

# Public Corruption



# Public Corruption

**Jonathan Kravis**

PROFESSORIAL LECTURER IN LAW  
GEORGE WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY LAW SCHOOL

**Carissa Byrne Hessick**

ANNE SHEA RANDELL AND WILLIAM GARLAND “BUCK” RANDELL JR.  
DISTINGUISHED PROFESSOR OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  

---

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2022  
Carolina Academic Press, LLC  
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Kravis, Jonathan, author. | Hessick, Carissa Byrne, author.  
Title: Public corruption / by Jonathan Kravis, Carissa Byrne Hessick.  
Description: Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, LLC, [2021]  
Identifiers: LCCN 2021048661 (print) | LCCN 2021048662 (ebook) | ISBN  
9781531022167 (paperback) | ISBN 9781531022174 (ebook)  
Subjects: LCSH: Political corruption--Law and legislation--United States. |  
LCGFT: Casebooks (Law)  
Classification: LCC KF9409 .K73 2021 (print) | LCC KF9409 (ebook) | DDC  
345.73/02323--dc23/eng/20211220  
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021048661>  
LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021048662>

Carolina Academic Press  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
(919) 489-7486  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

*For my wife Laura and my children William and Emily*  
— Jonathan

*For Andy, Hattie, and Dorothy*  
— Carissa



# Contents

---

<b>Table of Cases</b>	xiii
<b>Acknowledgments</b>	xv
<b>Chapter 1 · Introduction</b>	3
<b>Chapter 2 · “Official Acts” and Corruption</b>	7
I. Introduction	7
II. Bribes vs. Gratuities	7
<i>United States v. Sun-Diamond Growers</i>	7
Note: Bribe vs. Gratuity	15
Note: The “Status Gratuity”	16
<i>McDonnell v. United States</i>	16
Note: The Reasoning of <i>McDonnell</i>	31
Note: The Unperformed Official Act	31
Hypothetical	31
III. Effect of <i>McDonnell</i>	32
Note: A Possible Response to <i>McDonnell</i>	32
<i>United States v. Silver</i>	33
Note on <i>Silver</i>	40
Hypothetical	40
<b>Chapter 3 · Proving Corrupt Intent</b>	43
I. Introduction	43
II. Circumstantial Evidence of Corrupt Intent	44
Nick Corasaniti, <i>Opening Arguments in Menendez Trial Focus on the Meaning of Friendship</i>	44
Matt Zapotosky, Rosalind Helderman, & Laura Vozzella, <i>Defense Attorney: McDonnell Marriage Had “Broken Down”</i>	46
Note: The Friendship Defense	49
III. Cooperators	49
Proffer Agreement	50
Cooperation Agreement	52
Immunity Letter	53
U.S. Sentencing Guideline Section 5K1.1: Substantial Assistance to Authorities	54
Note on Proffers, Cooperation, and Immunity	55

Hon. Stephen S. Trott, <i>Words of Warning for Prosecutors</i>	55
<i>Using Criminals as Witnesses</i>	68
The Grand Jury	68
<b>Chapter 4 • Federal Prosecution of State and Local Corruption</b>	77
I. Introduction	77
II. Extortion	78
<i>Evans v. United States</i>	78
Note on <i>Evans</i>	85
<i>Ocasio v. United States</i>	86
Note on <i>Ocasio</i>	93
III. Federal Program Bribery	93
<i>Sabri v. United States</i>	93
<i>Fischer v. United States</i>	96
Note on <i>Sabri</i> and <i>Fischer</i>	100
Note on Federalism	100
Hypothetical	101
<b>Chapter 5 • Mail and Wire Fraud</b>	103
I. Introduction	103
II. The History of Honest Services Fraud	104
<i>McNally v. United States</i>	104
<i>Skilling v. United States</i>	107
Note on <i>Skilling</i> : Undisclosed Conflicts of Interest	115
Note: The Nature of the Fiduciary Duty	115
Hypothetical	117
III. Monetary Wire Fraud and Public Corruption	118
<i>Kelly v. United States</i>	118
Note on <i>Kelly</i>	123
Note on Interstate Wires	123
<b>Chapter 6 • Campaign Finance</b>	125
I. Introduction	125
II. Background on the Election Act	126
III. Willfulness	127
<i>United States v. Curran</i>	128
Note on <i>Curran</i> and Mens Rea	133
IV. The Election Act and Constitutional Law	134
<i>Citizens United v. FEC</i>	134
Note on <i>Citizens United</i>	158
Note on Super PACs	158
V. Campaign Payment as Bribe	158
<i>McCormick v. United States</i>	159
Note on <i>McCormick</i>	161
Hypothetical	162



VI. Election Crimes	162
Federal Prosecution of Election Offenses 8–9 (Richard C. Pilger ed., 8th ed. Dec. 2017)	163
Justice Manual § 9-85.215: Investigations of Federal Election Fraud	164
Memorandum: Post-Voting Election Irregularity Inquiries	165
Note: Federal Investigation of Election Crimes	166
<b>Chapter 7 • Foreign Corruption</b>	167
I. Introduction	167
II. Conspiracy and the FCPA	168
<i>United States v. Hoskins</i>	168
Note on <i>Hoskins</i>	176
<i>United States v. Napout</i>	177
Note: Application of the FCPA to Foreign Public Officials	184
<i>United States v. Concord Mgmt. &amp; Consulting LLC</i>	184
Note: Conspiracy to Defraud the United States	187
III. Corporate Criminal Liability	189
Justice Manual §§ 9-28.010 to 9-28.300	190
<b>Chapter 8 • False Statements and Obstruction</b>	197
I. Introduction	197
II. Materiality	198
Government Motion to Dismiss, <i>United States v. Flynn</i>	198
Brief for Court-Appointed Amicus Curiae, <i>United States v. Flynn</i>	202
III. Mens Rea — What Do You Have to Know?	206
IV. Concealment Schemes	206
<i>United States v. Safavian</i>	207
V. False Statements to Congress	212
Brian Heberlig, <i>Congressional Gamesmanship Leads to an Acquittal in Deepwater Horizon Case</i> — United States v. David Rainey: A Case Study	212
Note on <i>Rainey</i>	217
<i>United States v. North</i>	217
<i>United States v. Stone</i>	226
VI. Obstruction Nexus Requirement	229
<i>United States v. Aguilar</i>	229
Note on <i>Aguilar</i>	234
VII. Obstruction Statutes and Principles of Statutory Interpretation	235
<i>United States v. Bonds</i>	235
Note on <i>Bonds</i>	248
Note: Martha Stewart and Scooter Libby	249
<i>Arthur Andersen LLP v. United States</i>	251
Note on <i>Andersen</i>	255

<b>Chapter 9 • Independent Counsels and Special Counsels</b>	257
I. Introduction	257
II. Independent Counsel Act	258
Note on the Independent Counsel Act	260
<i>Morrison v. Olson</i>	260
Note on <i>Morrison v. Olson</i>	280
III. Special Counsel Regulations	281
<i>In re Grand Jury Investigation</i>	285
Note on Special Counsel Regulations	289
<b>Chapter 10 • Constitutional Defenses</b>	293
I. Introduction	293
II. Legislative Immunity and Privileges	293
<i>United States v. Brewster</i>	294
Notes on <i>Brewster</i>	309
<i>Gravel v. United States</i>	311
Notes on <i>Gravel</i>	315
III. Presidential Immunity and Privilege	319
<i>United States v. Nixon</i>	319
Notes on <i>Nixon</i>	326
<i>Trump v. Vance</i>	327
Notes on <i>Trump v. Vance</i>	338
IV. Public Employees and the Privilege Against Self-Incrimination	339
<i>Garrity v. New Jersey</i>	339
Notes on <i>Garrity</i>	341
V. The Vagueness Doctrine	344
Notes on <i>Skilling</i>	347
<b>Chapter 11 • Public Corruption Law in the States</b>	351
I. Introduction	351
II. Substantive Law	351
<i>State v. Begyn</i>	351
Notes on <i>Begyn</i>	358
Notes on Logrolling	360
III. Immunity in the States	361
<i>Ex parte Perry</i>	361
Notes on <i>Perry</i>	377
Notes on Legal Privilege and Protection	379
<b>Chapter 12 • The Future of Public Corruption Law</b>	381
I. Introduction	381
II. Legislation to Address Narrow Judicial Interpretations	381
U.S. Cong. Research Serv., R45479, Bribery, Kickbacks, and Self-Dealing: An Overview of Honest Services Fraud and Issues for Congress (Updated May 18, 2020)	382

Jennifer Ahearn, <i>A Way Forward for Congress on Bribery After McDonnell</i>	384
Notes: Prophylactic Rules	388
III. New Public Corruption Legislation	389
Notes on the Anti-Corruption and Public Integrity Act	391
The American Anti-Corruption Act	392
Notes on the American Anti-Corruption Act	395
IV. Special Counsel Reform	395
Jonathan Kravis & Jessie K. Liu, <i>The Justice Department and the Rule of Law</i>	396
Notes on Politically Sensitive Criminal Matters	405
<b>Appendix • Skills Topics</b>	407
<b>Index</b>	413



# Table of Cases

---

- Arthur Andersen LLP v. United States, 235, 251, 255–256
- Austin v. Michigan Chamber of Commerce, 135–139, 150–154
- Baker v. Carr, 320–322
- Blachly v. United States, 346
- Black v. United States, 348
- Bowsher v. Synar, 266
- Brady v. Maryland, 64
- Bryan v. United States, 126–127
- Buckley v. Valeo, 142, 147, 262, 265
- Calley v. Callaway, 215
- Chambers v. State of Florida, 340
- Chavez v. Martinez, 342
- Cheek v. United States, 126–127, 186
- Citizens United v. FEC, 3, 134–138
- City of Los Angeles v. Patel, 372
- Coffin v. Coffin, 298
- Court in Union Pac. R.R. Co. v. Public Service Comm., 340
- Davis v. Alaska, 215
- Dixon v. United States, 95
- Elec. Privacy Info. Ctr. v. United States DOJ, 290
- Evans v. United States, 78, 91–92, 162
- Fischer v. United States, 96
- Garrity v. New Jersey, 339
- Go-Bart Importing Co. v. United States, 264
- Gravel v. United States, 311, 315–316
- Grayned v. City of Rockford, 345
- Gustafson v. Alloyd Co., 24
- Hammerschmidt v. United States, 188
- Humphrey’s Executor v. United States, 271
- Jackson v. Virginia, 234
- Johnson v. Tenth Judicial Dist. Ct. Of Appeals at Waco, 377
- Kastigar v. United States, 51, 217, 219–225
- Kelly v. United States, 118
- Kilbourn v. Thompson, 295, 298
- Kolender v. Lawson, 344
- Lazar v. Ganim, 34–39
- Marbury v. Madison, 322
- McConnell v. Federal Election Comm’n, 135, 143, 145, 150
- McCormick v. United States, 159–162
- McCulloch v. Maryland, 323, 334–335
- McDonnell v. United States, 7, 16, 32–35, 49–50, 100, 104, 123, 248, 381–388, 407
- McNally v. United States, 83, 100, 103–106, 109–115, 119, 163, 180, 183, 344–347, 382
- Mezzanatto provision, 64
- Miranda v. Arizona, 82
- Morrison v. Olson, 95, 257, 260, 287
- National Federation of Federal Employees v. Greenberg, 343
- Nixon v. Fitzgerald, 329, 338
- Nixon v. Sirica, 324, 326
- Northern Pipeline Construction Co. v. Marathon Pipe Line Co, 273
- Ocasio v. United States, 86
- Old Monastery Co. v. United States, 194
- Olivas v. State, 367
- Osborn v. United States, 232
- People v. Montgomery, 360
- Pettibone v. United States, 230, 233–234
- Ratzlaf v. United States, 126–127
- Rewis v. United States, 83

- Russell v. United States, 206, 233  
 Sabri v. United States, 77, 93–95, 100  
 Skilling v. United States, 100, 103, 107, 123, 182, 345–348, 381–384  
 Slochower v. Board of Education, 341  
 Smith v. Goguen, 344  
 South Dakota v. Dole, 95  
 State v. Barts, 354  
 State v. Begyn, 351  
 State v. Hanson, 370  
 State v. Johnson, 372  
 State v. Weleck, 353  
 State v. Winne, 356  
 Tanner v. United States, 188  
 Tenney v. Brandhove, 298  
 Trump v. Vance, 327, 338  
 United States v. Aguilar, 229–231, 234–235, 255  
 United States v. Alvarez, 187  
 United States v. Automated Medical Laboratories, Inc., 193  
 United States v. Birdsall, 26–27  
 United States v. Boffa, 116  
 United States v. Bonds, 235  
 United States v. Boyd, 61  
 United States v. Braasch, 160–161  
 United States v. Brewster, 294  
 United States v. Brock, 86  
 United States v. Burnside, 61  
 United States v. Bush, 347  
 United States v. Calandra, 70  
 United States v. Cincotta, 193da  
 United States v. Commonwealth Edison, 189  
 United States v. Concord Management & Consulting LLC, 134, 184–188, 289  
 United States v. Curran, 128, 133–134  
 United States v. David Rainey, 212–213  
 United States v. De Diego, 219, 224  
 United States v. Dozier, 159  
 United States v. Fernandez, 15, 214  
 United States v. Flynn, 198–205  
 United States v. Gaudin, 198  
 United States v. Griffin, 15  
 United States v. Halloran, 116  
 United States v. Hoskins, 168–177  
 United States v. Hudson & Goodwin, 358  
 United States v. Jennings, 15  
 United States v. Jia Yuan USA Co., 189  
 United States v. Johnson, 294–295, 303, 305  
 United States v. Keller, 123  
 United States v. L. Cohen Grocery Co., 345  
 United States v. Lopez, 95  
 United States v. Margiotta, 116–117  
 United States v. Martinez, 68  
 United States v. Milovanovic, 116, 182  
 United States v. Mitchell, 215  
 United States v. Morrison, 95  
 United States v. Napout, 177, 180–181, 184  
 United States v. Nixon, 288, 317, 319, 338  
 United States v. Nobles, 215  
 United States v. North, 217  
 United States v. Potter, 193  
 United States v. Procter & Gamble, 183  
 United States v. Rayburn, 317–318  
 United States v. Reese, 347  
 United States v. Rybicki, 116, 182  
 United States v. Safavian, 207–212  
 United States v. Search of Law Office, 317  
 United States v. Siegelman, 162  
 United States v. Silver, 33  
 United States v. Spitler, 86  
 United States v. Stone, 226, 398  
 United States v. Sun-Diamond Growers, 7–9, 15–16, 25–26, 28, 34, 118  
 United States v. Valdés-Ayala, 123  
 United States v. Von Barta, 183  
 United States v. Williams, 70, 345  
 United States v. Yermian, 206  
 Upjohn Co. v. United States, 253  
 Valdes v. United States, 32  
 Weatherford v. Bursey, 317  
 Weyhrauch v. United States, 348

# Acknowledgments

---

I would like to thank my co-instructor Todd Gee for the many hours we have spent together preparing for and teaching our annual public corruption seminar at George Washington University Law School. I would also like to thank the students who have taken the seminar over the last few years. Their comments and insights during our classroom discussions greatly influenced this work.

Jonathan Kravis  
April 2022

