

Catholic Legal Perspectives

Catholic Legal Perspectives

THIRD EDITION

Bill Piatt

PROFESSOR OF LAW
ST. MARY'S UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2018
Bill Piatt
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 978-1-5310-0901-4
eISBN 978-1-53100-902-1
LCCN 2018944010

Carolina Academic Press, LLC
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

To my mom, Betty

To my wife, Chris

To my children:

Seana, Bob, Alicia

To my grandchildren:

Fallyn, Max, Rory, William, Julia, Noah, Caroline, Eva, and baby Spence

To my honorary granddaughter, Sophia

And, to my great-great niece, Kyara

Contents

Acknowledgments	xi
Chapter 1 • Introduction to the Sources of Law and Catholic Perspectives	3
A. Our Purpose	3
B. Introduction to the Extent and Limits of Papal Infallibility	4
<i>If The Pope Is Infallible, Why Does He Need Lawyers?</i>	4
I. Introduction	4
II. Papal Infallibility	6
A. Some Historical Perspective and Resentment	6
B. Contemporary View of Infallibility	10
C. Anti-Catholic/Anti-Pope Rhetoric Continues	13
III. “Head of State” (What State?) Immunity	15
A. Church, State, or Both?	15
B. Governance and Confusion	18
C. Attempts to Hold the Holy See Liable in the Sex Abuse Scandal	20
D. International Action Against the Vatican	22
IV. The Pope’s Lawyers	25
V. Conclusion	27
C. Our Approach	28
D. For Further Thought	29
Chapter 2 • Family Issues	31
A. Marriage	31
1. Marriage and the Legal System	31
2. The Catholic Church Views Marriage	36
B. Same-Sex Marriage	43
1. State Approaches and the Federal Response	43
2. The Catholic Church Opposes Same-Sex Marriage	47
3. Constitutional Issues—The Legal System Recognizes Same-Sex Marriage	58
a. DOMA Declared Unconstitutional	58
<i>United States v. Schlain Windsor, et al.</i>	58
b. A Constitutional Right to Same-Sex Marriage Announced	68
<i>Obergefell, et al. v. Hodges, et al.</i>	68
4. Children of Same-Sex Couples	74
a. Child Custody Suits	74

b. Gay and Lesbian People as Adoptive Parents in the Legal System	76
c. The Catholic Church Opposes Adoptions by Same-Sex Couples	77
C. Divorce, Annulment, and Separation	80
1. The Legal System	80
2. Teachings of the Church Regarding Divorce, Separation, and Annulment	84
3. The Dilemma, and the Solutions, for Catholics Who Face the Breakdown of a Marriage	87
4. The Role of the Catholic Lawyer or Judge in Divorce Proceedings	93
<i>Opting Out in the Name of God: Will Lawyers Be Compelled to Handle Same-Sex Divorces?</i>	97
I. Introduction	97
A. Right to Opt Out?	100
B. The Role of Lawyers in Same-Sex Divorces	105
II. Accommodation Not Coercion	111
D. For Further Thought	116
 Chapter 3 • Life and Death	117
A. Abortion	117
1. Catholic Church Position	118
2. Historical Perspectives	125
3. <i>Roe v. Wade</i>	130
<i>Roe v. Wade</i>	130
4. Upholding Some Abortion Restrictions	145
<i>Casey v. Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania</i>	146
<i>Gonzales v. Carhart</i>	154
<i>Whole Women's Health v. Hellerstedt</i>	171
5. Judicial Bypass	175
6. Abortion, Demographics, and Race	177
7. Harm to Women	179
B. Stem Cell Research	183
<i>Sherley v. Sebelius</i>	186
C. Miscellaneous Life Issues	196
D. Eugenics and Sterilization	206
<i>Buck v. Bell</i>	211
<i>Skinner v. Oklahoma</i>	213
E. Euthanasia	216
<i>Washington v. Glucksberg</i>	220
<i>Gonzales v. Oregon</i>	230
<i>Bush v. Schiavo</i>	234
F. Death Penalty	243
<i>Gregg v. Georgia</i>	249
G. For Further Thought	269

Chapter 4 • Who Is Allowed to Live and Work in the U.S.A.?

Immigration Issues	271
A. The Catholic Church Views on Immigration	271
B. United States Immigration Law and Policy	272
1. Who Are We?	273
2. Extreme Positions: Bill Piatt, <i>Immigration Reform from the Outside In</i>	274
a. Historical Extremes	274
b. Contemporary Extremes	277
(1) Closed Border Approaches	277
(2) Open Border Plus Amnesty	279
3. Formal Legal Structure	279
a. Citizenship	279
b. Permanent Residents	285
(1) Family Relationships	285
(2) Employment-Based Immigrants	288
(3) Diversity Immigrants	288
(4) Refugees & Asylees	288
c. Non-Immigrant Categories	290
d. Exclusions & Removals	290
C. The American Bishops Respond	290
1. USCCB: Welcoming the Stranger Among Us: Unity in Diversity	290
A Statement of the U.S. Catholic Bishops	290
2. USCCB: Frequently Asked Questions About the Catholic Church's	
Position on Immigration	294
D. Toward Reform	295
1. USCCB Views Reform	295
2. Bill Piatt: <i>Immigration Reform from the Outside In</i>	299
a. Moving Inward	299
b. Hope for Resolution	301
c. Conclusion	303
3. Voices from the Bishops of the Border Region	303
E. For Further Thought	304

Chapter 5 • Feeding the Hungry, Sheltering the Homeless, Treating the Sick 309

A. Feeding the Hungry	309
B. Housing	313
C. Health Care	313
<i>National Federation of Independent Business v. Sebelius</i>	323
<i>Burwell v. Hobby Lobby Stores</i>	332
<i>Zubik v. Burwell</i>	350
D. Education	353
<i>Goss v. Lopez</i>	354
<i>Plyler v. Doe</i>	355

<i>Texas v. Certain Named and Unnamed Undocumented Alien Children</i>	355
<i>Zelman v. Simmons-Harris</i>	359
E. Public Assistance	367
<i>Fuentes v. White</i>	368
F. For Further Thought	372
Chapter 6 • Applications	373
A. The Role of Education and Educators	373
1. Law Schools	373
a. Bill Piatt: Catholicism and Constitutional Law: More Than Privacy in the Penumbra	377
2. Undergraduate Institutions	393
3. Student Involvement	394
Hastings Christian Fellowship v. Martinez	395
B. The Role of Bench and Bar	404
1. Lawyers	404
State Bar Efforts to Deny Accreditation to Faith-Based CLE Ethics Programs Sponsored by Religiously-Affiliated Law Schools	409
<i>Town of Greece, New York v. Galloway</i>	424
2. Judges	429
C. The Role of the Church	431
D. Next Steps	433
E. For Further Thought	435
Selected Bibliography	439
Books	439
Articles	439
Reports	442
Statements & Press Releases	444
Roman Catholic Church Publications & Documents	445
Statutes & Acts	449
Cases	450
Blogs & Opinions	451
Websites Generally	452
Index	453

Acknowledgments

I am grateful to my research assistant Katja Wolf, LL.M., and to my administrative assistant Maria Vega, for their assistance.

The following entities and publications granted permission to reprint portions of previously-published material included in this book. I wish to thank them for the permission, and for their cooperation and assistance:

- Archdiocese of San Antonio, Texas
- The Journal of Catholic Social Thought
- The Scholar: St. Mary's Law Review on Race and Social Justice
- United States Conference of Catholic Bishops
- Albany Law Review
- Capital University Law Review
- Regent University Law Review

