Election Law
Election Law

Cases and Materials

SEVENTH EDITION

Daniel Hays Lowenstein
Professor of Law Emeritus
UCLA School of Law

Richard L. Hasen
Chancellor’s Professor of Law and Political Science
UC Irvine School of Law

Daniel P. Tokaji
Fred W. & Vi Miller Dean and Professor of Law
University of Wisconsin Law School

Nicholas O. Stephanopoulos
Kirkland & Ellis Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
For
Sharon
Aaron, Jessie, Asa, and Sadie
Nathan, Elham, and Adam
— D.H.L.

For
Lori
Deborah
Shana
Jared
— R.H.

For
Renuka
Aria
Mohan
— D.T.

For
Ruth
Iliana
— N.S.

To the memory of
our friend and colleague,
Gary Schwartz
— D.H.L. and R.H.
Summary of Contents

Chapter 1 · Introductory Readings
   I. Factions and the Public Interest 4
   II. Citizens and Representatives 12
   III. Pluralism and Progressivism 16

Chapter 2 · The Right to Vote
   I. A Brief History of the Right to Vote in the United States 31
   II. Court Review of State Limitations on the Franchise 54

Chapter 3 · Representation and Districting
   I. The Right to an Equally Weighted Vote 86
   II. Voting, Representation, and “Special-Purpose” Elections 124
   III. Districting Criteria 138

Chapter 4 · Partisan Gerrymandering and Political Competition
   I. Defining and Identifying Gerrymanders 149
   II. Gerrymandering and the Constitution 160
   III. Competition and Election Law 209

Chapter 5 · Race and Redistricting
   I. Section 5 of the Voting Rights Act 221
   II. Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act 265
   III. Racial Gerrymandering 347

Chapter 6 · Election Administration and Remedies
   I. Constitutional Claims 392
   II. Race Discrimination 441
   III. Law and Turnout 469
   IV. Judicial Remedies 488

Chapter 7 · Ballot Propositions
   I. Pros and Cons 505
   II. Content Restrictions 529
   III. Procedural Requirements and Judicial Review 562

Chapter 8 · Major Political Parties
   I. The Party and the Political System 582
   II. Obligations of Parties under the Constitution 589
III. Associational Rights of Parties 597
IV. Parties and Patronage 640

Chapter 9 · Third Parties and Independent Candidates 663
I. Ballot Access 668
II. Public Benefits 701

Chapter 10 · Campaigns 715
I. What We Know about American Political Campaigns 716
II. Regulating Campaign Speech 722
III. Judicial Elections 738

Chapter 11 · Bribery 801
I. Bribery of Candidates 803
II. Bribery of Public Officials 811

Chapter 12 · The Buckley Framework 853
I. Introduction: Basic Facts and Figures about Campaign Financing in the U.S. 853
II. Buckley v. Valeo: The Foundation of American Campaign Finance Jurisprudence 857
III. Empirical Observations about, and Theoretical Justifications for, Campaign Finance Regulation 892

Chapter 13 · Spending Limits 925
I. Corporate Spending Limits in Ballot Measure Campaigns 925
II. Limiting Spending by Corporations, Labor Unions, and Others in Candidate Elections 942
III. The Citizens United Revolution 957

Chapter 14 · Contribution Limits 991
I. Campaign Contribution Limits in Ballot Measure Elections 991
II. When Are Contribution Limits Too Low? 999
III. Campaign Contributions and Political Parties 1023
IV. The Growth of Super PACs and Other Outside Groups 1032
V. The New Skepticism 1040

Chapter 15 · Public Financing 1075
I. Existing Public Financing Systems 1078
II. Constitutional Questions with Public Financing 1101

Chapter 16 · Disclosure 1135
I. The Government Interests in Disclosure Versus the Right to Anonymity 1135
II. The New Skepticism About Disclosure 1164

Appendix 1195
I. Election Law Research 1195
II. Election Law Resources 1196
III. Interdisciplinary Research 1204
Contents

Introduction to the Seventh Edition xv
Copyright Acknowledgments xix

Chapter 1 · Introductory Readings 3
  I. Factions and the Public Interest 4
    James Madison, *The Federalist Papers, No. 10* 4
  II. Citizens and Representatives 12
    Edmund Burke, *Speech to the Electors of Bristol* 13
  III. Pluralism and Progressivism 16
    Richard J. Ellis, *Pluralism* 16

Chapter 2 · The Right to Vote 29
  I. A Brief History of the Right to Vote in the United States 31
    A. The Extension of the Suffrage 31
    1. The Attainment of White Male Suffrage 31
    2. The Fifteenth Amendment and Its Betrayal 33
    3. Votes for Women 43
    4. The Reenfranchisement of African Americans in the South 45
    5. Additional Extensions of the Franchise 49
    6. New Battles 50
  II. Court Review of State Limitations on the Franchise 54
    *Harper v. Virginia State Board of Elections* 54
    *Skafte v. Rorex* 63
    *Kramer v. Union Free School District No. 15* 74

Chapter 3 · Representation and Districting 85
  I. The Right to an Equally Weighted Vote 86
    *Reynolds v. Sims* 88
    *Lucas v. 44th General Assembly of Colorado* 95
    *Avery v. Midland County* 114
  II. Voting, Representation, and “Special-Purpose” Elections 124
    *Salyer Land Co. v. Tulare Lake Basin Water Storage District* 124
  III. Districting Criteria 138

Chapter 4 · Partisan Gerrymandering and Political Competition 149
  I. Defining and Identifying Gerrymanders 149
  II. Gerrymandering and the Constitution 160
    The Long Partisan Gerrymandering Interregnum 168
    *Rucho v. Common Cause* 175
III. Competition and Election Law  
   Miller v. Cunningham 214

Chapter 5 · Race and Redistricting  
I. Section 5 of the Voting Rights Act  
   Allen v. State Board of Elections 222
   Beer v. United States 226
   Shelby County v. Holder 242
II. Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act  
   White v. Regester 267
   Thornburg v. Gingles 275
   League of United Latin American Citizens v. Perry 303
   Bartlett v. Strickland 313
   Johnson v. De Grandy 330
   Holder v. Hall 338
III. Racial Gerrymandering  
   Shaw v. Reno 349
   Post-Shaw Decisions 365
   Alabama Legislative Black Caucus v. Alabama 379

Chapter 6 · Election Administration and Remedies  
I. Constitutional Claims  
   A. Counting and Recounting Votes  
      Bush v. Gore 394
   B. Voting Technology 416
   C. Voter Identification and Other Burdens on Voting  
      Crawford v. Marion County Election Board 420
II. Race Discrimination  
   Brnovich v. Democratic National Committee 443
III. Law and Turnout  
   A. Language Assistance 469
   B. The National Voter Registration Act (and the Elections Clause) 473
   C. The Help America Vote Act 477
   D. Empirical Research on Turnout 479
IV. Judicial Remedies  
   Pabey v. Pastrick 491

Chapter 7 · Ballot Propositions  
I. Pros and Cons  
   Richard J. Ellis, Democratic Delusions: The Initiative Process in America 505
II. Content Restrictions  
   People's Advocate v. Superior Court 529
   In re Advisory Opinion to the Attorney General 547
CONTENTS

The Separate Vote Requirement and Academic Criticisms of the Single Subject Rule 559

III. Procedural Requirements and Judicial Review 562
   A. Strict Enforcement or Substantial Compliance? 566
   B. Pre-Election Judicial Review 568
   C. Hard Looks? 572
   D. “The Legislature Thereof” 575

Chapter 8 · Major Political Parties 581
   I. The Party and the Political System 582
   II. Obligations of Parties under the Constitution 589
      A. The Federal Interest in Regulating Party Primaries 589
      B. The White Primary Cases and the State Action Doctrine 590
      Daniel Hays Lowenstein, Associational Rights of Major Political Parties: A Skeptical Inquiry 594
   III. Associational Rights of Parties 597
      A. Presidential Nominations 597
      B. State Parties 614
         1. Establishing the Right 614
            Tashjian v. Republican Party of Connecticut 614
         2. The Scope of the Right 626
   IV. Parties and Patronage 640
      Elrod v. Burns 643

Chapter 9 · Third Parties and Independent Candidates 663
   I. Ballot Access 668
      Munro v. Socialist Workers Party 670
      Timmons v. Twin Cities Area New Party 688
   II. Public Benefits 701
      Buckley v. Valeo 702

Chapter 10 · Campaigns 715
   I. What We Know about American Political Campaigns 716
   II. Regulating Campaign Speech 722
      281 Care Committee v. Arneson 722
   III. Judicial Elections 738
      A. Why Judicial Elections? 738
      B. Judicial Candidate Speech and Conduct Codes 744
         Republican Party of Minnesota v. White 744
         Williams-Yulee v. Florida Bar 761
      C. Judicial Elections and Campaign Money: Limits or Recusal? 784
         Caperton v. Massey 786
Chapter 11 · Bribery
   I. Bribery of Candidates
      People v. Hochberg
   II. Bribery of Public Officials
      A. Corrupt Intent
      People ex rel. Dickinson v. Van de Carr
      B. Anything of Value
      State v. Agan
      McCormick v. United States
      United States v. Sun-Diamond Growers of California
      C. Intent to Influence
      McDonnell v. United States

Chapter 12 · The Buckley Framework
   I. Introduction: Basic Facts and Figures about Campaign Financing in the U.S.
   II. Buckley v. Valeo: The Foundation of American Campaign Finance Jurisprudence
      Buckley v. Valeo
   III. Empirical Observations about, and Theoretical Justifications for, Campaign Finance Regulation
      A. Empirical Observations
      B. Preventing Corruption
      Daniel Hays Lowenstein, On Campaign Finance Reform: The Root of All Evil Is Deeply Rooted
      C. Promoting Equality
      Edward B. Foley, Equal-Dollars-Per-Voter: A Constitutional Principle of Campaign Finance

Chapter 13 · Spending Limits
   I. Corporate Spending Limits in Ballot Measure Campaigns
      First National Bank of Boston v. Bellotti
   II. Limiting Spending by Corporations, Labor Unions, and Others in Candidate Elections
   III. The Citizens United Revolution
      Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission
      American Tradition Partnership v. Bullock

Chapter 14 · Contribution Limits
   I. Campaign Contribution Limits in Ballot Measure Elections
   II. When Are Contribution Limits Too Low?
      Randall v. Sorrell
   III. Campaign Contributions and Political Parties
CONTENTS

IV. The Growth of Super PACs and Other Outside Groups 1032
   *SpeechNow.org v. Federal Election Commission* 1035
V. The New Skepticism 1040
   *McCutcheon v. Federal Election Commission* 1040

Chapter 15 · Public Financing 1075
I. Existing Public Financing Systems 1078
   A. In the States 1078
      Kenneth Mayer, Timothy Werner, and Amanda Williams,
      *Do Public Funding Programs Enhance Electoral Competition?* 1078
   B. In Presidential Elections 1096
II. Constitutional Questions with Public Financing 1101
   *Arizona Free Enterprise Club's Freedom Club PAC v. Bennett* 1104

Chapter 16 · Disclosure 1135
I. The Government Interests in Disclosure Versus the Right to Anonymity 1135
   *Buckley v. Valeo* 1136
   *McIntyre v. Ohio Elections Commission* 1145
II. The New Skepticism About Disclosure 1164
   *Americans for Prosperity Foundation v. Bonta* 1166

Appendix 1195
I. Election Law Research 1195
II. Election Law Resources 1196
III. Interdisciplinary Research 1204

Table of Cases 1207
Table of Authorities 1223
Index 1263
Introduction to the Seventh Edition

Readers of this book may well find nothing surprising about its existence. After all, Election Law is a course taught at many law schools and political science departments across the country. There are a growing number of competing casebooks, a quarterly journal dedicated to the field (Election Law Journal), and regular conferences and law review symposia dedicated to election law issues such as campaign finance, voting rights, redistricting, election administration, ballot measures and other topics.

But when the First Edition of this book first appeared in 1995, written solely by Daniel Hays Lowenstein, it was the first modern casebook on the subject. Things have changed much since Professor Lowenstein wrote in the First Edition’s Introduction: “So election law has not been a subject in the university.” Lowenstein was one of a handful of pioneers in the field, and his book helped define the range of topics which would come to fall under the “election law” category, the theoretical approaches which would be brought to bear on the subject matter, and the importance of empirical political science and political theory to a full examination of the questions raised in this book.*

The First Edition also spoke in Lowenstein’s distinctive voice: a mixture of dry and self-deprecating humor, a healthy skepticism of courts and abstract legal theory, and unremitting grammatical correctness.

The Seventh Edition of this casebook appears twenty-seven years after the First Edition, and is written by Professor Rick Hasen of UC Irvine, Dean Dan Tokaji of the University of Wisconsin, and Professor Nicholas Stephanopoulos of Harvard; Lowenstein retired from the field over a decade ago and the book now bears less of Lowenstein’s voice. But it kept the sensibility that Lowenstein articulated in the First Edition: “Although I have not attempted to conceal my own views on the subjects treated in this book, I have tried to assure that the book is not a brief for those or any other views. But I hope the book is animated by a respect for truth and a regard for the public good.”

* A special “festschrift” issue of the Election Law Journal (Volume 9, Number 4, December 2010) considers Lowenstein’s considerable contributions to the field. Lowenstein and Hasen served as founding co-editors of ELJ from 2001–2010. Tokaji served as co-editor from 2011-2013.
We have tried to emulate Lowenstein’s ethos, something particularly important in this hyperpartisan era following the 2020 election when there is so much mistrust and misinformation about the voting and election process.

The goals of this Seventh Edition of the casebook are the same as Lowenstein’s ambition with the First: to shed more light than heat on a disputed subject; to give students and their instructors a fair presentation of the cases and scholarship in the key areas of election law; to bring in political science evidence with which to evaluate legislative and judicial interventions into democratic processes; and to do all of this in clear language.

As always, we welcome your comments on how we can improve on this book. No doubt the book is already greatly improved thanks to the generosity of earlier readers.

Conventions Used in This Book

In the interest of saving the publisher’s space and the reader’s time, most of the materials reprinted in this book have been significantly edited. Insertions are indicated with brackets. Deletions are indicated with brackets or ellipses. However, footnotes have been deleted and citations have been deleted or altered without signalling. Sometimes, formatting of the original sources has been revised. For purposes of serious research, the reader should consult the original sources.

Footnotes that are signalled with a number are from the original work and retain the numbers that they have in the original. Footnotes signalled with a letter are those of the Editors.

Opinions differ on the extent to which law school casebooks should contain references to the scholarly literature. The interdisciplinary nature of this book has persuaded us that these annotations are appropriate. Very few readers of this book — whether instructors, students, or general readers — will have a strong background on all the subjects presented. The references are intended to facilitate further reading on matters of interest and to provide a head start on research projects. They are not intended to be intimidating, and we hope they will not have that effect.

Although the references are extensive, they are not remotely exhaustive. In most cases they should be sufficient to get you into the literature that interests you.

Acknowledgments

Before this Seventh Edition of the book, we republished in each edition the Introduction to the prior editions. We are no longer continuing this tradition to save ink and space, but the one thing lost from cutting those older Introductions are the names of all the people who helped make this book better through comments, research, proofreading, and overall assistance. Please refer to the Sixth Edition, pages xv-xxviii, for the earlier acknowledgments.
For this Seventh Edition of the Casebook, we thank Sara Sampson for her contribution of the updated Appendix on election law research. We also thank our research assistants: Hannah Bartlett, Alyx Bogus, Timothy Duong, Anna Setyaeva, Katy Shanahan, Timothy Duong and Xuechun Wang. We thank Stacy Tran for excellent administrative assistance and the team at Carolina Academic Press for wonderful production assistance.

RICK HASEN  
Los Angeles, CA

DAN TOKAJI  
Madison, WI

NICHOLAS STEPHANOPOULOS  
Cambridge, MA

August 2021
Copyright Acknowledgments

We gratefully acknowledge the permission granted by authors, publishers, and organizations to reprint portions of the following copyrighted materials.


