Art, Cultural Heritage, and the Law
Art, Cultural Heritage, and the Law

Cases and Materials

FOURTH EDITION

Patty Gerstenblith
DISTINGUISHED RESEARCH PROFESSOR OF LAW AND
DIRECTOR OF THE CENTER FOR ART, MUSEUM, & CULTURAL HERITAGE LAW
DePaul University College of Law

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina
To Sam
Contents

Preface to the Fourth Edition xix
Acknowledgments xxi

1 • An Introduction to Art and Cultural Heritage Law 3
   Section A. What Is Art? 4
      Mazer v. Stein 4
      Notes & Questions 9
      Stephanie Giry, An Odd Bird 12
      Notes & Questions 16
   Section B. Art and Cultural Heritage 18
      Lyndel V. Prott and Patrick J. O’Keefe, Cultural Heritage or Cultural Property 21
      Notes & Questions 24

Part I: Artists’ Rights 27

2 • Freedom of Expression 29
   Section A. Government Regulation of Artistic Expression 30
      Bery v. New York 30
      Notes & Questions 37
      Piarowski v. Illinois Community College 42
      Notes 47
      Problem 49
   Section B. Right of Publicity/Right of Privacy and the First Amendment 49
      Comedy III Productions, Inc. v. Saderup 50
      Notes & Question 60
      Hoepker v. Kruger 62
      Notes & Question 68
      Problem 69
   Section C. Government Support of the Arts 69
      National Endowment for the Arts v. Finley 70
      Notes & Questions 84
      Notes & Questions 96
      Note: Museum Ethics 98
American Alliance of Museums Guidelines on Exhibiting
Borrowed Objects

Problems

3 • Copyright

Section A. Eligibility for Copyright Protection

1. Copyrightable Subject Matter
2. Fixation
3. Originality

*Davidson v. United States*

Notes & Questions

Problem

Section B. Ownership of Copyright and the Work Made for Hire Doctrine

*Community for Creative Non-Violence v. Reid*

Notes & Questions

Problems

Section C. Infringement

*Rogers v. Koons*

*Blehm v. Jacobs*

Notes & Questions

Problems

Section D. Defense to Infringement: Fair Use


*Cariou v. Prince*

Notes & Questions

Problem

Section E. Copyright in Architectural Works

1. Qualifying as an Architectural Work

*Shine v. Childs*

Notes & Questions

Problem

2. Scope of Copyright Protection for Architectural Works

*Leicester v. Warner Brothers, Corp.*

Notes & Questions

4 • Moral Rights Doctrine

Section A. Moral Rights before Enactment of the Visual Artists Rights Act

1. Moral Rights in the Absence of Statute

Notes

2. State Statutes Protecting Moral Rights

Notes

Section B. The Visual Artists Rights Act of 1990

1. Introduction

Notes & Questions
## CONTENTS

2. Qualification of a Work of Art for Protection under VARA 225
   *Carter v. Helmsley-Spear, Inc.* 225
   Notes & Questions 231
3. Work of Recognized Stature 235
   *Martin v. City of Indianapolis* 235
   Notes & Questions 241
4. Location of Art Works and VARA Rights 244
   a. Site-Specific Art 244
      *Phillips v. Pemroke Real Estate, Inc.* 244
      Notes 256
      Problem 258
   b. VARA-Protected Works Incorporated into Buildings 258
      *Board of Managers of Soho International Arts Condominium v. New York* 258
      Notes & Questions 264

Part II: Museums, Merchants, and Markets 269

5. Museums 271
   Section A. The History of Museums in the United States 272
      Notes & Questions 285
   Section B. Legal Structures of Museums 287
      1. Museums as Not-for-Profit Organizations: State Regulation 287
         *The People ex rel. William J. Scott, Attorney General v. George F. Harding Museum* 289
         Notes & Questions 295
      2. Museums as Tax-Exempt Entities: Federal Regulation 297
         a. Donations of Art Works by the Artist 302
            Problem 305
         b. Unrelated Business Income Tax 305
            Problems 309
   Section C. Fiduciary Obligations of Museum Trustees 310
      1. Duty of Loyalty 311
         a. Conflicts of Interest and Self-Dealing 311
         b. Loyalty to the Trust Purpose 313
            *Commonwealth v. The Barnes Foundation* 313
            Notes & Questions 317
      2. Duty of Care: Management of Museum Collections 322
         Notes & Questions 327
      3. Fiduciary Duties and Deaccessioning 328
         *Rockwell v. Trustees of the Berkshire Museum* 328
         Notes & Questions 344
         Note: Deaccessioning and the Use of Proceeds of the Sale of Deaccessioned Works of Art 347
Notes & Questions 351
4. Doctrines of Cy Pres and Deviation 353
   In the Matter of the Application of Lewis Nixon, Sr. 353
   The Trustees of the Corcoran Gallery of Art v. District of Columbia 358
Doctrine of Deviation: The Barnes Foundation Litigation 372
   Notes & Questions 376
   Problems 379

6 • Art Merchants—Auction Houses and Dealers 381
   Section A. The Sale Transaction 382
      Phoenix Ancient Art, S.A. v. Kimbell Art Foundation 382
      Weil v. Murray 385
      Notes & Questions 390
   Section B. Sales on Consignment: The Fiduciary Relationship 395
      Cristallina S.A. v. Christie, Manson & Woods International, Inc. 395
      Greenwood v. Koven 403
      Notes 415
      Problem 423
   Section C. Special Relationship between Merchant and Artist 424
      In the Matter of the Estate of Mark Rothko 424
      Notes & Questions 430
      Note: Artist Consignments 432
      Illinois Consignment of Art Act 433
      Notes & Questions 436

7 • Questions of Quality and Authenticity 437
   Section A. Law before the Uniform Commercial Code 438
      1. Common Law Theories 438
         Jendwine v. Slade 438
         Power v. Barham 439
         Notes 441
      2. Uniform Sales Act 443
         Weisz v. Parke-Bernet Galleries, Inc. 443
         Notes and Question 444
   Section B. Uniform Commercial Code 445
      1. Barring a Claim 448
         Krahmer v. Christie's Inc. 448
         Krahmer v. Christie's Inc. 458
         De Sole v. Knoedler Gallery, LLC 465
         Notes & Questions 483
      2. Was a Warranty Given? 488
         Rogath v. Siebenmann 488
         Notes & Questions 492
         Note: Art Market Legislation 494
         Notes & Questions 496
Part III: Cultural Heritage

9 • Cultural Heritage in Time of War and in the Aftermath of War

Section A. Development of the Law of Armed Conflict as Applied to Cultural Heritage

1. Early Development

2. Napoleon and Developments of the Nineteenth Century

   The Marquis de Somerueles

   Notes & Questions

   Instructions for the Government of Armies of the United States in the Field (The Lieber Code)


   a. Preamble
   b. Definition of Cultural Property
   c. Obligations during War and Occupation
   d. First Protocol
   e. Second Protocol

   Notes & Questions

4. Cultural Heritage in the Middle East and North Africa:

   From Protection to Securitization

   a. Iraq
   b. Syria
   c. U.N. Security Council Resolutions

   Problems

   Zainab Bahrani, Desecrating History

Section B. Cultural Heritage during World War II

1. Background
2. Forced Sales 750
   *Vineberg v. Bissonnette* 750
   Notes & Questions 755
   Note: *The Portrait of Wally* Litigation 758
   Notes & Questions 762

3. Museums and Self-Regulation 766
   Washington Conference Principles on Nazi-Confiscated Art 767
   Report of the AAMD Task Force on the Spoliation of Art during the Nazi/World War II Era 1933–1945 768
   Addendum to the Report of the AAMD Task Force on the Spoliation of Art during the Nazi/World War II Era 1933–1945 772
   Notes & Questions 772
   Problems 775

Section C. Cultural Heritage and Human Rights 776
1. Genocide and Cultural Heritage 776
   a. Cultural Heritage and the Human Rights Conventions 776
      1. The Genocide Convention 776
      2. The Geneva Conventions and Protocols 778
      3. The Rome Statute and the International Criminal Court 779
   b. Genocide and the Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act 779
      *Philipp v. F.R.G.* 779
      Notes 790

2. Cultural Heritage during the Balkan Wars 791
3. Mali and the International Criminal Court 794
4. A Human Rights Approach to Cultural Heritage 796

10 • Cultural Heritage in the International Context 803

Section A. The Cultural Heritage Debate 803
1. Introduction 806
   Notes & Questions 814

2. The Cultural Heritage Debate: Archaeological Materials 817
   Clemency C. Coggins, *Illicit Traffic of Pre-Columbian Antiquities* 817
   Morag M. Kersel, *From the Ground to the Buyer: A Market Analysis of the Illegal Trade in Antiquities* 819
   Note: Archaeological Context and the Looting of Sites 830
   Notes & Questions 831

Section B. Legal Responses: International Conventions and Their Implementation 835
   Problem 837
2. The 1995 UNIDROIT Convention on Stolen or Illegally Exported Cultural Objects 838
   U.S. Senate Report No. 97-564 840
   Notes & Questions 841
   a. Stolen Cultural Property 842
      Autocephalous Greek-Orthodox Church of Cyprus v. Goldberg and Feldman Fine Arts, Inc. 844
      Notes & Questions 846
      Problem 847
   b. Archaeological and Ethnological Materials 847
4. Implementation of the 1970 UNESCO Convention by Other Market States 851
   a. Reciprocal Restrictions 851
   b. Bilateral Agreements 851
   c. Hybrid Approaches 852
   d. The Challenge of the Designation Requirement 853
5. The European Union 854
Section C. Legal Responses: State Ownership of Archaeological Artifacts 856
1. Foreign State Ownership in U.S. Court 856
   United States v. Schultz 856
   Notes & Questions 873
   Note: Who Cares about Provenance? 882
   Notes & Questions 884
2. Foreign State Ownership in U.K. Court 886
   Government of the Islamic Republic of Iran v. The Barakat Galleries Ltd. 886
   Notes & Questions 907
   Problem 909
Section D. Legal Responses: Smuggling and Forfeiture 910
1. Illegal Export 910
2. Illegal Import and Forfeiture 911
   United States v. An Antique Platter of Gold, known as a Gold Phiale Mesomphalos c. 400 B.C. 911
   United States v. Approximately Four Hundred Fifty Ancient Cuneiform Tablets, et al. 916
   Notes & Questions 927
   Problem 937
Section E. The Cultural Heritage Debate Revisited: The Role of Museums 937
CONTENTS

The Getty Saga and Its Aftermath 938
AAMD Guidelines on the Acquisition of Archaeological Material and Ancient Art (revised 2013) 945
American Alliance of Museums Standards Regarding Archaeological Material and Ancient Art 950
Notes & Questions 951
Declaration on the Importance and Value of Universal Museums 953
James Cuno, Who Owns Antiquity: Museums and the Battle over Our Ancient Heritage 953
Claire L. Lyons, Thinking about Antiquities: Museums and Internationalism 955
Notes & Questions 969
Problem 973

11 • Cultural Heritage of the United States 975
Section A. Historic Preservation 975
1. Historic Preservation and Regulatory Takings Jurisprudence 977
   Penn Central Transportation Co. v. New York City 978
   Notes 988
2. The National Historic Preservation Act 992
   a. Standing under the NHPA 993
      Pye v. United States 993
      Notes & Questions 1001
   b. Complying with the NHPA 1002
      Okinawa Dugong (Dugong Dugon) v. Mattis 1004
      Notes & Questions 1020
   c. The NHPA in the International Context 1025
Section B. Archaeological Resources on Land 1029
1. Common Law 1030
   Allred v. Biegel 1030
   Notes & Questions 1032
2. Federal Legislation 1035
   a. Antiquities Act of 1906 1035
   b. Archaeological Resources Protection Act of 1979 1037
      Notes 1037
      Problem 1038
(1) ARPA Enforcement 1039
   (a) Criminal Intent 1039
      United States v. Lynch 1039
      United States v. Quarrell 1045
      Notes & Questions 1052
   (b) ARPA Penalties 1054
      United States v. Shumway 1054
      Notes & Questions 1061
(2) Application of ARPA to Archaeological Sites Not on Federal Lands

United States v. Gerber

Note: ARPA in the International Context

Notes & Questions

3. State Legislation

a. State Statutes

b. Application of State Statutes to Private Land

Whitacre v. State

Notes & Questions

Section C. Underwater Cultural Resources

1. Law of Salvage/Law of Finds

Notes

2. Abandoned Shipwreck Act

Notes & Questions

Northeast Research, LLC v. One Shipwrecked Vessel

Notes & Questions

Problem

3. International Issues

a. The Titanic

b. Foreign Sovereign Immunity

c. International Law

12 • Indigenous Cultural Heritage

Section A. Native American Remains in the Absence of Statutory Regulation

Charrier v. Bell

Notes

Note: Native American Free Exercise of Religion

Section B. The Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA)

1. Newly Discovered Remains and Objects

Bonnichsen et al. v. United States

Notes & Questions

Note: Oral Tradition in the Courts

Catherine E. Bell & Robert K. Paterson, Aboriginal Rights to Cultural Property in Canada

2. Restitution from Museum Collections

Navajo Nation v. United States Dep't of Interior

Notes

3. Trafficking Provisions

United States v. Corrow

Notes & Question

Problem
xviii CONTENTS

Germany Act on the Protection of Cultural Property
(Cultural Property Protection Act — KGSG) 1342
Switzerland Federal Act on the International Transfer of Cultural
Property (Cultural Property Transfer Act) 1345
United Kingdom Dealing in Cultural Objects (Offences) Act 2003 1354

Table of Cases 1357
Table of Authors 1369
Index 1375
Preface to the Fourth Edition

The intersection of law with art and cultural heritage has become ever more vital, in part due to the exponential growth in the value of the art market and in part due to the tragic ongoing conflicts in much of the world. Cultural heritage now plays a central role in many of the world’s most significant events. The continuing vibrancy and excitement of this area are demonstrated by the need for the fourth edition of this casebook. Particularly striking are the pace at which new developments have occurred and the extent of current litigation.

The discipline of art and cultural heritage law has become part of the mainstream of the American law school curriculum. This casebook aims to present coherent legal doctrines in a fashion that binds together what often appear to be disparate areas of the law. This subject is increasingly important, not only because the monetary value of artworks continues to grow while the national and international legal regimes become more complex, but because we increasingly realize how important cultural heritage is to us as individuals, as communities, as a nation, and as part of our place in the international arena. Law students, practitioners and policy makers are attracted to the subject because it resonates with their sense of who they are and it will increasingly become an area of practice in the future.

Art and cultural heritage law is an inherently interdisciplinary topic drawing on history, art history, anthropology, archaeology, economics and international relations, to name just a few. This casebook brings in that interdisciplinary flavor, particularly by including images of many of the art works that were at stake in the legal disputes in which they figure.

Many individuals have contributed to the publication of this book. Several colleagues have contributed valuable suggestions for improvements in each edition. In particular, I want to thank Jane Levine, Jennifer Richman, Lucille Roussin, Leila Amineddoleh, Stephen Cribari, Lolly Gasaway, Morag Kersel, Claire Lyons, Christina Pannos and Carla Shapreau. The students in my classes at DePaul have provided valuable feedback. I owe a particular debt of gratitude to my research assistants over the years: Kelly Kuglitsch, Rebecca Martel, Elizabeth Marie Lally, and Dana Duffield, who worked on the first edition; Jennifer Marie Wegmann and Jo Ann G. Lim, who assisted with the second edition; Heather Hope Stephens, who worked on the third edition, and Joy Naifeh, Alyssa Pullara, Betina Schlossberg and Lois Wetzel who assisted with the fourth edition.
I am grateful to the many teachers from whom I have learned. Between the publication of the third and fourth editions, three founders of the field of cultural heritage law passed away: Professors David Lowenthal, John Henry Merryman and Norman Palmer. I and all of us who work in this field owe them our immense gratitude. Finally, I thank my family for their constant love, patience, and support.

Patty Gerstenblith
March 2019

Author’s note: Footnotes to the text, opinions, and other quoted materials are numbered consecutively within each chapter. Some footnotes and citations in opinions and secondary materials are omitted. The format for citations has been harmonized.
Acknowledgments

Books & Articles


Bell, Catherine E. & Robert K. Paterson, Aboriginal Rights to Cultural Property in Canada, Box of Treasures or Empty Box: Two Decades of Section 35. Copyright © 2003 Theytus Books. Reprinted by permission of Theytus Books Ltd.


Figures

Chapter 1


Fig. 1-3, page 13. Constantin Brancusi. Golden Bird. Copyright © 1916 Constantin Brancusi. Reproduced by permission of the Art Institute of Chicago, Chicago, IL, and Artist’s Rights Society (ARS), New York/ADAGP, Paris.


Chapter 2

Fig. 2-1, page 71. Andres Serrano. Piss Christ. Copyright © Andres Serrano. Courtesy of the artist and Yvon Lambert New York, Paris.

Chapter 3

Fig. 3-1, page 109. Statue of Liberty in Las Vegas (left) and the original in New York (right) with the USPS Lady Liberty stamp in the middle. Images courtesy Meredith P’s Flickrstream and Celso Flores’ Flickrstream, stamp courtesy USPS.

Fig. 3-2, page 129. James Earl Reid. Third World America. Photo copyright © 1985 Community for Creative Non-Violence and James Earl Reid. Photo by Gail Krughoff. Reproduced by permission of Community for Creative Non-Violence, Washington, D.C.

Fig. 3-3, page 140. Art Rogers. Puppies. Copyright © 1983 Art Rogers. Reproduced by permission of Art Rogers.

Fig. 3-4, page 141. Jeff Koons. String of Puppies. Copyright © 1988 Jeff Koons. Polychromed wood, 42” x 62” x 37” 106.7x157.5x94 cm. Photo by Jim Strong. Reproduced by permission of Jeff Koons.

Fig. 3-5, page 185. James Stevenson, cartoon. © 1989 James Stevenson/The New Yorker Collection/www.cartoonbank.com. All Rights Reserved.

Fig. 3-6, page 201. Andrew Leicester. Zanja Madre, Los Angeles, 1992. Copyright © Andrew Leicester. Reprinted by permission of Andrew Leicester.

Chapter 4

Fig. 4-1, page 236. Jan Martin. Symphony #1. Copyright © 1984 Jan Martin. Reproduced by permission of Jan Martin.
Chapter 5

Fig. 5-1, page 289. George F. Harding Jr’s Treasure House Castle on Lake Park Ave., “Old Gallery” with a Row of Armor. Reproduced by permission of the Art Institute of Chicago, Chicago, IL.


Fig. 5-3, page 314. Barnes Foundation Gallery. Copyright © The Barnes Foundation. Reproduced by permission of The Barnes Foundation.

Fig. 5-4, page 345. Caitlin Cass, cartoon © 2018 Caitlin Cass/The New Yorker Collection/The Cartoon Bank. All Rights Reserved.

Fig. 5-5, page 355. Charles Saxon, cartoon. © 1987 Charles Saxon/The New Yorker Collection/www.cartoonbank.com. All Rights Reserved.

Chapter 6

Fig. 6-1, page 421. Jack Ziegler, cartoon. © 2000 Jack Ziegler/The New Yorker Collection/www.cartoonbank.com. All Rights Reserved.

Chapter 7

Fig. 7-1, page 515. Charles Barsotti, cartoon. © 1993 Charles Barsotti/The New Yorker Collection/www.cartoonbank.com. All Rights Reserved.

Fig. 7-2, page 517. Kouros, Artist unknown, Greece, ca. 530 B.C.E. or a modern forgery, dolomitic marble, 206.1 x 54.6 x 51 cm. (81 1/8 x 21 1/12 x 20 1/16 in.). The J. Paul Getty Museum, Los Angeles.

Chapter 8

Fig. 8-1, page 547. Leo Cullum, cartoon. © Leo Cullum/The New Yorker Collection/www.cartoonbank.com. All Rights Reserved.

Fig. 8-2, page 558. Albrecht Dürer. Portrait of Hans Tucher. Photo courtesy of Kunstsammlungen zu Weimar. Reprinted with permission of Kunstsammlungen zu Weimar.

Fig. 8-3, page 558. Albrecht Dürer. Portrait of Felicitas Tucher. Photo courtesy of Kunstsammlungen zu Weimar. Reprinted with permission of Kunstsammlungen zu Weimar.

Chapter 9

Fig. 9-1, page 735. Iraq Museum, Warka Vase Stand. Photo courtesy of John M. Russell.

Fig. 9-2, page 739. Statue of Enmetena, King of Lagash (IM 5). Photo courtesy of John M. Russell.
Chapter 10

Fig. 10-1, page 805. Anonymous. Horsemen with Attendants Preparing to Form the Panathenaic procession, West Frieze from The Parthenon, Athens. 477-432 BCE British Museum, London. Photo © Art Resource, NY.

Fig. 10-2, page 822. Market Flow of the Illegal Trade in Antiquities. Morag M. Kersel.

Fig. 10-3, page 832. Umm al-Aqariib. Photo courtesy of the Italian Carabinieri, Republic of Italy.

Fig. 10-4a, page 857. Head of Amenhotep III. Photo © Jonathan Tokeley-Parry. Reprinted by permission of Jonathan Tokeley-Parry.

Fig. 10-4b, page 857. Head of Amenhotep III with gold paint. Photo © Jonathan Tokeley-Parry. Reprinted by permission of Jonathan Tokeley-Parry.

Fig. 10-5, page 880. Artemis and the Stag. Photograph Courtesy of Sotheby’s, Inc. © 2007.

Fig. 10-6, page 880. Guennol Lioness. Photograph Courtesy of Sotheby’s, Inc. © 2007.

Fig. 10-7, page 909. Statue of a Victorious Youth, Artist Unknown, 300 – 100 BCE. Bronze with inlaid copper (77.AB.30). 151.5 x 70 x 27.9 cm, 64.4108 k.g (59 5/8 x 27 9/16 x 11 in., 142 lb.). The J. Paul Getty Museum, Los Angeles.

Fig. 10-8a and b, page 928. Cuneiform Tablets and Bulla. Photo courtesy of the U.S. Department of Justice.

Fig. 10-9, page 939. Cult Statue of Goddess, possibly Aphrodite. Limestone and marble. H.: 7 ft 6 in. Greek, South Italy, possibly Sicily, 425-400 BCE Courtesy of the Ministeri per i Beni Culturali, Republic of Italy.

Chapter 11

Fig. 11-1, page 979. Frank English. Exterior of Grand Central Terminal. Reproduced by permission of the MTA, Metro-North Commuter Railroad, New York, NY.

Fig. 11-2, page 979. Frank English. Façade of Grand Central Terminal. Reproduced by permission of the MTA, Metro-North Commuter Railroad, New York, NY.

Fig. 11-3, page 1053. Petroglyph. Photo courtesy of USDA Forest Service, Humboldt-Toiyabe National Forest.
Chapter 12


Color Plates

Plate 1. Norman Rockwell, Shuffleton’s Barbershop. Printed by permission of the Norman Rockwell Family Agency. Copyright © 1950 the Norman Rockwell Family Entities. Illustration provided by Curtis Licensing.

Plate 2. Georgia O’Keeffe, Seaweed, 1923. Oil on Canvas, 7” x 7”. © 2019 Georgia O’Keeffe Museum/Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York.


Plate 11. The Phiale of Achyris. Hellenistic, Gold, 23 cm x 4 cm. Photo Copyright © 1997 Ira Block. Reproduced by permission of Ira Block.
