

Understanding the First Amendment

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS UNDERSTANDING SERIES

- Understanding Administrative Law,
Sixth Edition**
William Fox, Jr.
- Understanding Alternative Dispute Resolution**
Kristen M. Blankley and Maureen A. Weston
- Understanding Animal Law**
Adam Karp
- Understanding Antitrust and Its Economic
Implications, Seventh Edition**
E. Thomas Sullivan and Jeffrey L. Harrison
- Understanding Bankruptcy, Fourth Edition**
Jeffrey Ferriell and Edward J. Janger
- Understanding California Community
Property Law**
Jo Carrillo
- Understanding Capital Punishment Law,
Fourth Edition**
Linda E. Carter, Ellen S. Kreitzberg,
and Scott W. Howe
- Understanding Civil Procedure, Sixth Edition**
Gene R. Shreve, Peter Raven-Hansen, and
Charles Gardner Geyh
- Understanding Civil Procedure:
The California Edition**
Walter W. Heiser, Gene R. Shreve,
Peter Raven-Hansen, and
Charles Gardner Geyh
- Understanding Civil Rights Litigation,
Second Edition**
Howard M. Wasserman
- Understanding Conflict of Laws,
Fourth Edition**
William M. Richman, William L. Reynolds,
and Chris A. Whytock
- Understanding Constitutional Law,
Fourth Edition**
John B. Attanasio and Joel K. Goldstein
- Understanding Contracts, Fourth Edition**
Jeffrey Ferriell
- Understanding Copyright Law,
Seventh Edition**
Marshall A. Leaffer
- Understanding Corporate Law,
Fifth Edition**
Arthur R. Pinto and Douglas M. Branson
- Understanding Corporate Taxation,
Third Edition**
Leandra Lederman and Michelle Kwon
- Understanding Criminal Law,
Eighth Edition**
Joshua Dressler
- Understanding Criminal Procedure:
Vol. 1: Investigation, Seventh Edition**
Joshua Dressler, Alan C. Michaels,
and Ric Simmons
- Understanding Criminal Procedure:
Vol. 2: Adjudication, Fourth Edition**
Joshua Dressler and Alan C. Michaels
- Understanding Disability Law,
Third Edition**
Mark C. Weber
- Understanding Election Law
and Voting Rights**
Michael R. Dimino, Bradley A. Smith,
and Michael E. Solimine
- Understanding Employee Benefits Law**
Kathryn L. Moore
- Understanding Employment
Discrimination Law, Second Edition**
Thomas R. Haggard
- Understanding Employment Law,
Third Edition**
Paul M. Secunda, Richard A. Bales,
and Jeffrey M. Hirsch
- Understanding Environmental Law,
Third Edition**
Philip Weinberg and Kevin A. Reilly
- Understanding Estate and Gift Taxation,
Second Edition**
Brant J. Hellwig and Robert T. Danforth
- Understanding Evidence, Fifth Edition**
Paul C. Giannelli
- Understanding Family Law, Fourth Edition**
John Gregory, Peter N. Swisher,
and Robin Wilson
- Understanding Federal and
California Evidence**
Paul C. Giannelli
- Understanding Federal Courts
and Jurisdiction, Second Edition**
Linda Mullenix, Martin H. Redish,
and Georgene Vairo
- Understanding Federal Income Taxation,
Sixth Edition**
J. Martin Burke and Michael K. Friel

- Understanding The First Amendment,
Seventh Edition**
Russell L. Weaver
- Understanding Immigration Law,
Third Edition**
Kevin R. Johnson, Raquel Aldana,
Bill Ong Hing, Leticia M. Saucedo,
and Enid Trucios-Haynes
- Understanding Insurance Law, Sixth Edition**
Robert H. Jerry, II and Douglas Richmond
- Understanding Intellectual Property Law,
Fourth Edition**
Tyler T. Ochoa, Shubha Ghosh,
and Mary LaFrance
- Understanding International Business
and Financial Transactions,
Fourth Edition**
Jerold A. Friedland
- Understanding International Criminal Law,
Third Edition**
Ellen S. Podgor and Roger S. Clark
- Understanding International Law,
Second Edition**
Stephen C. McCaffrey
- Understanding Jewish Law, Second Edition**
Steven H. Resnicoff
- Understanding Juvenile Law,
Fifth Edition**
Martin Gardner
- Understanding Labor Law,
Fifth Edition**
Douglas E. Ray, Calvin William Sharpe,
and Robert N. Strassfeld
- Understanding the Law of Terrorism,
Second Edition**
Erik Luna and Wayne McCormack
- Understanding the Law of Zoning
and Land Use Controls, Third Edition**
Barlow Burke
- Understanding Lawyers' Ethics, Fifth Edition**
Monroe H. Freedman and Abbe Smith
- Understanding Local Government,
Second Edition**
Sandra Stevenson
- Understanding Modern Real Estate
Transactions, Fourth Edition**
Alex M. Johnson, Jr.
- Understanding Negotiable Instruments
and Payment Systems, Second Edition**
William H. Lawrence
- Understanding Nonprofit and Tax Exempt
Organizations, Second Edition**
Nicholas P. Cafardi and Jaclyn Fabean Cherry
- Understanding Partnership
and LLC Taxation, Fourth Edition**
Jerold A. Friedland
- Understanding Patent Law, Third Edition**
Amy L. Landers
- Understanding Products Liability Law,
Second Edition**
Bruce L. Ottley, Rogelio A. Lasso,
and Terrence F. Kiely
- Understanding Property Law,
Fourth Edition**
John G. Sprankling
- Understanding Remedies, Third Edition**
James M. Fischer
- Understanding Sales and Leases of Goods,
Third Edition**
William H. Henning, William H. Lawrence,
and Henry Deeb Gabriel
- Understanding Secured Transactions,
Fifth Edition**
William H. Lawrence, William H. Henning,
and R. Wilson Freyeremuth
- Understanding Securities Law,
Seventh Edition**
Marc I. Steinberg
- Understanding Taxation of Business Entities**
Walter D. Schwidetzky and Fred B. Brown
- Understanding Torts, Sixth Edition**
John L. Diamond, Lawrence C. Levine,
and Anita Bernstein
- Understanding Trade Secret Law**
John G. Sprankling and
Thomas G. Sprankling
- Understanding Trademark Law,
Fourth Edition**
Mary LaFrance
- Understanding Trusts and Estates,
Sixth Edition**
Roger W. Andersen and Susan Gary
- Understanding White Collar Crime,
Fourth Edition**
J. Kelly Strader

Understanding the First Amendment

SEVENTH EDITION

Russell L. Weaver

PROFESSOR OF LAW AND DISTINGUISHED UNIVERSITY SCHOLAR
UNIVERSITY OF LOUISVILLE
LOUIS D. BRANDEIS SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2020
Russell L. Weaver
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Weaver, Russell L., 1952- author.

Title: Understanding the First Amendment / by Russell L. Weaver.

Description: Seventh edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, [2020] | Series: Carolina Academic Press understanding series | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019045023 | ISBN 9781531018597 (hardcover) | ISBN 9781531018603 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: United States. Constitution. 1st Amendment. | Freedom of expression--United States. | LCGFT: Textbooks.

Classification: LCC KF4770 .W43 2020 | DDC 342.7308/5--dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019045023>

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

To Laurence, Ben and Kate, with love.

Contents

Chapter 1 • The Origins and Nature of the First Amendment	3
§ 1.01 Backdrop to the First Amendment	4
[A] Pre-Colonial Developments	4
[B] Colonial Developments	6
§ 1.02 Adoption of the First Amendment	8
§ 1.03 Development of the First Amendment	9
[A] An Early Tradition of Suppression	9
[B] Judicial Review and the First Amendment	11
§ 1.04 First Amendment Values	12
§ 1.05 Understanding and Applying First Amendment Standards of Review	15
[A] Speech	16
[B] Press	17
[C] Religion	18
[1] Establishment	18
[2] Free Exercise	18
§ 1.06 Types of Speech (Including Symbolic Speech)	19
§ 1.07 A Sample Analysis	19
[A] The Problem	20
[B] An Analytical Roadmap	20
§ 1.08 The First Amendment in Summary	20
Chapter 2 • Speech Advocating Violent or Illegal Action	23
§ 2.01 Formative Case Law	23
§ 2.02 Toward a More Speech Protective Standard	27
§ 2.03 Doctrinal Uncertainty	29
§ 2.04 The Modern Standard of Review	30
Chapter 3 • Content Regulation	35
§ 3.01 Basic Concepts and Applications	36
§ 3.02 Fighting Words	36
§ 3.03 Defamation	39
[A] Traditional Doctrine and Seeds of Change	40
[B] Defamation as Protected Expression: The Actual Malice Requirement	41
[1] Public Officials	41
[2] Public Figures	43
[a] The Outer Limits of the Actual Malice Standard	44
[b] The Public Figure Concept Refined	46

[3] The Not Entirely Irrelevant Public Concern Factor	48
[4] Second Thoughts on the Actual Malice Standard	49
[C] Fact and Opinion	51
[D] False Speech	51
§ 3.04 Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress	52
§ 3.05 Privacy	59
[A] Publication of Personal Information	60
[B] False Light Privacy	62
[C] Right of Publicity	62
[D] Intrusion on Seclusion	63
§ 3.06 Obscenity	64
[A] The Definitional Challenge	64
[B] Doctrinal Chaos	66
[C] <i>Miller</i> Amplifications and Applications	68
[1] Prurient Interest and Community Standards	68
[2] Patent Offensiveness Specified	69
[3] Speech Value	69
[D] Obscenity's Safe Harbor	70
Chapter 4 • Content Regulation: Other Candidates for Categorical Exclusion or Limited Protection	73
§ 4.01 "Offensive" Speech	73
§ 4.02 Child Pornography	80
§ 4.03 Pornography as Discrimination against Women	86
§ 4.04 Crush Videos	90
§ 4.05 Violent Videos	92
§ 4.06 Support for Terrorist Organizations	94
§ 4.07 Lies Regarding the Congressional Medal of Honor	95
§ 4.08 Reparative Therapy	98
§ 4.09 Commercial Speech	99
[A] The Backdrop to Modern Commercial Speech Doctrine	99
[B] Commercial Speech as Protected Expression	100
[C] The Standard of Review	101
[D] Special Circumstances: Lawyer Advertising	107
Chapter 5 • Overbreadth, Vagueness, and Prior Restraints	113
§ 5.01 Overbreadth and Vagueness	114
[A] Overbreadth	115
[B] Vagueness	117
§ 5.02 Prior Restraints	118
[A] Licensing	119
[1] Overview	119
[2] Motion Picture Licensing	120
[3] Non-Licensing Notifications	122
[4] Parade Permits	122

[5] Licensing Fundraisers	123
[6] Newsrack Licensing	123
[B] Injunctions	124
[1] Overview	124
[2] Prior Restraints and National Security	126
[3] Injunctions against Trademark Infringement	129
[4] Injunctions against Abortion Protests	129
[5] Prior Restraints on Printable Gun Designs	132
[6] Prior Restraints on Commercial Speech	133
Chapter 6 • Content Neutrality	135
§ 6.01 Speech Intertwined with Conduct	136
§ 6.02 Secondary Effects	139
§ 6.03 Public Fora	142
[A] Traditional Public Forum	144
[B] Designated Public Forums	149
[C] Reserved Forums	151
§ 6.04 Private Property	158
§ 6.05 Permit Requirements	158
Chapter 7 • Testing the Boundaries of Doctrine	165
§ 7.01 Religious Speech	166
§ 7.02 “Hate” Speech	170
[A] Early Precedent	170
[B] <i>R.A.V.</i>	171
[C] Sentence Enhancement	173
[D] Prohibiting Cross Burning	175
[E] Campus Speech Codes	175
§ 7.03 “True Threats”	177
§ 7.04 Campaign Finance Laws	179
[A] General Theory	180
[B] Expenditure Limitations	182
[C] Contribution Limitations	183
[D] Reporting and Disclosure Requirements	190
[E] Public Financing of Campaigns	193
[F] Government’s Authority to Equalize Resources between Candidates	196
[G] Limitations on Expenditures from Personal or Family Resources	197
[H] Independent Expenditures	198
[I] Corporate Contributions and Expenditures	201
[J] Regulation of Judicial Elections	210
Chapter 8 • Freedom of Association and Compelled Expression	213
§ 8.01 The Right to Associate	213
[A] Early Precedent	214
[B] The House Un-American Activities Committee	215

[C] <i>Claiborne Hardware</i>	216
[D] Compelled Admission to Membership	217
[E] “Fusion” Political Candidates	225
[F] Political Primaries	225
§ 8.02 The Right “Not to Speak”	226
[A] Overview	226
[B] The Solomon Amendment and Law School Placement Offices	229
[C] Parade Inclusion — Exclusion	230
[D] Compelled Financial Support for Expression	231
§ 8.03 Unconstitutional Conditions	237
§ 8.04 The Other Side of the Right to Be Let Alone	240
Chapter 9 • The Government as Employer, Educator, and Source of Funds	243
§ 9.01 First Amendment Rights of Public Employees	244
[A] Prohibiting Electioneering	244
[B] Other Employee Speech	247
[C] Other Governmental Employee Associational Rights	260
§ 9.02 The First Amendment in the Public Schools	265
§ 9.03 Government Financed Speech	273
[A] Overview	273
[B] The National Endowment for the Arts	278
[C] Legal Services Corporation Funding	280
[D] Monuments on Government Property	281
[E] State-Issued Specialty License Plates	282
Chapter 10 • Media and the First Amendment	287
§ 10.01 The Significance of the Press Clause	288
§ 10.02 The Newsgathering Function	289
[A] Reporter’s Privilege	289
[B] Newsroom Searches	292
[C] Access to Prisons	293
[D] Access to Judicial Proceedings	294
[E] The Problem of Prejudicial Publicity	296
[F] Electronic Media in the Courtroom	298
§ 10.03 Media Technology and First Amendment Standards	300
[A] Print	301
[B] Broadcasting	302
[1] Fairness Regulation	302
[2] Regulation of Indecent Programming	305
[C] Cable	308
[1] Must Carriage	308
[2] Regulation of Indecent Programming	310
[D] Telephony	311
[1] Common Carrier Status	311
[2] Indecency Regulation	312

[E] Internet	312
[1] Blogs, Email, and Social Media	313
[2] Regulation of Indecency	317
[F] Video Games	319
[G] Social Media	319
Net Neutrality	320
Chapter 11 · The Establishment Clause	323
§ 11.01 Financial Aid to Religion	325
[A] Early Cases	325
[B] The <i>Lemon</i> Test and Doctrinal Turmoil	327
[C] Other Applications of the <i>Lemon</i> Test	330
[D] Criticism of <i>Lemon</i> 's Three-Part Test	332
[E] <i>Agostini</i> , <i>Mitchell</i> , and Continued Doctrinal Turmoil	334
[1] <i>Agostini</i> 's Modification of <i>Lemon</i>	334
[2] <i>Mitchell</i> and Neutrality	338
[3] <i>Agostini</i> and <i>Mitchell</i> 's Impact	340
§ 11.02 School Vouchers	342
§ 11.03 State Sponsored Prayer	350
[A] In Public Schools	350
[B] Moment of Silence Laws	352
[C] Legislative Prayer	354
[D] Graduation Prayer	355
[E] Prayer at Athletic Events	358
§ 11.04 Curricular Issues	359
[A] Bible Readings	359
[B] Evolution	361
[C] Balanced Treatment of Creation Science	362
[D] Intelligent Design	364
§ 11.05 Official Acknowledgment	365
[A] The Ten Commandments	365
[B] Latin Crosses	373
[C] Holiday Displays	375
[D] Swearing Belief in God	380
[E] Day of Rest	380
[F] Church Vetoes	380
§ 11.06 Establishment-Free Exercise and Free Speech Tension	381
[A] <i>Kiryas Joel</i> and Special School Districts	381
[B] Prohibitions against Discrimination	384
[C] Armed Forces Chaplains	384
[D] Speech and Religion	385
[E] Religious Instruction in Public Schools	387
[F] Use of Public School Facilities	387
[G] Vocational Assistance to the Handicapped	388

[H] Funding of Non-Profit Private Organizations	388
[I] College Scholarships	389
Chapter 12 · The Free Exercise Clause	393
§ 12.01 Burdens on Religion	393
[A] Early Cases	394
[B] From <i>Sherbert</i> to <i>Smith</i>	395
[C] Modern Cases	400
§ 12.02 Discrimination against Religion	411
Table of Cases	423
Index	431