

# Mastering Employment Discrimination Law

**CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS MASTERING SERIES**

RUSSELL WEAVER, SERIES EDITOR

For other titles, please go to [caplaw.com](http://caplaw.com).

**Mastering Administrative Law, Second Edition**

Linda D. Jellum

**Mastering Adoption Law and Policy**

Cynthia Hawkins DeBose

**Mastering Alternative Dispute Resolution**

Kelly M. Feeley, James A. Sheehan

**Mastering American Indian Law**

Angelique Wambdi EagleWoman, Stacy L. Leeds

**Mastering Appellate Advocacy and Process, Revised Printing**

Donna C. Looper, George W. Kuney

**Mastering Art Law**

Herbert Lazerow

**Mastering Bankruptcy**

George W. Kuney

**Mastering Civil Procedure, Third Edition**

David Charles Hricik

**Mastering Constitutional Law, Second Edition**

John C. Knechtle, Christopher J. Roederer

**Mastering Contract Law**

Irma S. Russell, Barbara K. Bucholtz

**Mastering Corporate Tax, Second Edition**

Gail Levin Richmond, Reginald Mombrun, Felicia Branch

**Mastering Corporations and Other Business Entities, Second Edition**

Lee Harris

**Mastering Criminal Law, Second Edition**

Ellen S. Podgor, Peter J. Henning, Neil P. Cohen

**Mastering Criminal Procedure, Volume 1:**

**The Investigative Stage, Second Edition**

Peter J. Henning, Andrew Taslitz, Margaret L. Paris, Cynthia E. Jones, Ellen S. Podgor

**Mastering Criminal Procedure, Volume 2:**

**The Adjudicatory Stage, Second Edition**

Peter J. Henning, Andrew Taslitz, Margaret L. Paris, Cynthia E. Jones, Ellen S. Podgor

**Mastering Elder Law, Second Edition**

Ralph C. Brashier

**Mastering Employment Discrimination Law, Second Edition**

Paul M. Secunda, Jeffrey M. Hirsch, Joseph A. Seiner

**Mastering Family Law**

Janet Leach Richards

**Mastering Income Tax**

Christopher M. Pietruszkiewicz, Gail Levin Richmond

**Mastering Intellectual Property**

George W. Kuney, Donna C. Looper

**Mastering Labor Law**

Paul M. Secunda, Anne Marie Lofaso, Joseph E. Slater, Jeffrey M. Hirsch

**Mastering Legal Analysis and Communication**

David T. Ritchie

**Mastering Legal Analysis and Drafting**

George W. Kuney, Donna C. Looper

**Mastering Negotiable Instruments (UCC Articles 3 and 4)  
and Other Payment Systems, Second Edition**

Michael D. Floyd

**Mastering Negotiation**

Michael R. Fowler

**Mastering Partnership Taxation**

Stuart Lazar

**Mastering Professional Responsibility, Second Edition**

Grace M. Giesel

**Mastering Property Law, Revised Printing**

Darryl C. Wilson, Cynthia Hawkins DeBose

**Mastering Secured Transactions: UCC Article 9, Second Edition**

Richard H. Nowka

**Mastering Statutory Interpretation, Second Edition**

Linda D. Jellum

**Mastering Tort Law, Second Edition**

Russell L. Weaver, Edward C. Martin, Andrew R. Klein,

Paul J. Zwier, II, John H. Bauman

**Mastering Trademark and Unfair Competition Law**

Lars S. Smith, Llewellyn Joseph Gibbons

**Mastering Trusts and Estates**

Gail Levin Richmond, Don Castleman

For other titles, please go to [caplaw.com](http://caplaw.com).



# Mastering Employment Discrimination Law

SECOND EDITION

**Paul M. Secunda**

PROFESSOR OF LAW, AND DIRECTOR, LABOR AND  
EMPLOYMENT LAW PROGRAM  
MARQUETTE UNIVERSITY LAW SCHOOL

**Jeffrey M. Hirsch**

ASSOCIATE DEAN FOR STRATEGY AND GENEVA YEARGAN RAND  
DISTINGUISHED PROFESSOR OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA SCHOOL OF LAW

**Joseph A. Seiner**

PROFESSOR OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH CAROLINA SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2018  
Carolina Academic Press, LLC  
All Rights Reserved.

**Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data**

Names: Secunda, Paul M., author. | Hirsch, Jeffrey M., author. | Seiner, Joseph A., author.  
Title: Mastering employment discrimination law / Paul M. Secunda, Jeffrey M. Hirsch, and Joseph A. Seiner.  
Description: Second edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, LLC, [2018] | Series: Carolina Academic Press mastering series | Includes bibliographical references and index.  
Identifiers: LCCN 2018008269 | ISBN 9781531010355 (alk. paper)  
Subjects: LCSH: Discrimination in employment--Law and legislation--United States.  
Classification: LCC KF3464 .S425 2018 | DDC 344.7301/133--dc23  
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018008269>

Carolina Academic Press, LLC  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, NC 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

*Dedicated to—*

*Edith Godick, may her memory be for  
a blessing (pms)*

*Lynn, Noah & Naomi (jmh)*

*Joseph and Mary Elizabeth (jas)*





# Contents

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| Table of Cases   | xix       |
| Series Editor's Foreword   | xxvii     |
| Preface  | xxix      |
| <b>Chapter 1 · Introduction to Employment Discrimination Law</b> | <b>3</b>  |
| Roadmap  | 3         |
| A. An Opening Employment Discrimination Story                    | 3         |
| B. The Scope of Employment Discrimination Law                    | 4         |
| 1. Distinguished from Labor Law                                  | 5         |
| 2. Distinguished from Employment Law                             | 5         |
| 3. Distinguished from Employee Benefits Law                      | 5         |
| 4. Issues Covered by Employment Discrimination Law               | 6         |
| C. Recurring Themes in Employment Discrimination Law             | 6         |
| D. Employment at Will and Employment Discrimination Law          | 6         |
| E. Classification of Employment Discrimination Cases             | 7         |
| 1. The Three Axes of Employment Discrimination Law               | 7         |
| 2. Individual Disparate Treatment Claims                         | 8         |
| 3. Procedural Issues for Employment Discrimination Claims        | 8         |
| F. Sources of Employment Discrimination Law                      | 9         |
| 1. Statutory Sources   | 9         |
| 2. Constitutional Sources  | 9         |
| 3. Common Law Sources  | 9         |
| G. Jurisdiction for Employment Discrimination Claims             | 10        |
| 1. Enforcement of Employment Discrimination Law                  | 10        |
| 2. Sovereign Immunity Issues                                     | 10        |
| 3. Concurrent Jurisdiction and Claim Preclusion                  | 10        |
| Checkpoints  | 12        |
| <b>Chapter 2 · Coverage</b>                                      | <b>13</b> |
| Roadmap  | 13        |
| A. Covered Employers   | 13        |

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| 1. Nontraditional “Employers”: Unions and Employment Agencies                | 14        |
| 2. Small-Employer Exception  | 15        |
| 3. Joint or Single Employers   | 16        |
| 4. Businesses Using Contingent Employees                                     | 16        |
| 5. Statutory Exclusions  | 17        |
| B. Covered Employees   | 17        |
| 1. Employee or Independent Contractor?                                       | 18        |
| 2. Employee or Owner?  | 19        |
| C. Covered Employment Actions  | 20        |
| Checkpoints  | 22        |
| <b>Chapter 3 · Administrative Procedural Issues</b>                          | <b>23</b> |
| Roadmap  | 23        |
| A. The Centrality of Procedure to Employment Discrimination Claims           | 23        |
| B. What Constitutes a Charge of Discrimination?                              | 24        |
| C. The EEOC Administrative Process   | 24        |
| 1. The Investigation of the Charge and Cause Determination                   | 25        |
| 2. EEOC Attempts at Conciliation   | 26        |
| D. Timeliness of Administrative Charges                                      | 26        |
| 1. When the Charge Must Be Filed   | 27        |
| a. When Is the Date of Discrimination?                                       | 28        |
| b. Exceptions: Harassment and Pay Discrimination Claims                      | 28        |
| c. Disparate Impact Claims   | 29        |
| 2. With Whom the Charge Must Be Filed  | 29        |
| 3. Timing After Receiving Right to Sue Letter                                | 30        |
| E. Issue and Claim Preclusion in Employment Discrimination Cases             | 31        |
| 1. Issue Preclusion (Collateral Estoppel)                                    | 31        |
| 2. Claim Preclusion (Res Judicata)   | 31        |
| Checkpoints  | 33        |
| <b>Chapter 4 · Procedural Issues in Employment Discrimination Litigation</b> | <b>35</b> |
| Roadmap  | 35        |
| A. The Relationship Between the EEOC Charge and Lawsuit                      | 35        |
| B. Mandatory Arbitration Clauses in Employment Discrimination Cases          | 36        |
| 1. Union Arbitration Cases   | 36        |

---

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 2. Non-Union Arbitration Cases  | 37 |
| C. Employment Discrimination Litigation Procedure   | 38 |
| 1. The Single-Filing Rule   | 38 |
| 2. Plaintiff Intervention in EEOC-Initiated Cases   | 39 |
| D. The Federal Complaint  | 40 |
| E. Employment Discrimination Class Actions  | 40 |
| 1. Rule 23(a) Requirements  | 40 |
| a. Traditional Rule 23(a) Practice  | 41 |
| b. Modern Day Rule 23(a) Practice   | 41 |
| c. Size of the Class  | 42 |
| d. Commonality Redefined  | 43 |
| 2. Rule 23(b) Requirements  | 43 |
| 3. The EEOC and Class Actions   | 45 |
| 4. Class Actions and Arbitration  | 45 |
| Checkpoints   | 46 |
| <b>Chapter 5 · Employment Discrimination Remedies, Settlement,<br/>    and Tax Issues</b> | 47 |
| Roadmap   | 47 |
| A. Non-Monetary Equitable (Injunctive) Relief   | 48 |
| 1. Relief Available to Plaintiffs   | 48 |
| 2. Defenses Available to Defendants   | 49 |
| 3. Third-Party Relief   | 49 |
| B. Equitable Monetary Relief  | 49 |
| 1. Entitlement to Backpay Relief  | 49 |
| a. Plaintiff's Entitlement to Relief  | 49 |
| b. Employer Defenses to Backpay Awards  | 50 |
| 2. Alternative Theories for Determining Amounts of Relief                                 | 51 |
| 3. The Availability of Frontpay under Title VII   | 52 |
| C. Damages Available Under the Civil Rights Act of 1991                                   | 53 |
| 1. Compensatory Damages Available Under Title VII   | 53 |
| 2. Punitive Damages Available Under Title VII   | 53 |
| 3. Statutory Caps for Compensatory and Punitive Damages                                   | 54 |
| D. Issues Surrounding Class Relief  | 55 |
| E. Attorney Fees and Offers of Judgment   | 56 |
| 1. Prevailing Parties and Attorney's Fees   | 56 |
| 2. Offers of Judgment Under Rule 68   | 57 |
| F. Settlement and Taxation Issues under Title VII   | 58 |
| 1. Tax Considerations for Court-Ordered Relief  | 58 |

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| 2. Tax Considerations in Settlement of Employment<br>Discrimination Claims | 59        |
| Checkpoints  | 60        |
| <b>Chapter 6 · Title VII Individual Disparate Treatment Claims</b>         | <b>61</b> |
| Roadmap  | 61        |
| A. The Single-Motive Claim   | 61        |
| 1. The Traditional Civil Single-Motive Case                                | 62        |
| 2. The <i>McDonnell Douglas</i> Single-Motive Case                         | 63        |
| a. The Employee’s Prima Facie Case   | 63        |
| b. The Employer’s Legitimate, Nondiscriminatory<br>Reason                  | 64        |
| c. Employee Ultimately Establishes Discrimination as<br>Employer’s Motive  | 64        |
| B. The Mixed-Motive Claim  | 66        |
| C. Evidentiary Issues in Individual Disparate Treatment Cases              | 69        |
| 1. Comparator Evidence   | 69        |
| 2. “Me Too” Evidence   | 70        |
| 3. Cat’s Paw Evidence  | 70        |
| 4. Same Decisionmaker Evidence   | 71        |
| 5. After-Acquired Evidence   | 72        |
| D. Employer Defenses in Individual Disparate Treatment Cases               | 73        |
| 1. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification Defense                            | 73        |
| 2. Voluntary Affirmative Action Plan Defense                               | 75        |
| Checkpoints  | 77        |
| <b>Chapter 7 · Title VII Systemic Disparate Treatment Claims</b>           | <b>79</b> |
| Roadmap  | 79        |
| A. Systemic Disparate Treatment Analysis                                   | 79        |
| 1. Establishing a Pattern or Practice of Discrimination                    | 79        |
| a. Statistical Evidence  | 80        |
| b. Evidence of Intentional Discrimination                                  | 83        |
| B. Determining Remedies for Systemic Discrimination                        | 83        |
| Checkpoints  | 84        |
| <b>Chapter 8 · Title VII Disparate Impact Claims</b>                       | <b>85</b> |
| Roadmap  | 85        |
| A. Introduction to Disparate Impact Discrimination                         | 85        |
| B. The History of Disparate Impact Discrimination                          | 86        |
| 1. The Supreme Court Establishes the Basic Disparate<br>Impact Analysis    | 86        |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| a. Establishing a Disparate Impact   | 88  |
| b. Establishing Business Necessity and Job Relatedness   | 90  |
| c. Establishing a Less Discriminatory Alternative  | 91  |
| 2. The Supreme Court Narrows the Disparate Impact Theory in <i>Wards Cove</i>  | 91  |
| a. Higher Burden for Showing Statistical Disparity   | 92  |
| b. Requiring Identification of Specific Employer Practices That Caused a Disparate Impact  | 93  |
| c. Changing Burden of Proof for Showing Business Necessity and Job Relatedness   | 94  |
| d. Redefining Business Necessity   | 94  |
| e. Redefining Nondiscriminatory Alternative  | 94  |
| C. The Current State of Disparate Impact Discrimination under Title VII  | 95  |
| 1. Establishing a Disparate Impact: Demonstrating a Statistical Disparity and Showing That It Was Caused by a Specific Employment Practice (If Possible) | 95  |
| 2. Establishing Business Necessity and Job Relatedness   | 98  |
| a. Professionally Validated Test Defense   | 99  |
| b. Bona Fide Seniority System Defense  | 101 |
| 3. Establishing a Less Discriminatory Alternative  | 102 |
| D. New Questions About Disparate Impact Discrimination Raised by the Supreme Court in <i>Ricci</i>   | 103 |
| Checkpoints  | 105 |
| <b>Chapter 9 • Sexual and Other Forms of Harassment</b>  | 107 |
| Roadmap  | 107 |
| A. Harassment Claims vs. Discrimination Claims   | 108 |
| B. Tangible vs. Non-Tangible Sexual Harassment Claims  | 108 |
| C. The Five Elements of a Sexual Harassment Claim  | 109 |
| 1. Severe or Pervasive   | 109 |
| 2. Unwelcome   | 110 |
| 3. Creates a Hostile or Abusive Workplace  | 110 |
| 4. Because of the Victim's Sex   | 111 |
| 5. Respondeat Superior Liability   | 112 |
| a. Tangible Injury Caused by Supervisory Harassment  | 113 |
| b. Non-Tangible Injury Caused by Supervisory Harassment  | 113 |
| D. Specific Types of Sexual Harassment   | 114 |
| 1. Same-Sex Harassment   | 114 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 2. Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity Issues                       | 115 |
| 3. Sexual Orientation as a Protected Class?                            | 116 |
| 4. The Equal-Opportunity or Bisexual Harasser                          | 116 |
| 5. Third-Party Harassment of Employees                                 | 117 |
| Checkpoints  | 118 |
| <b>Chapter 10 · Retaliation</b>  | 119 |
| Roadmap  | 119 |
| A. Title VII's Anti-Retaliation Provisions                             | 120 |
| 1. Opposition Clause   | 120 |
| 2. Participation Clause  | 121 |
| B. Burden Shifting Framework for Retaliation Cases                     | 121 |
| 1. Plaintiff's Prima Facie Case in Pretext Action                      | 122 |
| 2. The Defendant's Response and Pretext                                | 123 |
| 3. Mixed-Motive Retaliation Cases Not Permissible                      | 123 |
| C. Retaliation Against Third Parties                                   | 123 |
| D. Retaliation Under Other Employment Discrimination Statutes          | 124 |
| 1. Age Discrimination in Employment Act (ADEA)                         | 124 |
| 2. Civil Rights Act of 1871 (§ 1981)                                   | 124 |
| Checkpoints  | 125 |
| <b>Chapter 11 · Special Issues in Title VII Antidiscrimination Law</b> | 127 |
| Roadmap  | 127 |
| A. Special Issues Regarding Race and Color Discrimination              | 127 |
| 1. Distinguishing Race and Color Discrimination                        | 127 |
| 2. Race-Plus or Color-Plus Claims of Discrimination                    | 128 |
| 3. Other Race and Color Issues   | 129 |
| B. Special Issues Regarding National Origin Discrimination             | 131 |
| C. Special Issues Regarding Sex Discrimination                         | 132 |
| 1. Pregnancy Discrimination Act  | 133 |
| 2. Breastfeeding at Work   | 136 |
| 3. Sex-Plus Claims of Discrimination                                   | 136 |
| 4. Sex Stereotyping and Differing Dress and Grooming Standards         | 136 |
| 5. Sexual Orientation  | 139 |
| D. Special Issues Regarding Religious Discrimination                   | 139 |
| 1. Defining Protected "Religious" Employees                            | 139 |
| 2. Defining Exempted "Religious" Employers                             | 140 |
| a. Title VII's Exemption of Religious Employers                        | 140 |

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| b. Constitutional Hurdles to Applying Title VII to Religious Employers | 142 |
| 3. Religious Discrimination Under Title VII                            | 143 |
| a. Disparate Treatment and Disparate Impact                            | 143 |
| b. Failure to Accommodate Religious Practices                          | 144 |
| c. Grooming, Dress Codes, and Other Religious Accommodations           | 147 |
| Checkpoints  | 148 |
| <b>Chapter 12 · Disability Discrimination Under the ADA</b>            | 149 |
| Roadmap  | 149 |
| A. The Disability Discrimination Framework under the ADA               | 150 |
| 1. “Discriminating Against”  | 150 |
| a. Discrimination in Terms and Conditions of Employment                | 150 |
| b. Failure to Reasonably Accommodate Claims                            | 151 |
| 2. “Disabled Individual”   | 151 |
| a. “Has, Had, or Is Regarded as Having”                                | 152 |
| b. “Physical or Mental Impairment”                                     | 153 |
| c. “Substantially Limits”  | 154 |
| d. “Major Life Activities”   | 155 |
| 3. “Otherwise Qualified”   | 156 |
| a. “Essential Job Functions”   | 156 |
| b. “With or Without Reasonable Accommodation”                          | 156 |
| i. The Nature of a Reasonable Accommodation                            | 156 |
| ii. The Interactive Process  | 157 |
| iii. Reasonable Accommodation and Seniority Systems                    | 158 |
| c. “Undue Hardship”  | 159 |
| d. “Direct Threat to Self or Others”                                   | 159 |
| 4. “Because of That Individual’s Disability”                           | 160 |
| B. Other Employer ADA Defenses   | 160 |
| 1. Bona Fide Insurance Plans and Disability-Based Distinctions         | 160 |
| 2. Mental Health Parity Act  | 161 |
| C. Association Discrimination Claims                                   | 162 |
| D. Retaliation Under the ADA   | 163 |
| E. Medical Exams and Inquiries   | 164 |
| F. Procedural and Remedial Issues Under the ADA                        | 164 |
| Checkpoints  | 166 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Chapter 13 · Age Discrimination in Employment Act</b>                                    | 167 |
| Roadmap   | 167 |
| A. Introduction to the ADEA   | 167 |
| B. Coverage and Remedies  | 168 |
| C. Disparate Treatment Age Discrimination   | 169 |
| 1. Single-Motive Disparate Treatment  | 169 |
| a. The Employee’s Prima Facie Case  | 169 |
| b. The Employer’s Legitimate, Nondiscriminatory Reason                                      | 171 |
| c. The Employee Ultimately Establishes That<br>Discrimination Was the Employer’s Motive     | 171 |
| 2. Mixed-Motive Disparate Treatment   | 172 |
| 3. Systemic Disparate Treatment   | 174 |
| D. Disparate Impact Age Discrimination  | 174 |
| E. Employer Defenses  | 176 |
| 1. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification   | 177 |
| 2. Bona Fide Seniority Systems  | 178 |
| 3. Bona Fide Seniority Employee Benefit Plans   | 178 |
| F. Older Workers Benefit Protection Act Waivers   | 178 |
| Checkpoints   | 181 |
| <br>  |     |
| <b>Chapter 14 · Other Civil Rights Protection Against Employment<br/>    Discrimination</b> | 183 |
| Roadmap   | 183 |
| A. Introduction to the Post-Civil War Enactments  | 183 |
| B. Equal Protection Under the Constitution  | 183 |
| 1. Traditional Disparate Treatment Discrimination under the<br>Constitution                 | 184 |
| a. Race, Color, National Origin, and State Alienage<br>Discrimination                       | 185 |
| b. Sex Discrimination   | 185 |
| c. Discrimination Based on Other Classifications  | 186 |
| d. Sexual Orientation Discrimination  | 186 |
| e. Religious Discrimination   | 187 |
| 2. The Affirmative Action Defense Under the Constitution                                    | 188 |
| C. Prohibiting Discrimination Under the Post-Civil War Civil<br>Rights Acts                 | 190 |
| 1. Prohibiting Race Discrimination Under § 1981   | 190 |
| 2. Prohibiting the Deprivation of Federal Rights by State<br>Actors Under § 1983            | 192 |
| Checkpoints   | 194 |



---

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Chapter 15 · Equal Pay Act and Other Compensation Issues</b> | 195 |
| Roadmap   | 195 |
| A. An Introduction to the EPA                                   | 195 |
| B. The Relationship Between EPA and Title VII                   | 196 |
| C. The Allocation of Proof in EPA Claims                        | 197 |
| 1. The Plaintiff's Prima Facie Case                             | 198 |
| 2. The Defendant's Statutory Defenses                           | 199 |
| 3. Plaintiff Showing of Pretext                                 | 201 |
| D. Paycheck Fairness Act of 2009                                | 201 |
| E. Other Compensation Issues                                    | 202 |
| Checkpoints   | 204 |
| <b>Master Checklist</b>   | 205 |
| <b>Index</b>  | 209 |



# Table of Cases

## A

Adams v. Proctor & Gamble Manufacturing, 39

Adarand Constructors, Inc. v.

Pena, 184, 185, 188, 189

AFSCME v. State of Washington, 196

Albemarle Paper Co. v. Moody, 49, 91, 99

Albertsons, Inc. v. Kirkinburg, 154

Alexander v. Gardner-Denver Co., 37

Allison v. Citgo Petroleum Corp., 44

American Tobacco Co. v. Patterson, 102

Ansonia Board of Education v. Philbrook, 144

Arbaugh v. Y & H Corp., 16

Arizona Governing Committee v. Norris, 49–50, 203

Ash v. Tyson Foods, 69

Ashcroft v. Iqbal, 40

AT&T Corp. v. Hulteen, 134

AT&T Mobility LLC v. Concepcion, 45

## B

Baldwin County Welcome Center v. Brown, 31

Balin v. Carson City, Nev., 145, 147

Barrow v. Greeneville Independent School District, 144

Bates v. United Parcel Service, 163

Baustian v. State of Louisiana, 153

BCI Coca-Cola Bottling Co. of Los Angeles v. EEOC., 71

Beasley v. Health Care Service Corp., 143

Beck v. University of Wisconsin Board of Regents, 158

Belfi v. Prendergast, 201

Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly, 40

Berry v. Stevenson Chevrolet, 121

Bhandari v. First National Bank of Commerce, 191

BMW of North America, Inc. v. Gore, 54

Boumehti v. Plastag Holdings, LLC, 122

Bradley v. Pizzaco of Nebraska, Inc., 90, 130

Bragdon v. Abbott, 159

Brennan v. Prince William Hospital Corp., 196

Brown v. General Services Administration, 192

Bryant v. Begin Manage Program, 129

- Buckhannon Board & Care Home, Inc. v. West Virginia Department of Health, 57
- Bunn v. Khoury Enterprises, Inc., 158
- Burlington Industries, Inc. v. Ellerth, 109, 112
- Burlington Northern & Santa Fe Railway Co. v. White, 121, 132
- Burns v. McGregor Electronic Industries, 110
- Butts v. County of Volusia, 192
- C
- Califano v. Webster, 189
- California Brewers Association v. Bryant, 101
- California Savings & Loan Association v. Guerra, 135
- Calloway v. Partners National Health Plans, 38
- Carey v. Piphus, 53
- CBOCS West, Inc. v. Humphries, 124, 191
- Chadwick v. Wellpoint, Inc., 136
- Chevron U.S.A., Inc. v. Echazabal, 159
- Christianburg Garment Co. v. EEOC, 56
- Circuit City Stores v. Adams, 38
- City of Cleburne v. Cleburne Living Center, 186
- City of Newport v. Fact Concerts, Inc., 193
- Clackamas Gastroenterology Associates, P.C. v. Wells, 19
- Clark County School District v. Breeden, 122
- Clark v. Kraft Foods, Inc., 35
- Cline v. Catholic Diocese of Toledo, 141
- Cloutier v. Costco Wholesale Corp., 140
- Commissioner v. Banks, 59
- Community for Creative Non-Violence v. Reid, 18
- Connecticut v. Teal, 89, 93
- Corning Glass Works v. Brennan, 199
- Corporation of the Presiding Bishop of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints v. Amos, 141, 142
- County of Washington v. Gunther, 197, 200
- Crawford v. Metropolitan Government of Nashville & Davidson County, 120
- Crossman v. Marcoccio, 58
- D
- Dawavendewa v. Salt River Project, 131
- Delaware State College v. Ricks, 28
- Desert Palace, Inc. v. Costa, 51, 68, 173
- Dewitt v. Proctor Hospital, 162
- Dey v. Colt Construction & Development Co., 71
- Dole v. Shenandoah Baptist Church, 142
- Doll v. Brown, 52
- Donnelly v. Yellow Freight Systems, 11
- Dothard v. Rawlinson, 74, 88, 89, 90, 97

- Dunn v. Washington County Hospital, 117
- E
- Eatman v. United Parcel Service, 130
- Edelman v. Jordan, 193
- Edelman v. Lynchburg College, 24
- EEOC v. Catholic University of America, 142
- EEOC v. Fremont Christian School, 141
- EEOC v. Houston Funding, Ltd., 136
- EEOC v. Joe's Stone Crab, Inc., 97
- EEOC v. Olson's Dairy Queens, Inc., 82
- EEOC v. Sage Realty Corp., 139
- EEOC v. Shell Oil Co., 25
- EEOC v. Sherwood Medical Industries, Inc., 26
- EEOC v. Sidley Austin Brown & Wood, 21
- EEOC v. Waffle House, 36
- EEOC, BCI Coca-Cola Bottling Co. of Los Angeles v., 71
- EEOC, Christianburg Garment Co. v., 56
- EEOC, Ford Motor Co. v., 51
- EEOC, General Telephone Co. of the Northwest, Inc. v., 45
- EEOC, Hosanna-Tabor Evangelical Lutheran Church and School v., 143
- EEOC, Local 28, Sheet Metal Workers v., 188, 190
- EEOC, Mach Mining v., 26
- EEOC, Newport News Shipbuilding & Dry Dock Co. v., 134
- Ellison v. Brady, 111
- Employment Division, Department of Human Resources of Oregon v. Smith, 187
- Engquist v. Oregon Department of Agriculture, 184
- Epic Systems Corp. v. Lewis, 45
- Espinoza v. Farah Manufacturing Co., 131
- Estate of Thornton v. Caldor, Inc., 147
- Evans v. Georgia Regional Hospital, 116
- Ex parte Young, 193
- F
- Fabela v. Socorro Independent School District, 121
- Fallon v. Illinois, 197
- Faragher v. City of Boca Raton, 112
- Farrar v. Hooby, 56
- Federal Express Corp. v. Holowecki, 24
- Federation of African American Contractors v. Oakland, 192
- Firefighters Local 1784 v. Stotts, 49
- Fisher v. University of Texas at Austin, 76
- Fitzpatrick v. City of Atlanta, 98, 130
- Fjellestad v. Pizza Hut of America, Inc., 158
- Ford Motor Co. v. EEOC, 51
- 14 Penn Plaza LLC v. Pyett, 37
- Frank v. United Airlines, Inc., 138

Franks v. Bowman Transportation Co., 48

Fullilove v. Klutznick, 185

## G

Garcia v. Gloor, 42, 132

General Building Contractors Association v. Pennsylvania, 192

General Dynamics Land Systems v. Cline, 170

General Electric Co. v. Gilbert, 133

General Telephone Co. of South-west v. Falcon, 41

General Telephone Co. of the Northwest, Inc. v. EEOC, 45

Gilmer v. Interstate/Johnson Lane Corp., 37

Glover v. Williamsburg Local School District Board of Education, 187

Gomez-Perez v. Potter, 124

Graziadio v. Culinary Institute of America, 162

Griffin v. Michigan Department of Corrections, 52

Griggs v. Duke Power Co., 86, 98

Gross v. FBS Financial Services, Inc., 173

Grutter v. Bollinger, 76, 189, 190

Guardians Association v. Civil Service Commission of New York, 100

## H

Harlow v. Fitzgerald, 193

Harris v. Forklift Systems, Inc., 110

Harrison v. Metropolitan Government, 108

Harriss v. Pan American World Airways, Inc., 134

Hazelwood School District v. United States, 81

Hazen Paper Co. v. Biggins, 64, 171

Hensley v. Eckerhart, 56

Hicklin v. Orbeck, 186

High Tech Gays v. Defense Industrial Security Clearance Office, 187

Hill v. Lockheed Martin Logistics Management, Inc., 71

Hishon v. King & Spalding, 21

Hively v. Ivy Tech., 116

Hosanna-Tabor Evangelical Lutheran Church and School v. EEOC, 143

## I

In re Union Pacific Railroad Employment Practices Litigation, 136

Ingram v. Madison Square Garden Center, Inc., 56

International Brotherhood of Teamsters v. United States, 49, 55, 79, 83, 101

Izquierdo Prieto v. Mercado Rosa, 186

## J

J.E.B. v. Alabama ex rel. T.B., 185

Jackson v. Birmingham Board. of Education, 124

Jackson v. City of Atlanta, 192

James v. Stockham Valves & Fittings Co., 102

- Jefferson v. Ingersoll International, Inc., 44
- Jespersion v. Harrah's Operating Co., 138
- Jett v. Dallas Independent School District, 191
- Johnson v. City of Memphis, 104
- Johnson v. Georgia Highway Express, Inc., 41
- Johnson v. Nekoosa-Edwards Paper Co., 40
- Johnson v. Transportation Agency, Santa Clara County, 75
- K**
- Kern v. Dynallectron Corp., 144
- Kolstad v. American Dental Association, 54
- Korematsu v. United States, 185
- Kouba v. Allstate Insurance Co., 200
- Kremer v. Chemical Construction Corp., 31
- Kyriazi v. Western Electric Co., 55
- L**
- Larimer v. IBM Corp., 162
- Lawrence v. Texas, 115, 187
- Ledbetter v. Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co., 29, 202
- Lemon v. Kurtzmann, 142
- Lewis v. City of Chicago, 29
- Local 28, Sheet Metal Workers v. EEOC, 188, 190
- Local No. 93, International Association of Firefighters v. Cleveland, 188
- Lockard v. Pizza Hut, Inc., 117
- Locke v. Kansas City Power & Light Co., 48
- Los Angeles Department of Water & Power v. Manhart, 202
- Lubetsky v. Applied Card Systems, 143
- Lujan v. National Wildlife Federation, 123
- M**
- Mach Mining v. EEOC, 26
- Maldonado v. City of Altus, 132
- Marek v. Chesney, 57
- Mariotti v. Mariotti Building Products, Inc., 20
- Massachusetts Board of Retirement v. Murgia, 186
- McCarthy v. Philadelphia Civil Service Commission, 186
- McDonald v. Santa Fe Train Transportation Co., 64, 69, 191
- McDonnell Douglas v. Green, 63
- McKennon v. Nashville Banner Publishing Co., 51, 72
- Meachem v. Knolls Atomic Power Agency, 176
- Meritor Savings Bank v. Vinson, 108
- Mohasco Corp. v. Silver, 27
- Monell v. Department of Social Services, 193
- Monroe v. Pape, 192
- Montes v. Vail Clinic, Inc., 132
- Morriss v. BNSF Railway Co., 153
- Murphy v. United Parcel Service, Inc., 154

**N**

Nashville Gas Co. v. Satty, 133  
National Education Association v. South Carolina, 100  
National Railroad Passenger Corporation v. Morgan, 28  
Nationwide Mutual Insurance Co. v. Darden, 18  
New York Transit Authority v. Beazer, 89  
Newhouse v. McCormick & Co., 59  
Newport News Shipbuilding & Dry Dock Co. v. EEOC, 134  
Nichols v. Azteca Restaurant Enterprise, Inc., 115  
Noesen v. Medical Staffing Network, 147  
Notari v. Denver Water Department, 64

**O**

O'Connor v. Consolidated Coin Caterers Corp., 170  
Oatis v. Crown Zellerbach Corp., 38  
Ocheltree v. Scollon Productions, Inc., 117  
Oncale v. Sundowner Offshore Services, Inc., 112, 114  
Oubre v. Energy Operations, Inc., 180  
Owen v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, 31

**P**

Parents Involved in Community Schools v. Seattle School District No. 1, 76, 189

Patterson v. McLean Credit Union, 191  
Payne v. McLemore's Wholesale & Retail Stores, 122  
Pembaur v. Cincinnati, 193  
Pennsylvania State Police v. Suders, 113  
Personnel Administrator of Massachusetts v. Feeney, 184  
Phillips v. Martin Marietta Corp., 136  
Price Waterhouse v. Hopkins, 67, 115, 137, 172  
Price-Cornelison v. Brooks, 187  
Pullman-Standard v. Swint, 102

**R**

Ray v. Tandem Computers, 116  
Rayburn v. General Conference of Seventh-Day Adventists, 142  
Raytheon v. Hernandez, 160  
Reeves v. Sanderson Plumbing Products, Inc., 66, 172  
Regents of California v. Bakke, 189  
Rene v. MGM Grand Hotel, Inc., 115  
Ricci v. DeStefano, 85, 103  
Richardson v. N.Y. State Department of Correctional Service, 111  
Richmond v. J.A. Croson Co., 189  
Riddle v. Cerro Wire & Cable Group, Inc., 39  
Robinson v. Metro North Commuter Railroad Co., 44  
Robinson v. Shell Oil Co., 120  
Rochon v. Gonzales, 121  
Rogers v. American Airlines, 130



Romer v. Evans, 116, 187

Runyan v. McCrary, 191

## S

Sagana v. Tenorio, 191

Saint Francis College v. Al-Khazraji, 191

Sanchez v. Standard Brands, Inc., 35

Sanchez v. Vilsack, 157

Schafer v. Board of Public Education of the School District of Pittsburgh, Pa., 135

Schlesinger v. Ballard, 186

School Board of Nassau County v. Arline, 152

Shaare Tefila Congregation v. Cobb, 191

Shapolia v. Los Alamos National Laboratory, 144

Simon v. Harris County Sheriff's Department, 130

Smith v. City of Jackson, 175

Smith v. City of Salem, 116

Smith v. Midland Brake, 157

Sprint/United Management Co. v. Mendelsohn, 70

St. Mary's Honor Center v. Hicks, 65, 172

State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell, 54

Staub v. Proctor Hospital, 71

Steiner v. Showboat Operating Co., 117

Stout v. Baxter Healthcare Corp., 134

Sullivan v. Little Hunting Park, Inc., 124

Summer v. Altarum Institute Corporation, 153

Sutton v. United Air Lines, Inc., 152, 154

## T

Takahashi v. Fish & Game Commission, 191

Texas Department of Community Affairs v. Burdine, 64, 65, 171

Texas Department of Housing & Community Affairs v. Inclusive Communities Project, Inc., 105

Thompson v. North American Stainless, LP, 123

Townley Engineering & Manufacturing Co., 141

Toyota Motor Manufacturing v. Williams, 154

Trans World Airlines, Inc. v. Hardison, 145

Trans World Airlines, Inc. v. Thurston, 168

## U

UAW v. Johnson Controls, Inc., 73, 134

United Air Lines v. Evans, 28, 102

United States v. Board of Education of Philadelphia, 147

United States v. Burke, 58

United States v. Miami, 56

United States v. Seeger, 140

United States v. State of South Carolina, 100

United States v. Virginia, 185–86

United Steelworkers of America v. Weber, 76

- University of Alabama v. Garrett, 165
- University of Tennessee v. Elliott, 31
- University of Texas Southwestern Medical Center v. Nassar, 123
- US Airways v. Barnett, 158
- Usery v. Tamiami Trail Tours, Inc., 74
- V**
- Vance v. Ball State, 112
- Vande Zande v. Wisconsin Department of Administration, 159
- Vaughn v. Villa, 121
- W**
- Walker v. Abbott Laboratories, 190
- Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Dukes, 43, 80, 88
- Walters v. Metropolitan Education Enterprises, Inc., 15
- Wambheim v. J.C. Penney Co., 90
- Wards Cove Packing Co. v. Atonio, 91, 98, 174, 175–76
- Washington v. Davis, 100, 184
- Watson v. Fort Worth Bank and Trust, 88, 93
- Weeks v. Southern Bell Telephone & Telegraph Co., 74
- Welsh v. United States, 140
- Western Airlines v. Criswell, 74, 177
- Wheeldin v. Wheeler, 192
- Williams v. Missouri Department of Mental Health, 114
- Wilson v. Southwest Airlines Co., 74
- Wygant v. Jackson Board of Education, 188, 189, 190
- Z**
- Zamlen v. City of Cleveland, 100
- Zamora v. City of Houston, 71
- Zarda v. Altitude Express, 116
- Zipes v. Trans World Airlines, Inc., 27

# Series Editor's Foreword

The Carolina Academic Press Mastering Series is designed to provide you with a tool that will enable you to easily and efficiently “master” the substance and content of law school courses. Throughout the series, the focus is on quality writing that makes legal concepts understandable. As a result, the series is designed to be easy to read and is not unduly cluttered with footnotes or cites to secondary sources.

In order to facilitate student mastery of topics, the Mastering Series includes a number of pedagogical features designed to improve learning and retention. At the beginning of each chapter, you will find a “Roadmap” that tells you about the chapter and provides you with a sense of the material that you will cover. A “Checkpoint” at the end of each chapter encourages you to stop and review the key concepts, reiterating what you have learned. Throughout the book, key terms are explained and emphasized. Finally, a “Master Checklist” at the end of each book reinforces what you have learned and helps you identify any areas that need review or further study.

We hope that you will enjoy studying with, and learning from, the Mastering Series.

Russell L. Weaver  
Professor of Law & Distinguished University Scholar  
University of Louisville, Louis D. Brandeis School of Law



# Preface

We asked in the First Edition of this Mastering book in 2010: What would the legislators who enacted the Civil Rights Act of 1964 have thought if they were zoomed into the future and saw the current state of employment discrimination law? Did they have any idea that Title VII of that landmark legislation would lead to a vibrant and voluminous area of law? The answer in 2017 is still: Probably not. But here we are.

In the second edition of this book, we are happy to add Professor Joseph Seiner of the University of South Carolina as a co-author. Professor Seiner is a nationally prominent expert on employment discrimination law, especially in the area of employment discrimination law procedure. Consequently, Chapter 3 on Administrative Procedural Issues and Chapter 4 on Procedural Issues in Employment Discrimination Litigation have been greatly expanded and updated.

This book continues to cover all the same major points that are discussed and analyzed in most employment discrimination law courses. Although the book seeks to be accessible to students, attorneys, and others by being concise, it does cover the primary procedural and substantive issues occurring under Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, along with Chapters focused on complimentary federal statutes including: the Americans with Disabilities Act, the Age Discrimination in Employment Act, the Civil Rights Acts, and the Equal Pay Act. It is our hope that this book will provide an instructive overview of employment discrimination law, and offer an effective method for mastering this often-complex area of labor and employment law.

There are many to thank, including Series Editor Russ Weaver, Marquette University Law School, the University of North Carolina School of Law, and the University of South Carolina School of Law. Many thanks also go to research assistants Julia Mader, Dena Welden, Veronica Barkley, and Hailey Klabo.

Paul M. Secunda  
Jeffrey M. Hirsch  
Joseph A. Seiner  
March 2018

