Texas Civil Procedure

Texas Civil Procedure

Pretrial Litigation

2018-2019 EDITION

William V. Dorsaneo III

Chief Justice John and Lena Hickman Distinguished Faculty Fellow and Professor of Law Southern Methodist University Dedman School of Law

Elizabeth Thornburg

Professor of Law Southern Methodist University Dedman School of Law

Elaine Grafton Carlson

Stanley J. Krist Distinguished Professor of Law South Texas College of Law

David Crump

John B. Neibel Professor of Law & Director of CLE University of Houston Law Center



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS Durham, North Carolina Copyright © 2018 Carolina Academic Press, LLC All Rights Reserved

Texas Civil Procedure: Pretrial Litigation ISSN: 2161-6485 LCCN: 2018950236

ISBN: 978-1-5310-1242-7 eISBN: 978-1-53101-243-4

Carolina Academic Press, LLC 700 Kent Street Durham, NC 27701 Telephone (919) 489-7486 Fax (919) 493-5668 www.caplaw.com

Printed in the United States of America

Table of Practice Exercises

Practice Exercise #1	61
Practice Exercise #2	
Practice Exercise #3	
Practice Exercise #4	
Practice Exercise #5	
Practice Exercise #6	
Practice Exercise #7	
Practice Exercise #8	
Practice Exercise #9	
Practice Exercise #10	
Practice Exercise #11	
Practice Exercise #12	
Practice Exercise #13	
Practice Exercise #14	
Practice Exercise #15	
Practice Exercise #16	
Practice Exercise #17	
Practice Exercise #18	
Practice Exercise #19	
Practice Exercise #20	
Practice Exercise #21	
Practice Exercise #22	532
Practice Exercise #23	
Practice Exercise #24	609
Practice Exercise #25	
Practice Exercise #26	645
Practice Exercise #27	648
Practice Exercise #28	659
Practice Exercise #29	
Practice Exercise #30	
Practice Exercise #31	691
Practice Exercise #32	
Practice Exercise #33	
Practice Exercise #34	

Contents

Introduction	xxi
Chapter 1 \cdot The Pre-Litigation Phase of a Civil Dispute	3
§ 1.01 Overview of the Pre-Trial Process	3
§1.02 Initiating the Attorney-Client Relationship	6
[A] Fees and Fee Contracts	6
[1] Propriety of Fee	6
[2] Client's Consent to Split Fee	7
[3] Contingent Fee Contracts	8
[4] Informing Client of Fee	8
Hoover Slovacek LLP v. Walton	9
Notes and Questions	16
Notes and Questions	19
[B] Avoiding Conflicts of Interest	21
[1] General Rule	21
[2] Prohibited Transactions	21
[a] Business Transactions	21
[b] Gifts	22
[c] Literary Rights	22
[d] Acquisition of Proprietary Interest	22
[e] Payment for Legal Services	22
[f] Aggregate Settlement	23
[g] Limitation of Liability	23
[3] Former Client	23
\$1.03 Case Evaluation, Acceptance, and Settlement	24
§1.04 Pre-Litigation Fact-Gathering: Investigation and Interviewing	27
§1.05 When to File the Lawsuit: Compliance With Preliminary	
Procedural Requirements Imposed by Statute	35
§1.06 When to File the Lawsuit: Statutes of Limitations and Statutes of	
Repose	40
S.V. v. R.V.	48
Notes and Questions	55
Practice Exercise #1	61
Chapter 2 · Emergency and Interim Relief (Special Remedies)	63
\$2.01 Temporary Restraining Orders and Injunctions	63

Note	67
Charter Medical Corp. v. Miller	68
\$2.02 Interim Relief for Secured Creditors and Other Claimants	69
[A] Sequestration	69
Monroe v. General Motors Acceptance Corp.	72
[B] Notice of Lis Pendens	74
[C] Self-Help Repossession by Secured Party	76
§2.03 Interim Relief for the General (Unsecured) Creditor	76
[A] Attachment	76
[B] Prejudgment Garnishment	79
Practice Exercise #2	82
§2.04 Wrongful Use of Special Remedies	82
Chandler v. Cashway Building Materials, Inc.	82
Barfield v. Brogdon	86
Notes and Questions	89
Chapter 3 · The Subject Matter Jurisdiction of the Texas Trial Courts	91
\$3.01 An Overview of the Texas Court System	91
[A] The Texas Appellate Courts	91
[B] A Simplified Description of the Texas Trial Courts	91
§3.02 Constitutional and Statutory Provisions: An Overview	92
[A] Justice Courts	93
[B] Constitutional County Courts	95
[C] Statutory Courts	98
[D] District Courts	101
[E] Shared Jurisdiction; District and County Level Courts	103
[F] Shared Jurisdiction, Filing, and Transfer	105
[1] Adjudicative Responsibility and Transfer: District Courts	
and Statutory Courts	105
[2] Adjudicative Responsibility and Transfer in Cases Involving	
Eminent Domain and Probate	107
[G] Summary	109
Practice Exercise #3	109
§3.03 Amount in Controversy	111
[A] General Rule	111
[B] Increase Above Court's Maximum	111
United Services Automobile Association v. Brite	112
Notes and Questions	115
[C] Non-Monetary Relief	116
[D] Included and Excluded Elements of Recovery	117
[E] Multiple Parties	118
[F] Counterclaims, Cross-Claims, and Third-Party Claims	119
Practice Exercise #4	120
[G] Defective Pleading of Amount in Controversy	120

Peek v. Equipment Service Co.	121
Notes and Questions	123
§3.04 Competing Jurisdictional Grants: Particular Controversies	124
[A] The District Court Land-Title Grant Collides With the	
Justice Court: Forcible Entry and Detainer	124
Dass, Inc. v. Benjie Smith d/b/a/ Oak Cliff Metals	124
Notes and Questions	126
[B] Problems With Probate Jurisdiction	129
[1] Statutory Probate Courts	129
[a] Generally	129
[b] Estates Code	129
Practice Exercise #5	134
[2] Pull-Down Jurisdiction vs. Venue	134
Gonzalez v. Reliant Energy, Inc.	135
Notes	138
Practice Exercise #6	139
§ 3.05 Justiciability, Standing, and Related Doctrines	140
§3.06 Consequences of Lack of Jurisdiction Over the Subject Matter	
and Related Problems	144
Vale v. Ryan	145
Notes and Questions	148
Appendix: Subject Matter Jurisdiction and the Texas Bar Exam	150
Chapter 4 · Jurisdiction of Persons and Property	153
\$4.01 General Principles Governing Jurisdiction	153
[A] Territoriality	153
[B] The "Minimum Contacts" Doctrine	154
[C] Specific vs. General Jurisdiction	154
[D] Other Bases of Jurisdiction	155
[1] Consent	155
[2] In Rem and Quasi in Rem Jurisdiction	155
[3] Transient Jurisdiction	156
§4.02 Personal Jurisdiction in Texas	157
[A] The General Long-Arm Statute	157
Notes and Questions	158
Practice Exercise #7	163
[B] Texas Courts Apply the Statute and Constitution:	
Specific Jurisdiction	164
[1] Purposeful Availment, Fair Play and Substantial Justice	164
Guardian Royal Exchange v. English China Clays	164
[2] Stream of Commerce Cases	172
CMMC v. Salinas	174
Michiana Easy Livin' Country, Inc. v. Holten	177
Notes and Questions	184

CONTENTS

[C] Texas Courts Apply the Statute and Constitution:	
General Jurisdiction	188
[1] Distinguishing Specific and General Jurisdiction:	
The Substantial Connection Test	188
Moki Mac River Expeditions v. Drugg	189
Notes and Questions	195
Practice Exercise #8	196
[2] The "Essentially at Home" Test for General Jurisdiction	197
Notes and Questions	199
Practice Exercise #9	200
[D] Internet Contacts and Jurisdiction	201
Choice Auto Brokers, Inc. v. Dawson	201
Notes and Questions	203
[E] Consent	204
§4.03 Other Long-Arm Statutes: The Family Code	205
In re Forlenza	207
Notes and Questions	213
\$4.04 Service of Process	217
[A] Due Process Requirements	217
Peralta v. Heights Medical Center, Inc.	218
Notes and Questions	218
[B] Texas' Statutory and Rule-Based Requirements	221
[1] The Strict Compliance Standard	221
Wilson v. Dunn	222
Notes	226
[2] Techniques of Service	227
[a] Issuance and Service of Citation	227
[b] Serving Persons in Texas—Basic Methods	228
[c] Alternative Methods of Service	229
[d] Waiving Service of Process	230
[e] Pre-Filing Waivers in Cases Terminating Parental Rights	230
[f] Service of Amended Pleadings	231
[g] Service of Cross-Claims and Counterclaims	231
[3] Service of Process and the Statute of Limitations	231
[4] Proof of Service: The Return	233
[a] Personal Service	233
[b] Certified or Registered Mail Service	233
[c] Returns for Alternative Service	234
[d] Amending Flawed Returns	234
Bavarian Autohaus, Inc. v. Holland	234
[5] Citation by Publication	236
[a] Generally	236
[b] Specific Uses	236
Notes and Questions	237

[6] Special Requirements for Service on the Secretary of	
State Under the General Texas Long-Arm Statute	237
[a] Pleading Requirements	237
McKanna v. Edgar	238
[b] Method of Service	239
[c] Proof of Long-Arm Service: The Return	239
Campus Investments, Inc. v. Cullever	240
[7] An Alternate Way to Serve Nonresident Defendants—	
Rule 108	242
Practice Exercise #10	242
§4.05 Challenges to Jurisdiction by Nonresidents	243
[A] The Special Appearance	243
[1] History and Procedure	243
Notes and Questions	246
[2] Strict Compliance Standard?	248
Dawson-Austin v. Austin	248
Notes and Questions	258
[B] Postjudgment Challenges by Nonresidents	258
Practice Exercise #11	260
§4.06 The Doctrine of Forum Non Conveniens	261
[A] The Common Law Doctrine	261
[B] The Statute	263
In re General Electric Company	265
Notes and Questions	272
Appendix: Personal Jurisdiction and the Texas Bar Exam	273
Chapter 5 · Venue	277
§ 5.01 The Basic Venue Scheme	277
[A] Defendant's Residence (Natural Persons)	278
Mijares v. Paez	278
Notes and Questions	279
[B] Defendant's Principal Office (Legal Persons)	280
In re Missouri Pacific Railroad Co.	281
Notes and Questions	286
[C] County in Which All or a Substantial Part of the Events or	
Omissions Giving Rise to the Claim Occurred	287
[1] Tort Claims	287
Velasco v. Texas Kenworth Co.	287
Note	290
[2] Contract Claims	290
KW Construction v. Stephens & Sons Concrete Contractors, Inc.	290
Note	295
[D] Transfer Based on Convenience	295
§5.02 Exceptions to the General Rule	297

[A] Types of Exceptions	297
[B] Mandatory and Permissive Exceptions	298
Practice Exercise #12	303
[C] Multiple Claims and Parties	304
[1] Multiple Claims	305
Practice Exercise #13	306
[2] Multiple Defendants	306
Practice Exercise #14	307
[3] Multiple Plaintiffs; Intervention	307
Surgitek, Bristol-Myers Corp. v. Abel	309
Notes and Questions	310
Practice Exercise #15	312
[D] Counterclaims, Cross-Claims, and Third Party Actions	312
§5.03 Litigating Venue Rights	313
[A] Raising the Issue of Improper Venue	313
[B] Venue "Hearings"	314
Practice Exercise #16	319
Carlile v. RLS Legal Solutions, Inc.	320
Notes and Questions	323
[C] Appellate Review of Venue Rulings	327
[1] The Standard of Review on Appeal	327
[2] Reversible Error	330
Wilson v. Texas Parks and Wildlife Dept.	330
Notes and Questions	333
§5.04 Contracting for Venue	334
§5.05 Change of Venue Because Impartial Trial Cannot Be Had	336
Notes and Questions	336
§5.06 Multidistrict Litigation	338
Chapter 6 · Pleadings	351
\$6.01 Historical Background	351
\$6.02 An Overview of Texas Pleadings and Their Functions	353
[A] Plaintiff's Pleadings	353
[B] Defendant's Pleadings	353
\$6.03 Sample Pleadings	355
Notes and Questions	358
\$6.04 Plaintiff's Petition	359
[A] General Considerations and Formal Elements	359
[B] Pleading a "Cause of Action"	360
[1] Defining the Term "Cause of Action"	360
Notes and Questions	361
[2] The "Fair Notice" Concept	362
Castleberry v. Goolsby Bldg. Corp.	362
City of Houston v. Crabb	364
Guy 0, 1100,500 V. Chubb	504

xii

Notes and Questions	365
[3] "Fair Notice" of Factual Claims	369
White v. Jackson	369
Willock v. Bui	372
Notes and Questions	374
[4] Fair Notice: A Sample Dispute	375
Notes and Questions	381
[5] Pleading Injuries and Damages	382
Weingartens, Inc. v. Price	383
Notes and Questions	384
[6] Alternative or Hypothetical Claims	385
Birchfield v. Texarkana Memorial Hosp.	385
[7] The "Demand for Relief"; Prayer	387
[8] Certification and Sanctions for Frivolous Pleadings	
and Motions	388
Notes and Questions	390
§6.05 Motions to Dismiss Baseless Causes of Action	395
[A] Dismissal Standards	395
[B] Recovery of Fees and Costs to Prevailing Party	397
[C] Motion Practice; Conduct of Hearings	397
[1] Contents of Motion	397
[2] Time for Motion and Hearing	397
[3] Effect of Nonsuit; Withdrawal of Motion	397
[4] Effect of Amendment of Petition	398
[5] Notice of Hearing; Evidence	398
[D] Relationship of Motion to Due Order Pleading Rules and	
Special Exception Practice	398
[1] Special Exception Practice	398
[2] Due Order Pleading Rules	398
§6.06 Defendant's Answer	399
[A] Contents and Primary Function of the Answer	399
[B] Use of Defensive Pleas	399
Practice Exercise #17	399
[C] Special Exceptions	400
McCamey v. Kinnear	400
Notes and Questions	403
Practice Exercise #18	408
[D] The Plea in Abatement	409
Wyatt v. Shaw Plumbing Co.	409
Notes and Questions	412
[E] Plea to the Jurisdiction	414
Texas Department of Parks and Wildlife v. Miranda	414
Notes and Questions	420
[F] The General Denial	421

Bahr v. Kohr	421
Notes and Questions	424
[G] Special Denials	424
[1] Conditions Precedent	424
Dairyland County Mutual Ins. Co. of Texas v. Roman	424
Notes and Questions	426
[2] Verified Denials—Execution	428
Bauer v. Valley Bank of El Paso	428
Notes and Questions	429
[3] Verified Denials—Capacity	430
Practice Exercise #19	432
[H] Affirmative Defenses	432
Echols v. Bloom	433
Notes and Questions	434
§6.07 Amended and Supplemental Pleadings	436
[A] Amended Pleadings	436
Burnett v. File	437
Greenhalgh v. Service Lloyds Ins. Co.	439
Notes and Questions	442
[B] Supplemental Petitions and Answers	443
Royal Typewriter Co. v. Vestal	443
Notes and Questions	445
Practice Exercise #20	446
§6.08 Specialized Pleading Forms	446
[A] The Sworn Account Petition	446
Panditi v. Apostle	446
[B] Types of Claims and Procedural Requirements	449
[C] Standard "Sworn Account" Petition	452
Notes and Questions	454
[D] Trespass to Try Title	455
[1] General Requirements	455
[2] The Declaratory Judgment Alternative	456
Notes and Questions	458
Appendix: Pleadings and the Texas Bar Exam	459
Chapter 7 · Parties	465
§ 7.01 Permissive Joinder of Claims	465
\$7.02 Permissive Joinder of Parties by the Plaintiff	466
Russell v. Hartford Casualty Ins. Co.	466
Notes and Questions	470
§7.03 Joinder of Claims by the Defendant	474
[A] Counterclaims	474
Ingersoll-Rand Co. v. Valero Energy Corp.	474
Jack H. Brown & Co. v. Northwest Sign Co.	479

Notes and Questions	484
[B] Cross-Claims	487
Notes and Questions	487
§7.04 Permissive Joinder of Parties by the Defendant	488
Notes and Questions	490
Practice Exercise #21	493
§7.05 Intervention; Voluntary Joinder of New Parties	493
In re Union Carbide Corporation	493
Notes and Questions	497
§7.06 Interpleader	499
Clayton v. Mony Life Ins. Co. of America	500
Notes and Questions	505
§7.07 Compulsory Joinder of Parties	506
Brooks v. Northglen Association	506
Notes and Questions	510
§7.08 Class Actions	512
[A] Texas Supreme Court's Approach to Class Certification	512
Southwestern Refining Company, Inc. v. Bernal	513
[B] Types of Class Actions	522
[1] Generally	522
[2] (b)(1)(A) Classes	523
[3] (b)(1)(B) Classes	523
[4] (b)(2) Classes	524
[5] (b)(3) Classes	524
Notes and Questions	525
Practice Exercise #22	532
Appendix: Parties and the Texas Bar Exam	533
Chapter 8 · Preclusion Doctrines	535
§8.01 Preclusion	535
[A] Claim Preclusion: The Doctrine of Merger and Bar	535
Barr v. Resolution Trust Corp.	537
Getty Oil Co. v. Insurance Co. of N. America	541
Martin v. Martin, Martin & Richards, Inc.	544
Notes and Questions	546
[B] Issue Preclusion: Collateral Estoppel	547
[1] Basic Elements	547
Notes and Questions	547
[2] The Doctrine of Mutuality	549
Hardy v. Fleming	549
Notes and Questions	552
§8.02 Parties Bound by Prior Adjudications	552
Benson v. Wanda Petroleum Company	552
Notes and Questions	554

§8.03 Election of Remedies	556
Bocanegra v. Aetna Life Ins. Co.	556
Notes and Questions	563
§8.04 The Law of the Case Doctrine	565
Hudson v. Wakefield	565
Notes	568
Chapter 9 \cdot Discovery: Purposes, Scope, and Uses	569
§9.01 An Introduction to the Purposes and Scope of Discovery	569
[A] Objectives of Discovery	569
[B] The Scope and Limits of Discovery	570
[C] The Ultimate Policies Underlying the Discovery Rules	571
[D] Limits Created by the "Discovery Levels"	572
[1] Level 1 Plans	572
[2] Level 2 Plans	573
[3] Level 3 Plans	574
§9.02 Discovery and Attorney Obligations	575
[A] Discovery and Ethical Rules	575
[B] Beyond the Ethical Minimum: Lawyer Professionalism	
and Discovery	576
The Texas Lawyer's Creed	576
Notes and Questions	579
§ 9.03 The Scope of Discovery: "Relevant" Information, "Not Privileged"[A] The Discovery "Relevance" Standard; Information "Reasonably	580
Calculated" to Lead to Admissible Evidence	580
[1] The Relevance Test Generally	581
K Mart Corp v. Sanderson	581
In re C.S.X. Corp.	582
In re National Lloyds Insurance Co.	586
Notes and Questions	588
[2] Special Relevance Issues	589
[a] Witnesses, Witness Statements, People with Knowledge,	
and Contentions	589
[b] Insurance Policies and Settlement Agreements	590
In re Dana Corp.	590
Notes and Questions	593
[c] Net Worth	594
[d] Information Sought Solely for Impeachment	595
Practice Exercise #23	596
[B] Privileges and Other Limits on Discovery	597
[1] The Discovery Rule Privileges	598
[a] Work Product	598
National Tank Co. v. Brotherton	600
[b] The Problem of Witness Statements	605

In re Team Transport, Inc.	605
Notes and Questions	608
Practice Exercise #24	609
[c] Expert Witnesses	610
Lindsey v. O'Neill	610
Axelson, Inc. v. McIlhany	612
Tom L. Scott, Inc. v. McIlhany	614
Notes and Questions	616
Practice Exercise #25	620
[2] Other Discovery Privileges	620
[a] Constitutional Privileges	620
[b] Privileges Based on the Texas Rules of Evidence	621
Notes and Questions	625
In re Continental General Tire, Inc.	626
[c] Other Statutory Privileges	632
§9.04 Preservation and Waiver of Privileges	636
[A] Preservation of Privileges; Written Discovery	636
In re E.I. Dupont de Nemours & Co.	640
Practice Exercise #26	645
[B] Involuntary and Inadvertent Disclosure	646
Practice Exercise #27	648
[C] Waiver by Offensive Use	648
Appendix: Scope of Discovery and the Texas Bar Exam	649
Chapter 10 · Discovery: Methodology of the Individual Devices	655
§10.01 The Individual Discovery Devices: An Introduction	655
[A] The Discovery Devices Provided by the Rules	655
[B] Discovery Timing	657
Practice Exercise #28	659
§10.02 Discovery Devices	660
[A] Written Discovery	660
[1] Requests for Disclosure	660
Notes and Questions	661
[2] Interrogatories to Parties	662
Notes and Questions	663
Practice Exercise #29	663
[3] Production and Inspection of Documents and Tangible	
Things From Parties	664
[a] In General	664
In re Kuntz	665
Notes and Questions	669
[b] Electronic Discovery	670
In re Weekley Homes, L.P.	670
Notes and Questions	681

[4] Getting Documents and Things From Nonparties by	
Subpoena Without Deposition	682
Notes and Questions	683
Practice Exercise #30	683
[5] Requests for Admissions	684
Stelly v. Papania	685
Wheeler v. Green	687
Notes and Questions	690
Practice Exercise #31	691
[B] Oral and Other Non-Written Discovery	691
[1] Depositions—General Considerations	691
[2] Notice and Formalities for Depositions	692
Notes and Questions	693
[3] Conduct During Oral Depositions	701
Notes and Questions	702
Practice Exercise #32	702
[4] Use of Depositions at Hearings or Trials	703
Notes and Questions	704
Practice Exercise #33	705
[5] Motions for Physical or Mental Examinations	706
Coates v. Whittington	706
Notes and Questions	710
§10.03 Amendment and Supplementation of Discovery Responses	711
Alvarado v. Farah Mfg. Co., Inc.	711
Notes and Questions	716
§10.04 Sanctions for Failure to Provide Discovery	719
Transamerican Natural Gas v. Powell	719
Notes and Questions	725
Practice Exercise #34	728
Appendix: Discovery Devices and the Texas Bar Exam	729
Chapter 11 · Disposition Without Trial	739
§11.01 Judgment by Default	739
Morgan v. Compugraphic Corp.	740
Notes and Questions	743
§11.02 Summary Judgment	745
[A] Standards and Procedure for Granting	745
[1] Traditional Motions	745
Science Spectrum, Inc. v. Martinez	748
[2] No Evidence Motions	750
Moore v. K Mart Corp.	751
Notes and Questions	756
[3] Hybrid Motions	757
[B] Procedure and Evidence	758

[1] Summary Judgment Proof	758
Kerlin v. Arias	758
[2] Preserving Complaints About Summary Judgment Evidence	759
Mathis v. Bocell	760
Notes and Questions	767
Cooper v. Circle Ten Council Boy Scouts of America	772
Appendix: Disposition Without Trial and the Texas Bar Exam	775
Chapter 12 \cdot Settlement and Alternative Dispute Resolution	779
\$12.01 Settlement and Its Effects	779
[A] General Attributes of Settlement Agreements	779
[B] Offers of Settlement Under Rule 167	781
[C] The Effects of Settlement on Remaining Claims	785
McMillen v. Klingensmith	785
Notes and Questions	788
[D] The Consent Judgment/Enforcement of the Settlement	794
Leal v. Cortez	794
Notes and Questions	800
§ 12.02 Alternate Dispute Resolution	801
[A] ADR Overview	801
[B] Mediation	803
[1] The Third-Party Facilitator—Qualifications	803
[2] Duties of Impartial Third Parties	804
[3] Impartiality of Third Parties	804
[4] Orders to Mediate	805
[C] Arbitration	812
[D] Other Types of ADR	818
[1] Mini-Trial	818
[2] Moderated Settlement Conference	819
[3] Summary Jury Trial	820
Appendix: Settlement, ADR, and the Texas Bar Exam	821
Table of Cases	823
Index	841