

Understanding Employment Law

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS UNDERSTANDING SERIES

- Understanding Administrative Law,
Sixth Edition
William Fox, Jr.
- Understanding Alternative Dispute Resolution
Kristen Blankley and Maureen A. Weston
- Understanding Animal Law
Adam Karp
- Understanding Antitrust and Its Economic
Implications, Seventh Edition
E. Thomas Sullivan and Jeffrey Harrison
- Understanding Bankruptcy, Third Edition
Jeffrey Ferriell and Edward Janger
- Understanding California Community
Property Law
Jo Carrillo
- Understanding Capital Punishment Law,
Fourth Edition
Linda E. Carter, Ellen S. Kreitzberg,
and Scott W. Howe
- Understanding Civil Procedure, Sixth Edition
Gene R. Shreve, Peter Raven-Hansen,
and Charles Gardner Geyh
- Understanding Civil Procedure:
The California Edition
Walter W. Heiser, Gene R. Shreve,
Peter Raven-Hansen, and Charles Geyh
- Understanding Civil Rights Litigation,
Second Edition
Howard M. Wasserman
- Understanding Conflict of Laws,
Fourth Edition
William Richman, William Reynolds,
and Chris Whytock
- Understanding Constitutional Law,
Fourth Edition
John Attanasio and Joel Goldstein
- Understanding Contracts, Fourth Edition
Jeffrey Ferriell
- Understanding Copyright Law, Seventh Edition
Marshall Leaffer
- Understanding Corporate Law,
Fifth Edition
Arthur Pinto and Douglas M. Branson
- Understanding Corporate Taxation,
Third Edition
Leandra Lederman and Michelle Kwon
- Understanding Criminal Law,
Eighth Edition
Joshua Dressler
- Understanding Criminal Procedure:
Vol. 1: Investigation, Seventh Edition
Joshua Dressler, Alan C. Michaels,
and Ric Simmons
- Understanding Criminal Procedure:
Vol. 2: Adjudication, Fourth Edition
Joshua Dressler and Alan C. Michaels
- Understanding Disability Law, Third Edition
Mark C. Weber
- Understanding Election Law
and Voting Rights
Michael R. Dimino, Bradley A. Smith,
and Michael E. Solimine
- Understanding Employee Benefits Law
Kathryn Moore
- Understanding Employment
Discrimination Law, Second Edition
Thomas Haggard
- Understanding Employment Law,
Third Edition
Paul M. Secunda, Richard Bales, and
Jeffrey M. Hirsch
- Understanding Environmental Law,
Third Edition
Philip Weinberg and Kevin Reilly
- Understanding Estate and Gift Taxation,
Second Edition
Brant J. Hellwig and Robert T. Danforth
- Understanding Evidence, Fifth Edition
Paul C. Giannelli
- Understanding Family Law, Fourth Edition
John Gregory, Peter N. Swisher,
and Robin Wilson
- Understanding Federal and
California Evidence
Paul C. Giannelli
- Understanding Federal Courts and
Jurisdiction, Second Edition
Linda Mullenix, Martin H. Redish,
and Georgene Vairo
- Understanding Federal Income Taxation,
Sixth Edition
J. Martin Burke and Michael K. Friel

- Understanding the First Amendment,
Sixth Edition
Russell L. Weaver
- Understanding Immigration Law,
Third Edition
Kevin R. Johnson, Raquel Aldana, Ong Hing,
Leticia Saucedo, and Enid Trucios-Haynes
- Understanding Insurance Law, Sixth Edition
Robert H. Jerry, II and Douglas Richmond
- Understanding Intellectual Property Law,
Third Edition
Donald Chisum, Tyler T. Ochoa, Shubha
Ghosh, and Mary LaFrance
- Understanding International Business and
Financial Transactions, Fourth Edition
Jerold Friedland
- Understanding International Criminal Law,
Third Edition
Ellen S. Podgor and Roger S. Clark
- Understanding International Law,
Second Edition
Stephen McCaffrey
- Understanding Jewish Law, Second Edition
Steven H. Resnicoff
- Understanding Juvenile Law,
Fifth Edition
Martin Gardner
- Understanding Labor Law,
Fifth Edition
Douglas E. Ray, Calvin William Sharpe,
and Robert N. Strassfeld
- Understanding the Law of Terrorism,
Second Edition
Erik Luna and Wayne McCormack
- Understanding the Law of Zoning and
Land Use Controls, Third Edition
Barlow Burke
- Understanding Lawyers' Ethics,
Fifth Edition
Monroe H. Freedman and Abbe Smith
- Understanding Local Government,
Second Edition
Sandra Stevenson
- Understanding Modern Real Estate
Transactions, Fourth Edition
Alex M. Johnson, Jr.
- Understanding Negotiable Instruments and
Payment Systems, Second Edition
William H. Lawrence
- Understanding Nonprofit and Tax Exempt
Organizations, Second Edition
Nicholas Cafardi and Jaclyn Cherry
- Understanding Partnership and
LLC Taxation, Fourth Edition
Jerold Friedland
- Understanding Patent Law,
Third Edition
Amy Landers
- Understanding Products Liability Law,
Second Edition
Bruce L. Ottley, Rogelio Lasso, and
Terrence F. Kiely
- Understanding Property Law,
Fourth Edition
John Sprankling
- Understanding Remedies, Third Edition
James Fischer
- Understanding Sales and Leases of Goods,
Third Edition
William H. Henning, William H. Lawrence,
and Henry Deeb Gabriel
- Understanding Secured Transactions,
Fifth Edition
William H. Lawrence, William H. Henning,
and R. Wilson Freyeremuth
- Understanding Securities Law,
Seventh Edition
Marc I. Steinberg
- Understanding Taxation of
Business Entities
Walter Schwidetzky and Fred B. Brown
- Understanding Torts, Sixth Edition
John Diamond, Lawrence C. Levine,
and Anita Bernstein
- Understanding Trademark Law, Third Edition
Mary LaFrance
- Understanding Trusts and Estates,
Sixth Edition
Roger W. Andersen and Susan Gary
- Understanding White Collar Crime,
Fourth Edition
J. Kelly Strader

Understanding Employment Law

THIRD EDITION

Paul M. Secunda

PROFESSOR OF LAW AND DIRECTOR OF THE
LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT LAW PROGRAM AT
MARQUETTE UNIVERSITY LAW SCHOOL

Richard A. Bales

PROFESSOR OF LAW AND DEAN EMERITUS AT
OHIO NORTHERN UNIVERSITY PETTIT COLLEGE OF LAW

Jeffrey M. Hirsch

GENEVA YEARGAN RAND DISTINGUISHED PROFESSOR
OF LAW AT UNC SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2019
Carolina Academic Press, LLC
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Bales, Richard A., author. | Secunda, Paul M., author. |
Hirsch, Jeffrey M., author.

Title: Understanding employment law / by Paul M. Secunda,
Richard Bales, Jeffrey M. Hirsch.

Description: Third edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina
Academic Press, LLC, [2019] | Series: Understanding series |
Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019016373 | ISBN 9781531011659 (alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Labor laws and legislation—United States.

Classification: LCC KF3455 .B354 2019 | DDC 344.7301—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019016373>

e-ISBN 978-1-5310-1166-6

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

PMS:

To Mindy, Jake, and Izzy, who continue to provide constant inspiration
and support for all my work

RAB:

With love to Dennis and Emma

JMH:

To Lynn, Noah, and Naomi, with love

Contents

Preface	xvii
Acknowledgments	xix
Chapter 1 • Introduction	3
§ 1.01 Historical Overview and the Multi-Layered Nature of Employment Law	3
[A] At-Will Employment	3
[B] Workers' Compensation	4
[C] New Deal Federal Legislation	4
[D] Federal Antidiscrimination Legislation	5
[E] Federal Legislation Setting Workplace Standards	5
[F] State Legislation and Common Law	6
§ 1.02 Scope of This Book	6
Chapter 2 • Legal Boundaries of the Employment Relationship	9
§ 2.01 Employees versus Independent Contractors	9
[A] Introduction	9
[B] The Control Test	10
[C] The Economic Realities Test	11
[D] The ABC Test	14
[E] Applying the Tests to Employment Laws	14
§ 2.02 Covered Employees	16
[A] Exclusion by Statute	16
[B] Exclusion by Contract	17
[C] Contingent Workers	19
[D] On-Demand Employees	20
§ 2.03 Covered Employers	22
[A] Statutory Exemptions	22
[1] Certain Types of Employers	22
[2] The "Small Employer" Exemption	22
[B] Joint Employees	23
[C] Leased Employees	24
Chapter 3 • Historical Foundations of Employment at Will	25
Introduction	25
§ 3.01 English Origins	25
§ 3.02 Horace Wood's Treatise	27
[A] Contrasting Approaches	27

[B] Flexibility	27
[C] As Legal Scholarship	28
[D] Explanations for the Rule	28
§ 3.03 Historical Application	29
§ 3.04 Modern Application	30
§ 3.05 Evaluating the At-Will Rule	31
Chapter 4 • Contract Erosions of Employment at Will	33
§ 4.01 Express Modification of At-Will Contracts, Written and Oral	33
[A] Definite-Term Contracts	33
[B] Oral Contracts	35
[C] Statute of Frauds	36
§ 4.02 Promissory Estoppel	38
§ 4.03 Reliance and Implied-in-Fact Contracts	40
§ 4.04 Employment Manuals	42
[A] Disclaimers	44
[B] Amendments	45
§ 4.05 Contract Damages	46
Chapter 5 • Tort Erosions of Employment at Will	47
§ 5.01 Introduction	47
§ 5.02 Wrongful Discharge in Violation of Public Policy	48
[A] Defining Public Policy	48
[B] Pigeonholing Public Policy Claims	49
[1] Refusing to Commit an Unlawful Act	49
[2] Exercising a Statutory Right	49
[3] Fulfilling a Public Obligation	50
[4] Whistleblowing	50
[a] Source of Legal Protection	50
[b] Scope of Legal Protection	51
[c] Burdens of Proof	52
[d] The Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002	53
[e] Whistleblowing Lawyers	54
§ 5.03 Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress	55
[A] Introduction	55
[B] Elements	56
[1] Extreme and Outrageous Conduct	56
[2] Severe Emotional Distress	57
Chapter 6 • Good Faith and Fair Dealing	59
§ 6.01 Implied Covenant of Good Faith and Fair Dealing	59
[A] Good Faith Not Applicable to At-Will Employment	59
[B] Good Faith Protects Earned Benefits	60
[C] Good Faith Requires General Fairness	61
[D] The Restatement Approach	61

Chapter 7 • The Future of Wrongful Discharge Law	63
§ 7.01 A Brief Reprise of the At-Will Rule	63
§ 7.02 Defending the At-Will Rule	64
§ 7.03 Critiquing the At-Will Rule	65
§ 7.04 Alternatives to the At-Will Rule	66
§ 7.05 Dismissal Standards in Other Countries	67
Chapter 8 • Employee Free Speech and Political Protections	69
§ 8.01 Introduction	69
§ 8.02 The Public Workplace	69
[A] Public Employee Equal Protection Claims	71
[B] Public Employee Political Affiliation Protections	72
[C] Public Employee Free Speech: The <i>Connick/Pickering/Garcetti</i> Line of Cases	74
§ 8.03 The Private Workplace	76
[A] <i>Novosel v. Nationwide Insurance Co.</i> and Using Public Policy Torts for Political Protection	77
[B] Private Sector Employee Free Speech, the National Labor Relations Act, and Off-Duty Conduct Statutes	78
Chapter 9 • Employee Privacy Protections	81
§ 9.01 Introduction	81
§ 9.02 Privacy Claims On-the-Job	82
[A] Public Employment	82
[B] The Tort of Invasion of Privacy	85
[C] Wiretap Act and Electronic Communication and Privacy Act (ECPA)	86
§ 9.03 Privacy Claims Off-the-Job	88
[A] Legal Off-Duty Conduct	88
[1] Common Law Protections	88
[2] The Union Context	89
[3] State Off-Duty Conduct Statutes	89
[B] Romantic Relationships	90
[C] Public Employee Sexual Privacy Claims in Light of <i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	91
§ 9.04 Drug Testing	92
[A] Public Employees and the Fourth Amendment	92
[B] Private Employees and Invasion of Privacy	94
§ 9.05 Polygraphs and Honesty Testing	96
[A] Polygraph Testing	96
[B] Honesty Testing	97
§ 9.06 Genetic Testing	99
Chapter 10 • Defamation and Employment References	101
§ 10.01 Introduction	101
§ 10.02 The Tort of Defamation	101

[A] The Basic Framework	101
[1] False and Defamatory Statement	102
[2] Publication and Self-Publication	102
[3] Fault	103
[4] Special Harm	103
[B] Conditional Privileges and Abuse of Privilege	103
[C] False Light Claims	105
§ 10.03 Employment References	105
§ 10.04 Invasion of Privacy Claims	107
Chapter 11 • The Duty of Loyalty, Trade Secrets, Covenants Not to Compete, and Employee Inventions	109
§ 11.01 Introduction	109
§ 11.02 The Theory: of Human Capital and High Velocity Markets	110
[A] Rubin and Shedd on Human Capital	110
[B] Hyde on High-Velocity Markets	111
§ 11.03 The Duty of Loyalty and the Misappropriation of Trade Secrets	112
[A] Common Law Duty of Loyalty	112
[B] The Tort of Misappropriation of Trade Secrets	114
§ 11.04 Covenants Not to Compete	118
[A] Factors to Consider for Enforceability	118
[1] Employer's Legitimate Interest and Employee Unique Skills	119
[2] Duration of Covenant	120
[3] Geographic Scope of Covenant	120
[4] Adequate Consideration	121
[B] Special Issues Under Covenants Not to Compete Law	121
[1] Employees Who Are Terminated	122
[2] Blue-Penciling and Other Responses to Overbroad Covenants	122
[3] Confidentiality and Non-Solicitation Agreements	123
[4] Covenants in Employee Severance Agreements	123
[5] Employer Suits Against Subsequent Employers	124
§ 11.05 Employee Inventions	124
[A] The Common Law: The Duty to Assign and the Shop Right Rule	124
[B] Contractual Agreements	125
[C] Statutory Law: The Case of California	126
Chapter 12 • Regulation of Compensation and Leave Time	127
§ 12.01 Introduction	127
§ 12.02 Fair Labor Standards Act	128
[A] Coverage	129
[B] Child Labor	132
[C] Minimum Wage	134
[D] Overtime	136

[1] Salary Basis Test	138
[2] Duties Test	139
[a] Executive Exemption	140
[b] Administrative Exemption	142
[c] Professional Exemption	144
[E] Determining Wage Rates	145
[F] Enforcement	149
§ 12.03 Wage Payment Laws	150
[A] Overview	150
[B] Form of Wage Payment	151
[C] Wage Payment After Separation	151
[D] Restrictions on Assignment and Garnishment	152
[E] Tips	154
§ 12.04 Family and Medical Leave Act	155
[A] Coverage	156
[B] FMLA Rights	156
[1] Leave and Restoration	157
[2] Health Benefits	158
[3] Interference and Retaliation Prohibitions	159
[C] Serious Health Condition	160
[D] Notice and Certification Requirements	161
[E] Enforcement	164
Chapter 13 • Unemployment and WARN	167
§ 13.01 Introduction	167
§ 13.02 Unemployment Insurance	168
[A] History and Overview of Unemployment Insurance in the United States	168
[B] Disqualifications from Benefits	170
[1] Voluntary Separation	170
[2] Willful Misconduct	172
[3] Work Search Requirement	173
§ 13.03 Worker Adjustment and Retraining Notification Act of 1988 (WARN)	175
[A] Coverage and Notice Requirement	175
[B] Exceptions	177
[1] Faltering Company	177
[2] Unforeseen Business Circumstances	178
[3] Natural Disaster	179
[C] Enforcement	179
Chapter 14 • Employee Benefit Plans Under ERISA	181
§ 14.01 Introduction	182
§ 14.02 Employee Retiree Income Security Act of 1974 (ERISA)	183
[A] Statutory Structure	184

[B] ERISA Plans	184
[1] Types of ERISA Plans	185
[2] Plans Exempt from ERISA	185
[C] Plan Documents, Trust Requirements, and Plan Amendments	186
[D] Summary Plan Description (SPD) and Reporting and Disclosure Requirements	186
§ 14.03 Retirement Plans	187
[A] Types of Retirement Plans	187
[1] Defined Benefit Plans	188
[2] Defined Contribution Plans	188
[3] Cash Balance Plans	190
[B] Participation and Vesting Standards	190
[1] Minimum Participation Standards	190
[2] Minimum Vesting Standards	191
[C] Plan Termination Issues and the PBGC	192
[1] Distress Terminations with Insufficient Assets	193
[2] Standard Terminations with Sufficient Assets	194
§ 14.04 Health and Welfare Plans	194
[A] Introduction	194
[B] Insured versus Self-Insured Health Plans	195
[C] Health Savings Accounts and High-Deductible Health Plans	195
[D] Retiree Health Care Issues	196
[E] COBRA and Continuation of Health Coverage	197
[F] Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA)	198
[G] Affordable Care Act of 2010 (ACA)	199
§ 14.05 Common Issues to Retirement and Welfare Plans	201
[A] Fiduciary Duties Under ERISA	201
[1] The Definition of an ERISA Fiduciary	201
[2] Responsibilities of ERISA Fiduciaries	202
[a] Basic Fiduciary Duties	202
[b] Co-Fiduciary Liability and Prohibited Transactions	204
[3] Duty to Inform Cases	204
[a] Early Retirement Plan Cases	205
[b] Participant Communication Cases	205
[B] ERISA Preemption	206
[1] Section 514 “Relates to” Language	206
[2] The Savings Clause	208
[3] The Deemer Clause	209
[C] ERISA Civil Enforcement Actions	210
[1] Overview and Jurisdictional Issues	210
[2] Claims for Benefits	211
[3] Claims for Fiduciary Breaches Under Section 502(a)(2)	213
[4] Claims for Equitable Relief Under the Catch-All Provision	214
[5] Discrimination Claims Under Section 510	215

Chapter 15 • Safety and Health	217
§ 15.01 Introduction	217
§ 15.02 Occupational Safety and Health Act (OSHA)	218
[A] Coverage	218
[B] OSHA Administration	218
[C] General Duty Clause	219
[D] OSHA Standards	220
[1] Promulgation of Standards	220
[2] Interim Standards	220
[3] Emergency Temporary Standards	221
[4] Permanent Standards	222
[5] Variances	223
[6] Substantive Criteria for Evaluating and Challenging Standards	224
[a] Technological Feasibility	225
[b] Economic Feasibility	226
[c] Benefit to Employees' Health and Safety	227
[d] Cost-Benefit Analysis	228
[E] Employee Rights	229
[F] Employer Responsibilities	231
[G] Enforcement	232
[1] Procedures	233
[2] Recordkeeping and Inspections	234
[3] Penalties	235
[4] Imminent Danger	236
[5] State Regulation of Safety and Health	236
Chapter 16 • Enforcing Employment Rights	239
§ 16.01 Remedies	239
§ 16.02 Choice of Enforcement Forum — Agencies or Courts	240
[A] Administrative Agencies	240
[1] Compensation versus Fines	240
[2] Agency versus Court Adjudication	241
[B] Individual Enforcement	241
[C] Hybrid Enforcement	242
Chapter 17 • Arbitration of Employment Disputes	243
§ 17.01 Arbitration Generally	243
§ 17.02 A Brief History of Arbitration in Labor and Employment Law	244
§ 17.03 Employment Arbitration Law Today	245
§ 17.04 Current Issues in Employment Arbitration	248
§ 17.05 The Advantages and Disadvantages of Employment Arbitration	251
Table of Cases	253
Index	261

Preface

Barely 30 years ago, what today is known as “employment law” was known as “master-servant law.” The change of nomenclature is telling. Historically, “regulation” of the workplace amounted to little more than market forces and employer whims. The modern workplace, however, is governed by a complex and multifaceted legal framework that is continually evolving both as a result of federal and state statutes and as a result of decisions by state courts.

This book strikes a balance between comprehensiveness and selectivity. It provides the substantive material needed to succeed in practice and in the classroom and on final examinations, without overwhelming the reader with details that are unduly esoteric or tangential. The book begins with common-law employment doctrines such as employment at-will, employment contracts, employment torts, workplace privacy issues, and restrictive covenants. It then turns to federal and state statutory regulation of the workplace, covering topics such as compensation (including wage and hour legislation and unemployment insurance), employee benefits (including leave time, pensions, and health insurance), and workplace safety legislation.

Acknowledgments

The authors wish to acknowledge their intellectual debt to Steven Willborn, Stewart Schwab, John Burton, and Gillian Lester. Their casebook *EMPLOYMENT LAW: CASES AND MATERIALS* was the foundation upon which much of this *UNDERSTANDING* book was built.

Professor Bales thanks his co-authors, Jeff Hirsch and Paul Secunda, for their inspiration, gentle prodding, fine editing, and never-ending words of encouragement.

Professor Hirsch thanks his co-authors, Rick Bales and Paul Secunda, for their diligence, great editing, and, most importantly, good cheer throughout this project. He also is indebted to Steven Willborn for providing him the opportunity to take part in this project and to Leslia Caia and Casey Turner for their excellent research assistance.

Professor Secunda thanks his wonderful co-authors, Dean Joseph Kearney for his continual financial and institutional support of my work, and the authors of the Fifth Edition of the Willborn, Schwab, Burton & Lester book for providing a wonderful template for our own work.

