

New York Legal Research

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
LEGAL RESEARCH SERIES

Tenielle Fordyce-Ruff, Series Editor
Suzanne E. Rowe, Series Editor Emerita



- Arizona, Third Edition—Tamara S. Herrera
Arkansas, Second Edition—Coleen M. Barger, Cheryl L. Reinhart &
Cathy L. Underwood
California, Fourth Edition—Aimee Dudovitz, Sarah Laubach & Suzanne E. Rowe
Colorado, Second Edition—Robert Michael Linz
Connecticut—Jessica G. Hynes
Federal, Second Edition—Mary Garvey Algero, Spencer L. Simons,
Suzanne E. Rowe, Scott Childs & Sarah E. Ricks
Florida, Fifth Edition—Barbara J. Busharis, Anne E. Mullins & Suzanne E. Rowe
Georgia—Nancy P. Johnson, Elizabeth G. Adelman & Nancy J. Adams
Idaho, Third Edition—Tenielle Fordyce-Ruff
Illinois, Second Edition—Mark E. Wojcik
Iowa, Second Edition—John D. Edwards, Karen L. Wallace & Melissa H. Weresh
Kansas—Joseph A. Custer & Christopher L. Steadham
Kentucky, Second Edition—William A. Hilyerd, Kurt X. Metzmeier & David J. Ensign
Louisiana, Third Edition—Mary Garvey Algero
Massachusetts, Second Edition—E. Joan Blum & Shaun B. Spencer
Michigan, Third Edition—Cristina D. Lockwood & Pamela Lysaght
Minnesota—Suzanne Thorpe
Mississippi—Kristy L. Gilliland
Missouri, Third Edition—Wanda M. Temm & Julie M. Cheslik
New York, Fourth Edition—Elizabeth G. Adelman, Courtney L. Selby,
Brian T. Detweiler & Kathleen Darvil
North Carolina, Third Edition—Brenda D. Gibson, Julie L. Kimbrough,
Laura P. Graham & Nichelle J. Perry
North Dakota—Anne E. Mullins & Tammy R. Pettinato
Ohio, Second Edition—Sara Sampson, Katherine L. Hall & Carolyn Broering-Jacobs
Oklahoma—Darin K. Fox, Darla W. Jackson & Courtney L. Selby
Oregon, Fourth Edition, Revised Printing—Suzanne E. Rowe & Megan Austin
Pennsylvania, Second Edition—Barbara J. Busharis, Catherine M. Dunn,
Bonny L. Tavares & Carla P. Wale
Tennessee, Second Edition—Scott Childs, Sibyl Marshall & Carol McCrehan Parker
Texas, Second Edition—Spencer L. Simons
Washington, Second Edition—Julie A. Heintz-Cho, Tom Cobb & Mary A. Hotchkiss
West Virginia, Second Edition—Hollie Schwartz Temple
Wisconsin—Patricia Cervenka & Leslie Behroozi
Wyoming, Second Edition—Debora A. Person & Tawnya K. Plumb



New York Legal Research

Fourth Edition

Elizabeth G. Adelman
Courtney L. Selby
Brian T. Detweiler
Kathleen Darvil

Tenielle Fordyce-Ruff, Series Editor
Suzanne E. Rowe, Series Editor Emerita



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2020
Carolina Academic Press, LLC
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Adelman, Elizabeth, author. | Selby, Courtney, author. | Detweiler, Brian, author. | Darvil, Kathleen, author.

Title: New York legal research / by Elizabeth G. Adelman, Courtney L. Selby, Brian Detweiler, Kathleen Darvil.

Description: Fourth edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, , LLC, [2020] | Series: Legal Research Series | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2020009395 | ISBN 9781531016661 (paperback) | ISBN 9781531016678 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Legal research—New York (State)

Classification: LCC KFN5074 .A34 2020 | DDC 340/.0720747—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020009395>

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

For “A” and A^2
—E.G.A.

For Sarah, who makes sure I tighten my prose.
—C.L.S.

To my parents, for everything.
—B.T.D.

*To my husband, Ben, for reminding me to treasure our
loved ones and for always making me laugh.*
—K.D.

Summary of Contents

List of Tables and Figures	xix
Series Note	xxv
Preface to the Fourth Edition	xxvii
Chapter 1 · The Research Process and Legal Analysis	3
Chapter 2 · Legal Research Techniques	13
Chapter 3 · Secondary Sources	35
Chapter 4 · Researching Judicial Opinions	57
Chapter 5 · Statutes, Constitutions, Local Laws, and Court Rules	89
Chapter 6 · Legislative History	111
Chapter 7 · Administrative Law	131
Chapter 8 · Updating with Citators	151
Chapter 9 · New York City Legal Research	167
Chapter 10 · Legal Ethics Research	183
Chapter 11 · Research Strategies and Organization	193
Appendix · Legal Citation	209

About the Authors	215
Index	217

Contents

List of Tables and Figures	xix
Series Note	xxv
Preface to the Fourth Edition	xxvii
Chapter 1 · The Research Process and Legal Analysis	3
1. New York Legal Research	3
2. The Intersection of Legal Research and Legal Analysis	3
3. Types of Legal Authority	4
4. Overview of the Research Process	6
A. Frame the Question(s) and Develop Search Terms	7
B. Identify, Prioritize, and Consult Relevant Sources	9
i. Secondary Sources	9
ii. Primary Authorities	10
C. Expand and Update Your Research	10
D. Make Sure Your Research Is Responsive to the Question(s) Presented	11
E. Know When to Stop	11
5. Organization of This Book	12
Chapter 2 · Legal Research Techniques	13
1. Introduction to Commercial Databases	13
A. Natural Language Searching versus Terms and Connectors Searching	14
B. Segment and Field Searching	14

C. Table of Contents Searching	16
D. Keeping Current with Alerts	16
E. Organizational Tools: Folders and Workspaces	16
2. Lexis Advance	17
A. Keyword Searching on Lexis Advance	17
B. Browsing Sources on Lexis Advance	18
C. Creating Alerts on Lexis Advance	20
3. Westlaw Edge	20
A. Keyword Searching on Westlaw Edge	20
B. Browsing Sources on Westlaw Edge	22
C. Creating Alerts on Westlaw Edge	23
4. Fastcase	24
5. Open Access Resources	25
A. Case Law on Google Scholar	26
B. New York State Statutes on the State Legislature Website	27
C. New York Codes, Rules, and Regulations, Provided by Thomson Reuters	28
D. Additional State Administrative Law Resources	28
E. Federal Primary Law Materials on Govinfo	28
F. United States Code on the Office of the Law Revision Counsel Website	29
G. Code of Federal Regulations on the e-CFR	29
H. Additional Federal Administrative Law Resources	30
I. Cost-Effective Research	30
6. Making the Most of Your Local Law Library	31
7. Print Research Techniques	32
A. Table of Contents Searching in Print Resources	32
B. Searching with a Print Index	32
C. Updating Print Resources	33
8. Conclusion	33
 Chapter 3 · Secondary Sources	 35
1. Introduction	35
2. Encyclopedias	35
A. State Encyclopedias	36

B. Multijurisdictional Encyclopedias	38
C. Using Legal Encyclopedias	38
3. Practice Materials	40
A. Bar Association Materials	40
i. New York State	40
ii. National	41
iii. Finding Bar Association Materials	41
B. CLE Materials	41
C. Forms	42
D. Pattern Jury Instructions	44
E. Finding and Using Practice Materials	44
4. Legal Periodicals	45
A. Academic and Commercial Legal Periodicals	45
B. Finding Law Review and Journal Articles	46
i. Indexes	46
ii. Online Journal and Law Review Databases	47
iii. Freely Available Journals and Law Reviews	48
5. American Law Reports	49
6. Treatises, Hornbooks, and Nutshells	49
7. Restatements, Principles, Model Codes, and Uniform Laws	51
A. Restatements and Principles of the Law	51
B. Model Codes and Uniform Laws	53
8. Using Secondary Sources	55
A. Choosing a Secondary Source	55
B. Citing a Secondary Source	55
Chapter 4 · Researching Judicial Opinions	57
1. Court Systems	57
A. New York State Unified Court System	58
B. Federal Courts	61
2. Reporters	62
A. Reporters for New York Cases	62
i. Citing New York Cases	64
ii. Features of a Reported Case as Published by Thomson Reuters	65

iii. Advance Sheets	70
iv. Other Sources for New York Cases	70
B. Reporters for Federal Cases	71
3. Finding Cases	72
A. Retrieving Cases by Citation	72
i. Commercial Research Platforms	73
ii. Using Free Online Sources	73
a. Court Websites	73
b. Google Scholar	74
iii. Print	75
B. Finding and Retrieving Cases Referenced in Other Sources	75
i. From Secondary Sources	75
ii. From Other Cases	75
a. The One Good Case Approach Using Westlaw Edge	76
b. The One Good Case Approach Using Lexis Advance	78
iii. From Dockets and Case Filings	79
C. Online Search Strategies	80
i. Choose the Right Database Within the Research Platform	80
ii. Natural Language versus Boolean or Advanced Search	81
iii. Searching within Results	82
D. Discovering and Retrieving Cases in Print	83
E. Unpublished Opinions	84
F. Updating and Validating Cases	85
Chapter 5 · Statutes, Constitutions, Local Laws, and Court Rules	89
1. New York Statutes	89
A. Consolidated and Unconsolidated Laws Defined	90
B. Sources of Consolidated Laws	91
C. Sources of Unconsolidated Laws	93
i. Current Sources of Unconsolidated Laws	93
ii. Historical Source of Unconsolidated Laws	94
D. The Research Process Using Print Codes	94
i. Develop a List of Research Terms	94
ii. Search the Index	95
iii. Find and Read the Statutory Language	95
iv. Update the Section of the Code	96
v. Find Cases That Interpret or Apply Statutes	96
E. Chapter Laws and Session Laws	97

F. Using Online Codes and Session Laws	98
i. Using the Online Codes and Chapter Laws on Lexis Advance and Westlaw Edge	98
ii. Using LRS Online to Retrieve Current Codes and Session Laws	99
G. Uniform Laws Annotated	99
2. New York Constitutions	100
3. Local Laws, Special Laws, and Ordinances	101
A. New York City	101
B. Other Jurisdictions in New York	101
C. Sources of Local Laws, Special Laws, and Ordinances	102
4. Court Rules	102
5. Federal Research	105
A. Federal Codes	105
i. Sources of the Federal Code	106
ii. United States Code	106
iii. <i>United States Code Annotated</i> and <i>United States Code Service</i>	106
iv. Finding Federal Statutes	107
B. Session Laws	107
C. United States Constitution	108
D. Federal Court Rules	109
Chapter 6 · Legislative History	111
1. Introduction to the Legislative Process	111
A. Overview of the New York Legislative Process	111
B. Categories of Bills	115
C. Resolutions	116
2. Bill Tracking	116
3. New York Legislative History Research	118
A. Sources of New York Legislative History	119
B. Process of New York Legislative History Research	124
4. Federal Legislative Research	128
A. Brief Overview of the Federal Legislative Process	128
B. Federal Bill Tracking	129

C. Federal Legislative History	129
i. Sources of Federal Legislative History	129
ii. Compiled Legislative History	130
iii. Online Sources for Federal Legislative History	130
Chapter 7 · Administrative Law	131
1. Introduction to Administrative Law and Governmental Agencies	131
2. Administrative Rules	132
A. Overview	132
B. The Rulemaking Process	134
3. Administrative Law Research	135
A. Researching the Enabling Act	135
B. Locating Rules	136
C. Exploring Regulatory Intent	137
D. Judicial Interpretation of Rules	141
E. Updating and Tracking Tools	141
4. Researching Agency Decisions	141
5. Researching Attorney General Opinions	142
6. Researching Governors' Executive Orders and Proclamations	144
7. Other Resources for Researching New York Administrative Law	145
8. Federal Administrative Law	146
A. Code of Federal Regulations	146
B. Federal Register	146
C. Updating Federal Regulations	147
D. Agency Decisions	148
E. Judicial Opinions	148
Chapter 8 · Updating with Citators	151
1. Why Update	151
2. When to Update	151
3. How to Update Case Law Using Online Citators	152
A. Updating Cases with Shepard's on Lexis Advance	152
B. Updating Cases with KeyCite on Westlaw Edge	154
C. Authority Check on Fastcase	157

D. How Cited on Google Scholar	158
4. Updating Statutes and Regulations with Online Citators	164
A. Updating Statutes and Regulations Using Shepard's	164
B. Updating Statutes and Regulations Using KeyCite	165
5. Online Citators for Law Review Articles	165
A. Shepard's for Law Review Articles on Lexis Advance	166
B. KeyCite for Law Review Articles on Westlaw Edge	166
Chapter 9 · New York City Legal Research	167
1. Introduction	167
2. New York City's Charter	167
A. The Current Charter	167
B. Revisions to the Charter	168
C. Finding the Charter and Related Documents	169
i. In Print	169
ii. Online	169
iii. Charter Revision Commission Documents	170
D. Historical Background of Charter Sections	170
3. New York City's Legislative Structure	170
A. Legislation	171
B. Finding Council Bills and Meeting Minutes	172
i. Bills	172
ii. Meeting Minutes	172
4. New York City's Administrative System	173
A. Origin of the Administrative Code	173
B. The Administrative Code	174
C. Finding the Administrative Code	174
i. In Print	174
ii. Online	175
5. New York City's Rules	175
A. Origin of Rules and Authority to Promulgate	175
B. Organization of Rules	176
C. Sources of Rules	176
D. Opinions and Rulings	177
i. Agency Rulings	177

ii. Actions against Agencies, Opinions of the Corporation Counsel	177
6. New York City's Court System	178
A. Court Structure	178
i. New York City Civil Court	179
ii. New York City Criminal Court	179
iii. Other Courts in New York City	179
B. Court Rules	180
C. Case Law of New York City	180
Chapter 10 · Legal Ethics Research	183
1. Introduction to Legal Ethics Research	183
2. The Model Code and Model Rules: A Brief History	183
3. Comparing the Style of the Old Rules to the <i>New York Rules of Professional Conduct</i>	185
A. New York Lawyer's Code of Professional Responsibility	185
B. New York Rules of Professional Conduct	186
4. The Process of Legal Ethics Research	187
A. Preparation for Research	187
B. New York's Model Rules, New York Statutes, and Other Laws	188
C. New York Opinions	189
i. Ethics Opinions	189
ii. Disciplinary Proceedings	190
D. Other Jurisdictions	191
E. Precedent from Other Jurisdictions and Secondary Sources	191
Chapter 11 · Research Strategies and Organization	193
1. Developing a Research Strategy	193
A. Review the Research Process	193
B. Think Through the Practical Considerations	193
C. Take Notes That Make a Difference	196
D. Choose a Strategy that Fits	198
i. The Fresh Search	198
ii. Starting with a Case, Statute, or Regulation on Point	198
iii. Using an Iterative Approach	199
iv. Researching within Time Constraints	200

E. Cost-Effective Research Methods	200
i. Consider the Format	200
ii. Consider Free Sources	201
F. Sample Strategy	201
2. Organization	203
A. Organizing Authorities	203
B. Organizing Analysis	204
3. Ending Research	204
Appendix · Legal Citation	209
1. New York Citation	209
A. Citation Placement and Appearance	210
B. Case Citation	211
C. Statutory Citation	213
2. Citations Not Covered by a Manual	213
About the Authors	215
Index	217

List of Tables and Figures

Tables

Table 1-1. Essential Elements of the Research Process	7
Table 1-2. Developing Search Terms	9
Table 2-1. Commonly Used Terms and Connectors	15
Table 2-2. Advanced Search Symbols on Google Scholar	27
Table 2-3. Free Federal Legislative Resources	30
Table 2-4. Additional Commercial Databases	31
Table 3-1. Restatement Areas and Topics of Law	53
Table 4-1. Reporters for New York Cases	63
Table 4-2. Reporters for Federal Court Cases	71
Table 5-1. Researching Statutes	90
Table 5-2. Examples of Bluebook Citation Formats for McKinney's and CLS	92
Table 5-3. Researching New York Statutes in Print	94
Table 5-4. Online Sources of New York's Consolidated Laws	98

Table 5-5. Selected Print and Online Sources of New York Court Rules	103
Table 6-1. Outline for Bill Tracking	116
Table 6-2. Selected Online Sources for Bill Tracking	119
Table 6-3. Summary of How a Bill Becomes a Law and Documents Associated with the Process	120
Table 6-4. Checklist for New York Legislative History Research	126
Table 7-1. Outline for New York Administrative Law Research	132
Table 7-2. Online Sources of Agency Rules: NYCRR and <i>State Register</i>	137
Table 7-3. History Line from New York Rule 9 NYCRR § 7005.5	138
Table 7-4. Selected Online Sources of New York Agency Decisions	143
Table 7-5. Selected Sources of Attorney General Opinions	144
Table 7-6. Current Sources of Governors' Executive Orders	145
Table 8-1. Treatment Indicators for Selected Online Citators	156
Table 9-1. New York City Charter Excerpt	168
Table 9-2. Locations of Current and Past Intros and Local Laws	173
Table 9-3. New York City's Administrative Code Excerpt	174
Table 9-4. Agency Decisions Included in New York Law School's City Admin	178
Table 10-1. Timeline of Historical Development of Rules of Professional Ethics	184
Table 10-2. Legal Ethics Research Steps	187

Table 10-3. Selected Online Sources for the <i>New York Rules of Professional Conduct</i>	188
Table 11-1. Sample Research Strategy	202
Table 11-2. Organizing Research Results with Analysis	206
Table A-1. Citation with the <i>New York Law Reports Style Manual</i>	210
Table A-2. Preferred Reporters Under the <i>New York Style Manual</i>	212
Figures	
Figure 2-1. Table of Contents View on Lexis Advance	19
Figure 2-2. Advanced Search Fields for Cases on Westlaw Edge	21
Figure 2-3. The West Key Number System Interface on Westlaw Edge	23
Figure 3-1. Table of Contents in New York Jur	36
Figure 3-2. Table of Contents of Carmody-Wait, 2d on Westlaw Edge	37
Figure 3-3. Content Types on Westlaw Edge	39
Figure 3-4. Table of Contents in Bender's Forms	43
Figure 3-5. <i>American Law Reports</i> Annotation	50
Figure 3-6. Example of a Restatement of the Law	52
Figure 4-1. Civil Court Structure	59
Figure 4-2. Criminal Court Structure	60
Figure 4-3. Case from Westlaw Edge, <i>People v. Lewis</i> , 502 N.E.2d 988 (N.Y. 1986)	67
Figure 4-4. Example of a Headnote as Displayed on Lexis Advance	78

Figure 4-5. Excerpt from the Descriptive-Word Index in <i>West's New York Digest, 4th</i>	84
Figure 5-1. Excerpt of New York Statute from McKinney's	96
Figure 6-1. How a Bill Becomes a Law in New York	112
Figure 6-2. Bill Status Page from the New York State Senate's Website	117
Figure 6-3. Text of Statute with History Line, <i>New York Consolidated Laws Service</i> and McKinney's	124
Figure 7-1. Example of a New York Agency Rule and Historical Note	133
Figure 7-2. NYCRR Digital Archive Basic Search Screen	138
Figure 7-3. Text of the August 1997 Version of 9 NYCRR § 7005	139
Figure 7-4. Reproduction of Notice of Agency Action from the Print <i>State Bulletin</i>	140
Figure 7-5. Example of Federal Regulations from GovInfo, 28 CFR § 551	147
Figure 8-1. Shepard's Report Citing Decisions on Lexis Advanc	153
Figure 8-2. Filtering by Headnote Topics in the KeyCite Citing References Tab	157
Figure 8-3. Authority Check on Fastcase 6	159
Figure 8-4. Authority Check on Fastcase 6	160
Figure 8-5. Negative Treatment of a Case in Fastcase 7's Authority Check	161
Figure 8-6. How Cited on Google Scholar	162
Figure 8-7. List of Citing Documents Accessed from Google Scholar's How Cited Page	163

Figure 9-1. New York City Council Flowchart	171
Figure 11-1. Template for Research Notes	197

Series Note

The Legal Research Series published by Carolina Academic Press includes titles from many states around the country as well as a separate text on federal legal research. The goal of each book is to provide law students, practitioners, paralegals, college students, laypeople, and librarians with the essential elements of legal research in each jurisdiction. Unlike more bibliographic texts, the Legal Research Series books seek to explain concisely both the sources of legal research and the process for conducting legal research effectively.

Preface to the Fourth Edition

The goal of *New York Legal Research* is to explore concisely both the sources of New York state law research and the process of conducting research using these sources. New to the fourth edition is a much greater emphasis on online sources and online research process. Print sources are discussed when it provides an opportunity to enhance the research process or when no online equivalent is available.

Writing a book like this is a collaborative effort, and that approach is as true in this edition as it was in previous editions. In the fourth edition, Elizabeth Adelman took a leading role in updating the chapters on legislative history, administrative law, and legal ethics. Courtney Selby was responsible for updating the chapters on the process of legal research, case law research, and research strategies and organization. Brian Detweiler was responsible for updating the chapters on legal research techniques and updating. In addition, he took the leading role in updating the citation appendix. We welcomed a new co-author in this edition: Kathleen Darvil took a leading role in updating the chapters on secondary sources, statutes, and New York City law.

The authors gratefully acknowledge Suzanne Rowe (University of Oregon) and Theodora Belniak's (University at Buffalo) contributions to this book. Suzanne co-authored the first and second editions and Theodora co-authored the second and third editions. Any of their work that remains is used with their permission. Tenielle Fordyce-Ruff contributed to each chapter in this book through her role as series editor for the fourth edition. Portions of this edition continue to be drawn from other books in the Legal Research Series and are used with permission. Please note that reproduction of this work is prohibited.

Elizabeth G. Adelman
Courtney L. Selby
Brian T. Detweiler
Kathleen Darvil
February 2020

