

Constitutional Law

Structure and Rights in Our Federal System

EIGHTH EDITION

William C. Banks

Board of Advisors Distinguished Professor Professor of Law Emeritus Syracuse University College of Law

Daan Braveman

President Emeritus Nazareth University
Former Dean Syracuse University College of Law

Rodney A. Smolla

President
Vermont Law and Graduate School



Copyright © 2024 Carolina Academic Press All Rights Reserved

ISBN 978-1-5310-1266-3 eISBN 978-1-5310-1267-0 LCCN 2023944568

Carolina Academic Press, LLC 700 Kent Street Durham, NC 27701 (919) 489-7486 www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America



Contents

Table of	Cases	xvii
Preface		xxix
Chapter	1 · The Origins: "We the People" — Where Does Power Reside	
in Ou	r Constitutional System?	3
§ 1.01	Introduction	3
§1.02	An Historical Prologue to the Constitution	4
	A. Pre-Colonial Constitutional Theory	4
	B. From the Colonies to the Convention	4
	C. The Constitutional Convention of 1787	6
§ 1.03	Conceptions of Sovereignty: The National Government,	
	the States, and the People	8
	A Case Study of Gun Control	9
	Notes and Questions	11
§1.04	The Final Word? — The Judicial Review Doctrine	12
	Marbury v. Madison	13
	Notes and Questions	21
§1.05	Judicial Review of Executive Action	23
	United States v. Nixon	23
	Trump v. Vance	30
	Notes and Questions	33
	Problem A	36
§1.06	Judicial Review of State Action	37
	Martin v. Hunter's Lessee	37
	Notes and Questions	41
§1.07	Contemporary Sovereignty Problems	42
	Cooper v. Aaron	42
	Notes and Questions	44
Chapter	2 · Separation of Powers: Constitutional Checks and Balances	47
\$2.01	An Historical Overview	47
	A. The English Heritage	47
	B. Bringing Separation Theory to America	49
	C. From the Convention to Current Doctrine	51

viii CONTENTS

	D. The Court Walks a Tightrope: Accommodating	
	Separation's Diverse Goals	53
\$ 2.02	How Are Separation of Powers Disputes Decided? — An	
	Introductory Case Study	55
	Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer [The Steel Seizure Case]	55
	Notes and Questions	67
	Problem A	69
\$ 2.03	Limits on the Elected Branches: Oversight and Accountability	
	in the Administrative State	69
	A. Introduction	69
	B. Delegation of Legislative Power	70
	Gundy v. United States	72
	Problem B	77
	Notes and Questions	78
	C. Too Much Oversight: The Legislative Veto	81
	Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Chadha	81
	Notes and Questions	95
	D. Executive Control Over the Appointment and Removal	
	of Officials	96
	Morrison v. Olson	96
	Seila Law LLC v. Consumer Financial Protection Bureau	100
	Notes and Questions	103
	Problem C	105
	E. Line Item Veto	106
	Clinton v. City of New York	106
	Notes and Questions	115
	F. Executive Privilege, Presidential Immunity from Lawsuit, and Con	-
	gress' Power of Impeachment	115
	Trump v. Mazars USA, LLP	116
	Notes and Questions	120
	Clinton v. Jones	121
	Notes and Questions	123
\$ 2.04	Limits on the Elected Branches: Foreign Relations and	
	the War Powers	125
	A. Foreign Relations Powers	125
	United States v. Curtiss-Wright Export Corporation	125
	Zivotofsky v. Kerry	128
	Notes and Questions	136
	B. War Powers	140
	Prize Cases	140
	Notes and Questions	142
	Hamdi v. Rumsfeld	143
	Problem D	159

CONTENTS ix

§ 2.05	Limits on Judicial Power — The Justiciability Doctrines	159
	A. Introduction	159
	1. Legitimacy	160
	2. Efficiency	161
	3. Tyranny	162
	B. Political Questions	162
	Powell v. McCormack	164
	Nixon v. United States	166
	Notes and Questions	170
	C. Standing to Sue	170
	Notes and Questions — Citizen Plaintiffs	171
	Notes and Questions — Congressional Plaintiffs	173
	Notes and Questions — States as Plaintiffs	174
	D. Ripeness	176
	Trump v. New York	176
	Notes and Questions	181
	Problem E	181
•	3 · Federalism Limits on Federal Courts	183
§ 3.01	Historical Overview	183
	A. The What and Why of Federalism	183
	B. The Constitutional Convention	185
	1. Federalism Concerns and the National Legislature	186
	2. Federalism Concerns and the National Judiciary	186
	3. Federalism Concerns and the National Executive	187
	C. The Ratification Debates	188
	D. Federalism From the 1780s to the Twenty-First Century	190
	1. The Pre-Civil War Period	191
	2. From the Civil War to the New Deal	192
	3. Modern Federalism	194
	E. The Role of the Tenth Amendment and "Considerations	
	of Federalism" in Deciding Cases	195
	Introduction: Federalism and the Judiciary	196
\$3.03	Eleventh Amendment	198
	Hans v. Louisiana	198
	Notes and Questions	200
	Ex parte Young	201
	Notes and Questions	205
	Edelman v. Jordan	205
	Notes and Questions	212
	Seminole Tribe of Florida v. Florida	216
	Notes and Questions	229
	Problem A	231

x CONTENTS

Chapter	4 · Federalism Limits on the Elected Branches and on the States	233
§ 4.01	Introduction	233
§ 4.02	Scope of Federal Power	236
	McCulloch v. Maryland	236
	Notes and Questions	243
	Problem A	244
§ 4.03	Congressional Power to Regulate Interstate Commerce	245
	A. The Emergence of Dual Sovereignty	245
	Gibbons v. Ogden	245
	Notes and Questions	248
	United States v. E.C. Knight Co.	249
	Notes and Questions	252
	Hammer v. Dagenhart	254
	Notes and Questions	258
	Problem B	259
	B. The New Deal and Beyond	259
	A.L.A. Schechter Poultry Corporation v. United States	259
	Notes and Questions	263
	United States v. Darby	266
	Katzenbach v. McClung	270
	Notes and Questions	273
	United States v. Lopez	274
	Gonzales v. Raich	284
	Notes and Questions	298
	Problem C	303
§ 4.04	Congressional Power to Enforce Civil Rights	304
	Tennessee v. Lane	309
	Notes and Questions	320
§ 4.05	Tenth Amendment Limits on Congressional Power?	320
	Garcia v. San Antonio Metropolitan Transit Authority	322
	Notes and Questions	326
	New York v. United States	326
	Notes and Questions	334
	Printz v. United States	335
	Notes and Questions	346
§ 4.06	Putting the Pieces Together: Commerce Clause, Necessary and Pro	per
	Clause, Spending Clause	350
	National Federation of Independent Business v. Sibelius	351
	Notes and Questions	365
	Problem D	365
§ 4.07	Constitutional Limits on State Regulation of Commerce: The Dorn	nant
	Commerce Clause	366
	Gibbons v. Ogden	368

CONTENTS xi

	City of Philadelphia v. New Jersey	369
	Notes and Questions	372
	C & A Carbone, Ind. v. Town of Clarkstown	374
	United Haulers Assn, Inc. v. Oneida-Herkimer Solid Waste Mo	anage-
	ment Authority	376
	Notes and Questions	378
	Problem E	379
Chapter	5 · Public and Private Domain	381
§ 5.01	Introduction	381
§ 5.02	Prohibiting Governmental Encroachments on Individual Rights	390
	A. The Bill of Rights	390
	Barron v. The Mayor and City Council of Baltimore	390
	Notes and Questions	392
	B. The Civil War Amendments	392
	Slaughter-House Cases	392
	Notes and Questions	404
	Problem A	407
§ 5.03	Prohibiting Encroachments on Individual Rights by Private Parties	s: The
	State Action Doctrine	408
	The Civil Rights Cases	408
	Notes and Questions	415
	Jackson v. Metropolitan Edison Company	416
	Flagg Bros., Inc. v. Brooks	421
	Lugar v. Edmondson Oil Co.	427
	Notes and Questions	430
	Problem B	439
Chapter	6 · Exclusion and Equal Protection	441
§ 6.01	Introduction	441
	A. "We the People"	441
	Johnson v. McIntosh	441
	Dred Scott v. Sandford	444
	Notes and Questions	448
	B. Exclusion and the Equal Protection Clause	449
\$6.02	Social and Economic Classification: Traditional Approach	452
	Railway Express Agency v. New York	452
	Notes and Questions	453
	Massachusetts Board of Retirement v. Murgia	454
	Notes and Questions	457
	San Antonio Independent School District v. Rodriguez	459
	Notes and Questions	463
	Problem A	464

xii CONTENTS

\$6.03	Racial Classification	465
	A. Constitutional Standard	465
	Plessy v. Ferguson	465
	Korematsu v. United States	470
	Notes and Questions	477
	Brown v. Board of Education [Brown I]	479
	Notes and Questions	481
	Brown v. Board of Education [Brown II]	483
	Notes and Questions	484
	Loving v. Virginia	484
	Notes and Questions	487
	B. Discriminatory Intent or Impact?	487
	Washington v. Davis	487
	Notes and Questions	492
	Problem B	495
	C. Affirmative Action	496
	Students for Fair Admissions v. President and Fellows	
	of Harvard College	498
	Notes and Questions	520
	Problem C	520
\$6.04	Gender Classification	521
	A. Constitutional Standard	521
	Goesaert v. Cleary	521
	Notes and Questions	522
	Frontiero v. Richardson	522
	Notes and Questions	528
	United States v. Virginia	534
	Notes and Questions	543
	Romer v. Evans	546
	Notes and Questions	549
	B. Discriminatory Intent or Impact?	550
	Personnel Administrator of Massachusetts v. Feeney	550
	Notes and Questions	556
§ 6.05	Conclusion	556
	City of Cleburne v. Cleburne Living Center	557
	Notes and Questions	566
	Problem D	567
Chapter	7 · Economic and Social Rights	569
\$7.01	The Rise, Fall, and Resurrection of Entrepreneurial Liberty	569
	Lochner v. New York	569
	Williamson v. Lee Optical Co.	576
	Notes and Questions	578

CONTENTS xiii

§ 7.02	Privacy and the Right to Be Let Alone	580
	Buck v. Bell	580
	Griswold v. Connecticut	582
	Notes and Questions	590
	Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Organization	597
	Notes and Questions	619
	Problem A	619
	Obergefell v. Hodges	620
	Notes and Question	635
	Problem B	635
§ 7.03	Entitlements and the Negative Constitution	636
	Dandridge v. Williams	636
	DeShaney v. Winnebago County Department of	
	Social Services	642
	Notes and Questions	650
§ 7.04	Due Process in the Administrative State	651
	Goldberg v. Kelly	651
	Board of Regents v. Roth	655
	Cleveland Board of Education v. Loudermill	658
	Notes and Questions	663
	Problem C	665
§ 7.05	The Right to Bear Arms	666
	District of Columbia v. Heller	666
	Notes and Questions	680
Chapter	8 · Religion	685
\$8.01	What Does "Religion" Mean?	685
\$8.02	Establishment of Religion	686
	A. Rituals and Symbols in the Public Arena	686
	Town of Greece, New York v. Galloway	690
	American Legion v. American Humanist Association	702
	Notes and Questions	707
	B. Rituals and Symbols in School Settings	708
	Santa Fe Independent School District v. Doe	709
	Kennedy v. Bremerton School District	715
	Notes and Questions	721
	C. Economic Aid to Religion	725
	Everson v. Board of Education	725
	Zelman v. Simmons-Harris	730
	Notes and Questions	736
\$8.03	Free Exercise of Religion	736
	A. Discrimination or Hostility	736
	B. Neutral Laws That Burden Religion	740

xiv CONTENTS

	Reynolds v. United States	740
	Sherbert v. Verner	742
	Wisconsin v. Yoder	747
	Employment Division, Department of Human Resources	
	v. Smith	751
	Notes and Questions	756
	Problem A	762
\$8.04	Religious Disputes in Secular Courts	762
	Hosanna-Tabor Evangelical Lutheran Church & School	
	v. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission	763
	Notes and Questions	771
Chapter	9 · Freedom of Speech and Association	773
§ 9.01	Competing Conceptions of Freedom of Speech	773
	A. Dueling Visions	773
	B. The Order and Morality Theory	774
	Chaplinsky v. New Hampshire	774
	Beauharnais v. Illinois	776
	C. The Marketplace Theory	782
	Abrams v. United States	782
	Whitney v. California	788
	Notes and Questions	792
§ 9.02	Speech and Lawless Activity	797
	A. Incitement	797
	Brandenburg v. Ohio	797
	Notes and Questions	800
	Problem A	803
	B. True Threats	804
	Virginia v. Black	804
	Notes and Questions	822
\$9.03	Vulgar, Graphic, and Offensive Speech	824
	A. Vulgarity	824
	Cohen v. California	824
	Federal Communications Commission v. Pacifica Foundation	829
	Notes and Questions	835
	B. Graphically Offensive Speech	836
	Texas v. Johnson	836
	United States v. Stevens	847
	Notes and Questions	854
\$9.04	Content-Based, Viewpoint-Based, and Content-Neutral Regulation	858
	A. Content and Viewpoint Discrimination	858
	B. Incidental Burdens on Speech and the <i>O'Brien</i> Principle	859
	United States v. O'Brien	859

CONTENTS xv

	C. Evidentiary Use of Speech to Prove the Elements of an Offense	864
	Wisconsin v. Mitchell	864
	Notes and Questions	869
	Problem B	870
\$9.05	Obscene and Pornographic Speech	870
	A. Obscenity in the General Marketplace	870
	Miller v. California	870
	Paris Adult Theatre I v. Slaton	874
	Notes and Questions	877
	B. Obscenity in the Privacy of the Home	879
	Stanley v. Georgia	879
	Notes and Questions	882
	C. Pornography and the Protection of Children	882
	Ashcroft v. Free Speech Coalition	883
	Reno v. American Civil Liberties Union	889
	Notes and Questions	895
	D. Erotic Dance Clubs, Public Nudity, and the	
	Secondary Effects Doctrine	896
\$9.06	Free Speech and Tort Liability	898
	A. Defamation	898
	New York Times Company v. Sullivan	898
	McKee v. Cosby	908
	Notes and Questions	910
	B. False Light	913
	C. Publication of Private Facts	914
	D. Intrusion	917
	E. Appropriation and Right of Publicity	919
	F. Infliction of Emotional Distress	920
	Hustler Magazine v. Falwell	920
	Notes and Questions	929
§ 9.07	Prior Restraints	929
	New York Times Company v. United States	929
	Notes and Questions	941
	Problem C	942
\$9.08	Commercial Speech	943
	44 Liquormart, Inc. v. Rhode Island	943
	Notes and Questions	957
\$9.09	Campaign Finance and the Political Process	961
	Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission	961
\$9.10	Public Forum Law	972
	Widmar v. Vincent	972
	Frisby v. Schultz	976
	Notes and Questions	983

xvi CONTENTS

§9.11 Government Speech	984
Shurtleff v. City of Boston	985
§ 9.12 Government Funding	994
Rust v. Sullivan	994
Rosenberger v. Rector and Visitors of University of Virginia	1001
Legal Services Corporation v. Valezquez	1004
§ 9.13 Government Employees	1012
A. Discipline Against Employees	1012
B. Political Patronage	1017
Branti v. Finkel	1017
§ 9.14 Education	1019
Morse v. Frederick	1019
Notes and Questions	1030
Problem D	1031
Mahanoy Area School District v. B.L. by & through Levy	1031
Notes and Questions	1041
Problem E	1042
§ 9.15 The Legal System	1042
A. Reporting on Judicial Proceedings	1042
B. Controlling the Speech of Lawyers	1043
§ 9.16 Anonymous Speech	1044
§ 9.17 Forced Speech	1046
303 Creative LLC v. Elenis	1046
Notes and Questions	1050
§ 9.18 Freedom of Expressive Association	1052
§ 9.19 Journalism and the First Amendment	1057
A. The Press Clause	1057
B. Access to Institutions and Events	1060
C. Reporters' Privilege	1061
Appendix \cdot The Constitution of the United States of America	1063
Index	1081

Table of Cases

12 200-ft. Reels of Super 8MM. Film, United States v., 320 303 Creative LLC v. Elenis United States Supreme Court, 1046 44 Liquormart, Inc. v. Rhode Island, 943 A.L.A. Schechter Poultry Corporation v. United States, 259 Abbott Laboratories v. Gardner, 180 Ableman v. Booth, 44 Abood v. Detroit Board of Education, 1051 Abrams v. United States, 782 Adair v. United States, 579 Adarand Constructors, Inc. v. Pena, 496, 501, 507 Adkins v. Children's Hospital, 579 Allegheny, County of, v. American Civil Liberties Union Greater Pittsburgh Chapter, 689, 700 Allen v. Wright, 171, 173 Allgeyer v. Louisiana, 569 Already, LLC v. Nike, Inc., 177 Alvarez, United States v., 513, 854 American Ins. Assn. v. Garamendi, 131, 136, 137, 139 American Legion v. American Humanist Association 702 American Mfrs. Mut. Ins. Co. v. Sullivan, 437 Anderson v. Dunn, 779 Area Educ. Telcoms. Consortium v. FCC, 894 Arkansas Writers' Project, Inc. v. Ragland, 996, 1007

Arlington Heights v. Metropolitan Housing Dev. Corp., 551, 553 Arnett v. Kennedy, 659, 663 Arthrex, Inc., United States v., 104 Ashcroft v. Free Speech Coalition, 883 Associated Press v. Walker, 912

Atascadero State Hospital v. Scanlon, 213

Austin v. Michigan Chamber of Commerce, 968

Babbitt v. Farm Workers, 179 Baker v. Carr, 24, 163 Baker v. Nelson, 624 Barclay v. Florida, 866 Barnes v. Glen Theatre, Inc., 896 Barron v. The Mayor and City Council of Baltimore, 390 Barron ex rel. Tiernan v. Mayor of Baltimore, 602 Bartnicki v. Vopper, 915 Bass, United States v., 276 Bates v. State Bar of Ariz., 945 Batson v. Kentucky, 531 Baumgartner v. United States, 922 Beal v. Doe, 424 Beauharnais v. Illinois, 776 Belmont, United States v., 138 Berisha v. Lawson, 910 Bethel School Dist. No. 403 v. Fraser, 1020, 1033 Biden v. Nebraska, 79, 175 Bigelow v. Virginia, 944, 945

Bishop v. Wood, 659

Blatchford v. Native Village of Noatak, 227 Blum v. Yaretsky, 437 Board of Airport Comm'rs of Los Angeles v. Jews for Jesus, Inc., 848 Board of Directors of Rotary International v. Rotary Club of Duarte, 1053 Board of Educ. v. Earls, 1024 Board of Educ. of Okla. City Pub. Schs., Indep. Sch. Dist. No. 89 v. Dowell, 484 Board of Regents of Univ. of Wis. System v. Southworth, 710, 1006 Board of Regents v. Roth, 457, 655 Board of Trustees v. Garrett, 230, 310 Board of Trustees, State Univ. of N.Y. v. Fox, 950 Boddie v. Connecticut, 312 Boerne, City of, v. Flores, 304, 311, 316, 416, 757 Bolger v. Youngs Drug Products Corp., Bolling v. Sharpe, 449, 450, 481 Bond v. Floyd, 1029 Boos v. Barry, 840 Bose Corp. v. Consumers Union of United States, Inc., 922 Bostock v. Clayton County, 549 Bowers v. DeVito, 463 Bowers v. Hardwick, 623 Bowsher v. Synar, 106, 336 Boy Scouts of America v. Dale, 1046, 1055 Bradwell v. Illinois, 407, 522 Brandenburg v. Ohio, 797, 800, 945 Branti v. Finkel, 1017 Branzburg v. Hayes, 1061 Braunfeld v. Brown, 743, 760 Bray v. Alexandria Women's Health Clinic, 601

Brentwood Academy v. Tennessee

Broadrick v. Oklahoma, 888, 982

tion, 435

Brig Aurora, The, 71

Secondary School Athletic Associa-

Brown v. Board of Education I, 42, 197, 460, 479, 512, 619 Brown v. Board of Education II, 194, 483, 500, 508 Brown v. EPA, 342 Brown v. North Carolina, 533 Brown, United States v., 54 Brown-Forman Distillers Corporation v. New York State Liquor Authority, 372 Buck v. Bell, 451, 580 Buckley v. Valeo, 121, 961 Bunting v. Oregon, 579 Burke, United States v., 1062 Butler, United States v., 264, 357 Byrd v. Raines, 106 C & A Carbone, Ind. v. Town of Clarkstown, 374 Caetano v. Massachusetts, 681 Cafeteria & Restaurant Workers Union v. McElroy, 652 Califano v. Webster, 536 California Federal Sav. & Loan Ass'n v. Guerra, 536 California Retail Liquor Dealers Ass'n v. Midcal Aluminum, Inc., 950 California v. Texas, 365 Calvary Chapel Dayton Valley v. Sisolak, 761 Cantrell v. Forest City Publishing Co., Cantwell v. Connecticut, 407, 743, 775, 777 Capital Cities Cable, Inc. v. Crisp, 950 Capitol Square Review and Advisory Bd. v. Pinette, 807 Carey v. Brown, 976 Carey v. Population Services Int'l, 596, 894, 945, 946 Carolene Products Co., United States v., 388, 389, 451 Carroll Towing Co., United States v., 795 Carson v. Makin, 1048

Carter v. Carter Coal Co., 72, 264 Castaneda v. Partida, 492 Castle Rock, Town of, v. Gonzalez, 665 Central Hudson Gas & Elec. Corp. v. Public Serv. Comm'n of N.Y., 946, 948 Champion v. Ames (The Lottery Case), Chaplinsky v. New Hampshire, 774 Chicago & Southern Air Lines, Inc. v. Waterman S.S. Corp., 137 Child Labor Tax Case (Drexel Furniture), 357 Chisholm v. Georgia, 199, 202 Christian Legal Society Chapter of the University of California, Hastings v. Martinez, 1055 Church of the Lukumi Babalu Aye, Inc. v. City of Hialeah, 718 Cincinnati v. Discovery Network, Inc., 948 Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission, 961 City of (See Name of City) Civil Rights Cases, 307, 408, 466 Clapper v. Amnesty International USA, 171, 180 Clark v. Jeter, 533 Cleburne v. Cleburne Living Center, Inc., 312, 533, 557 Cleland's Memoirs of a Woman of Pleasure v. Attorney General of Mass., 886 Cleveland Board of Education v. Loudermill, 658 Clinton v. City of New York, 106 Clinton v. Jones, 121 Cohen v. California, 824, 831 Cohen v. Cowles Media Co., 918 Cohens v. Virginia, 22 Collins v. Yellen, 105 Committee for Public Education v. Nyquist, 973 Comstock, United States v., 350, 351 Connick v. Myers, 1012

Coombs, United States v., 292
Cooper v. Aaron, 42
Coppage v. Kansas, 579
Cornelius v. NAACP Legal Defense and Educ. Fund, 984
Counterman v. Colorado, 823
County of (See Name of County)
Cox v. Louisiana, 866
Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn, 914
Curtis Publishing Co. v. Butts, 912
Curtiss-Wright Export Corporation,
United States v., 125
Cutter v. Wilkinson, 765

Dames & Moore v. Regan, 138, 158 Dandridge v. Williams, 451, 636 Darby, United States v., 191, 266, 293, Dartmouth College v. Woodward, 382 Davis v. Beason, 685 Dawson v. Delaware, 866 De Jonge v. Oregon, 796 Dean Milk Co. v. Madison, 374 Debs v. United States, 793 Debs, In re, 54 Dellinger, United States v., 1029 Dellmuth v. Muth, 213 Dennis v. United States, 795, 799 Department of Commerce v. New York, Department of Commerce v. United States House of Representatives, 179 DeShaney v. Winnebago County Department of Social Services, 463, 642 Dillon v. Gloss, 167 District of Columbia v. Heller, 10, 666, Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Organization, 597, 681

Doe v. University of Michigan, 1041

Drexel Furniture (Child Labor Tax

Dred Scott v. Sandford, 382, 444

Case), 357

Dun & Bradstreet, Inc. v. Greenmoss Builders, Inc., 913, 925 Duncan v. Louisiana, 623 Dunn v. Blumstein, 312

E.C. Knight Co., United States v., 249 Eastland v. United States Servicemen's Fund, 118 Edelman v. Jordan, 205 Edge Broadcasting Co., United States v., 951 Edmond v. United States, 103 Edmonson v. Leesville Concrete Company, 430, 502 Edwards v. Aguillard, 724 Eisenstadt v. Baird, 592, 596, 613 Elk v. Wilkins, 449 Elliott v. Commonwealth, 822 Elrod v. Burns, 1017 Employment Division, Department of Human Resources v. Smith, 751, 757 Engel v. Vitale, 694, 720, 722 Epperson v. Arkansas, 723 Erie, City of, v. Pap's A.M., 896 Espinoza v. Montana Department of Revenue, 740 Estate of (See Name of Deceased) Estelle v. Gamble, 645 Eu v. San Francisco County Democratic Central Comm., 963 Evans v. Newton, 426 Everson v. Board of Education, 725 Ewing v. Mytinger & Casselberry, Inc., 660

F.S. Royster Guano Co. v. Virginia, 451 Fairfax's Devisee v. Hunter's Lessee, 37 Faretta v. California, 312 FCC v. Beach Communications, Inc., 458 FCC v. Pacifica Foundation, 829, 890, 892, 924

Ex parte (See Name of Relator)

Federal Election Comm'n v. Wisconsin Right to Life, Inc., 961 Feiner v. New York, 801, 826 FERC v. Mississippi, 278 First Nat. Bank of Boston v. Bellotti, 964, 1059 Fisher v. University of Texas at Austin (2013), 510Fisher v. University of Texas at Austin (2016), 510, 512, 515 Fitzpatrick v. Bitzer, 219, 230, 304 Flagg Bros., Inc. v. Brooks, 421, 437 Fletcher v. Peck, 382 Florida Bar v. Went For It, Inc., 947 Florida Star v. B.J.F., 915 Food Lion v. Capital Cities/ABC, Inc., 918 Ford Motor Co. v. Department of Treasury, 207 Frazee v. Illinois Dep't of Employment Sec., 685, 759 Free Enterprise Fund v. Public Company Accounting Oversight Bd., 101 Freeman v. Pitts, 484 Friedman v. Rogers, 946 Frisby v. Schultz, 976 Frohwerk v. United States, 793 Frontiero v. Richardson, 522, 531 Frost & Frost Trucking Co. v. Railroad Comm'n of Cal., 953 Fuentes v. Shevin, 422 Fulton v. City of Philadelphia, Pennsyl-

Garcetti v. Ceballos, 717, 1012
Garcia v. San Antonio Metropolitan
Transit Authority, 322
Garrison v. Louisiana, 923
Gayle v. Browder, 481
Geduldig v. Aiello, 450, 601
Gentile v. State Bar of Nevada, 1043
Georgia v. McCollum, 435
Gertz v. Robert Welch, Inc., 831, 912, 922

vania, 759

Gibbons v. Ogden, 245, 368, 600, 667 Ginsberg v. New York (1968), 879, 890 Ginsberg v. New York (1972), 832 Gitlow v. New York, 794 Glickman v. Wileman Brothers & Elliott, Inc., 959 Goesaert v. Cleary, 521 Goldberg v. Kelly, 208, 651, 661 Goldman v. Weinberger, 761 Gonzales v. Carhart, 600 Gonzales v. O Centro Espirita Beneficente Uniao do Vegetal, 758 Gonzales v. Raich, 284 Goodridge v. Dep't of Pub. Health, 625 Graham v. Richardson, 208 Grand Jury Subpoena, Judith Miller, In re, 1062 Granholm v. Heald, 372 Gratz v. Bollinger, 500 Greece, New York, Town of, v. Galloway, 690 Green v. County School, 484 Green v. Mansour, 213 Gregory v. Ashcroft, 348 Griswold v. Connecticut, 582, 596, 613 Grutter v. Bollinger, 496, 501, 503, 505, 510, 512, 514 Guest, United States v., 416 Gundy v. United States, 72

H.P. Hood & Sons v. DuMond, 233, 234, 235

Haaland v. Brackeen, 174, 350

Hague v. CIO, 983

Haig v. Agee, 139

Hamdi v. Rumsfeld, 143

Hammer v. Dagenhart, 254

Hans v. Louisiana, 198

Harris v. McRae, 996

Haupt v. United States, 868

Hazelwood School Dist. v. Kuhlmeier, 709, 1023, 1033

Hazelwood School Dist. v. United States, 492

Healy v. James, 1002 Heart of Atlanta Motel v. United States, 270, 275, 322, 1050 Helvering v. Hallock, 220 Hernandez v. Texas, 492 Herndon v. Lowry, 796 Hess v. Indiana, 800 Hipolite Egg Co. v. United States, 255 Hirabayashi v. United States, 471 Hishon v. King & Spalding, 867 Hodel v. Virginia Surface Mining & Reclamation Assn., Inc., 275, 322, 323 Hoke v. United States, 255 Holden v. Hardy, 569 Holmes v. Atlanta, 481 Hosanna-Tabor Evangelical Lutheran Church & School v. EEOC, 763 Houchins v. KQED, Inc., 1060 Hudgens v. NLRB, 438 Humphrey's Executor v. United States, 96, 101 Hurley v. Irish-American Gay, Lesbian

Hurley v. Irish-American Gay, Lesbian and Bisexual Group of Boston, Inc., 1047, 1053, 1055 Hustler Magazine v. Falwell, 920

Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Chadha, 81 In re (See Name of Party or Matter) Iota XI Chapter of Sigma Chi Fraternity v. George Mason University, 1041

J.E.B. v. Alabama, 531, 536
J.W. Hampton, Jr. & Co. v. United States, 72
Jackson v. Indiana, 313
Jackson v. Metropolitan Edison Company, 416, 437
Jackson v. Virginia, 820
Jackson Women's Health Org. v. Currier, 600
Jacobellis v. Ohio, 879

Jacobson v. Massachusetts, 581

Jaffree v. Board of School Commissioners of Mobile County, 407

Janus v. American Federation of State,
City & Municipal Employees,
Council 31, 1051

Jefferson v. Hackney, 488

Jett v. Dallas Independent School Dist.,
807

Johnson v. California, 501

Johnson v. McIntosh, 441

Jones v. Alfred H. Mayer Co., 416, 1050

Jones v. United States, 299

Kadrmas v. Dickinson Public Schools, 548 Kahriger, United States v., 357 Karcher v. Islamic Rep. of Iran, 159 Katzenbach v. McClung, 270, 275 Katzenbach v. Morgan, 304, 416 Kedroff v. Saint Nicholas Cathedral of Russian Orthodox Church in North America, 766 Kennedy v. Bremerton School District, 715

Kilbourn v. Thompson, 120 Kimel v. Florida Board of Regents, 316 Kirchberg v. Feenstra, 532 Kitchen v. Herbert, 628 Klein, United States v., 54 Kois v. Wisconsin, 886 Korematsu v. United States, 470, 478 Kotch v. Board of River Pilot Commis-

Keyishian v. Board of Regents, State

Univ. of N.Y., 1002

sioners, 454

Laird v. Tatum, 181 Lander v. Seaver, 1040 Landmark Communications, Inc. v. Virginia, 801 Lane Co. v. Oregon, 251 Larkin v. Grendel's Den, Inc., 707 Lassiter v. Northampton County Bd. of Elections, 305 Lawrence v. Texas, 613, 623 Lee v. Weisman, 697, 700 Legal Services Corporation v. Valezquez, 1004 Lemon v. Kurtzman, 490, 687, 973 Levy v. Louisiana, 640 Linmark Associates, Inc. v. Willingboro, 945, 946 Lochner v. New York, 564, 569, 603, 629 Locke v. Davey, 739 Logan v. Zimmerman Brush Co., 659, Lopez, United States v., 274, 291, 293 Lottery Case (Champion v. Ames), 253 Louisiana v. Biden, 79 Louisiana v. United States, 539 Lovett, United States v., 54 Loving v. Virginia, 484, 605, 624 Lucia v. Securities and Exchange Commission, 104 Lugar v. Edmondson Oil Co., 427, 437 Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife, 171, 172, 179 Lynch v. Donnelly, 688 Lyng v. Automobile Workers, 1010

M.L.B. v. S.L.J., 312

Mahanoy Area School District v. B.L.
by & through Levy, 1031

Maher v. Roe, 996, 1010

Manhattan Community Access Corp.
v. Halleck, 436

Marbury v. Madison, 13, 849

Marsh v. Alabama, 422, 437

Marsh v. Chambers, 336

Marshall Field & Co. v. Clark, 71, 110

Marshall v. Gordon, 26

Martin v. Hunter's Lessee, 37, 607

Martinez v. California, 645

Massachusetts Board of Retirement v.

Murgia, 454

Massachusetts v. Environmental Protection Agency, 174 Masterpiece Cakeshop, Ltd. v. Colorado Civil Rights Comm'n, 737, 1048 Matal v. Tam, 987, 993 Mathews v. Eldridge, 147, 660, 664 McAuliffe v. Mayor of New Bedford, 1012 McCleskey v. Kemp, 492 McCollum v. Board of Education, 721 McConnell v. Federal Election Comm'n, 972 McCreary County Kentucky v. American Civil Liberties Union of Kentucky, 688 McCulloch v. Maryland, 26, 236, 614, 682 McDaniel v. Paty, 739 McDonald v. Chicago, 10, 602, 680, 682 McGowan v. Maryland, 707 McGrain v. Daugherty, 98, 117 McIntyre v. Ohio Elections Commission, 955, 1044 McKee v. Cosby, 908 McKesson Corp. v. Division of Alcoholic Beverages and Tobacco, 229 McLaurin v. Oklahoma State Regents, Members of City Council v. Taxpayers for Vincent, 979 Metromedia, Inc. v. San Diego, 951 Meyer v. State of Nebraska, 582, 590 Miami Herald Publishing Co. v. Tornillo, 832 Milkovich v. Lorain Journal Co., 913 Miller v. California, 870, 893 Miller, United States v., 670, 672, 678, 679 Milliken v. Bradley, 539 Mills v. Commonwealth, 604 Mississippi University for Women v. Hogan, 532, 543 Missouri ex rel. Gaines v. Canada, 617 Mitchell v. Helms, 736

Mitchum v. Foster, 196 Monitor Patriot Co. v. Roy, 963 Moore v. East Cleveland, 603 Moore v. Harper, 41 Morrison v. Olson, 96, 101 Morrison, United States v., 289 Morse v. Frederick, 1019, 1033, 1037 Mt. Healthy City School District Board of Education v. Doyle, 1016 Mueller v. Allen, 732 Mugler v. Kansas, 569 Mullane v. Central Hanover Bank & Trust Co., 660 Muller v. Oregon, 579 Murphy v. National Collegiate Athletic Ass'n, 348, 350 Myers v. United States, 53, 54, 336 NAACP v. Alabama, 583 NAACP v. Button, 743 NAACP v. Claiborne Hardware Co., 866 Naim v. Naim, 485 National Collegiate Athletic Assn. v. Tarkanian, 437 National Federation of Independent Business v. Sibelius, 351 National Institute of Family & Life Advocates v. Becerra, 1050 National League of Cities v. Usery, 194, 195, 320 National Pork Producers Council v. Ross, 378 National Rifle Association v. City of Chicago, 10 Near v. Minnesota ex rel. Olson, 672, 932, 941 Nevada Department of Human Resources v. Hibbs, 230, 311 New Orleans City Park Improvement Ass'n v. Detiege, 481 New Orleans v. Dukes, 564 New State Ice Co. v. Liebmann, 10, 185, 294

New York State Rifle & Pistol Association v. Bruen, 11

New York Times Co. v. Sullivan, 898, 910

New York Times Co. v. United States, 929

New York v. Ferber, 849, 865, 886

New York v. United States, 191, 326

Nixon v. Administrator of General Services, 133

Nixon v. Condon, 437

Nixon v. Fitzgerald, 31, 120, 122

Nixon v. United States, 166

Nixon, United States v., 23

NLRB v. Jones & Laughlin Steel Corp., 265

NLRB v. Noel Canning, 133, 614

North American Cold Storage Co. v. Chicago, 660

North Georgia Finishing, Inc. v. Di-Chem, Inc., 422

Northeastern Florida Chapter, General Contractors of America v. City of Jacksonville, 170

O'Brien, United States v., 604, 837, 859, 866

O'Mara v. Commonwealth, 806 Obergefell v. Hodges, 550, 613, 620, 1049

Ohralik v. Ohio State Bar Ass'n, 946 Oklahoma v. Civil Service Comm'n, 301

Oregon v. Mitchell, 305, 416 Osborne v. Ohio, 882, 886 Our Lady of Guadalupe School v. Morrissey-Berru, 771

Palko v. Connecticut, 587 Palmer v. Thompson, 489, 495 Palmore v. Sidoti, 500 Panama Refining Co. v. Ryan, 72, 74 Papasan v. Allain, 463 Parents Involved in Community Schools v. Seattle School District No. 1, 484, 501, 507

Paris Adult Theatre I v. Slaton, 874

Pell v. Procunier, 1060

Pendergrass, State v., 1026

Pennhurst State School & Hospital v. Halderman, 216

Pennsylvania v. Union Gas Co., 219

Perez v. United States, 274

Perpich v. Department of Defense, 677, 679

Perry Educational Ass'n v. Perry Local Educators' Ass'n, 983

Perry v. Sindermann, 664, 953

Personnel Administrator of Mass. v. Feeney, 311, 532, 550

Peters, United States v., 44

Philadelphia Newspapers, Inc. v. Hepps, 913

Philadelphia, City of, v. New Jersey, 369, 376

Pickering v. Board of Ed. of Township High School Dist. 205, 717

Pierce v. Society of Sisters, 582, 590, 625, 748

Pietsch v. Bush, 172, 173

Pike v. Bruce Church, Inc., 370

Pink, United States v., 131, 138

Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v. Casey, 595, 598, 599, 606, 611, 612

Planned Parenthood of the Columbia/ Wilmette, Inc. v. American Coalition of Life Activists, 823

Plaut v. Spendthrift Farm, Inc., 319

Playboy Entertainment Group, Inc., United States v., 848, 895

Pleasant Grove City v. Summum, 986, 989

Plessy v. Ferguson, 465, 617

Plyler v. Doe, 512

Poe v. Ullman, 585, 586, 615

Polk County v. Dodson, 432
Pope v. Illinois, 878
Posadas de Puerto Rico Associates v.
Tourism Co. of P.R., 951
Powell v. McCormack, 52, 164
Powers v. Ohio, 435, 532
Press-Enterprise Co. v. Superior Court of Cal., County of Riverside, 312
Principality of Monaco v. Mississippi, 340
Printz v. United States, 335
Prize Cases, 140
Process Gas Consumer Group v.
Consumer Energy Council, 95

Quinn v. United States, 118

R.A.V. v. City of St. Paul, 806, 858, 953 Railway Express Agency v. New York, 452 Raines v. Byrd, 106, 173, 175 Rankin v. McPherson, 1016 Red Lion Broadcasting Co. v. FCC, 832, 892

Reed v. Reed, 524, 527

Reed v. Town of Gilbert, 718, 858

Regan v. Taxation with Representation of Wash., 996

Regents of Univ. of Cal. v. Bakke, 501, 510

Rendell-Baker v. Kohn, 437

Reno v. American Civil Liberties

Union, 802, 889

Reno v. Condon, 346

Renton v. Playtime Theatres, Inc., 890, 897

Reynolds v. United States United States Supreme Court 740

Rice v. Cayetano, 501, 505

Rice v. Paladin Enterprises, Inc., 802

Richmond v. J.A. Croson Co., 505

Roberts v. United States Jaycees 768, 866, 867, 1053

Roe v. Wade, 592, 598, 601, 611, 612
Roman Catholic Diocese of Brooklyn v.
Cuomo, 761
Rome, City of, v. United States, 305
Romer v. Evans, 546, 623
Rosado v. Wyman, 210
Rosenberger v. Rector and Visitors of
Univ. of Va., 709, 1001, 1006
Rosenbloom v. Metromedia, Inc., 912
Roth v. United States, 831, 872, 878, 879

Rubin v. Coors Brewing Co., 943

D. M. C. 2007

Runyon v. McCrary, 867

Rust v. Sullivan, 994

Sable Communications of Cal., Inc. v. FCC, 513

Sabri v. United States, 303

San Antonio Ind. School District v. Rodriguez, 455, 459, 511

San Francisco Arts & Athletics, Inc. v. United States Olympic Comm., 437

Santa Fe Independent School District v. Doe, 709

Saxbe v. Washington Post Co., 417 U.S. 843, 1060

Schechter Poultry Corp. v. United States, 72, 74

Schenck v. United States, 783, 792 Schlesinger v. Reservists Committee to

Stop the War, 172, 173

School Dist. of Abington v. Schempp, 722

Scott v. School Board of Alachua County, 1042

Seeger, United States v., 685, 760

Seila Law LLC v. Consumer Financial Protection Bureau, 100

Seminole Tribe of Florida v. Florida, 216, 230

Serbian Eastern Orthodox Diocese for United States and Canada v. Milivojevich, 767

Shapiro v. Thompson, 211, 312

Shaw v. Hunt, 501, 505 Swift & Co. v. United States, 280 Shelley v. Kraemer, 439 Sherbert v. Verner, 742 Shreveport Rate Case (W.T.R. Co. v. United States), 253, 293 Shurtleff v. City of Boston, 985 Shuttlesworth v. City of Birmingham, Sipuel v. Board of Regents of Univ. of Okla., 617 Skinner v. Oklahoma ex rel. Williamson, 312, 487, 583, 590, 616 Slagle, State v., 604 Div., 759 Slaughter-House Cases, 392, 465 Smith v. Allwright, 437 Smith v. California, 879 Sniadach v. Family Finance Corp., 422 Snyder v. Phelps, 926 Sorrell v. IMS Health Inc., 959 South Bay United Pentecostal Church v. Newsom, 761 Co., 323 South Carolina v. Katzenbach, 305 South Dakota v. Dole, 300, 330 Southeastern Promotions, Ltd. v. Conrad, 892 Spence v. Washington, 866 Spokeo, Inc. v. Robins, 172 Sprague, United States v., 667 Stanley v. Georgia, 876, 879, 882 State v. (See Name of Defendant) Sterling v. Constantin, 44 Stevens, United States v., 847 Stone v. Graham, 722 Strauder v. West Virginia, 488 Stromberg v. People of State of California, 780 Students for Fair Admissions v. Presi-959 dent and Fellows of Harvard College, 498 Susan B. Anthony List v. Driehaus, 177, Authority, 376 179 United Public Workers v. Mitchell, 176 Sweatt v. Painter, 479, 617 United States Dept. of Agriculture v.

Sweezy v. New Hampshire, 1002

Talley v. California, 1044 Taylor v. Louisiana, 312 Teamsters v. United States, 492 Tennessee v. Lane, 231, 309 Terminiello v. City of Chicago, 780, 865 Terry v. Adams, 437 Texas v. Johnson, 836 Texas v. United States, 365 Texas v. White, 192 Texas, United States v., 175 Thomas v. Review Bd., Ind. Empl. Sec. Thornhill v. State of Alabama, 780 Thornton, Estate of, v. Caldor, Inc., 760 Tilton v. Richardson, 765 Time, Inc. v. Hill, 914 Torcaso v. Watkins, 685, 694 Town of (See Name of Town) Transportation Union v. Long Island R. TransUnion v. Ramirez, 172 Trinity Lutheran Church of Columbia, Inc. v. Comer, 739 Trump v. Hawaii, 478, 707 Trump v. Mazars USA, LLP, 116 Trump v. New York, 176 Trump v. Vance, 30 Tuan Anh Nguyen v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 544 Turner Broadcasting System, Inc. v. FCC, 604, 892 Tyler Pipe Indus. v. Washington State Dep't of Revenue, 373 United Foods, Inc., United States v., United Haulers Assn, Inc. v. Oneida-Herkimer Solid Waste Management

Moreno, 464, 548

United States Forest Service v. Cowpasture River Preservation Ass'n, 299

United States Postal Service v. Council of Greenburgh Civic Associations, 984

United States v. (See Name of Defendant)

Utah v. Strieff, 514 UWM Post v. Board of Regents of the University of Wisconsin, 1041

Van Orden v. Perry, 688
Vasquez v. Hillery, 512
Virginia Bd. of Pharmacy v. Virginia
Citizens Consumer Council, Inc.,
944, 945, 954
Virginia v. Black, 804, 1023
Virginia v. Rives, 424
Virginia, Ex parte, 304
Virginia, United States v., 534
Vitek v. Jones, 659

W.T.R. Co. v. United States (The Shreveport Rate Case), 253, 293 Walker v. City of Birmingham, 941 Walker v. Texas Division, Sons of Confederate Veterans, Inc., 988 Wallace v. Jaffree, 407, 723 Ward v. Rock Against Racism, 983 Washington v. Davis, 487, 551 Washington v. Glucksberg, 602, 603 Watkins v. United States, 117 Watson v. Jones, 766 Wayman v. Southard, 75 Weber v. Aetna Casualty & Surety Co., 526 Welch v. Department of Highways and Public Transportation, 213 Welsh v. United States, 685 West v. Derby Unified School District No. 260, 1042

West Coast Hotel Co. v. Parrish, 579

West Virginia Board of Education v. Barnette, 959 West Virginia v. Environmental Protection Agency, 78 Whitney v. California, 788, 945 Wickard v. Filburn, 272, 273, 274, 322 Widmar v. Vincent, 972 Williamson v. Lee Optical of Okla., 454, 459, 563, 576 Williams-Yulee v. Florida Bar, 512, 513 Wisconsin v. Constantineau, 656 Wisconsin v. Mitchell, 864 Wisconsin v. Yoder, 747, 756 Witters v. Washington Dept. of Servs. for Blind, 732 Wooley v. Maynard, 959, 1050 Wyoming v. Oklahoma, 376

Yick Wo v. Hopkins, 488, 500, 645 Young v. American Mini Theatres, Inc., 831 Young, Ex parte, 197, 201, 208 Youngberg v. Romeo, 313, 646 Younger v. Harris, 41, 198 Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer, 54, 55, 129, 131, 134, 137, 138, 936

Zablocki v. Redhail, 487
Zacchini v. Scripps-Howard Broadcasting Co., 919
Zaidan v. Trump, 170
Zelman v. Simmons-Harris, 730
Zivotofsky v. Kerry, 128
Zobrest v. Catalina Foothills School
Dist., 732
Zorach v. Clauson, 718, 721

Preface

More than thirty years ago we set out to create a constitutional law casebook that teaches well. We wanted to teach from a book that would engage students in learning basic constitutional law and would enable teachers to work with cases and problems relatively unencumbered by extensive secondary source materials and treatise-like notes. In preparing the eighth edition of our casebook, we have continued to develop the characteristics that distinguish our book from others. First, we continue to place heavy emphasis on the structure of government, the constitutional concepts of federalism and separation of powers. Typically, the constitutional law course has focused on three themes: judicial function, distribution of government power among the branches of the federal government and between the federal government and the states, and individual rights. The separation of powers and federalism issues, however, have been shortchanged in favor of study of the judicial function and individual rights.

Since the conception of our first edition in the early 1980's, separation of powers and federalism have retained their status as dominant themes in constitutional law as well as society generally. They continue to deserve close examination. Indeed, the renewed attention to separation of powers and federalism issues by the Supreme Court in recent years underscores the importance of structural issues in constitutional law.

Our treatment of the individual rights material also distinguishes this book from others. In prior editions, we organized the rights material around the contexts in which rights issues arise. Beginning with the third edition, we adopted a more traditional approach of presenting the individual rights materials doctrinally through separated examination of due process, equal protection, and the First Amendment. In doing so, however, we have maintained a unique focus. The chapter on equal protection, for example, begins with a consideration of the groups that were excluded from constitutional protection and then examines whether the equal protection clause has served as a vehicle of inclusion. We also omitted the electoral districting and reapportionment materials in favor of their extensive coverage in specialized texts and courses, and we relocated congressional enforcement of civil rights from what was chapter nine to the earlier chapter on congressional powers, chapter four.

Finally, we have rejected the notion that a good casebook must also be a treatise. We also have worked hard to produce a treatment of constitutional law that may reasonably be presented in a survey course. With a few exceptions, we have prepared

xxx PREFACE

only brief notes and comments to guide the reader through the cases and to provoke independent thought about important constitutional issues without overwhelming students with scholarly debates. In lieu of extensive excerpts from secondary sources, we rely on hypothetical problems to facilitate study of the material. In drafting problems, we have been mindful of the value of placing law students in practical situations where they may be asked to be problem solvers of concrete and realistic constitutional issues. We remain convinced that such practical problems enable students to develop a better understanding of the underlying theory and doctrine. In addition, to improve the readability of the text in this edition we have chosen not to use ellipses to indicate omitted material.

WILLIAM C. BANKS Syracuse, New York

RODNEY A. SMOLLA South Royalton, Vermont

DAAN BRAVEMAN Rochester, New York January, 2024