

THE U.S. LEGAL SYSTEM

THE U.S. LEGAL SYSTEM

The Basics

Toni Jaeger-Fine
ASSISTANT DEAN
FORDHAM LAW SCHOOL



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2021
Toni Jaeger-Fine
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Jaeger-Fine, Toni, 1961– author.

Title: The US legal system : the basics / by Toni M. Jaeger-Fine.

Other titles: U.S. legal system

Description: Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press,
LLC, [2020]

Identifiers: LCCN 2020032453 | ISBN 9781531020378 (paperback)
| ISBN 9781531020385 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Law—United States. | Justice, Administration of—
United States.

Classification: LCC KF386.J34 2020 | DDC 349.73—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020032453>

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

For my students, former, current, and future:

I have learned more from you than I ever could hope to teach you.

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| CHAPTER I AN OVERVIEW OF THE U.S. LEGAL SYSTEM | 3 |
| A. The Constitution of the United States of America | 3 |
| 1. History and Overview | 3 |
| <i>a. Historical Antecedents</i> | 4 |
| <i>b. Defining Characteristics: Short and Enduring</i> | 5 |
| 2. The Preamble | 5 |
| 3. The Articles | 6 |
| 4. The Amendments | 7 |
| B. The U.S. Judicial Systems | 7 |
| 1. In General | 7 |
| 2. The Federal Judicial System | 7 |
| 3. The State Judicial Systems | 8 |
| C. Sources of Law in the United States | 8 |
| D. Working with Case Law | 9 |
| E. Civil Litigation in the United States | 10 |
| CHAPTER II THE CONSTITUTION OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA | 13 |
| A. Executive Summary | 13 |
| B. Introduction to the Constitution of the United States of America | 15 |
| C. The Articles | 16 |

| | |
|--|--------|
| 1. The National Government: Separation of Powers and Checks and Balances | 16 |
| <i>a. Separation of Powers</i> | 16 |
| <i>b. Checks and Balances</i> | 18 |
| 2. The Relationship between National and State Governments: Federalism, Supremacy, and Full Faith and Credit | 19 |
| <i>a. Limits on the Powers of the Federal Government</i> | 19 |
| <i>b. Limits on the Powers of the States</i> | 24 |
| 3. The Amendment Process | 28 |
| 4. Ratification of the Constitution | 28 |
| D. The Amendments | 28 |
| 1. In General | 28 |
| 2. The Bill of Rights | 29 |
| <i>a. In General</i> | 29 |
| <i>b. Due Process</i> | 30 |
| 3. The Reconstruction Amendments | 31 |
| 4. The Doctrines of Incorporation and Reverse Incorporation | 32 |
| E. Constitutional Interpretation | 33 |
| CHAPTER III U.S. JUDICIAL SYSTEMS | 35 |
| A. Executive Summary | 36 |
| B. State and Federal Courts as Dual/Parallel Structures | 37 |
| C. The Federal Court System | 38 |
| 1. Constitutional Foundation | 38 |
| <i>a. Structure of the Federal Courts</i> | 38 |
| <i>b. The Appointment Process for Federal Judges</i> | 38 |
| <i>c. Judicial Independence</i> | 39 |
| <i>d. Limits on Federal Judicial Power</i> | 39 |
| <i>e. The Power of Judicial Review</i> | 41 |

| | |
|--|--------|
| 2. Organization of the Federal Courts | 42 |
| <i>a. The Hierarchical Organization of the Federal Courts</i> | 42 |
| <i>b. The Geographical Organization of the Federal Courts</i> | 42 |
| <i>c. Specialized Federal Courts</i> | 45 |
| 3. Moving through the Federal Court System | 46 |
| <i>a. The Federal District Courts</i> | 46 |
| <i>b. The Federal Courts of Appeals</i> | 46 |
| <i>c. The Supreme Court of the United States</i> | 47 |
| D. State Court Systems | 49 |
| 1. Autonomous and Independent Systems | 49 |
| 2. Structure of State Court Systems | 50 |
| 3. Selection of State Court Judges | 50 |
| E. Choosing a Court: Jurisdiction and Related Issues | 51 |
| 1. Subject Matter Jurisdiction: Federal or State Court? | 51 |
| <i>a. Jurisdictional Possibilities</i> | 51 |
| <i>b. Forms of Federal Court Subject Matter Jurisdiction</i> | 51 |
| <i>c. Effect of a Lack of Subject Matter Jurisdiction</i> | 53 |
| 2. Personal Jurisdiction: In Which State(s) Can the Defendant Be Required to Respond to a Lawsuit? | 53 |
| <i>a. State Long-Arm Statute</i> | 54 |
| <i>b. Due Process</i> | 54 |
| 3. Venue: Which State or Federal Court? | 55 |
| F. Choice of Law | 56 |
| 1. Procedural Matters | 56 |
| 2. Substantive Matters | 56 |
| CHAPTER IV SOURCES OF LAW | 59 |
| A. Executive Summary | 60 |
| B. Overview of U.S. Legal Authorities | 60 |
| 1. Primary versus Secondary Sources of Law | 60 |
| 2. The Binding Impact of Various Sources of Law | 61 |
| 3. Hierarchy of Sources of Law | 62 |

| | |
|--|----|
| C. Legislation and Statutory Interpretation | 63 |
| 1. Legislation (and a Word about Regulation) | 63 |
| 2. Statutory Interpretation | 64 |
| D. An Introduction to Case Law | 68 |
| 1. Case Reporters | 69 |
| a. <i>In General</i> | 69 |
| b. <i>Federal Reporters</i> | 70 |
| c. <i>State and Regional Reporters</i> | 71 |
| 2. The Anatomy of Reported Cases | 71 |
| 3. Case Citations | 74 |
| E. Precedent and <i>Stare Decisis</i> | 76 |
| 1. Introduction to Precedent and <i>Stare Decisis</i> | 76 |
| 2. Application of Precedent and <i>Stare Decisis</i> Principles | 78 |
| a. <i>In General</i> | 78 |
| b. <i>Scope of Precedent</i> | 79 |
| c. <i>Relationship between Current Court and Court Issuing Precedent</i> | 81 |
| 3. The Special <i>Stare Decisis</i> Impact of “Super Precedent” | 85 |
| 4. The Limits of Precedent and <i>Stare Decisis</i> | 86 |
| a. <i>Stare Decisis as a Tendency, Not an Immutable Rule</i> | 86 |
| b. <i>When Will the Supreme Court Overrule Its Own Precedent?</i> | 87 |
| | |
| CHAPTER V WORKING WITH CASE LAW: A GUIDE FOR STUDENTS | 91 |
| A. Executive Summary | 92 |
| B. Reading and Understanding a Judicial Opinion | 92 |
| 1. Introduction to Reading and Understanding Cases | 92 |
| 2. Elements of a Judicial Opinion | 93 |
| 3. Beyond Reading | 95 |
| C. Briefing Cases | 96 |
| 1. Benefits of a Case Brief | 96 |
| 2. Elements of a Case Brief | 97 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 3. Tips for Briefing Cases | 97 |
| 4. Template of a Case Brief | 98 |
| 5. To Brief or Not to Brief? | 98 |
| D. Rule Synthesis | 99 |
| 1. Rule Synthesis Defined | 99 |
| 2. Goal of Rule Synthesis | 99 |
| 3. Importance of Rule Synthesis | 99 |
| 4. Steps for Rule Synthesis | 100 |
| 5. Attributes of a Synthesized Rule | 100 |
| E. Outlining | 101 |
| 1. What Is an Outline? | 101 |
| 2. Why Outline? | 101 |
| 3. Timing Issues: When to Outline? | 102 |
| 4. Outlining as an Iterative Process | 102 |
| 5. Make Your Own Outline—It’s the Journey, Not the Destination | 103 |
| 6. Outline Style | 104 |
| 7. Preparing Your Outline | 104 |
| <i>a. Begin Your Outline</i> | 104 |
| <i>b. Fill in Your Outline</i> | 104 |
| | |
| CHAPTER VI CIVIL DISPUTE RESOLUTION IN THE UNITED STATES | 107 |
| A. Executive Summary | 108 |
| B. Forms of Dispute Resolution in the U.S. and the Prominence of Settlement | 108 |
| C. Civil Litigation in the U.S. | 109 |
| 1. Introduction | 109 |
| 2. The Players: The Role of the Parties and Their Attorneys, the Judge, and the Jury | 110 |
| <i>a. The Parties and Their Attorneys</i> | 110 |
| <i>b. The Judge</i> | 111 |
| <i>c. The Jury</i> | 112 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 3. An Overview of Civil Litigation | 115 |
| <i>a. Starting the Litigation: Preliminary Considerations</i> | 115 |
| <i>b. The Complaint</i> | 115 |
| <i>c. Defendant's Response to the Complaint</i> | 117 |
| <i>d. Managerial Judging: Scheduling and Other Pre-Trial Orders</i> | 118 |
| <i>e. Discovery</i> | 119 |
| <i>f. Summary Judgment Motions</i> | 123 |
| <i>g. Other Pre-Trial Motions</i> | 123 |
| <i>h. Selecting the Jury</i> | 124 |
| <i>i. Trial</i> | 126 |
| D. Appeals and the Appellate Process | 132 |
| 1. Right to Appeal | 132 |
| 2. Appellate Review Limited to the Record Below | 132 |
| 3. Appellate Practice and Procedure | 132 |
| 4. Standards of Review on Appeal | 135 |
| <i>a. Clear Error</i> | 135 |
| <i>b. De Novo</i> | 135 |
| <i>c. Abuse of Discretion</i> | 135 |
| APPENDIX A ANNOTATED JUDICIAL OPINION | 137 |
| APPENDIX B SAMPLE CASE BRIEF: <i>UNITED STATES V. MORRISON</i> | 159 |
| APPENDIX C SAMPLE OUTLINE | 161 |
| Index | 163 |