When Justice Fails
To Saundra Westervelt, an incredible teacher, scholar, mentor, and friend, who sparked my interest in wrongful convictions more than a decade ago. And to Kirk Bloodsworth, who cemented my desire to be an ally in the fight for justice. May this work and these stories do the same for others.

— RJN

To Vin, my mother, and my brothers. And to justice.

— CLB

To three generations of family—Jenny, Elizabeth, Anna, and Ethan—and to the continuing quest for justice in the courts and well beyond.

— JRA
# Contents

**Acknowledgments**  
xi

**Chapter 1 · Wrongful Convictions: Introduction and Overview**  
3  
Learning Objectives  
3  
Case Study: The Scottsboro Boys  
3  
Wrongful Convictions in the United States  
5  
How Common Are Wrongful Convictions?  
6  
Wrongful Convictions: Contributing Factors  
10  
An Abbreviated History of the Innocence Movement  
11  
Administering Justice: Arrest, Prosecution, and Adjudication  
12  
Learning Objectives and Volume Preview  
16  
Key Terms and Concepts  
17  
Discussion Questions  
18  
References  
19

**Chapter 2 · Wrongful Convictions and Criminal Justice in Social Context**  
25  
Learning Objectives  
25  
Case Study: The Central Park Five  
25  
Politics, Social Structural Conditions, and the Criminal Legal System  
27  
Contextualizing Wrongful Convictions  
27  
Race and Wrongful Convictions  
30  
Intersections: Race, Gender, and the Lessons of History  
33  
A Note on Gender and Wrongful Convictions  
37  
Moving Forward: Further Exploring the Structural Sources of Wrongful Convictions  
39  
Key Terms and Concepts  
40
Discussion Questions 41
References 41

Chapter 3 · Eyewitness Identification 47
Learning Objectives 47
Case Study: Robert Foxworth 48
Eyewitness Errors: Overview and Research 49
  Estimator Variables 50
  System Variables 51
  Witness Confidence 53
  False Memories 54
Eyewitness Identification and the Law 55
  Constitutional Rules Governing the Admissibility 56
  of Eyewitness Identification Testimony
  Legislative Guidelines for Eyewitness Identification 71
Reducing Witness Error: Eyewitness Identification Policy Reforms 74
  Pre-Lineup Suggestions 74
  Suggestions for Conducting the Lineup 75
  Post-Lineup Suggestions 77
  Recording Identification Procedures 78
Conclusion 78
Key Terms and Concepts 78
Discussion Questions 79
References 80

Chapter 4 · False Admissions: Interrogations and Confessions 83
Learning Objectives 83
Case Study: Frances Choy 83
False Admissions: Overview and Research 85
Interrogations and False Confessions 86
  Misclassification 89
  Coercion 90
    Situational Risk Factors 90
    Dispositional Risk Factors 91
  Contamination 92
  Strength of Confession Evidence 93
Interrogations, Confessions, and the Law 94
Reforming Interrogations 101
  Recording Custodial Interrogations 101
  Reforming Interrogation Practices 103
  Protecting Vulnerable Suspects 104
CONTENTS

Pretrial Reliability Hearings 172
Corroboration Requirements 173
Expert Testimony 173
Cautionary Jury Instructions 174
Conclusion 174
Key Terms and Concepts 175
Discussion Questions 175
References 176

Chapter 8 · Government Actors: Police and Prosecutors 179
Learning Objectives 179
Case Study: Derrick Hamilton 179
Research on Government Actors 181
Mass Exonerations and Police Misconduct 185
The Law 186
The Police and Probable Cause 186
Police Investigations and the Preservation of Evidence 189
The Prosecutor’s Duty to Disclose Material Exculpatory Evidence 192
Prosecutorial Immunity from Civil Liability 195
Policy Implications and Reforms 200
Conclusion 201
Key Terms and Concepts 202
Discussion Questions 202
References 203

Chapter 9 · Defense Attorneys 207
Learning Objectives 207
Case Study: A Tale of Two Attorneys 207
Research on Inadequate Defense Representation 208
Misdemeanor Defense 210
Felony Defense 211
Defense Attorneys and the Law 214
The Right to Court-Appointed Counsel 214
Ineffective Assistance of Counsel 217
Assistance of Counsel and Expert Witnesses 222
Attorney-Client Confidentiality 224
Implications for Policy and Reform 226
Conclusion 227
Key Terms and Concepts 227
Discussion Questions 228
References 229
Chapter 10 · No-Crime Cases

Learning Objectives 233
Overview of No-Crime Cases 233
No-Crime Murder Convictions 235
Murder or Suicide? The Case of Cesar Munoz 235
Death by Arson: The Case of Han Tak Lee 237
Infanticide: The Case of Sabrina Butler 239
Shaken Baby Syndrome: The Case of Brandy Briggs 240
No-Crime Drug Convictions 241
Planted Evidence: The Westbrooks-Cruz Case 242
Faulty Field Tests: Harris County Drug Cases 243
No-Crime Child Sex Abuse Convictions 244
The Howard Dudley Case 244
Kern County Convictions 246
Wrongful Convictions and Failed Affirmative Defenses 247
Conclusion 248
Key Terms and Concepts 249
Discussion Questions 250
References 250

Chapter 11 · Detecting and Correcting Miscarriages of Justice

Learning Objectives 253
Case Study: The Norfolk Four 253
The Courts 254
Appeals 255
State Post-Conviction Review 257
Federal Habeas Corpus 258
Executive Clemency 261
Special Tribunals and Commissions 262
Preservation and Production of Evidence 263
Conclusion 264
Key Terms and Concepts 264
Discussion Questions 265
References 265

Chapter 12 · The Aftermath of Wrongful Convictions: Reintegration and Compensation

Learning Objectives 269
Case Study: Kirk Bloodsworth 269
Life after Exoneration 271
CONTENTS

Redress for Wrongful Conviction 274
  Methods of Compensation 275
  Compensation Statutes: Strengths and Weaknesses 276
Improving Reentry Assistance for Exonerees 280
Official Accountability 281
Key Terms and Concepts 282
Discussion Questions 283
References 283

Chapter 13 · Actual Perpetrators: Public Safety and Monetary Considerations 287
Learning Objectives 287
Case Study: Levon Brooks and Kennedy Brewer 287
Additional Victims 289
Monetary Costs 295
Policy Implications 296
Key Terms and Concepts 299
Discussion Questions 300
References 300

Chapter 14 · Wrongful Convictions: Continuing and Future Challenges 305
Learning Objectives 305
Introduction 305
A Focus on Justice Systems 306
  Conviction Integrity Units 306
  Wrongful Convictions as Sentinel Events 306
Capital Punishment: The Risk of Wrongful Executions 308
Misdemeanors 311
Juvenile Justice 312
Politics, Policy, and Public Opinion 315
Researching Miscarriages of Justice 318
Conclusion 319
Key Terms and Concepts 319
Discussion Questions 320
References 320

Glossary 327
Index 335
Acknowledgments

We first wish to thank the good folks at Carolina Academic Press, who have been a pleasure to work with. Beth Hall has shepherded us through the process from the outset with enthusiasm and unwavering support. We also gratefully acknowledge the careful and thorough assistance provided by TJ Smithers in helping prepare our manuscript for publication. Any remaining errors, of course, are ours alone.

We also are thankful to our many colleagues in wrongful conviction scholarship and teaching, whose work has inspired this book and made it possible.

We are particularly indebted to Andrew Madrigal and Clayton Drummond, whose research assistance helped greatly in getting this manuscript across the finish line.

Finally, we must acknowledge those whose stories are covered in this volume and the thousands of others like them. Individuals who experience wrongful conviction and the many others affected by errors in the criminal legal system withstand harm that is difficult to capture in words. Yet they manage to survive and endure with grace and humility. We hope this book will help educate students, scholars, practitioners, advocates, and the public and be a small contribution toward reducing further injustices. And to those who advocate on behalf of the wrongly convicted and are in the trenches fighting to ensure our system is one of justice, we continue to admire your work and hope this volume will help accelerate needed reforms.

RJN, CLB, & JRA