A Student Electronic Discovery Primer

A Student Electronic Discovery Primer

An Essential Companion for Civil Procedure Courses

SECOND EDITION

William F. Hamilton

Jennifer M. Smith

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2023
Carolina Academic Press
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Hamilton, William, (Law teacher), author. | Smith, Jennifer M., (Law teacher), author.
Title: A student electronic discovery primer : an essential companion for civil procedure courses / William F. Hamilton and Jennifer M. Smith.
Description: Second edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, 2023. | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2023025518 | ISBN 9781531025694 (paperback) | ISBN 9781531025700 (ebook)
Subjects: LCSH: Electronic discovery (Law)--United States.
Classification: LCC KF8902.E42 H35 2023 | DDC 347.73/6--dc23/eng/20230613
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023025518

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
(919) 489-7486
www.cap-press.com
Printed in the United States of America

To my wife, Cindy, for her inspiration and belief
that love and dedication will always prevail.
— WFH

To my extraordinary mother, a trailblazer as the first lawyer in
our family and my ultimate inspiration to pursue a legal career;
and to my cherished students, who ignite a passion within me
to pursue what I truly love each and every day.
— JMS

Contents

Part I · Introduction 3

Chapter 1 · The Modern Electronic Computer and the Emergence of Electronically Stored Information 5

Electronically Stored Information 7
Electronic Discovery Terminology: Bits and Bytes 8
Key Characteristics of Electronically Stored Information 9
Voluminous 10
Searchable 10
Rich Information Including Metadata 12
Location Dispersal 13
Fragile and Recoverable 13
The Electronic Discovery Reference Model 14
The Electronic Discovery Best Practices Model 15
Amendments to the Rules of Civil Procedure Governing Electronic Discovery 15
2006 Federal Rule Amendments 16
2015 Federal Rule Amendments 16
Large Language Models/Generative Artificial Intelligence (GenAI) 17
Managing the Electronic Discovery Process 19

Part II · Illustrative Electronic Discovery Case Law 21
Zubulake Background 22

Chapter 2 · Accessible and Inaccessible Data 23
Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC, 217 F.R.D. 309 (S.D.N.Y. 2003) (*Zubulake I*) 23
Case Postscript 34

Chapter 3 · Cost-Shifting and the Proportionality Test 37
Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC, 216 F.R.D. 280 (S.D.N.Y. 2003) (*Zubulake III*) 37

Chapter 4 · Duty to Preserve and Spoliation 51
Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC, 220 F.R.D. 212 (S.D.N.Y. 2003) (*Zubulake IV*) 51
Case Postscript 61

Chapter 5 · Counsel and Litigant Duties, Litigation Holds, Record Retention Policies, and Sanctions 63
Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC, 229 F.R.D. 422 (S.D.N.Y. 2004) (*Zubulake V*) 63
Case Postscript 80

Chapter 6 · Search Methods, Sampling, Clawback Agreements, and Quick-Peek Agreements 81
Victor Stanley, Inc. v. Creative Pipe, Inc., 250 F.R.D. 251 (D. Md. 2008) 81

Chapter 7 · Budgeting, Cost Control, and Meet and Confer Obligations 93
Mancia, et al. v. Mayflower Textile Servs. Co., 253 F.R.D. 354 (D. Md. 2008) 93
Case Postscript 104

Chapter 8 · Computer Forensics, Confidentiality, and Experts 105
In re Wesley F. Honza, Jr. and Robert A. Honza, 242 S.W.3d 578 (Tex. App. 2008) 105

Chapter 9 · Computer-Assisted Review and Seed Sets 111
Moore v. Publicis Groupe, 287 F.R.D. 182 (S.D.N.Y. 2012) 111

Part III · Chart of Principal Amendments to the Federal Civil Procedure Rules Relating to Electronic Discovery 127

Part IV · Sample Forms 131
A. Preservation Demand Letter to Opposition 131
B. Custodian Litigation Hold Notice 133
C. IT Systems Litigation Hold Notice 135
D. Checklist for Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(f) Conference 137
E. Electronically Stored Information Discovery Agreement and Protocols 139
F. Topics of Rule 30(b)(6) Deposition Regarding Electronically Stored Information 141
G. Interrogatories Related to Electronically Stored Information 144
H. Instructions and Directions for Request for Production of Electronically Stored Information 146
I. Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) Protective Order Containing Clawback Provision 148
J. Standard Electronic Discovery Order 150
K. Judicial Order Related to Lawyer Use of Generative AI 153

About the Authors 155

Index 157