

# Criminal Law



# Criminal Law

## *Concepts and Practice*

FIFTH EDITION

**ELLEN S. PODGOR**

Gary R. Trombley Family White-Collar Crime Research Professor  
Professor of Law  
Stetson University College of Law

**PETER J. HENNING**

Professor of Law  
Wayne State University Law School

**CYNTHIA E. JONES**

Professor of Law  
American University Washington College of Law

**ALFREDO GARCIA**

Professor of Law  
St. Thomas University School of Law



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2022  
Carolina Academic Press, LLC  
All Rights Reserved

ISBN: 978-1-5310-2029-3  
eISBN: 978-1-5310-2030-9  
LCCN: 2021947413

Carolina Academic Press, LLC  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, NC 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

*Dedicated To:*

*Cheryl*

*Alexandra, Grace, and Molly*

*In memory of my mother, Ernestine, who continues  
to inspire me everyday*

*To Cindy, Christina, James, and Catherine*

*And of course to all of our students.*

*Special Dedication From All of Us To:*

*The late Andrew E. Taslitz*



---

---

# Summary of Contents

---

---

Preface	xxvii
Acknowledgments	xxxii
Online Materials	xxxiii

---

## PART ONE | GENERAL FOUNDATIONS OF CRIMINAL LAW

---

<b>Chapter 1   Overview of Criminal Justice System</b>	<b>3</b>
§ 1.01 Generally	3
§ 1.02 Classifications of Crimes	3
§ 1.03 The Source of Criminal Law	4
A. Common Law	4
B. Criminal Statutes	4
1. Federal, State, and Local Criminal Laws	5
2. The Elements of Crimes	5
3. Lesser Included Offenses	5
C. Model Penal Code	6
D. Limitations on Criminal Statutes	6
§ 1.04 The Criminal Adjudication Process	7
A. Arrest and Booking	7
B. The Charging Decision	8
C. Initial Hearing	9
1. Appointment of Defense Counsel	9
2. Bail	9
D. Preliminary Hearing	10
E. Grand Jury	11
F. Arraignment	11

G. Pretrial Proceedings	12
1. Government Pretrial Preparation	12
2. Defense Case Preparation	12
H. Trial	13
1. Burdens and Presumptions	13
a. Presumption of Innocence	13
b. Burden of Proof and Proof Beyond a Reasonable Doubt	13
2. Constitutionally Guaranteed Trial Rights	14
3. The Role of the Judge and Jury	14
a. Motion for Judgment of Acquittal	15
b. Jury Instructions	15
I. Sentencing	16
J. Appeals	16
K. Post-Conviction Remedies	17
§ 1.05 Plea Agreements	17
A. What Is a Plea?	17
§ 1.06 Problems in Adjudication Process and Criminal Justice Reform	18
A. Wrongful Convictions	18
1. Eyewitness Misidentification	19
2. False Confessions	20
3. Faulty Forensic Science	20
4. Use of Informants or “Incentivized” Witness Testimony	21
B. Jury Nullification	22
C. Racial and Ethnic Disparities in the Criminal Justice System	24
<b>Chapter 2   Principles of Punishment</b>	<b>31</b>
§ 2.01 Generally	31
§ 2.02 Theories of Punishment	31
§ 2.03 Determining the Appropriate Sentence	39
§ 2.04 Sentencing Under the Federal Guidelines	51
§ 2.05 Proportionality	56
§ 2.06 Capital Punishment	60
<b>Chapter 3   Criminal Statutes</b>	<b>73</b>
§ 3.01 General Principles	73
§ 3.02 Common Law versus Model Penal Code (MPC)	74
§ 3.03 Defining the Crime	74
§ 3.04 Constitutional Limits	93
A. Vagueness	93
B. Federalism	98
C. Other Constitutional Limitations	102



---

 PART TWO | ELEMENTS OF A CRIME
 

---

<b>Chapter 4   Actus Reus</b>	<b>107</b>
§ 4.01 The Act	107
§ 4.02 Omission as Actus Reus	113
§ 4.03 Possession as Actus Reus	118
§ 4.04 Status or Condition	123
<b>Chapter 5   Mens Rea</b>	<b>129</b>
§ 5.01 Specific Intent-General Intent	129
§ 5.02 The Model Penal Code	135
A. Model Statute	135
B. Purposely	139
C. Knowingly	142
D. Recklessly	144
E. Negligently	149
§ 5.03 Proving Intent	153
§ 5.04 Willful Blindness	164
§ 5.05 Transferred Intent	170
§ 5.06 Strict Liability	176
§ 5.07 Mistake	182
A. Mistake of Fact	182
B. Mistake of Law	185
C. Mistake of Fact and Law—Model Penal Code	194
<b>Chapter 6   Causation</b>	<b>197</b>
§ 6.01 Cause-in-Fact	197
§ 6.02 Proximate Cause	206

---

 PART THREE | PROOF
 

---

<b>Chapter 7   Concurrence and Proof of the Elements</b>	<b>219</b>
§ 7.01 Concurrence	219
§ 7.02 Proof Beyond a Reasonable Doubt	220
A. Reasonable Doubt	221
B. Proof Beyond a Reasonable Doubt	225
C. Defining Reasonable Doubt	229
D. Jury Unanimity	230
§ 7.03 Jurisdiction and Venue	233

---

 PART FOUR | CRIMES
 

---

<b>Chapter 8   Homicide</b>	<b>245</b>
§ 8.01 The Law of Homicide	245
§ 8.02 Intentional Killings	247
A. Murder—Willful, Deliberate and Premeditated	247
B. Second-Degree Murder	266
1. Murder—Depraved Heart	266
2. Murder—Extreme Recklessness	271
C. Manslaughter	276
§ 8.03 Unintentional Killings	292
A. Involuntary Manslaughter—Simple Negligence	293
B. Involuntary Manslaughter—Gross Negligence	298
C. Involuntary Manslaughter—Unlawful Act Doctrine	302
§ 8.04 The Felony-Murder Rule	307
A. Inherently Dangerous Crimes	307
B. The Merger (Ireland) Rule	312
C. Co-Felon Rule	314
<b>Chapter 9   Sexual Assault</b>	<b>321</b>
§ 9.01 Common Law Rape	321
§ 9.02 Statutes	324
<b>Chapter 10   Theft and Property Offenses</b>	<b>347</b>
§ 10.01 Theft Offenses	347
A. Larceny	348
B. Receiving Stolen Property	365
§ 10.02 Robbery	368
§ 10.03 Burglary	377

---

 PART FIVE | INCHOATE CRIMES AND  
ACCESSORY LIABILITY
 

---

<b>Chapter 11   Attempt</b>	<b>385</b>
§ 11.01 Generally	385
A. Inchoate Offenses	385
B. Attempt	385
§ 11.02 The Act	387
§ 11.03 Mens Rea	394

§ 11.04	Impossibility	402
§ 11.05	Abandonment and Renunciation	407
<b>Chapter 12</b>	<b>  Solicitation</b>	<b>413</b>
<b>Chapter 13</b>	<b>  Conspiracy</b>	<b>419</b>
§ 13.01	Generally	419
§ 13.02	Agreement	422
§ 13.03	Mens Rea	427
§ 13.04	Single-Multiple Conspiracies and Conspirators	436
§ 13.05	Conspiracy and Liability for Substantive Crimes	441
<b>Chapter 14</b>	<b>  Accomplice Liability</b>	<b>447</b>
§ 14.01	Actus Reus	447
§ 14.02	Mens Rea	456

---

**PART SIX | DEFENSES**

---

<b>Chapter 15</b>	<b>  Defenses</b>	<b>475</b>
§ 15.01	Generally	475
§ 15.02	The Right to Present a Defense	479
§ 15.03	Alibi Defense	484
§ 15.04	Justification	490
§ 15.05	Nonstatutory and Cultural Defenses	493
<b>Chapter 16</b>	<b>  Defending Self, Others, and Property</b>	<b>499</b>
§ 16.01	Self-Defense	499
§ 16.02	Battered Person Syndrome	521
§ 16.03	Defense of Others	529
§ 16.04	Defense of Property	538
§ 16.05	Arrest	546
<b>Chapter 17</b>	<b>  Necessity and Duress</b>	<b>561</b>
§ 17.01	Necessity/Choice of Evils	561
§ 17.02	Civil Disobedience	566
§ 17.03	Duress	571
<b>Chapter 18</b>	<b>  Entrapment</b>	<b>579</b>
§ 18.01	Generally	579
§ 18.02	Subjective Predisposition	580
§ 18.03	Objective Approach	586

<b>Chapter 19   Insanity and Diminished Capacity</b>	<b>591</b>
§ 19.01 Competency to Stand Trial	591
§ 19.02 Insanity	596
§ 19.03 Diminished Capacity	611
<b>Chapter 20   Intoxication</b>	<b>621</b>
§ 20.01 Involuntary Intoxication	621
§ 20.02 Strict Liability Crimes	627
§ 20.03 Actus Reus	631
<b>Case Study   <i>Guyger v. Texas</i></b>	<b>637</b>
<b>Table of Cases</b>	<b>651</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>653</b>

---

---

# Contents

---

---

Preface	xxvii
Acknowledgments	xxxi
Online Materials	xxxiii

---

## PART ONE | GENERAL FOUNDATIONS OF CRIMINAL LAW

---

<b>Chapter 1   Overview of Criminal Justice System</b>	<b>3</b>
§ 1.01 Generally	3
§ 1.02 Classifications of Crimes	3
§ 1.03 The Source of Criminal Law	4
A. Common Law	4
B. Criminal Statutes	4
1. Federal, State, and Local Criminal Laws	5
2. The Elements of Crimes	5
3. Lesser Included Offenses	5
C. Model Penal Code	6
D. Limitations on Criminal Statutes	6
§ 1.04 The Criminal Adjudication Process	7
A. Arrest and Booking	7
B. The Charging Decision	8
C. Initial Hearing	9
1. Appointment of Defense Counsel	9
2. Bail	9
D. Preliminary Hearing	10
E. Grand Jury	11

F. Arraignment	11
G. Pretrial Proceedings	12
1. Government Pretrial Preparation	12
2. Defense Case Preparation	12
H. Trial	13
1. Burdens and Presumptions	13
a. Presumption of Innocence	13
b. Burden of Proof and Proof Beyond a Reasonable Doubt	13
2. Constitutionally Guaranteed Trial Rights	14
3. The Role of the Judge and Jury	14
a. Motion for Judgment of Acquittal	15
b. Jury Instructions	15
I. Sentencing	16
J. Appeals	16
K. Post-Conviction Remedies	17
§ 1.05 Plea Agreements	17
A. What Is a Plea?	17
§ 1.06 Problems in Adjudication Process and Criminal Justice Reform	18
A. Wrongful Convictions	18
1. Eyewitness Misidentification	19
2. False Confessions	20
3. Faulty Forensic Science	20
4. Use of Informants or “Incentivized” Witness Testimony	21
B. Jury Nullification	22
C. Racial and Ethnic Disparities in the Criminal Justice System	24
<i>The Police Beating of Floyd Dent</i>	25
Notes and Questions	27
<b>Chapter 2   Principles of Punishment</b>	<b>31</b>
§ 2.01 Generally	31
§ 2.02 Theories of Punishment	31
<i>The Queen v. Dudley and Stephens</i>	31
Notes and Questions	34
<b>Theories of Punishment</b>	34
Notes and Questions	36
<i>Problem One</i>	38
<i>Problem Two</i>	38
§ 2.03 Determining the Appropriate Sentence	39
<i>State v. Jensen</i>	39
Notes and Questions	43
<i>Problem Three</i>	50

§ 2.04	Sentencing Under the Federal Guidelines	51
	<i>United States v. Crawford</i>	52
	Note	55
§ 2.05	Proportionality	56
	<i>Ewing v. California</i>	57
§ 2.06	Capital Punishment	60
	<i>Roper v. Simmons</i>	60
	Notes and Questions	67
<b>Chapter 3   Criminal Statutes</b>		<b>73</b>
§ 3.01	General Principles	73
§ 3.02	Common Law versus Model Penal Code (MPC)	74
§ 3.03	Defining the Crime	74
	<i>People v. Lopez</i>	74
	<i>State v. Donaldson</i>	79
	Notes and Questions	81
	<i>Yates v. United States</i>	84
	Notes and Questions	90
	<i>Problem Four</i>	92
	<i>Problem Five</i>	92
	<i>Problem Six</i>	93
§ 3.04	Constitutional Limits	93
	A. Vagueness	93
	<i>Columbus v. Kim</i>	93
	Notes	95
	<i>Problem Seven</i>	97
	B. Federalism	98
	<i>Jones v. United States</i>	98
	Model Penal Code	
	220.1 Arson and Related Offenses	101
	C. Other Constitutional Limitations	102

---

PART TWO | ELEMENTS OF A CRIME

---

<b>Chapter 4   Actus Reus</b>		<b>107</b>
§ 4.01	The Act	107
	<i>Martin v. State</i>	107
	Notes and Questions	107
	<i>Cox v. Director of Revenue</i>	109
	Notes and Questions	112
§ 4.02	Omission as Actus Reus	113
	<i>West v. Commonwealth</i>	113

	Notes and Questions	116
	<i>Problem Eight</i>	118
§ 4.03	Possession as Actus Reus	118
	<i>State v. Winsor</i>	118
	Notes and Questions	121
	<i>Watson v. State</i>	122
§ 4.04	Status or Condition	123
	<i>Robinson v. California</i>	123
	Note	127
<b>Chapter 5   Mens Rea</b>		<b>129</b>
§ 5.01	Specific Intent-General Intent	129
	<i>United States v. Cortes-Caban</i>	129
	Notes	134
§ 5.02	The Model Penal Code	135
	A. Model Statute	135
	§ 1.13. General Definitions	135
	§ 2.02. General Requirements of Culpability.	136
	Note and Question	138
	B. Purposely	139
	<i>Vermont v. Trombley</i>	139
	Note	141
	C. Knowingly	142
	<i>United States v. Youts</i>	142
	Note	144
	D. Recklessly	144
	<i>People v. Hall</i>	144
	Notes and Questions	148
	E. Negligently	149
	<i>Harber v. State</i>	149
	Note and Question	152
	<i>Problem Nine</i>	153
§ 5.03	Proving Intent	153
	<i>Holloway v. United States</i>	153
	Notes and Questions	157
	<i>State v. Worthy</i>	159
	<i>Problem Ten</i>	163
§ 5.04	Willful Blindness	164
	<i>United States v. Gatto</i>	164
	Notes	167
	<i>Problem Eleven</i>	169



§ 5.05	Transferred Intent	170
	<i>People v. Jackson</i>	170
	Notes	173
	<i>Problem Twelve</i>	175
§ 5.06	Strict Liability	176
	<i>State v. Blake</i>	176
	Notes	179
	<i>Problem Thirteen</i>	182
§ 5.07	Mistake	182
	A. Mistake of Fact	182
	<i>United States v. Bowling</i>	182
	Note	185
	B. Mistake of Law	185
	<i>Cheek v. United States</i>	185
	Notes and Questions	190
	C. Mistake of Fact and Law—Model Penal Code	194
	Model Penal Code	
	§ 2.04 <i>Ignorance or Mistake.</i>	194
	Notes and Questions	194
	<i>Problem Fourteen</i>	195
<b>Chapter 6   Causation</b>		<b>197</b>
§ 6.01	Cause-in-Fact	197
	<i>State v. Lane</i>	197
	Notes and Questions	199
	<i>Lucas v. United States</i>	201
	Notes and Questions	205
	Model Penal Code § 2.03	205
§ 6.02	Proximate Cause	206
	<i>United States v. Pritchard</i>	206
	Notes and Questions	209
	<i>Problem Fifteen</i>	210
	<i>State v. Pelham</i>	211
	Note	216
	<i>Problem Sixteen</i>	216
<hr/> <b>PART THREE   PROOF</b> <hr/>		
<b>Chapter 7   Concurrence and Proof of the Elements</b>		<b>219</b>
§ 7.01	Concurrence	219
	<i>Problem Seventeen</i>	220

§ 7.02	Proof Beyond a Reasonable Doubt	220
	A. Reasonable Doubt	221
	<i>United States v. Jackson</i>	221
	Notes and Questions	224
	B. Proof Beyond a Reasonable Doubt	225
	Model Penal Code § 1.12	225
	Notes and Questions	226
	<i>Problem Eighteen</i>	228
	C. Defining Reasonable Doubt	229
	D. Jury Unanimity	230
	<i>Problem Nineteen</i>	233
§ 7.03	Jurisdiction and Venue	233
	<i>Jones v. State</i>	233
	<i>Commonwealth v. Peck</i>	236
	Notes and Questions	239
	<i>Problem Twenty</i>	242

---

PART FOUR | CRIMES

---

<b>Chapter 8   Homicide</b>	<b>245</b>	
§ 8.01	The Law of Homicide	245
	The Elements of the Major Forms of Common Law	
	Homicide in Most Jurisdictions	246
§ 8.02	Intentional Killings	247
	A. Murder—Willful, Deliberate and Premeditated	247
	California Penal Code	
	§ 187. <i>Murder defined</i>	247
	§ 188. <i>Malice, Express Malice, and Implied Malice Defined.</i>	247
	§ 189. <i>Murder; degrees.</i>	248
	Model Penal Code	
	Article 210. <i>Criminal Homicide</i>	248
	Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court	249
	Article 7. <i>Crimes against Humanity</i>	249
	<i>State v. Thompson</i>	249
	Notes and Questions	254
	<i>Coolen v. State</i>	256
	<i>Gilbert v. State</i>	259
	Notes and Questions	264
	<i>Problem Twenty-One</i>	265

B.	Second-Degree Murder	266
1.	Murder—Depraved Heart	266
	<i>State v. Doub</i>	266
	Note	270
2.	Murder—Extreme Recklessness	271
	<i>United States v. Williams</i>	271
	<i>Problem Twenty-Two</i>	275
C.	Manslaughter	276
	California Penal Code	
	§ 192. Manslaughter	276
	Model Penal Code	
	§ 210.3 Manslaughter	276
	<i>People v. Pouncey</i>	277
	<i>High v. United States</i>	280
	Notes and Questions	283
	<i>State v. Elliot</i>	288
	Notes and Questions	291
§ 8.03	Unintentional Killings	292
	Georgia Penal Code	
	§ 16-5-3. Involuntary manslaughter	292
	Model Penal Code	
	§ 210.4. Negligent Homicide.	293
A.	Involuntary Manslaughter—Simple Negligence	293
	<i>State v. Williams</i>	293
	Notes and Questions	297
B.	Involuntary Manslaughter—Gross Negligence	298
	<i>State v. Thomas</i>	298
	<i>Problem Twenty-Three</i>	302
C.	Involuntary Manslaughter—Unlawful Act Doctrine	302
	<i>State v. Young</i>	302
	Note and Questions	306
§ 8.04	The Felony-Murder Rule	307
A.	Inherently Dangerous Crimes	307
	<i>Hines v. State</i>	307
	Notes and Questions	310
B.	The Merger (Ireland) Rule	312
	<i>People v. Baker</i>	312
C.	Co-Felon Rule	314
	<i>State v. Sophophone</i>	314
	Notes and Questions	318

	<i>Problem Twenty-Four</i>	320
	<i>Problem Twenty-Five</i>	320
<b>Chapter 9   Sexual Assault</b>		<b>321</b>
§ 9.01	Common Law Rape	321
	Susan Estrich, <i>Rape</i>	321
	Anne M. Coughlin, <i>Sex and Guilt</i>	322
§ 9.02	Statutes	324
	Alabama	
	§ 13A-6-61. <i>Rape in the first degree.</i>	324
	Georgia	
	§ 16-6-1. <i>Rape</i>	324
	Maine	
	17-A M.R.S.A. § 253. <i>Gross Sexual Assault</i>	325
	Wisconsin	
	§ 940.225. <i>Sexual assault.</i>	327
	District of Columbia	
	§ 22-3001. <i>Definitions.</i>	331
	§ 22-3002. <i>First degree sexual abuse.</i>	332
	§ 22-3003. <i>Second degree sexual abuse.</i>	333
	§ 22-3004. <i>Third degree sexual abuse.</i>	333
	§ 22-3005. <i>Fourth degree sexual abuse.</i>	334
	§ 22-3006. <i>Misdemeanor sexual abuse.</i>	334
	Model Penal Code	
	§ 213.1. <i>Rape and Related Offenses.</i>	334
	§ 213.2. <i>Deviate Sexual Intercourse by Force or Imposition.</i>	335
	§ 213.3. <i>Corruption of Minors and Seduction.</i>	336
	§ 213.4. <i>Sexual Assault.</i>	336
	<i>Problem Twenty-Six</i>	337
	Note and Questions	337
	<i>Problem Twenty-Seven</i>	345
<b>Chapter 10   Theft and Property Offenses</b>		<b>347</b>
§ 10.01	Theft Offenses	347
	A. Larceny	348
	<i>Bell v. United States</i>	348
	<i>People v. Shannon</i>	351
	Notes and Questions	354
	<i>Problem Twenty-Eight</i>	364

B. Receiving Stolen Property	365
<i>State v. Jennings</i>	365
<i>Problem Twenty-Nine</i>	367
§ 10.02 Robbery	368
<i>Commonwealth v. Powell</i>	368
Notes and Questions	371
<i>Problem Thirty</i>	372
<i>State v. Lennon</i>	373
Note	376
<i>Problem Thirty-One</i>	376
§ 10.03 Burglary	377
<i>State v. Crossman</i>	377
Notes	379
<i>Problem Thirty-Two</i>	381

---

PART FIVE | INCHOATE CRIMES AND  
ACCESSORY LIABILITY

---

<b>Chapter 11   Attempt</b>	<b>385</b>
§ 11.01 Generally	385
A. Inchoate Offenses	385
B. Attempt	385
Note	387
§ 11.02 The Act	387
Model Penal Code	
§ 5.01. <i>Criminal Attempt.</i>	388
<i>Evans v. State</i>	389
Notes and Questions	391
<i>Problem Thirty-Three</i>	393
§ 11.03 Mens Rea	394
<i>Baldwin v. Commonwealth</i>	394
Notes	397
<i>Problem Thirty-Four</i>	401
§ 11.04 Impossibility	402
<i>Chen v. State</i>	404
<i>Problem Thirty-Five</i>	407
§ 11.05 Abandonment and Renunciation	407
<i>Patterson v. State</i>	409

Notes and Questions	410
<i>Problem Thirty-Six</i>	411
<i>Problem Thirty-Seven</i>	412
<b>Chapter 12   Solicitation</b>	<b>413</b>
<b>Model Penal Code</b>	
§ 5.02 <i>Criminal Solicitation.</i>	413
<i>People v. Nelson</i>	414
Notes	416
<i>Problem Thirty-Eight</i>	417
<i>Problem Thirty-Nine</i>	417
<b>Chapter 13   Conspiracy</b>	<b>419</b>
§ 13.01 Generally	419
<b>Model Penal Code</b>	
§ 5.03. <i>Criminal Conspiracy</i>	420
§ 13.02 Agreement	422
<i>United States v. Fitz</i>	422
Notes and Questions	423
<i>Problem Forty</i>	427
§ 13.03 Mens Rea	427
<i>United States v. Jones</i>	427
Notes and Questions	431
<i>Problem Forty-One</i>	436
<i>Problem Forty-Two</i>	436
§ 13.04 Single-Multiple Conspiracies and Conspirators	436
<i>United States v. Thompson</i>	436
Notes and Questions	439
§ 13.05 Conspiracy and Liability for Substantive Crimes	441
<i>United States v. Pierce</i>	441
Notes and Questions	444
<i>Problem Forty-Three</i>	445
<b>Chapter 14   Accomplice Liability</b>	<b>447</b>
§ 14.01 Actus Reus	447
<i>State v. Barnum</i>	447
Notes and Questions	450
<b>Model Penal Code</b>	
§ 2.06. <i>Liability for Conduct of Another; Complicity.</i>	455
<i>Problem Forty-Four</i>	456

§ 14.02	Mens Rea	456
	<i>Waddington v. Sarausad</i>	456
	<i>United States v. Cruz</i>	461
	Notes and Questions	465

---

PART SIX | DEFENSES

---

<b>Chapter 15</b>	<b>  Defenses</b>	<b>475</b>
§ 15.01	Generally	475
	<i>Table: Approaches to the Defense of Criminal Charges</i>	476
§ 15.02	The Right to Present a Defense	479
	<i>Beaty v. Commonwealth</i>	479
	Notes	482
§ 15.03	Alibi Defense	484
	<i>State v. Deffebaugh</i>	484
	Notes and Questions	488
	<i>Problem Forty-Five</i>	490
§ 15.04	Justification	490
	<i>State v. Sedlock</i>	490
	<i>Problem Forty-Six</i>	493
§ 15.05	Nonstatutory and Cultural Defenses	493
	<i>State v. Pollard</i>	494
	Notes and Questions	496
	<i>Problem Forty-Seven</i>	498
<b>Chapter 16</b>	<b>  Defending Self, Others, and Property</b>	<b>499</b>
§ 16.01	Self-Defense	499
	<i>People v. Goetz</i>	500
	Notes and Questions	507
	<b>Model Penal Code</b>	
	§ 3.04. <i>Use of Force in Self Protection</i>	518
	§ 3.09. <i>Mistake of Law as to Unlawfulness of Force or</i> <i>Legality of Arrest; Reckless or Negligent Use of</i> <i>Otherwise Justifiable Force; Reckless or Negligent</i> <i>Injury or Risk of Injury to Innocent Persons</i>	519
	§ 3.11. <i>Definitions</i>	520
	<i>Problem Forty-Eight</i>	520
§ 16.02	Battered Person Syndrome	521
	<i>Bonner v. State</i>	521
	Notes and Questions	524

	<i>Problem Forty-Nine</i>	527
§ 16.03	Defense of Others	529
	<i>State v. Cook</i>	529
	Note	534
	Model Penal Code	
	§ 3.05. <i>Use of Force for the Protection of Other Persons</i>	535
	§ 3.08. <i>Use of Force by Persons with Special Responsibility                     for Care, Discipline or Safety of Others</i>	536
	<i>Problem Fifty</i>	537
§ 16.04	Defense of Property	538
	<i>Gatlin v. United States</i>	538
	Notes and Questions	543
	Model Penal Code	
	§ 3.06. <i>Use of Force for Protection of Property</i>	543
	<i>Problem Fifty-One</i>	546
§ 16.05	Arrest	546
	<i>State v. Johnson</i>	546
	Note	550
	Model Penal Code	
	§ 3.07. <i>Use of Force in Law Enforcement</i>	551
	<i>State v. Mantelli</i>	552
	Note	558
	<i>Problem Fifty-Two</i>	559
<b>Chapter 17</b>	<b>  Necessity and Duress</b>	<b>561</b>
§ 17.01	Necessity/Choice of Evils	561
	<i>People v. Fontes</i>	561
	Model Penal Code	
	§ 3.02. <i>Justification Generally: Choice of Evils.</i>	563
	Notes and Questions	563
	<i>Geljack v. State</i>	564
§ 17.02	Civil Disobedience	566
	<i>State v. Ward</i>	566
	Notes and Questions	569
	<i>Problem Fifty-Three</i>	571
§ 17.03	Duress	571
	<i>State v. Harvill</i>	571
	Model Penal Code	
	§ 2.09. <i>Duress</i>	574



Notes and Questions	574
<i>Problem Fifty-Four</i>	577
<b>Chapter 18   Entrapment</b>	<b>579</b>
§ 18.01 Generally	579
<i>People v. Maffett</i>	579
§ 18.02 Subjective Predisposition	580
<i>Jacobson v. United States</i>	580
Notes and Questions	584
§ 18.03 Objective Approach	586
Model Penal Code	
§ 2.13. Entrapment.	586
<i>People v. Moore</i>	587
Notes	589
<i>Problem Fifty-Five</i>	589
<b>Chapter 19   Insanity and Diminished Capacity</b>	<b>591</b>
§ 19.01 Competency to Stand Trial	591
<i>Medina v. California</i>	591
Notes and Questions	593
Model Penal Code	
§ 4.04. Mental Disease or Defect Excluding Fitness to Proceed.	595
§ 4.06. Determination of Fitness to Proceed; Effect of Finding of Unfitness; Proceedings if Fitness Is Regained [; PostCommitment Hearing].	595
§ 19.02 Insanity	596
<i>Kahler v. Kansas</i>	596
Notes and Questions	603
<i>State v. Turgeon</i>	606
<i>Problem Fifty-Six</i>	610
§ 19.03 Diminished Capacity	611
<i>People v. Carpenter</i>	611
Notes and Questions	614
Model Penal Code	
§ 4.10. Immaturity Excluding Criminal Conviction; Transfer of Proceedings to Juvenile Court.	618
Note	619
<i>Problem Fifty-Seven</i>	619

<b>Chapter 20   Intoxication</b>	<b>621</b>
§ 20.01 Involuntary Intoxication	621
<i>Miller v. Florida</i>	621
Note	623
<b>Model Penal Code</b>	
§ 2.08. Intoxication	623
Notes and Questions	624
§ 20.02 Strict Liability Crimes	627
<i>State v. Hammond</i>	627
§ 20.03 Actus Reus	631
<i>United States v. Hernandez-Hernandez</i>	631
Notes and Questions	634
<i>Problem Fifty-Eight</i>	635
<b>Case Study   <i>Guyger v. Texas</i></b>	<b>637</b>
Questions	647
<b>Table of Cases</b>	<b>651</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>653</b>

---

---

# Preface

---

---

Crime, and the law related to the prosecution of offenders, is one of the most widely covered and discussed topics in society today. Media coverage is pervasive of both crimes and the prosecutions that result from them, ranging from the innumerable fictional programs devoted to every conceivable aspect of the criminal justice system to YouTube videos showing actual criminal trials. Daily newspapers and local news shows devote substantial coverage to local crimes, while the seemingly endless parade of celebrity run-ins with the law, some as trivial as a traffic ticket while others involving charges of murder, are fodder for breathless coverage in tabloids and weekly magazines. The criminal law is perhaps the most widely followed area in the legal landscape, and crime touches all segments of society.

While the media is quick to label a person as guilty or innocent, the process of determining actual guilt is far more complex. The roles of the criminal lawyer, both the prosecutor and the defense attorney, are far different from what is portrayed in television shows or movies, and the law of crimes involves many difficult conceptual and policy issues. One important question in the application of the criminal law is whether the government targets certain groups for a disproportionate level of enforcement, or does not take into consideration the particular circumstances of the defendant's race, gender, sexual orientation, social status, or economic situation in deciding whether conduct constitutes a crime. The criminal law cannot be divorced from the social setting in which it occurs, and media stereotypes can feed perceptions of criminality that are not otherwise supported.

The focus of this book is on both sides of the criminal law equation: the *principles* of the law of crimes and the *proof* of the criminal violation. The determination of whether a person is guilty of a crime is the key question in every case, and an issue in all prosecutions is whether there is sufficient evidence to convict a person of a crime charged. What constitutes the type of evidence that will be important to that determination, and whether there is enough evidence to meet the requirements of the statutory definition of a crime, is the primary focus of the lawyers on both sides.

This casebook consists of cases, problems, and supplemental notes that concentrate primarily on how a particular crime can be proven, the defenses available to that crime, and the tools that are available to lawyers to assist in the process of prosecuting and defending a case. The materials consider the theoretical underpinnings of the criminal law to give a clearer understanding of why the law adopts a particular approach to conduct. It places criminal law in a real setting, one with issues of race and gender.

Lawyers are trained to represent clients, whether the client be society or an individual defendant, and use their abilities to interpret statutes and organize evidence to evaluate how to best represent the client's interests. The casebook is a means to develop those skills in the context of one area of the law, but the reader would be mistaken to view the criminal law as a hermetically-sealed set of legal rules that have no effect on other areas. Lawyers deal with evidence in every area of legal practice, ranging from estate planning to corporate law to real estate finance. Even if a lawyer never represents a client in a criminal case, principles from the criminal law have an impact on how a lawyer and client will (and should) act.

Some of the problems in the casebook are drawn from the facts of actual cases, although in many instances changes have been made to make them more useful tools for analyzing the law and how it might be applied using different legal principles. Below is a list of the problems that are based on actual cases for readers who may wish to see how a court dealt with an issue:

- Chapter 2**    Problem 1:    *United States v. Holmes*, 26 F.Cas. 360 (E.D. Pa. 1842).
- Chapter 3**    Problem 4:    *United States v. Havelock*, 619 F.3d 1091 (9th Cir. 2010),  
664 F.3d 1284 (9th Cir. 2012) (en banc).  
Problem 5:    *Belay v. District of Columbia*, 860 A.2d 365 (D.C. 2004).  
Problem 7:    *State v. Wells*, 965 So. 2d 834 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 2007).
- Chapter 5**    Problem 10:    *United States v. X-Citement Video*, 513 U.S. 64 (1994).  
Problem 13:    *Loftus v. District of Columbia*, 51 A.3d 1285 (D.C. 2012).
- Chapter 6**    Problem 15:    *Bullock v. State*, 775 A.2d 1043 (Del. 2001).
- Chapter 7:**    Problem 18:    *State v. Gerbasio*, 2008 WL 2415083  
(N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. 2008).  
Problem 19:    *United States v. DeJohn*, 368 F.3d 533 (6th Cir. 2004).
- Chapter 8**    Problem 22:    *Commonwealth v. Thomas*, 656 A.2d 514  
(Pa. Super. Ct. 1995).  
Problem 23:    *State v. Elliott*, 411 A.2d 3 (Conn. 1979).  
Problem 23:    *People v. Carter*, 2005 WL 3500873  
(Mich. Ct. App. 2005).

- Problem 25: *King v. Commonwealth*, 368 S.E.2d 704 (Va. Ct. App. 1988).
- Chapter 10** Problem 28: *People v. Dadon*, 640 N.Y.S.2d 425 (N.Y. Crim. Ct. 1996).  
 Problem 29: *People v. Kelly*, 2012 WL 3965150 (Cal. Ct. App. 2012)  
 Problem 30: *People v. Smith*, 52 N.Y.S.3d 692 (N.Y. 2017)  
 Problem 31: *State v. Long*, 830 So. 2d 552 (La. Ct. App. 2002).  
 Problem 32: *State v. Office of the Public Defender*, 285 P.3d 622 (N.M. 2012)
- Chapter 11** Problem 33: *Collier v. State*, 846 N.E.2d 340 (Ind. Ct. App. 2006).  
 Problem 34: *State v. Mateyko*, 53 S.W.3d 666 (Tenn. 2001).  
 Problem 36: *People v. Acosta*, 609 N.E.2d 518 (N.Y. 1993).
- Chapter 14** Problem 44: *People v. Genoa*, 470 N.W.2d 447 (Mich. Ct. App. 1991).
- Chapter 15** Problem 45: *Gardner v. State*, 397 A.2d 1372 (Del. 1979).  
 Problem 46: HAW. REV. STAT. § 703-309(1) (2001)  
 (This statute was, however, revised in 2013) and  
*State v. Dowling*, 263 P.3d 116 (Haw. Ct. App. 2011)
- Chapter 16** Problem 48: *Hair v. State*, 17 So. 3d 804 (Fla. 1st DCA 2009).  
 Problem 49: *State v. Norman*, 378 S.E.2d 8 (N.C. 1989).  
 Problem 51: *Commonwealth v. Haddock*, 704 N.E.2d 537 (Mass. App. Ct. 1999).  
 Problem 52: *State v. Weddell*, 43 P.3d 987 (Nev. 2002).
- Chapter 17** Problem 53: *United States v. Heatwole*, <<http://fl1.findlaw.com/news.findlaw.com/wp/docs/crim/usheatwole102003cmp.pdf>>.
- Chapter 18** Problem 55: *Roberts v. State*, 2010 WL 3934598 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] Oct. 7, 2010).
- Chapter 19** Problem 56: *United States v. Layton*, 855 F.2d 1388 (9th Cir. 1988).  
 Problem 57: *State v. Phipps*, 883 S.W.2d 138 (Tenn. Crim. App. 1994).

The authors' goal in putting together this casebook was to focus on the staples of criminal cases: issues related to how the government goes about proving a crime, the process of statutory interpretation, and the elements of criminal defenses. To that end, we have chosen cases and problems with an eye toward their usefulness in teaching about how the evidence of a crime, or lack thereof, affects the application of the criminal law. Moreover, we chose, by and large, current cases that reflect the approach of courts today. While some "old favorites" familiar to all law students are in the case-

book, we opted largely for cases decided since 2005 because they are illustrative of how judges approach cases today and push the law into new areas.

The process of putting together a casebook involves the assistance and support of a number of individuals and institutions beyond the named authors. We would like to express our appreciation to Professors Roger Clark, Bruce Green, and Mae C. Quinn, as well as the following for helping to bring this fifth edition into being:

*Ellen S. Podgor:* Thanks go to Stetson University College of Law, Dean Michèle Alexandre, Shannon Edgar, and everyone in faculty support. Thanks also go to past and current research assistants Ashley Adams, Ross Felsher, Gordon Kirsch, Adam Labonte, Jennifer Rex, and Tyler Spayd, as well as the many students at Stetson who caught errors from the prior editions and also allowed me to serve as their guide in their legal journey. Thanks also go to Abraham, who prior to his passing worked with me — often in the wee hours of the morning for the fourth edition and Ezra who accompanied me in this edition. I am particularly grateful to my co-authors who lightened this project with nicknames and laughter, and of course, incredibly thoughtful contributions.

*Peter Henning:* Wayne State University Law School provided very generous support throughout all the editions of this book. I appreciate the continuing assistance of Olive Hyman, who provided much help and encouragement. I also am grateful to my family for putting up with me turning our dining room into a repository of all things criminal when I stack piles of cases throughout the house. It is a true joy to work with Ellen Podgor, Cynthia Jones, and Al Garcia on the book — they are an inspiration.

*Cynthia E. Jones:* To my students at the American University Washington College of Law, your energy will always inspire and motivate me to infuse every class with creativity, passion, and enthusiasm. A special thanks to my two amazing research assistants, Nina Zegarra-Schmidt and Paul Zajde, who provided excellent legal research and editing for this edition. Finally, a special thanks to my wonderful co-authors. I am simply honored to collaborate with you on this excellent publication.

*Alfredo Garcia.* My thanks to St. Thomas University School of Law and to my co-authors, three wonderful colleagues, scholars, and teachers, who deserve most of the credit for this endeavor. I wish to thank my two research assistants, Glenn Garcia and Gerald Lane, for their assistance on this edition of the book.

In our fourth edition we lost a dear friend and co-author, Andrew E. Taslitz. We miss him dearly and have fond memories of his laughter and smiles from our work on past editions and as a colleague in the legal academy. We were all close friends of the late Andrew E. Taslitz and although he is no longer a part of this project, his memory will live on.

July, 2021

---

---

# Acknowledgments

---

---

Excerpts from the following books and articles appear with the kind permission of the copyright holders:<sup>a</sup>

Anne M. Coughlin, *Sex and Guilt*, 84 VIRGINIA LAW REVIEW 1 (1998). Reprinted by permission of the Virginia Law Review and Anne M. Coughlin.

Susan Estrich, *Rape*, 95 YALE LAW JOURNAL 1087 (1986). Reprinted by permission of Susan Estrich.

*Model Penal Code*, Copyright 1985 by the American Law Institute. Reprinted with permission. All rights reserved.

Eugene Milhizer, *Justification and Excuse: What They Were, What They Are, and What They Ought to Be*, 78 ST. JOHN'S LAW REVIEW 725 (2004). Reprinted by permissions of ST. JOHN'S LAW REVIEW and Eugene Milhizer.

Richard E. Redding, *Why It Is Essential to Teach About Mental Health Issues in Criminal Law (And a Primer on How to Do It)*, 14 WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY JOURNAL OF LAW & POLICY 407 (2004). Reprinted with permission of the WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY JOURNAL OF LAW & POLICY and Richard E. Redding.

Andrew E. Taslitz, *Rape and Culture of the Courtroom* (New York: New York University Press, 1999). Copyright (c) 1999 New York University. Used with permission.

Lalena Weintraub Siegel, Note, *The Marital Rape Exemption: Evolution to Extinction*, 43 CLEVELAND STATE LAW REVIEW. 351 (1995). Reprinted by permission of the CLEVELAND STATE LAW REVIEW and Lalena Weintraub Siegel.

---

a. Case citations in the text, the footnotes of judicial opinions, and in the writings of commentators have been omitted without so specifying. Footnotes in judicial opinions and articles are also omitted without specifying. Numbered footnotes are from the original source; lettered footnotes are written by the authors of this casebook. Asterisks and brackets are used to designate omissions from the original materials.





---

---

## Online Materials

---

---

Additional content for the fifth edition of *Criminal Law: Concepts and Practice* is available on Carolina Academic Press's *Core Knowledge for Lawyers* (CKL) website.

*Core Knowledge for Lawyers* is an online teaching and testing platform that hosts practice questions and additional content for both instructors and students.

To learn more, please visit:  
[coreknowledgeforlawyers.com](http://coreknowledgeforlawyers.com)

Instructors may request complimentary access through the “Faculty & Instructors” link.

