Overview	301
§ 12.02 Delinquency	301
§ 12.03 Status Offenses	303
Table of Cases	305
Index	313

Acknowledgments

The author wishes to express appreciation for the generous support made available through the Ross McCollum Research Fund at the University of Nebraska College of Law; for the superb research and editorial assistance provided by Audrey Bellew; for the excellent secretarial service performed by Vida Eden; and, most of all, for the patience and encouragement of his wife, Anne.

Preface

This text examines the topic of juvenile law. The book addresses issues of children and the law in the context of common law doctrine, federal constitutional principles, and statutory enactments.

The book discusses these various bodies of law in relation to a fundamental issue permeating the entire field of juvenile law: the extent to which the law should protect young people rather than recognize them as autonomous persons. While the law traditionally adopted a protectionist posture, recent legal developments appear to recognize autonomy rights of adolescents in certain contexts. These developments are praised by some commentators who advocate wholesale rejection of the paternalistic model in favor of a system that treats adolescents as full-fledged persons under the law. This book does not advocate any particular resolution of the current debate about the nature of the rights of young people; rather, it suggests that sensitivity to the issues and arguments entailed in that debate is essential to any true understanding of the present state of juvenile law.

With these concerns in mind, the text begins with a general discussion of the nature of the rights of juveniles and the perception that young people constitute a unique class under the law. This theoretical introduction will serve as a background for subsequent discussion of juvenile law doctrine. The discussion separates aspects of juvenile law arising outside the juvenile justice system (defined in this text as the system of separate courts organized to deal with “delinquents” and “status offenders”)¹ from those arising within that system. This division is created as a useful means of organizing the doctrinal material, given the extensive body of rules that govern the juvenile justice system. Moreover, this organization permits the juvenile justice section to stand by itself as an independent text for students in courses that cover only that aspect of juvenile law.

Finally, for readers interested in single sources providing broader attention to juvenile law issues than provided in this text, two multi-volume sources may be useful starting points. Donald Kramer’s three-volume second edition to *Legal Rights of Children* offers a well organized treatment of a host of legal issues affecting young people. In addition, the various volumes of *Juvenile Justice Standards* from the Institute of Judicial Administration and the American Bar Association Joint Commission provide useful commentary on a variety of juvenile law issues. Finally, for a treatment of the juvenile justice system, the second edition of Samuel Davis’s *Rights of Juveniles* provides an excellent source.

1. A separate section (Part Three) is devoted to the delinquency/status offense aspects of juvenile law under the label “juvenile justice system.” Sometimes this label is used more broadly to include abuse and neglect jurisdiction or any other matter handled in a separate juvenile court. The label “juvenile justice system” always includes, however, and is often limited to, that system of courts created to deal with delinquents and status offenders.

