

**The Cherokee Supreme Court:
1823–1835**

The Cherokee Supreme Court: 1823–1835

J. Matthew Martin



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2021
J. Matthew Martin
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Martin, J. Matthew, author.

Title: The Cherokee Supreme Court : 1823–1835 / by J. Matthew Martin.

Description: Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, LLC,
[2020]

Identifiers: LCCN 2020030629 (print) | LCCN 2020030630 (ebook) | ISBN
9781531018412 (paperback) | ISBN 9781531018429 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Cherokee Indians—Legal status, laws, etc. |
Courts—Cherokee Nation. | Cherokee law. | Indians of North
America—Legal status, laws, etc. | United States. Supreme Court.

Classification: LCC KIG2013 .M37 2020 (print) | LCC KIG2013 (ebook) |
DDC

347.73/2808997557—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020030629>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020030630>

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

For C.S.M.

Contents

| | |
|--|-----|
| Acknowledgments | ix |
| 1 · Introduction | 3 |
| A Manifest Destiny | 3 |
| A Legal Framework Emerges | 6 |
| Methodology | 8 |
| 2 · The Origins of the Cherokee Supreme Court | 17 |
| 3 · The Language of the Court | 33 |
| 4 · Women and the Court | 41 |
| 5 · The Court and the Institution of Slavery | 53 |
| 6 · The Criminal Jurisprudence of the Court | 67 |
| 7 · The Civil Jurisprudence of the Court | 89 |
| 8 · Conclusion | 99 |
| Appendix: Cherokee Supreme Court Judgment Docket | 105 |
| Index | 215 |

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank all the tribal court personnel with whom I served over the years, in particular my fellow judges: Chief Justices Harry C. Martin, William M. Boyum, and my great friend, Kirk G. Saunooke; Associate Justices Brenda Toineeta-Pipestem, Terri Henry, and Danny E. Davis; the late Judge Steve Philo; and Magistrates Hope Pheasant, Dick Crowe, Elizabeth Jackson, Sam Reed, Anthony Sequoyah, and David Blanton. It was a privilege to serve the Cherokee people, and I appreciate Principal Chiefs Leon Jones and Michell Hicks for appointing me to the bench and the Tribal Council for confirming me.

The library staffs at the following institutions have been extraordinarily helpful and patient: the Tennessee State Archives, the UNC School of Law's Katherine R. Everett Law Library and its outstanding director, Professor Anne Klinefelter, the Hunter Library at Western Carolina University, Chancellor Emeritus Anne Ponder and the Ramsey Library at UNC-Asheville, the University of North Carolina's Davis Library, and especially my research assistant, Nor Ortiz, of the University of North Carolina's House Library and Everett Law Library.

My colleagues at the UNC School of Law, the Elon University School of Law, the American Bar Association, and the National Judicial College have been uniformly supportive of this project, and I appreciate their interest.

James W. Kilbourne, Jr. made an off-handed comment one afternoon following a court session about the activities of the original Cherokee Supreme Court. That comment led to this research, and he deserves credit for sparking my interest in this period.

The following individuals have been kind enough to review portions of this material and provide invaluable feedback over the years: Andy Cahan, Judge Tim Fox, the late Justice Harry C. Martin, Craig Nova, George Sagar, George

Pappas, Ph.D., David Chase Hawisher, Clarke S. Martin, Professor Matthew L. M. Fletcher, and Col. Joe Martin.

I was fortunate to have a Ph.D. committee committed to this work, each of whom prodded me to continue it: my chair, Elizabeth A. Francis, Ph.D.; Jim Richardson, Ph.D., J.D.; John D. Loftin, Ph.D., J.D.; and Vice Chancellor Emeritus Stacy Leeds, J.D., M.B.A., L.L.M. Theda Perdue, Ph.D., helped me for years as a member of my master's committee before retiring. The late Elmer Rusco, Ph.D., served on my master's committee. Cameron Strang, Ph.D., served as my graduate school representative. Shawn Marsh, Ph.D., the director of the Judicial Studies Program at the University of Nevada-Reno, stepped in when Dr. Richardson could not attend the defense. Without their care and input, this would not have been possible.

Portions of this material have previously appeared in the *North Carolina Central Law Review* and the *Elon Law Review*. I am most appreciative of those two journals and their staffs for their interest in this work.

I am very grateful to everyone at Carolina Academic Press for their support. Thanks also to Justices Mark Davis and Willis Whichard.

Finally, I would like to thank my long-suffering family, Catherine and Clarke Martin, who have been very patient and helpful over the last eighteen years as this book came into being.