

Slavery in the Southwest

Slavery in the Southwest

Genízaro Identity, Dignity and the Law

Bill Piatt

PROFESSOR OF LAW
ST. MARY'S UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

Moises Gonzales

ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR
COMMUNITY AND REGIONAL PLANNING
SCHOOL OF ARCHITECTURE AND PLANNING
UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2019
Carolina Academic Press, LLC
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Piatt, Bill, author. | Gonzales, Moises, author.
Title: Slavery in the Southwest : Genizaro identity, dignity and the law /
by Robert William Piatt, Jr., Moises Gonzales.
Description: Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, LLC, [2019]
| Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2019021502 | ISBN 9781531015558
Subjects: LCSH: Indians of North America—New Mexico—History. | Indians of
North America—Legal status, laws, etc.—New Mexico—History. |
Slavery—New Mexico—History.
Classification: LCC E78.N65 P53 2019 | DDC 306.3/6209789--dc23
LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019021502>

ISBN 978-1-5310-1555-8
e-ISBN 978-1-5310-1556-5

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Bill Piatt

To my mom, Betty

To my wife, Chris

To my children:

Seana, Bob, Alicia

To my grandchildren:

Fallyn, Max, Rory, William, Julia, Noah, Caroline, Eva, and Jonah

To my honorary granddaughter, Sophia

And, to my great-great niece, Kyara

Moises Gonzales

To my wife, Lynn Velarde y Gonzales

To my children, Vidal and Mariposa

To Cañon de Carnue Land Grant

To Los Comanchitos de La Sierra Sandia

To Los Matachines de La Sierra Sandia

To Abiquiu Library and Cultural Center—Isabel Trujillo, Director

To Pueblo de Abiquiu—Virgil Trujillo, Floyd Trujillo, and

Dexter Trujillo (members)

To Enrique LaMadrid—Mentor

To Cristobal de La Serna Land Grant—Francisco “el Comanche” Gonzales

In memory of Benito Cordova the first Genizaro scholar

To Bernardo Gallegos

To the Community and Regional Planning Program,

School of Architecture and Planning at the

University of New Mexico (UNM)

And, to the New Mexico Land Grant Studies Program, UNM

Contents

List of Figures	xi
Acknowledgments	xiii
Chapter 1 • An Introduction	3
Chapter 2 • Conquest, Conversion and Conflict	9
A. Indigenous Roots	10
B. Arrival of the Spanish	14
C. Genízaros	20
D. Mexicans, Anglos, and Peonage	29
E. Genízaro Endurance, Re-Emergence	33
Chapter 3 • Who Is an Indian? What Is an Indian Tribe? Why Does It Matter?	45
A. Who Is an “Indian”?	46
B. What Is an Indian Tribe?	50
C. Why Does It Matter?	54
D. Misunderstanding Indian Preferences: A Case Study in Legal Education	61
E. Re-Examining Indian Identity	69
F. Genízaros Are Not the Only Indians without a Federally Recognized Tribe	73
G. Loss of Indian Identity	75
Chapter 4 • Should Genízaros (and Lumbees and Others) Pursue Federal Recognition?	79
A. Background of BIA Recognition Process	85
1. Recent Approvals	87

2. Denial of Acknowledgment of the Georgia Tribe of Eastern Cherokee	92
3. Denial of Acknowledgment of the Tolowa Nation	95
4. Denial of Acknowledgment of the Choctaw Nation of Florida	97
5. Denial of Acknowledgment of the Brothertown Indian Nation	99
6. The 2015 Revised Version of the Tribal Recognition Regulation	101
B. Lumbee Tribe and Genízaro Comparisons	102
1. Origins and Numbers	102
2. Racial Concerns	104
3. State Recognition	105
4. Casinos	106
5. Federal Recognition: Legislation	107
6. Cultural Maintenance	108
C. To Seek or Not to Seek	108
Chapter 5 • The Legal Framework for Recognition/Validation	109
A. Individual Access to Recognition by Means of Heritage Statements	109
B. Individual Recognition through Permit Applications	112
C. Tribal Recognition by States	115
D. Federal Recognition	118
1. Federal Recognition through Legislation	118
2. Federal Recognition through Executive Branch Action	119
3. Federal Protection by the Judiciary	123
a. Judicial Recognition of the Genízaro Nation as an Entity	124
b. Due Process: Identity and Dignity	127
c. Equal Protection and Equal Protection-Type Classification Challenge	131
d. 13th Amendment Challenge	137
E. Logistics	138
Chapter 6 • International Recognition of Indigenous Rights	141
A. United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples	141
B. Canada's Recognition of Its Méti Nation	159
C. The Australian Experience	165
D. New Zealand and Its Māori Population	169

Chapter 7 • Rebirth	173
A. Focusing Inward	175
B. Focusing Outward to Enlist Allies	182
1. Request a UN Examination	182
2. Enlist the Support of the Catholic Church	183
3. Ask for Assistance by Federally Recognized Tribes and Indians	186
C. Consider Demanding Recognition	190
D. Rebirth	192
Appendix	195
I. “Comanchitos” Song	195
II. Regulations Governing the Applications of Groups Seeking Federal Acknowledgment as an Indian Tribe	196
Bibliography	223
Books	223
Book Chapters	225
Articles	225
Statutes, Legislation & Regulations	230
New Mexico	230
United States	230
International	231
Cases	231
United States	231
Canada	233
Websites Generally	233
Video, Film & Radio	234
Index	235
About the Authors	247

List of Figures

Moises Gonzales and Genízaro danzantes, Comanchitos Dance, Atrisco, New Mexico (Dec. 8, 2018). Photo by Lynn Velarde y Gonzales, digitally enhanced by Robert J. Ruybalid, (“El Mogote”), from the collection of Moises Gonzales.	xiii
List of reservations in NM. From Wikimedia, public domain.	14
Areas of Genízaro settlement. Figure made by author.	39
Matachines Dance performed on Aug. 10, 2018 on the Cañon de Carnue Land Grant, New Mexico. Photo by Bill Piatt.	43
Matachines, San Antonio, New Mexico (June 12, 1931). Photo by Carmen Chavez Gonzales, grandmother of Moises Gonzales handed down to him and part of his collection.	53
Historical Structures on the Genízaro Cañon de Carnue Land Grant, New Mexico (2018). Photos by Bill Piatt.	84
Professor Moises Gonzales, Comanchitos Dance, New Mexico (2018). Photo by Lynn Velarde y Gonzales.	113
Pueblo de Abiquiu Dancers, Abiquiu, New Mexico (November 24, 2017). Photo by Moises Gonzales.	121
Historic Genízaro pottery shards, Cañon de Carnue Land Grant, New Mexico (2018). Photo by Bill Piatt.	160
Creek, Cañon de Carnue Land Grant, New Mexico (2018). Photo by Bill Piatt.	178
Mass on Tortugas Peak, New Mexico, in honor of Our Lady of Guadalupe, (Dec. 11 2018). https://www.facebook.com/TortugasPueblo/photos/rpp.1526719887592524/2194118040852702/?type=3&theater .	180
Church of San Antonio, Cañon de Carnue Land Grant, New Mexico (2018). Photo by Bill Piatt.	185
Comanchitos de la Sierra, La Madera, New Mexico (December 15, 2017). Photo by Lynn Velarde y Gonzales.	190



Moises Gonzales and Genízaro *danzantes*, *Comanchitos* Dance, Atrisco, New Mexico (Dec. 8, 2018). Photo by Lynn Velarde y Gonzales.

Acknowledgments

Bill Piatt wishes to thank Katja Wolf, LL.M. Katja served not only as his research assistant but also his collaborator on this project. She is also his co-author along with Moises Gonzales on their New Mexico Law Review article *Law Schools Harm Genízaros and Other Indigenous People by Misunderstanding ABA Policy*. This book would not have been completed without her help. He is grateful to his research assistants, Kimberly Boutte and Carroll McHaney, and to his administrative assistant Maria Vega, for their assistance.

Moises Gonzales is grateful for las animas de los antepasados y los danzantes de los pueblos Genízaros—the spirits of our ancestors and to all the traditional dancers from Genízaro communities.

