The Pretrial Process

The Pretrial Process

THIRD EDITION

J. Alexander Tanford

Professor of Law Emeritus Indiana University, Bloomington

Layne S. Keele

Associate Professor of Law Faulkner University Jones School of Law



Carolina Academic Press

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2022 Carolina Academic Press, LLC All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Tanford, J. Alexander, author. | Keele, Layne S., author.
Title: The pretrial process / by J. Alexander Tanford, Layne S. Keele.
Description: Third edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, LLC, [2021] | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2021049806 (print) | LCCN 2021049807 (ebook) | ISBN 9781531021481 (paperback) | ISBN 9781531021498 (ebook)
Subjects: LCSH: Pre-trial procedure--United States. | LCGFT: Textbooks.
Classification: LCC KF8900 .T36 2021 (print) | LCC KF8900 (ebook) | DDC 347.73/72--dc23/eng/20211220
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021049806
LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021049807

Carolina Academic Press, LLC 700 Kent Street Durham, North Carolina 27701 (919) 489-7486 www.cap-press.com

Contents

Preface	xvii
Chapter 1 · Introduction to Pretrial Litigation	3
\$1.01 Overview	3
\$1.02 Importance of the Pretrial Process	4
\$1.03 Typical Order of Pretrial Litigation	6
\$ 1.04 Law, Rules, and Customs	8
§ 1.05 Basic Things You Need to Know to Litigate	10
[A] You Have to Read the Rules	10
[B] The Judge Is in Charge	11
[C] The Judge Can Throw You in Jail	12
[D] You Have to Cooperate with Your Adversary	13
[E] You Can't Negotiate with Terrorists	14
[F] The Clerks' Office Is Important	14
[G] You Must Learn to Keep Track of Time	15
Notes	16
§1.06 The Attorney-Client Relationship	18
[A] The Duty of Loyalty	18
[B] Conflict between Your Duties to Clients and to the Court	19
[C] The Attorney-Client Privilege	20
§1.07 The Decision to Take the Case	21
[A] Does It Have Merit?	21
[B] Do You Have a Conflict of Interest?	22
[C] Is It Worth Pursuing?	23
Note	24
§1.08 Fees	24
[A] Setting the Fee	24
[B] Real World Resource Constraints	25
Notes	26
§1.09 Representation Agreements	28
Chapter 2 · Interviewing	31
§2.01 Introduction	31
§2.02 Principles of Interviewing	31
[A] Legal and Ethical Principles	31
[1] The Right to Interview Witnesses	31

[2] Use of Deception	32
[3] Confidentiality	33
[4] The Witness-Advocate Rule	34
[B] Psychological Principles	34
[1] Intrinsic Problems of Perception, Memory, and Recall	35
[2] Interviewer Bias	37
Note	38
§2.03 Planning an Interview	39
[A] Legal Research	39
[B] Identify Your Goals	40
[C] Plan the Time and Place	41
[1] Office Interviews	42
[2] Videoconference Interviews	43
[D] Outlines and Checklists	43
Notes	44
§2.04 Conducting an Interview	46
[A] Types of Questions	46
[1] Broad Questions	46
[2] Directed Questions	46
[3] Narrow Questions	47
[a] Unrestricted Narrow Questions	47
[b] Restricted Narrow Questions	47
[c] Leading Questions	47
[B] The Sequence of Questions	48
[C] Verbal and Nonverbal Communication	51
[D] Facilitating Effective Communication	53
[E] Reluctant and Hostile Witnesses	55
[F] Ambush Interviews	57
[G] Should You Take Notes or Record the Interview?	58
[H] The Structure of an Effective Interview	58
[1] Stage 1: Mutual Evaluation and Ice-Breaking	58
[2] Stage 2: Overview and Problem Identification	59
[3] Stage 3: Determination of the Starting Point	60
[4] Stage 4: Detailed Chronology	61
[5] Stage 5: Covering Legally Important Topics	63
[6] Stage 6: Conclusion	64
Note	65
Chapter 3 · Initiating Litigation	67
§3.01 Do You Have a Case?	67
[A] Legal Investigation	68
[B] Factual Investigation	70
\$3.02 Can Your Client Sue?	71
[A] Real Party in Interest	71

[B] Capacity	71
[C] Standing	72
[D] Mootness	73
[E] Arbitration Clauses	74
Note	75
§3.03 Finding a Defendant	75
§3.04 Remedies	76
[A] The Legal Remedy—Money	76
[B] Equitable Remedies	77
[C] Declaratory Relief	78
[D] Punitive Damages	79
[E] Litigation Costs	80
[1] Taxable Costs	80
[2] Attorney's Fees	81
\$3.05 Joining Multiple Claims or Defendants	82
\$3.06 What Forum?	83
[A] The Choice between State or Federal Court	84
[1] Strategy	84
[2] Subject-Matter Jurisdiction: State v. Federal Court	86
[3] Eleventh Amendment Immunity	87
[4] Subject-Matter Jurisdiction within the State Court System	87
[B] Personal Jurisdiction	88
[C] Venue	90
\$3.07 Pre-Filing Matters	90
Note	92
\$3.08 The Complaint	92
[A] Caption	93
[B] Jury Demand	93
[C] The Contents of the Complaint	94
[1] Form	94
[2] The Body of the Complaint	96
[3] Evidentiary Considerations	98
[4] Making Detailed Allegations	99
[D] Request for Relief	99
[E] Signature	100
[F] Verification	100
[G] Attaching Exhibits	101
[H] Client Approval	102
[I] Filing and Service	102
[1] Filing	102
[2] Service	103
\$3.09 Documents Accompanying the Complaint	105
[A] Summons	105
[B] Return of Service	106

[C] Waiver of Service	108
[D] Appearance and Cover Sheet	111
[E] Jury Demand	112
[F] Motion for Temporary Restraining Order or Other	
Emergency Relief	112
[G] Disclosure Statement	114
Note	114
§ 3.10 Answering the Complaint	114
[A] Caption	115
[B] Jury Demand	116
[C] Responding to the Allegations	117
[D] Asserting Defenses	121
[1] Defenses in Tort Cases	122
[2] Defenses in Contract Actions	122
[3] General Defenses Available in a Wide Range of Cases	122
[4] Defenses in Rule 12(b) of the Rules of Civil Procedure	123
[5] Equitable Defenses against Claims for Equitable Relief	123
[E] Counterclaims, Cross-Claims, and Third-Party Lawsuits	124
[F] Prayer for Relief	125
[G] Signature	125
[H] Certificate of Service	125
[I] Client Approval	127
§3.11 Other Documents to Be Filed with the Answer	127
§ 3.12 Responses Other Than Answers	127
[A] Removal to Federal Court	128
[B] Objections to Venue	128
[C] Forum non Conveniens Motion	130
[D] Motion for More Definite Statement	130
[E] Motion to Strike Scandalous Matter	131
[F] Rule 12(B) Motions	131
Note	134
§ 3.13 Subsequent Pleadings	134
Note	134
Chapter 4 · Client Counseling	137
§4.01 Introduction	137
§4.02 Who Makes the Decisions in the Attorney-Client Relationship?	137
[A] The Lawyer-Centered Model: The Lawyer as Independent	
Contractor	138
[B] The Client-Centered Model: The Lawyer as Therapist	138
[C] The Collaborative Model—Lawyer and Client as a Team	140
§4.03 The Authoritarian Lawyer and How Not to Be One	141
§4.04 The Lawyer's Role in Decision-Making	142
[A] Step One: Generate Alternatives (Brainstorming)	142

[B] Step Two: Evaluate the Strengths and Weaknesses of Each Option	143
[C] Step Three: Can You Make This Decision without	
Consulting the Client?	144
[D] Step Four: Decide Which Options to Present to Your Client	145
[E] Step Five: Discuss the Options with the Client	147
[1] The Presentation	147
[2] The Decision	148
[F] Dealing with Poor Choices by the Client	149
§4.05 The Ethics of Client Counseling	150
§4.06 The Line between Compassion and Getting Involved	151
Chapter 5 · Fact Development	153
§5.01 Introduction	153
§ 5.02 Developing a Fact Investigation Plan	153
[A] What Do You Look For?	153
[B] Do You Have to Look at All?	155
[1] Initial Disclosures	155
[2] Later Disclosures	156
[3] Another Trial or Hearing in a Related Case	156
[4] Other Attorneys Who Have Tried a Similar Case	157
[5] Presumptions	157
[6] Stipulations	157
[7] Judicial Notice	158
[C] Should You Use Formal or Informal Discovery Methods?	159
[D] Sequence	161
[E] Litigation Chart	161
[F] Don't Focus Too Early	162
[G] How Much Justice Can Your Client Afford?	163
Note	165
§5.03 Informal Fact Investigation	165
[A] Sequence of Informal Investigation	165
[B] Getting Stuff from Your Client	167
[C] Obtaining Medical Records	167
[D] Obtaining Personnel Records	168
[E] Getting Stuff from Other Parties	169
[1] The No-Contact Rule	169
[2] The Non-Cooperation Rule	170
[3] Voluntary Exchanges	170
[F] Interviewing Witnesses	171
Notes	173
[G] Using Investigators	174
[H] Visiting the Scene	175
[I] Obtaining Government Documents	175
[J] The Internet	176

§5.04 Subpoenas	177
§5.05 Developing New Evidence	179
[A] Expert Opinions	179
[B] Documenting Damages	182
[C] Surveillance	182
[D] Summaries of Complicated Data	183
Notes	183
§5.06 Amending Pleadings	185
Chapter 6 · Written Discovery	187
§6.01 Introduction	187
Note	187
§6.02 The Discovery Plan	187
§ 6.03 Electronically Stored Information	191
Note	193
§ 6.04 General Principles of Discovery	194
[A] Scope of Discovery	194
[B] The Duty of Good Faith	197
[C] Privilege	198
[1] Grounds for Claiming Privilege	198
[2] Work Product Doctrine	201
[3] Waiver	202
[D] Resisting Discovery	203
[1] Objecting	203
[2] Protective Orders	205
[E] Duty to Supplement Discovery	207
[F] What Has to Be Filed with the Court?	207
Note	208
§6.05 Initial Disclosures	208
§ 6.06 Making Discovery Requests	210
[A] Interrogatories	210
[1] General Procedure	210
[2] What Are Interrogatories Useful For?	212
[3] Caption, Name of Document, and Introduction	214
[4] Instructions	215
[5] Definitions	217
[6] Drafting the Interrogatories	218
[7] Signature	221
[8] Service	222
[B] Requests for Production of Documents or Physical Evidence	223
[1] Caption, Name of Document, and Introduction	223
[2] Instructions and Definitions	224
[3] Drafting Production Requests	225
[4] Requesting Electronic Data	226

[5] Signature and Service	227
[C] Requests for Entry Upon Land	227
[D] Requests for Admission	228
Notes	232
§6.07 Responding to Discovery Requests	233
[A] Deadlines	233
[B] Responding to Interrogatories	234
[1] General Procedure	234
[2] Make Sure You Understand the Question	236
[3] Caption, Name of the Document, and Introduction	236
[4] Instructions and Definitions	237
[5] Answering the Interrogatories	237
[6] Objections	238
[7] Signature, Oath, and Service	240
[C] Responding to Production Requests	241
[1] Distinguishing the Obligation to Respond from the	
Actual Production	241
[2] The Procedure for Production	243
[3] Who Pays?	244
[4] How to Respond	244
[D] Responding to a Request for Entry to Land	248
[E] Responding to Requests for Admissions	248
Note	250
§6.08 Physical or Mental Examination	250
§6.09 Final Disclosures	252
Note	253
§6.10 Typical Sequence of Discovery	253
\$6.11 What to Do If the Opposing Attorney Obstructs Discover	ry 254
[A] What Is Obstruction and What Isn't	254
[B] Re-Serve Interrogatories as Requests for Admission	254
[C] Motion to Compel Discovery	255
[1] First Step—Informal Resolution	255
[2] Second Step — Motion to Compel Discovery	256
[3] Third Step—Sanctions	257
Note	258
Chapter 7 · Depositions	261
\$7.01 Introduction	261
§7.02 Whom to Depose	267
Note	268
\$7.03 Making the Arrangements	268
[A] When to Take Depositions	269
[B] Arranging to Have the Deposition Recorded	269
[C] Time and Place	20)

[D] Remote Depositions	272
[E] The Notice	274
[F] A Subpoena	276
[G] Planning	277
§7.04 Taking a Deposition	277
[A] Beginning	277
[B] Deponent's Background	281
[C] The Facts	283
[1] What to Ask About	283
[2] How to Ask Good Deposition Questions	286
[3] Question Sequence	287
[D] Other Topics	290
[1] Damages	290
[2] Other Witnesses and Documents	291
[3] Other Similar Events	291
[4] Responses to Accusations Made by Others	292
[5] Impeachment Evidence	292
[6] Demonstrations	294
[7] Exhibits	295
[8] Go Over Allegations and Denials	297
[E] Cross-Examination	298
[F] Redirect Examination	298
[G] Concluding	298
Notes	299
§7.05 Deposing Expert Witnesses	299
Note	304
§7.06 Defending a Deposition	304
[A] Make Sure Your Client Shows Up	304
[B] Be Prepared	305
[C] Prepare Your Client	305
[1] Deposition Procedures	305
[2] The Substance of the Client's Testimony	307
[D] Is a Protective Order Necessary?	308
[E] What Do You Do during a Deposition?	308
[1] At the Beginning	308
[2] While the Other Attorneys Ask Questions	308
[3] Should You Make Any Objections?	309
[4] Why Not?	309
[5] Seriously, When Should You Object?	309
[6] Instructing Your Client Not to Answer	310
[7] Suspending the Deposition	312
[8] Should You Ask Any Questions When It's Your Turn?	312
[F] Correcting Mistakes	313
[1] During the Deposition	313

CONTENTS

[2] After the Deposition Is Over	314
§7.07 Dealing with Objections, Obstruction, and Disruption	315
[A] Obstruction by the Witness	315
[B] Obstruction by the Defending Attorney	317
[1] What Is Obstruction and What Isn't	317
[2] Responding to Objections	317
[3] Responding to Instructions Not to Answer or Demands to	
Suspend the Deposition	319
[4] Responding to a Request for a Recess	320
[5] Responding to Improper Objections and Other Interference	321
§7.08 Post-Deposition Procedure	322
Note	323
§7.09 Quasi-Depositions upon Written Questions	324
Chapter 8 · Motion Practice	325
§8.01 Introduction	325
§8.02 Types of Motions	326
§8.03 The Conference Rule	329
§8.04 The Basic Motion	330
[A] Caption and Name of Document	330
[B] Body of the Motion	331
[C] The Prayer for Relief	332
[D] Request for a Hearing	333
[E] Signature	333
[F] Certificate of Conference	333
[G] Certificate of Service	335
[H] Memorandum in Support of Motion	335
[I] Supporting Evidence	338
[1] Affidavits	339
[2] Exhibits	341
[3] Depositions	342
[4] Discovery Responses	342
[J] Proposed Order	343
[K] Distribution List	344
[L] Filing	345
[M] Service	346
Note	347
§8.05 Timing	347
§8.06 Tactics of Motion Practice	348
§8.07 Responding to a Motion	349
[A] Do You Have to Respond at All?	349
[B] When Do You Respond?	349
[C] The Memorandum in Opposition	350
[D] Opposing Affidavits and Exhibits	351

[E] Proposed Order Denying the Motion	351
§8.08 Hearings	352
[A] Notice of Hearing	353
[B] Hearing Procedure	354
[C] Ex Parte and Emergency Motions	355
[D] Effective Advocacy	356
[E] Virtual Hearings	360
§8.09 Motions for Summary Judgment or Judgment on the Pleadings	361
Note	369
§ 8.10 Motions for Default Judgment	369
§8.11 Appealability	370
Chapter 9 · Negotiation	373
§9.01 Introduction	373
Note	373
§9.02 Legal and Ethical Framework	374
[A] The Rules of Negotiation	374
[B] The Ethics of Negotiation	375
[1] Competence	376
[2] Client Authority	376
[3] Acting in the Client's Best Interests	377
[4] Maintaining Collaborative Decision-Making	378
[5] Protecting Client Confidences	379
[6] Duty of Fair-Dealing	379
[7] Bargaining Directly with the Other Party	381
[8] The Client Makes the Final Decision	381
[9] Illegal and Unconscionable Terms and Conditions	382
[10] Extortion and Threats	382
Notes	383
§9.03 Competitive vs. Cooperative Negotiating Style	384
Note	385
§9.04 Preparing for Negotiation	385
[A] When Should You Negotiate?	385
[B] Be Ready for Trial	386
[C] Valuation	388
[1] Step One: Estimate Probable Damage Award	389
[2] Step Two: Place a Value on Non-Economic Issues	390
[3] Step Three: Estimate the Odds that a Jury Would Find Liability	391
[4] Step Four: Add Your Litigation Costs	393
Notes	394
[D] Bargaining Range	396
[E] Conceptualizing the Negotiation Process	399
[F] The Role of the Client	401
[G] Preparing a Negotiation Plan	402

[1] Agenda	402
[2] First Offer	403
[3] Planning Concessions and Demands	405
[H] Prepare to Prove Your Case	407
[I] Preliminary Arrangements: Time, Place, and Ground Rules	408
Note	410
§9.05 Conducting Negotiation	411
[A] Basic Principles: Cooperation and Flexibility	411
[B] Face-to-Face, Remote, or in Writing?	413
[C] Stage One: Ice-Breaking	414
[D] Stage Two: Setting the Agenda	415
[E] Stage Three: Exchanging Information	415
[F] Stage Four: Making a First Offer	417
[G] Stage Five: Bargaining	418
[1] Identifying and Defining a Dispute	418
[2] Making Non-Negotiable Demands	419
[3] Mutual Compromise	419
[4] Reasoned Arguments	419
[5] Responding to New Information and Unanticipated Arguments	422
[6] Bargaining Tactics	423
[a] Procedural Tactics	423
[b] Tactics of Presenting Offers and Arguments	424
[c] Deadlock Avoidance Tactics	425
[d] Unreasonable and Hardball Tactics	426
[7] Dealing with Hard or Unreasonable Tactics	426
[a] Unreasonable First Offers	427
[b] Failure to Make an Offer (Not Bargaining in Good Faith)	427
[c] Attempts to Reopen Settled Issues	427
[d] Walkouts	428
§9.06 Mediation	428
§9.07 Finalizing the Settlement	430
[A] Tax Consequences	430
[B] Lump Sums versus Structured Settlement	430
[C] Settlements in Exchange for Testimony	431
[D] Documenting the Agreement	432
[E] Terminating the Representation	435
Table of Cases	437
Index	445

Preface

The origins of this book go back to 1990, when Professor Tanford started trying to develop a set of teaching materials for students in the Indiana University Community Legal Clinic. These students had to perform basic civil litigation tasks like drafting pleadings, interviewing and counseling clients, developing facts, preparing interrogatories, taking depositions, and filing motions, but had little idea how to go about them. No other course in the curriculum covered these issues and we could find no textbook that covered all stages of pretrial litigation comprehensively, pragmatically, and succinctly without being over-simplified, so we began working on our own materials. This book and its supplements are the result. Our goal has been to write about pretrial litigation in a way that makes this book useful both to clinical students working on their first cases and to students taking a separate pretrial litigation class who expect an intellectually satisfying law school experience.

One cannot write a book without the support and encouragement of family and colleagues. Professor Tanford would like to thank his family—Philippa, Philippa, and Jamie—for their patience and understanding. He also owes a debt to his father, Charles Tanford, who inspired him to pursue an academic career and instilled in him that scholarship must be both thoughtful and useful. In his honor, we have named the characters in this book after the important historic scientific figures mentioned in his own book, CHARLES TANFORD & JACQUELINE REYNOLDS, THE SCIENTIFIC TRAVELER (1992).

Professor Keele would like to thank Professor Tanford, to whom he is deeply indebted for the invitation to collaborate on this book and for his ongoing instruction, guidance, mentoring, and friendship. Professor Keele would also like to thank his wife, Kelli, and their four children, Jolie, Macy, Emory, and Witten, for their constant encouragement.

Throughout this book, we use Monroe County, Indiana as the location for most events, because that is a city both authors are familiar with. Where reference to a specific court is necessary, we use the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Indiana, which does not actually exist. Unless otherwise attributed, that hypothetical court is not intended to bear any actual resemblance to the Southern District of Indiana, which does exist.

> December 1, 2021 JAMES ALEXANDER TANFORD · BLOOMINGTON, INDIANA LAYNE S. KEELE · MONTGOMERY, ALABAMA