The Wrongful Convictions Reader
The Wrongful Convictions Reader

Edited by

Russell D. Covey
Professor of Law
Georgia State University College of Law

Valena E. Beety
Professor of Law
Arizona State University
Sandra Day O’Connor College of Law

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
To Noah and Reuben—may justice always guide you—and to all wrongfully convicted men and women, who have paid the price on our behalf.

—R.D.C.

To my wife Jenn for her light and love; to my students for their fire and tenacity; and to my clients for their brave and kind hearts. You have taught me how we each create our own freedom.

—V.E.B.
Summary of Contents

Preface xvii
Acknowledgements xix
Introduction by Barry Scheck xxvii
Chapter 1 · Prologue to Wrongful Convictions 3
Chapter 2 · Defining Innocence and Miscarriages of Justice 25
Chapter 3 · Overview of the Causes of Wrongful Convictions 43
Chapter 4 · The Innocence “Myth” and the Costs of Preventing Wrongful Convictions 75
Chapter 5 · Eyewitness Misidentifications 103
Chapter 6 · False Confessions 135
Chapter 7 · Scientific Standards, Statistical Evidence, and the Future of Forensic Science 187
Chapter 8 · DNA and Junk Science 251
Chapter 9 · Informants and Snitches 303
Chapter 10 · Police and Prosecutorial Misconduct 343
Chapter 11 · Incompetent Lawyering 375
Chapter 12 · Cognitive Bias and Tunnel Vision 403
Chapter 13 · Guilty Pleas, Pretrial Procedure, and Innocence 431
Chapter 14 · Appellate and Post-Conviction Review of Innocence: The Cases 465
Chapter 15 · Appellate and Post-Conviction Review of Innocence: An Assessment 511
Chapter 16 · Intersections: Race, Gender, Sexual Orientation, and Innocence 545
Chapter 17 · Reconsidering Innocence: Rethinking Causes and Addressing Consequences 577
Appendix: Wrongful Convictions Podcasts 631
Index 633
Contents

Preface xvii
Acknowledgements xix
Introduction by Barry Scheck xxvii

Chapter 1 · Prologue to Wrongful Convictions 3
A. Readings 3
   Eric M. Freedman, Earl Washington’s Ordeal 3
   Tucker Carrington, Mississippi Innocence: The Convictions and Exonerations of Levon Brooks and Kennedy Brewer and the Failure of the American Promise 9
B. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 23

Chapter 2 · Defining Innocence and Miscarriages of Justice 25
A. Readings 25
   Larry May and Nancy Viner, Actual Innocence and Manifest Injustice 25
   Hugo Adam Bedau and Michael L. Radelet, Miscarriages of Justice in Potentially Capital Cases 26
   D. Michael Risinger and Lesley C. Risinger, Miscarriages of Justice: A Theoretical and Practical Overview 32
   Emily Hughes, Innocence Unmodified 38
   Daniel S. Medwed, Innocentrism 39
   James R. Acker, The Flipside Injustice of Wrongful Convictions: When the Guilty Go Free 41
B. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 42

Chapter 3 · Overview of the Causes of Wrongful Convictions 43
A. Readings 43
   Brandon L. Garrett, Judging Innocence 59
   Jon B. Gould and Richard A. Leo, One Hundred Years Later: Wrongful Convictions After a Century of Research 69
B. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 71
Chapter 4 · The Innocence “Myth” and the Costs of Preventing Wrongful Convictions
Joshua Marquis, The Innocent and the Shammed
Kansas v. Marsh
D. Michael Risinger, Innocents Convicted: An Empirically Justified Factual Wrongful Conviction Rate
Larry Laudan, The Elementary Epistemic Arithmetic of Criminal Justice

Chapter 5 · Eyewitness Misidentifications
A. Case Study
Mike Celizic, She Sent Him to Jail for Rape; Now They’re Friends
B. Readings
Gary L. Wells, Eyewitness Identification: Systemic Reforms
Nancy K. Steblay, Scientific Advances in Eyewitness Identification Evidence
Steven E. Clark, Costs and Benefits of Eyewitness Identification Reform: Psychological Science and Public Policy
Timothy E. Moore et al., Shaping Eyewitness and Alibi Testimony with Coercive Interview Practices

Chapter 6 · False Confessions
A. Readings
Richard A. Leo, Steven A. Drizin, Peter J. Neufeld, Bradley R. Hall, and Amy Vatner, Bringing Reliability Back In: False Confessions and Legal Safeguards in the Twenty-First Century
Chris Smith, Central Park Revisited
Saul M. Kassin, Steven A. Drizin, Thomas Grisso, Gisli H. Gudjonsson, Richard A. Leo, and Allison D. Redlich, Police-Induced Confessions: Risk Factors and Recommendations
Douglas Starr, The Interview: Do Police Interrogation Techniques Produce False Confessions?
Brandon L. Garrett, The Substance of False Confessions
B. Current Law: Overview
C. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media
People v. Wise

Chapter 7 · Scientific Standards, Statistical Evidence, and the Future of Forensic Science
A. Readings
1. Overview
CONTENTS

Vanessa Meterko, Strengths and Limitations of Forensic Science: What DNA Exonerations Have Taught Us and Where to Go from Here 187

2. Rethinking Traditional Forensic Science 189
   Jennifer L. Mnookin, The Courts, the NAS, and the Future of Forensic Science 198

3. Base Rates, Error Rates, and Proficiency Tests 204
   William C. Thompson and Edward L. Schumann, Interpretation of Statistical Evidence in Criminal Trials: The Prosecutor’s Fallacy and the Defense Attorney’s Fallacy 204
   Boaz Sangero and Mordechai Halpert, Why a Conviction Should Not Be Based on a Single Piece of Evidence: A Proposal for Reform 208
   Jonathan J. Koehler, Error and Exaggeration in the Presentation of DNA Evidence at Trial 212
   Jonathan J. Koehler, Fingerprint Error Rates and Proficiency Tests: What They Are and Why They Matter 221

4. Reform Initiatives: The National Academy of Science Report & PCAST 225
   National Academy of Sciences, Strengthening Forensic Science in the United States: A Path Forward 226
   John M. Butler, U.S. Initiatives to Strengthen Forensic Science and International Standards in Forensic DNA 229
   President’s Council of Advisors on Science & Technology, An Addendum to the PCAST Report on Forensic Science in Criminal Courts 230
   Jennifer E. Laurin, Remapping the Path Forward: Toward a Systemic View of Forensic Science Reform and Oversight 239

B. Current Law: Overview 242
C. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 244

Chapter 8 · DNA and Junk Science 251

A. Readings 251
   1. Forensic DNA: A Double-Edged Helix 251
      Simon A. Cole, Forensic Science and Wrongful Convictions: From Exposer to Contributor to Corrector 251
      Jessica Gabel Gino, Tackling Technical Debt: Managing Advances in DNA Technology That Outpace the Evolution of Law 255
      Erin Murphy, The Art in the Science of DNA: A Layperson’s Guide to the Subjectivity Inherent in Forensic DNA Typing 257
   2. Studies in Junk Science: Shaken Baby Syndrome and Arson 269
      Deborah Tuerkheimer, Science-Dependent Prosecution and the Problem of Epistemic Contingency: A Study of Shaken Baby Syndrome 269
      Deborah W. Denno, Concocting Criminal Intent 270
CONTENTS


Deborah Tuerkheimer, Arson and SBS excerpt from Science-Dependent Prosecution and the Problem of Epistemic Contingency: A Study of Shaken Baby Syndrome 275

Caitlin M. Plummer and Imran J. Syed, “Shifted Science” Revisited: Percolation Delays and the Persistence of Wrongful Convictions Based on Outdated Science 277

John J. Lentini, Confronting Inaccuracy in Fire Cause Determinations 281

Rachel Dioso-Villa, Scientific and Legal Developments in Fire and Arson Investigation Expertise in Texas v. Willingham 283

Sandra Guerra Thompson and Nicole Bremner Cásarez, Building the Infrastructure for “Justice Through Science”: The Texas Model 285

B. Current Law: Overview 288
C. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 290

Chapter 9 · Informants and Snitches
A. Readings 303

Alexandra Natapoff, Beyond Unreliable: How Snitches Contribute to Wrongful Convictions 303


Russell D. Covey, Abolishing Jailhouse Snitch Testimony 307

Jessica A. Roth, Informant Witnesses and the Risk of Wrongful Convictions 317

American Bar Association, Section of Criminal Justice, Report to the House of Delegates 324

B. Current Law: Overview 326
C. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 328

Brief for Respondent, Kansas Appellate Defender Office, State of Kansas v. Ventris 330

Brief of the National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers as Amicus Curiae in Support of Respondent State of Kansas v. Ventris 331

Reply Brief for Petitioner, State of Kansas v. Ventris 334

Kansas v. Donnie Ray Ventris 339

Chapter 10 · Police and Prosecutorial Misconduct
A. Readings 343

Russell Covey, Police Misconduct as a Cause of Wrongful Convictions 343

Peter A. Joy, The Relationship between Prosecutorial Misconduct and Wrongful Convictions: Shaping Remedies for a Broken System 349
CONTENTS

Kara MacKillop and Neil Vidmar, Decision-Making in the Dark: How Pre-Trial Errors Change the Narrative in Criminal Jury Trials 356
Jon B. Gould, Julia Carrano, Richard A. Leo, and Katie Hail-Jares, Predicting Erroneous Convictions 358
Valena Beety, Changing the Culture of Disclosure and Forensics 360
Jacqueline McMurtrie, The Unindicted Co-Ejaculator and Necrophilia: Addressing Prosecutors’ Logic-Defying Responses to Exculpatory DNA Results 363
Dan Simon, Criminal Law at the Crossroads: Turn to Accuracy 366
B. Current Law: Overview 367
C. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 368

Chapter 11 · Incompetent Lawyering 375
A. Readings 375
Barry Scheck, Peter Neufeld, and Jim Dwyer, Sleeping Lawyers, excerpt from Actual Innocence: When Justice Goes Wrong and How to Make It Right 375
Meghan J. Ryan and John Adams, Cultivating Judgment on the Tools of Wrongful Conviction 377
Jacqueline McMurtrie, Strange Bedfellows: Can Insurers Play a Role in Advancing Gideon’s Promise? 379
Eve Brensike Primus, Defense Counsel and Public Defense 380
Mark Godsey, Blind Injustice: A Former Prosecutor Exposes the Psychology and Politics of Wrongful Convictions 384
Tigran W. Eldred, Prescriptions for Ethical Blindness: Improving Advocacy for Indigent Defendants in Criminal Cases 385
Stephen B. Bright, Counsel for the Poor: The Death Sentence Not for the Worst Crime but for the Worst Lawyer 388
Bruce A. Green, Access to Criminal Justice: Where Are the Prosecutors? 395
B. Current Law: Overview 400
C. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 401

Chapter 12 · Cognitive Bias and Tunnel Vision 403
A. Readings 403
Keith A. Findley and Michael S. Scott, The Multiple Dimensions of Tunnel Vision in Criminal Cases 403
Sherry Nakhaeizadeh, Itiel E. Dror, and Ruth M. Morgan, The Emergence of Cognitive Bias in Forensic Science and Criminal Investigations 409
Jennifer L. Mnookin, The Courts, the NAS, and the Future of Forensic Science 425
CONTENTS


B. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 543

Chapter 16 · Intersections: Race, Gender, Sexual Orientation, and Innocence 545

A. Readings 545

1. Race, Mass Incarceration, and Wrongful Convictions
   - National Registry of Exonerations Report on Race and Wrongful Convictions 545
   - David Oshinsky, *Worse Than Slavery: Parchman Farm and the Ordeal of Jim Crow Justice* 548
   - Bryan Stevenson, *Just Mercy: A Story of Justice and Redemption* 550
   - L. Song Richardson, *Systemic Triage: Implicit Racial Bias in the Criminal Courtroom* 551
   - Michelle Alexander, *The New Jim Crow: Mass Incarceration in the Age of Colorblindness* 552

2. Sexual Orientation and the Criminal Justice System 554
   - *Queer Criminal Archetypes*, excerpt from *Queer (In)Justice* 557
   - Carrie L. Buist and Emily Lenning, *Queer Criminology: New Directions in Critical Criminology* 558
   - Affidavit of Professor of Law and University Distinguished Professor Ruthann Robson 559
   - *Heteronormativity*, excerpt from *Queer (In)Justice* 562
   - Bennett Capers, *Cross Dressing and the Criminal* 562

3. Gender and Wrongful Convictions 564
   - Andrea L. Lewis and Sara L. Sommervold, *Death, But Is It Murder? The Role of Stereotypes and Cultural Perceptions in the Wrongful Convictions of Women* 564
   - Elizabeth Webster and Jody Miller, *Gendering and Racing Wrongful Conviction: Intersectionality, “Normal Crimes,” and Women’s Experiences of Miscarriage of Justice* 565

B. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 568

Chapter 17 · Reconsidering Innocence: Rethinking Causes and Addressing Consequences 577

A. Readings 577

1. Reconsidering Innocence 577
Carol S. Steiker and Jordan M. Steiker, *The Seduction of Innocence: The Attraction and Limitations of the Focus on Innocence in Capital Punishment Law and Advocacy* 579
David Feige, *The Dark Side of Innocence* 581
Daniel S. Medwed, *Innocentrism* 582

2. Systemic Constraints and Solutions 585
William C. Thompson, *Beyond Bad Apples: Analyzing the Role of Forensic Science in Wrongful Convictions* 585
James M. Doyle, *Orwell’s Elephant and the Etiology of Wrongful Convictions* 589
Jon B. Gould, Julia Carrano, Richard A. Leo, and Katie Hail-Jares, *Predicting Erroneous Convictions* 595
Paul Cassell, *Can We Protect the Innocent without Freeing the Guilty? Thoughts on Innocence Reforms That Avoid Harmful Tradeoffs* 600

3. Compensation, Access to DNA Testing, and Parole Considerations for the Innocent 611
Michael Leo Owens and Elizabeth Griffiths, *Uneven Reparations for Wrongful Convictions: Examining the State Politics of Statutory Compensation Legislation* 611
The Innocence Project: Access to Post-Conviction DNA Testing 617
Daniel S. Medwed, *The Innocent Prisoner’s Dilemma: Consequences of Failing to Admit Guilt at Parole Hearings* 625

B. Legal Materials, Exercises, and Media 628

Appendix: Wrongful Convictions Podcasts 631
Index 633
Preface

This volume is intended primarily as a teaching tool for law students, undergraduate and graduate students, lawyers, judges, and those interested in educating themselves (or teaching others) about the current state of knowledge regarding wrongful convictions. This includes what we do and do not know about their prevalence, what causes them to occur, what might be done to limit their number, and how we should think about balancing the costs of preventing them with the costs of maintaining an effective criminal justice system.

The book represents some of the most important work in the field of wrongful convictions studies of the past three decades. Contributions were selected not only to inform readers about the current state-of-the-art, but also to give readers a sense of the historical progress of innocence scholarship and the innocence movement, and to expose readers to the sometimes heated debates that were its byproduct. Participants in those debates include countless scholars and researchers, reporters, prosecutors, forensic scientists, advocates for the innocent, judges, and Supreme Court justices. We are deeply grateful for the willingness of the numerous contributing authors, journals, and news media to allow us to collect and publish their path-breaking work in this volume. Needless to say, this is but the tip of a large and ever-growing iceberg of research, scholarship, adjudication, and reporting dealing with the phenomena of wrongful convictions. A great amount of important work was necessarily omitted from this volume due to the inevitable space constraints.
We acknowledge with great appreciation the following authors, journals, magazines, newspapers, and publishers who have so graciously permitted us to reproduce excerpts of their work in this reader. Because this book is intended primarily as a teaching tool, citations and footnotes have in most cases been omitted for purposes of readability, and in some instances material has been reordered from the original. Textual alterations, omissions and deletions have been indicated. Those wishing to use these works for purposes of scholarship should consult the original sources.

Artist Dan Bolick painted and sketched exonerated men and women for his series, “Resurrected: The Innocence Portraits.” He graciously permitted us to use his portrait of John Thompson, or JT, for the cover of the Reader. John Thompson passed away on October 4, 2017; he had spent 18 years in prison for a crime he did not commit, 14 of those years on death row, before he was exonerated. He established Resurrection After Exoneration (RAE) as a home for new exonerees, called out widely for prosecutor reform, and his civil case resulted in one of the most infamous U.S. Supreme Court decisions on prosecutorial misconduct: Connick v. Thompson, 563 U.S. 51 (2011). Thank you to JT, and to all wrongfully convicted men and women, for their will to fight and their pursuit of justice.

Finally, special thanks go to Kelly Parker and Christopher Maidona, West Virginia University College of Law, Class of 2018, whose research and technical assistance were critical to completing this reader. We wish you the best in your careers.


ACKNOWLEDGMENTS


Mike Celizic, She sent him to jail for rape; now they’re friends: DNA evidence exonerated him; today they’re co-authors fighting for justice, TODAY (updated 3/10/2009).


ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Mark Godsey, Blind Injustice: A Former Prosecutor Exposes the Psychology and Politics of Wrongful Convictions. (c) 2017 by Mark Godsey. Published by the University of California Press. Reprinted with permission.


ACKNOWLEDGMENTS


ACKNOWLEDGMENTS


Barry Scheck, Peter Neufeld and Jim Dwyer, Actual Innocence: Five Days to Execution, and Other Dispatches from the Wrongly Convicted, copyright © 2000 by Barry Scheck, Peter Neufeld and Jim Dwyer. Used by permission of Doubleday, an imprint of the Knopf Doubleday Publishing Group, a division of Penguin Random House LLC. All rights reserved.


American Bar Association, Resolution Against Coercive Alford Pleas (2017).


Introduction

This is a very smart book. It serves as the best introduction yet to the impact of the innocence movement and the systematic study of wrongful convictions.

When the Innocence Project began twenty-six years ago as a clinical program at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law it featured a seminar on “Wrongful Convictions: Causes and Remedies,” as well as a docket of post-conviction cases involving clients from across the country trying to prove their innocence and vacate their convictions. From the beginning, the innocence movement was deliberately organized through law school programs, combining interdisciplinary scholarship with litigation strategies, an agenda of legislative reforms, and advocacy through the media. As I write this introduction, there is an Innocence Network that consists of 56 organizations within the United States, most of them affiliated with law schools, and 11 international organizations. There have been 358 post-conviction DNA exonerations (in 47% of those cases the person who committed the crime has been identified) and, according to the National Registry of Exonerations, 2,252 United States exonerations since 1989, involving DNA and non-DNA evidence.

The success of the innocence movement is always best understood through the experiences of the exonerees and their families, not just the good case law established in courts, the laws passed by legislatures, or the reforms implemented by criminal justice stakeholders. But the intellectual foundation of the enterprise, the unstinting struggle to understand in all its dimensions why the innocent are convicted and what can be done to prevent miscarriages of justice, is what generates energy, shapes the narrative, and assures long-term sustainability of what we believe is an international human rights movement. This book is a wonderful contribution to that effort.

Professors Covey and Beety make wise selections from a rich, interdisciplinary literature that demonstrate how dramatically the examination of wrongful convictions has influenced experimental psychology (excellent chapters on false confessions and eyewitness identification research) and forensic science (a chapter on reform efforts to bring sound scientific and statistical standards to the field as a whole and a chapter on exposés of “junk science” in the fields of arson investigation and the complex area of Shaken Baby Syndrome/Abusive Head Trauma). In Chapter 7 they astutely introduce the problem of prosecutorial misconduct from the perspective of cognitive bias and “tunnel vision,” an emphasis that avoids ad hominem attack and ineluctably points to ways criminal investigations can be improved. This sets the stage for subsequent chapters on “Police and Prosecutorial Misconduct,” “Informants and Snitches,” and “Incompetent Lawyering and the Tilted Playing Field” that pull no punches. The
overarching focus on a scientific approach to criminal justice reform, a core value of the innocence movement, continually invites the faculty and students to engage with controversial and potentially polarizing issues in a rigorous and objective fashion.

Accordingly, Covey and Beety include chapters on “The Innocence ‘Myth’ and the Costs of Preventing Wrongful Convictions,” and “Reconsidering Innocence: Rethinking Causes and Addressing Consequences,” that fairly and appropriately feature criticisms of the innocence movement and the dangers of focusing too much on wrongful convictions from prosecutors (Josh Marquis), capital lawyers (Carol and Jordan Steiker), public defenders (Abbe Smith and David Feige), and a long time leader of the movement (Daniel Medwed). They are equally careful at the beginning of the book to include readings that explore how “exoneration,” “innocence,” and “miscarriage of justice” have been defined over time in the literature (Chapter 2 “Defining Innocence and Miscarriages of Justice”) and to establish the limitations of what we know about the extent of wrongful convictions and what “causes” them (Chapter 3 “Overview of the Causes of Wrongful Convictions”).

The authors do not neglect the heartland issues for a traditional legal curriculum with thoughtful readings in Chapter 13 “Guilty Pleas, Pretrial Procedure, and Innocence,” excerpts from the key Supreme Court “innocence” cases in Chapter 14, and realistic assessments about the severe limitations created by the “harmless error” doctrine, the demands of “finality,” and the strictures of federal habeas law in Chapter 15, “Appellate and Post-Conviction Review of Innocence: An Assessment.” In Chapter 16, “Intersections: Race, Gender, Sexual Orientation and Innocence,” powerful readings are assembled addressing the most pressing issues of the day that ought to be part of every law school curriculum.

In short, this casebook lays out a stimulating course of study that ought to be exciting for students in many graduate schools to take, not just law students, and a pleasure to teach.

Barry Scheck
Co-Founder of the Innocence Project
Professor, Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law