

# When Justice Fails



**When Justice Fails**  
*Causes and Consequences of  
Wrongful Convictions*

SECOND EDITION

**Robert J. Norris**

GEORGE MASON UNIVERSITY

**Catherine L. Bonventre**

NORTH CAROLINA A&T STATE UNIVERSITY

**James R. Acker**

UNIVERSITY AT ALBANY, SUNY



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2021  
Carolina Academic Press, LLC  
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Norris, Robert J., author. | Bonventre, Catherine L., author. |  
Acker, James R., 1951- author.  
Title: When justice fails : causes and consequences of wrongful convictions  
/ by Robert J. Norris, Catherine L. Bonventre, James R. Acker.  
Description: Second edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic  
Press, LLC, [2021] | Includes index.  
Identifiers: LCCN 2021028862 | ISBN 9781531023638 (paperback) | ISBN  
9781531023645 (ebook)  
Subjects: LCSH: Criminal justice, Administration of--United States. |  
Judicial error--United States.  
Classification: LCC HV9950 .N67 2021 | DDC 345.73/0122--dc23  
LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021028862>

Carolina Academic Press  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

*To Sandra Westervelt, an incredible teacher, scholar, mentor, and friend,  
who sparked my interest in wrongful convictions more than a decade ago.  
And to Kirk Bloodsworth, who cemented my desire to be an ally in the fight  
for justice. May this work and these stories do the same for others.*

—RJN

*To Vin, my mother, and my brothers. And to justice.*

—CLB

*To three generations of family—Jenny, Elizabeth, Anna, and Ethan—  
and to the continuing quest for justice in the courts and well beyond.*

—JRA



# Contents

<b>Acknowledgments</b>	xiii
<b>Chapter 1 · Wrongful Convictions: Introduction and Overview</b>	3
Learning Objectives	3
Case Study: The Scottsboro Boys	3
Wrongful Convictions in the United States	5
How Common Are Wrongful Convictions?	6
Wrongful Convictions: Contributing Factors	10
An Abbreviated History of the Innocence Movement	11
Administering Justice: Arrest, Prosecution, and Adjudication	12
Learning Objectives and Volume Preview	16
Key Terms and Concepts	17
Discussion Questions	18
References	19
<b>Chapter 2 · Wrongful Convictions and Criminal Justice     in Social Context</b>	25
Learning Objectives	25
Case Study: The Central Park Five	25
Politics, Social Structural Conditions, and the Criminal Legal System	27
Contextualizing Wrongful Convictions	27
Race and Wrongful Convictions	30
Intersections: Race, Gender, and the Lessons of History	33
A Note on Gender and Wrongful Convictions	37
Moving Forward: Further Exploring the Structural Sources of Wrongful Convictions	39
Key Terms and Concepts	40

Discussion Questions	41
References	41
<b>Chapter 3 · Eyewitness Identification</b>	<b>47</b>
Learning Objectives	47
Case Study: Robert Foxworth	48
Eyewitness Errors: Overview and Research	49
Estimator Variables	50
System Variables	51
Witness Confidence	53
False Memories	54
Eyewitness Identification and the Law	55
Constitutional Rules Governing the Admissibility of Eyewitness Identification Testimony	56
Legislative Guidelines for Eyewitness Identification	71
Reducing Witness Error: Eyewitness Identification Policy Reforms	74
Pre-Lineup Suggestions	74
Suggestions for Conducting the Lineup	75
Post-Lineup Suggestions	77
Recording Identification Procedures	78
Conclusion	78
Key Terms and Concepts	78
Discussion Questions	79
References	80
<b>Chapter 4 · False Admissions: Interrogations and Confessions</b>	<b>83</b>
Learning Objectives	83
Case Study: Frances Choy	83
False Admissions: Overview and Research	85
Interrogations and False Confessions	86
Misclassification	89
Coercion	90
Situational Risk Factors	90
Dispositional Risk Factors	91
Contamination	92
Strength of Confession Evidence	93
Interrogations, Confessions, and the Law	94
Reforming Interrogations	101
Recording Custodial Interrogations	101
Reforming Interrogation Practices	103
Protecting Vulnerable Suspects	104



Conclusion	104
Key Terms and Concepts	105
Discussion Questions	106
References	106
<b>Chapter 5 · False Admissions: Guilty Pleas and Plea Bargaining</b>	<b>111</b>
Learning Objectives	111
Case Study: Corruption in Cook County, Illinois	111
Innocence, Guilty Pleas, and Plea Bargaining: Overview and Research	114
Wrongful Convictions and Guilty Pleas	115
Plea Bargaining and the Law	119
Suggested Reforms	124
Conclusion	126
Key Terms and Concepts	126
Discussion Questions	127
References	127
<b>Chapter 6 · Forensic Science Evidence</b>	<b>131</b>
Learning Objectives	131
Case Study: Santae Tribble	131
Research on Forensic Science Errors	133
Mistakes and Intentional Misconduct in the Lab and at Trial	134
Human Factors	136
Forensic Science Evidence and the Law	137
Forensic Science Reform	146
Conclusion	148
Key Terms and Concepts	149
Discussion Questions	150
References	150
<b>Chapter 7 · Incentivized Informants and Snitches</b>	<b>155</b>
Learning Objectives	155
Case Study: William Dillon	155
Incentivized Informants: Overview and Research	157
Incentivized Informants and the Law	162
Increasing Informant Reliability: Policy Reforms	169
Data Collection	169
Establishing Guidelines	170
Limits on Informants and Prosecutors	170
Recording Requirements	171
Discovery and Disclosure	171

Pretrial Reliability Hearings	172
Corroboration Requirements	173
Expert Testimony	173
Cautionary Jury Instructions	174
Conclusion	174
Key Terms and Concepts	175
Discussion Questions	175
References	176
<b>Chapter 8 · Government Actors: Police and Prosecutors</b>	179
Learning Objectives	179
Case Study: Derrick Hamilton	179
Research on Government Actors	181
Mass Exonerations and Police Misconduct	185
The Law	186
The Police and Probable Cause	186
Police Investigations and the Preservation of Evidence	189
The Prosecutor’s Duty to Disclose Material Exculpatory Evidence	192
Prosecutorial Immunity from Civil Liability	195
Policy Implications and Reforms	200
Conclusion	201
Key Terms and Concepts	202
Discussion Questions	202
References	203
<b>Chapter 9 · Defense Attorneys</b>	207
Learning Objectives	207
Case Study: A Tale of Two Attorneys	207
Research on Inadequate Defense Representation	208
Misdemeanor Defense	210
Felony Defense	211
Defense Attorneys and the Law	214
The Right to Court-Appointed Counsel	214
Ineffective Assistance of Counsel	217
Assistance of Counsel and Expert Witnesses	222
Attorney-Client Confidentiality	224
Implications for Policy and Reform	226
Conclusion	227
Key Terms and Concepts	227
Discussion Questions	228
References	229

<b>Chapter 10 · No-Crime Cases</b>	233
Learning Objectives	233
Overview of No-Crime Cases	233
No-Crime Murder Convictions	235
Murder or Suicide? The Case of Cesar Munoz	235
Death by Arson: The Case of Han Tak Lee	237
Infanticide: The Case of Sabrina Butler	239
Shaken Baby Syndrome: The Case of Brandy Briggs	240
No-Crime Drug Convictions	241
Planted Evidence: The Westbrooks-Cruz Case	242
Faulty Field Tests: Harris County Drug Cases	243
No-Crime Child Sex Abuse Convictions	244
The Howard Dudley Case	244
Kern County Convictions	246
Wrongful Convictions and Failed Affirmative Defenses	247
Conclusion	248
Key Terms and Concepts	249
Discussion Questions	250
References	250
<b>Chapter 11 · Detecting and Correcting Miscarriages of Justice</b>	253
Learning Objectives	253
Case Study: The Norfolk Four	253
The Courts	254
Appeals	255
State Post-Conviction Review	257
Federal Habeas Corpus	258
Executive Clemency	261
Special Tribunals and Commissions	262
Preservation and Production of Evidence	263
Conclusion	264
Key Terms and Concepts	264
Discussion Questions	265
References	265
<b>Chapter 12 · The Aftermath of Wrongful Convictions:     Reintegration and Compensation</b>	269
Learning Objectives	269
Case Study: Kirk Bloodsworth	269
Life after Exoneration	271

Redress for Wrongful Conviction	274
Methods of Compensation	275
Compensation Statutes: Strengths and Weaknesses	276
Improving Reentry Assistance for Exonerees	280
Official Accountability	281
Key Terms and Concepts	282
Discussion Questions	283
References	283
<b>Chapter 13 · Actual Perpetrators: Public Safety and     Monetary Considerations</b>	287
Learning Objectives	287
Case Study: Levon Brooks and Kennedy Brewer	287
Additional Victims	289
Monetary Costs	295
Policy Implications	296
Key Terms and Concepts	299
Discussion Questions	300
References	300
<b>Chapter 14 · Wrongful Convictions:     Continuing and Future Challenges</b>	305
Learning Objectives	305
Introduction	305
A Focus on Justice Systems	306
Conviction Integrity Units	306
Wrongful Convictions as Sentinel Events	306
Capital Punishment: The Risk of Wrongful Executions	308
Misdemeanors	311
Juvenile Justice	312
Politics, Policy, and Public Opinion	315
Researching Miscarriages of Justice	318
Conclusion	319
Key Terms and Concepts	319
Discussion Questions	320
References	320
<b>Glossary</b>	327
<b>Index</b>	335

# Acknowledgments

We first wish to thank the good folks at Carolina Academic Press, who have been a pleasure to work with. Beth Hall has shepherded us through the process from the outset with enthusiasm and unwavering support. We also gratefully acknowledge the careful and thorough assistance provided by TJ Smithers in helping prepare our manuscript for publication. Any remaining errors, of course, are ours alone.

We also are thankful to our many colleagues in wrongful conviction scholarship and teaching, whose work has inspired this book and made it possible.

We are particularly indebted to Andrew Madrigal and Clayton Drummond, whose research assistance helped greatly in getting this manuscript across the finish line.

Finally, we must acknowledge those whose stories are covered in this volume and the thousands of others like them. Individuals who experience wrongful conviction and the many others affected by errors in the criminal legal system withstand harm that is difficult to capture in words. Yet they manage to survive and endure with grace and humility. We hope this book will help educate students, scholars, practitioners, advocates, and the public and be a small contribution toward reducing further injustices. And to those who advocate on behalf of the wrongly convicted and are in the trenches fighting to ensure our system is one of justice, we continue to admire your work and hope this volume will help accelerate needed reforms.

RJN, CLB, & JRA

