

Understanding the First Amendment

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS UNDERSTANDING SERIES

- Understanding Administrative Law,
Seventh Edition**
Kristin E. Hickman
- Understanding Alternative Dispute Resolution**
Kristen M. Blankley and Maureen A. Weston
- Understanding Animal Law**
Adam Karp
- Understanding Antitrust and Its Economic
Implications, Seventh Edition**
E. Thomas Sullivan and Jeffrey L. Harrison
- Understanding Bankruptcy, Fourth Edition**
Jeffrey Ferriell and Edward J. Janger
- Understanding California Community
Property Law, Second Edition**
Jo Carrillo
- Understanding Capital Punishment Law,
Fourth Edition**
Linda E. Carter, Ellen S. Kreitzberg,
and Scott W. Howe
- Understanding Civil Procedure, Sixth Edition**
Gene R. Shreve, Peter Raven-Hansen, and
Charles Gardner Geyh
- Understanding Civil Procedure:
The California Edition**
Walter W. Heiser, Gene R. Shreve,
Peter Raven-Hansen, and
Charles Gardner Geyh
- Understanding Civil Rights Litigation,
Second Edition**
Howard M. Wasserman
- Understanding Conflict of Laws,
Fourth Edition**
William M. Richman, William L. Reynolds,
and Chris A. Whytock
- Understanding Constitutional Law,
Fifth Edition**
William D. Araiza
- Understanding Contracts, Fifth Edition**
Jeffrey Ferriell
- Understanding Copyright Law,
Seventh Edition**
Marshall A. Leaffer
- Understanding Corporate Law,
Fifth Edition**
Arthur R. Pinto and Douglas M. Branson
- Understanding Corporate Taxation,
Fourth Edition**
Leandra Lederman and Michelle Kwon
- Understanding Criminal Law, Ninth Edition**
Joshua Dressler
- Understanding Criminal Procedure:
Vol. 1: Investigation, Eighth Edition**
Joshua Dressler, Alan C. Michaels,
and Ric Simmons
- Understanding Criminal Procedure:
Vol. 2: Adjudication, Fourth Edition**
Joshua Dressler and Alan C. Michaels
- Understanding Disability Law,
Third Edition**
Mark C. Weber
- Understanding Election Law
and Voting Rights**
Michael R. Dimino, Bradley A. Smith,
and Michael E. Solimine
- Understanding Employee Benefits Law,
Second Edition**
Kathryn L. Moore
- Understanding Employment
Discrimination Law, Third Edition**
Thomas R. Haggard and Bruce N. Cameron
- Understanding Employment Law,
Third Edition**
Paul M. Secunda, Richard A. Bales,
and Jeffrey M. Hirsch
- Understanding Environmental Law,
Fourth Edition**
Kevin A. Reilly and Philip Weinberg
- Understanding Estate and Gift Taxation,
Second Edition**
Brant J. Hellwig and Robert T. Danforth
- Understanding Evidence, Sixth Edition**
Paul C. Giannelli and Jules Epstein
- Understanding Family Law, Fourth Edition**
John Gregory, Peter N. Swisher,
and Robin Wilson
- Understanding Federal and
California Evidence**
Paul C. Giannelli
- Understanding Federal Courts
and Jurisdiction, Second Edition**
Linda Mullenix, Martin H. Redish,
and Georgene Vairo
- Understanding Federal Income Taxation,
Seventh Edition**
J. Martin Burke and Michael K. Friel

- Understanding the First Amendment, Eighth Edition**
Russell L. Weaver
- Understanding Immigration Law, Third Edition**
Kevin R. Johnson, Raquel Aldana, Bill Ong Hing, Leticia M. Saucedo, and Enid Trucios-Haynes
- Understanding Insurance Law, Sixth Edition**
Robert H. Jerry, II and Douglas Richmond
- Understanding Intellectual Property Law, Fourth Edition**
Tyler T. Ochoa, Shubha Ghosh, and Mary LaFrance
- Understanding International Business and Financial Transactions, Fourth Edition**
Jerold A. Friedland
- Understanding International Criminal Law, Fourth Edition**
Ellen S. Podgor, Roger S. Clark, and Lucian E. Dervan
- Understanding International Law, Third Edition**
Stephen C. McCaffrey
- Understanding Jewish Law, Second Edition**
Steven H. Resnicoff
- Understanding Juvenile Law, Fifth Edition**
Martin Gardner
- Understanding Labor Law, Fifth Edition**
Douglas E. Ray, Calvin William Sharpe, and Robert N. Strassfeld
- Understanding the Law of Terrorism, Second Edition**
Erik Luna and Wayne McCormack
- Understanding the Law of Zoning and Land Use Controls, Third Edition**
Barlow Burke
- Understanding Lawyers' Ethics, Fifth Edition**
Monroe H. Freedman and Abbe Smith
- Understanding Local Government, Second Edition**
Sandra Stevenson
- Understanding Modern Real Estate Transactions, Fourth Edition**
Alex M. Johnson, Jr.
- Understanding Negotiable Instruments and Payment Systems, Second Edition**
William H. Lawrence
- Understanding Nonprofit and Tax Exempt Organizations, Third Edition**
Nicholas P. Cafardi and Jaclyn Fabean Cherry
- Understanding Partnership and LLC Taxation, Fifth Edition**
Jerold A. Friedland
- Understanding Patent Law, Third Edition**
Amy L. Landers
- Understanding Products Liability Law, Second Edition**
Bruce L. Ottley, Rogelio A. Lasso, and Terrence F. Kiely
- Understanding Property Law, Fifth Edition**
John G. Sprankling
- Understanding Remedies, Fourth Edition**
James M. Fischer
- Understanding Sales and Leases of Goods, Third Edition**
William H. Henning, William H. Lawrence, and Henry Deeb Gabriel
- Understanding Secured Transactions, Fifth Edition**
William H. Lawrence, William H. Henning, and R. Wilson Freyeremuth
- Understanding Securities Law, Eighth Edition**
Marc I. Steinberg
- Understanding Sports Law**
Timothy Davis and N. Jeremi Duru
- Understanding Taxation of Business Entities, Second Edition**
Walter D. Schwidetzky and Fred B. Brown
- Understanding Torts, Seventh Edition**
John L. Diamond, Lawrence C. Levine, and Anita Bernstein
- Understanding Trade Secret Law**
John G. Sprankling and Thomas G. Sprankling
- Understanding Trademark Law, Fourth Edition**
Mary LaFrance
- Understanding Trusts and Estates, Seventh Edition**
Roger W. Andersen and Susan Gary
- Understanding White Collar Crime, Fifth Edition**
J. Kelly Strader and Todd Haugh

Understanding the First Amendment

EIGHTH EDITION

Russell L. Weaver

PROFESSOR OF LAW AND DISTINGUISHED UNIVERSITY SCHOLAR
UNIVERSITY OF LOUISVILLE
LOUIS D. BRANDEIS SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2023
Russell L. Weaver
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

ISBN 978-1-5310-2504-5
eISBN 978-1-5310-2505-2
LCCN 2022055200

See catalog.loc.gov for complete Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
(919) 489-7486
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

To Laurence, Ben and Kate, with love.

*Special thanks to my research assistants, Ben Weaver,
Taylor Castleman and Payton Fergus.*

Contents

Chapter 1 · The Origins and Nature of the First Amendment	3
§ 1.01 Backdrop to the First Amendment	4
[A] Pre-Colonial Developments	4
[B] Colonial Developments	6
§ 1.02 Adoption of the First Amendment	8
§ 1.03 Development of the First Amendment	8
[A] An Early Tradition of Suppression	9
[B] Judicial Review and the First Amendment	10
§ 1.04 First Amendment Values	11
§ 1.05 Understanding and Applying First Amendment Standards of Review	14
[A] Speech	14
[B] Press	16
[C] Religion	16
[1] Establishment	16
[2] Free Exercise	17
§ 1.06 Types of Speech (Including Symbolic Speech)	17
§ 1.07 A Sample Analysis	18
[A] The Problem	18
[B] An Analytical Roadmap	19
§ 1.08 The First Amendment in Summary	19
Chapter 2 · Speech Advocating Violent or Illegal Action	23
§ 2.01 Formative Case Law	23
§ 2.02 Toward a More Speech Protective Standard	27
§ 2.03 Doctrinal Uncertainty	28
§ 2.04 The Modern Standard of Review	30
Chapter 3 · Content Regulation	35
§ 3.01 Basic Concepts and Applications	36
§ 3.02 Fighting Words	37
§ 3.03 Defamation	39
[A] Traditional Doctrine and Seeds of Change	39
[B] Defamation as Protected Expression: The Actual Malice Requirement	40
[1] Public Officials	40
[2] Public Figures	42
[a] The Outer Limits of the Actual Malice Standard	43
[b] The Public Figure Concept Refined	45

[3] The Not Entirely Irrelevant Public Concern Factor	46
[4] Second Thoughts on the Actual Malice Standard	48
[C] Fact and Opinion	50
[D] False Speech	50
§ 3.04 Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress	51
§ 3.05 Privacy	58
[A] Publication of Personal Information	59
[B] False Light Privacy	60
[C] Right of Publicity	61
[D] Intrusion on Seclusion	61
§ 3.06 Obscenity	62
[A] The Definitional Challenge	63
[B] Doctrinal Chaos	64
[C] <i>Miller</i> Amplifications and Applications	66
[1] Prurient Interest and Community Standards	66
[2] Patent Offensiveness Specified	67
[3] Speech Value	67
[D] Obscenity's Safe Harbor	68
Chapter 4 · Content Regulation: Other Candidates for Categorical Exclusion or Limited Protection	71
§ 4.01 "Offensive" Speech	71
§ 4.02 Child Pornography	77
§ 4.03 Pornography as Discrimination against Women	84
§ 4.04 Crush Videos	87
§ 4.05 Violent Videos	89
§ 4.06 Support for Terrorist Organizations	91
§ 4.07 Lies Regarding the Congressional Medal of Honor	92
§ 4.08 Reparative Therapy	95
§ 4.09 Commercial Speech	96
[A] The Backdrop to Modern Commercial Speech Doctrine	96
[B] Commercial Speech as Protected Expression	97
[C] The Standard of Review	98
[D] Special Circumstances: Lawyer Advertising	104
Chapter 5 · Overbreadth, Vagueness, and Prior Restraints	111
§ 5.01 Overbreadth and Vagueness	112
[A] Overbreadth	113
[B] Vagueness	115
§ 5.02 Prior Restraints	116
[A] Licensing	116
[1] Overview	116
[2] Motion Picture Licensing	117
[3] Non-Licensing Notifications	119
[4] Parade Permits	120

[5] Licensing Fundraisers	120
[6] News Rack Licensing	120
[B] Injunctions	121
[1] Overview	121
[2] Prior Restraints and National Security	123
[3] Injunctions against Trademark Infringement	126
[4] Injunctions against Abortion Protests	126
[5] Prior Restraints on Printable Gun Designs	130
[6] Prior Restraints on Commercial Speech	130
Chapter 6 · Content Neutrality	133
§ 6.01 Speech Intertwined with Conduct	134
§ 6.02 Secondary Effects	137
§ 6.03 Public Fora	140
[A] Traditional Public Forum	142
[B] Designated Public Forums	146
[C] Reserved Forums	149
§ 6.04 Private Property	155
§ 6.05 Permit Requirements	156
Chapter 7 · Testing the Boundaries of Doctrine	161
§ 7.01 Religious Speech	162
§ 7.02 “Hate” Speech	165
[A] Early Precedent	165
[B] <i>R.A.V.</i>	166
[C] Sentence Enhancement	168
[D] Prohibiting Cross Burning	170
[E] Campus Speech Codes	171
§ 7.03 “True Threats”	172
§ 7.04 Campaign Finance Laws	174
[A] General Theory	174
[B] Expenditure Limitations	176
[C] Contribution Limitations	178
[D] Reporting and Disclosure Requirements	184
[E] Public Financing of Campaigns	187
[F] Government’s Authority to Equalize Resources between Candidates	191
[G] Limitations on Expenditures from Personal or Family Resources	192
[H] Independent Expenditures	192
[I] Corporate Contributions and Expenditures	195
[J] Regulation of Judicial Elections	204
Chapter 8 · Freedom of Association and Compelled Expression	207
§ 8.01 The Right to Associate	207
[A] Early Precedent	208
[B] The House Un-American Activities Committee	210

[C] <i>Claiborne Hardware</i>	212
[D] Compelled Admission to Membership	212
[E] “Fusion” Political Candidates	219
[F] Political Primaries	220
§ 8.02 The Right “Not to Speak”	221
[A] Overview	221
[B] The Solomon Amendment and Law School Placement Offices	223
[C] Parade Inclusion — Exclusion	224
[D] Compelled Financial Support for Expression	226
§ 8.03 Unconstitutional Conditions	231
§ 8.04 The Other Side of the Right to Be Let Alone	236
Chapter 9 · The Government as Employer, Educator, and Source of Funds	239
§ 9.01 First Amendment Rights of Public Employees	240
[A] Prohibiting Electioneering	240
[B] Other Employee Speech	243
[C] Other Governmental Employee Associational Rights	255
§ 9.02 The First Amendment in the Public Schools	260
§ 9.03 Government Financed Speech	270
[A] Overview	270
[B] The National Endowment for the Arts	277
[C] Legal Services Corporation Funding	279
[D] Monuments on Government Property	281
[E] State-Issued Specialty License Plates	281
Chapter 10 · Media and the First Amendment	287
§ 10.01 The Significance of the Press Clause	289
§ 10.02 The Newsgathering Function	289
[A] Reporter’s Privilege	289
[B] Newsroom Searches	291
[C] Access to Prisons	293
[D] Access to Judicial Proceedings	294
[E] The Problem of Prejudicial Publicity	296
[F] Electronic Media in the Courtroom	298
§ 10.03 Media Technology and First Amendment Standards	299
[A] Print	301
[B] Broadcasting	302
[1] Fairness Regulation	302
[2] Regulation of Indecent Programming	305
[C] Cable	307
[1] Must Carriage	308
[2] Regulation of Indecent Programming	309
[D] Telephony	310
[1] Common Carrier Status	310
[2] Indecency Regulation	311

[E] Internet	311
[1] The Role of the Internet Under the First Amendment	312
[2] Regulation of Indecency	314
[3] Banning Sex Offenders from the Internet	316
[4] Bloggers, Internet “Journalists,” and First Amendment Protections	317
[5] Artificial Intelligence, Robotic Speech, and the Internet	317
[6] The Section 230 Shield	317
[7] Disinformation	318
[8] Net Neutrality	318
[F] Video Games	319
Chapter 11 · The Establishment Clause	321
§ 11.01 Financial Aid to Religion	323
[A] Early Cases	323
[B] The <i>Lemon</i> Test	326
[C] Other Applications of the <i>Lemon</i> Test	328
[D] Criticism of <i>Lemon</i> ’s Three-Part Test	330
[E] <i>Agostini</i> , <i>Mitchell</i> , and Continued Doctrinal Turmoil	332
[1] <i>Agostini</i> ’s Modification of <i>Lemon</i>	333
[2] <i>Mitchell</i> and Neutrality	336
[3] <i>Agostini</i> and <i>Mitchell</i> ’s Impact	338
[4] The <i>Kennedy</i> Decision and the “Historical Practices and Understandings” Test	340
§ 11.02 Parental Choice and Financial Aid	341
[A] Early Cases	342
[B] The Cleveland School Voucher Case	342
[C] State Divergence	348
[D] Recent Parental Choice Decisions	348
§ 11.03 State Sponsored Prayer	349
[A] In Public Schools	349
[B] Moment of Silence Laws	351
[C] Legislative Prayer	352
[D] Graduation Prayer	354
[E] Prayer at Athletic Events	355
[F] Prayer by School Officials	356
§ 11.04 Curricular Issues	359
[A] Bible Readings	359
[B] Evolution	361
[C] Balanced Treatment of Creation Science	362
[D] Intelligent Design	364
§ 11.05 Official Acknowledgment	365
[A] The Ten Commandments	365
[B] Latin Crosses	373
[C] Holiday Displays	374

[D] Swearing Belief in God	378
[E] Day of Rest	378
§ 11.06 Vesting Government Authority in Religious Institutions	379
[A] Vesting Veto Authority in Religious Institutions	379
[B] <i>Kiryas Joel</i> and Special School Districts	379
[C] Armed Forces Chaplains	382
§ 11.07 Establishment, Free Exercise and Freedom of Speech	383
[A] Student Publications	384
[B] Religious Instruction in Public Schools	385
[C] Use of Public-School Facilities	385
[D] Vocational Assistance to the Handicapped	386
[E] Funding of Non-Profit Private Organizations	387
[F] College Scholarships	388
[G] Prohibitions against Discrimination	389
Chapter 12 · The Free Exercise Clause	391
§ 12.01 Burdens on Religion	392
[A] Early Cases	392
[B] From <i>Sherbert</i> to <i>Smith</i>	394
[C] The <i>Smith</i> Decision	398
[D] Post- <i>Smith</i> Developments: Adoption of the Religious Freedom Restoration Act	401
[E] The Ministerial Exception	405
[F] Post- <i>Smith</i> Free Exercise Decisions	407
[G] The Future of <i>Smith</i> 's "Neutral and Generally Applicable" Test	409
§ 12.02 Discrimination against Religion	409
[A] College Scholarships: <i>Locke v. Davey</i>	410
[B] Vocational Training: <i>Witters v. Washington Department of Services</i>	411
[C] More on Scholarships: <i>Espinoza v. Montana Department of Revenue</i>	412
[D] Tuition Assistance: <i>Carson v. Makin</i>	413
[E] Ritual Sacrifice of Animals: <i>Church of the Lukumi Babalu Aye</i>	414
[F] Custom-Designed Cakes: <i>Masterpiece Cakeshop, Ltd.</i>	418
[G] School Playgrounds: <i>Trinity Lutheran</i>	421
[H] The Boston Flagpole: <i>Shurtleff v. City of Boston</i>	422
[I] Foster Care Placements: <i>Fulton v. City of Philadelphia</i>	423
[J] The Buddhist Execution	425
§ 12.03 The Intersection of Speech and Religion	425
[A] Access to Public Facilities	425
[B] Funding for Student Publications: <i>Rosenberger v. Rector</i>	426
Table of Cases	429
Index	437