

Mediation in an Evolving World

Mediation in an Evolving World

Theory and Practice

James Alfini

PROFESSOR OF LAW EMERITUS AND DEAN EMERITUS
SOUTH TEXAS COLLEGE OF LAW HOUSTON

Donna Erez-Navot

LEGAL SKILLS PROFESSOR AND ASSOCIATE DIRECTOR OF THE INSTITUTE
FOR DISPUTE RESOLUTION
UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA LEVIN COLLEGE OF LAW

William Froehlich

LANGDON FELLOW IN DISPUTE RESOLUTION AND DIRECTOR OF THE DIVIDED
COMMUNITY PROJECT
THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY MORITZ COLLEGE OF LAW

Sharon Press

PROFESSOR OF LAW AND DIRECTOR OF THE DISPUTE RESOLUTION INSTITUTE
MITCHELL HAMLINE SCHOOL OF LAW

Joseph B. Stulberg

PROFESSOR EMERITUS
THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY MORITZ COLLEGE OF LAW

Oladeji M. Tiamiyu

ASSISTANT PROFESSOR OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF DENVER, STURM COLLEGE OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2024
Carolina Academic Press, LLC
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 978-1-5310-2936-4
eISBN 978-1-5310-2937-1
LCCN 2024931824

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, NC 27701
(919) 489-7486
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

To Barry, Carol, Edo, Jessie, Midge, and Muibi

Table of Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments	xix
Online Materials	xxi
Chapter 1 · Conceptual Framework and Historical Context	3
A. Introduction	3
Why Study Mediation?	3
B. Mediation’s Development	4
1. Historical Perspective	4
2. Foundational Years: (1969–1989)	5
a. Group Conflicts	5
b. Court Cases	6
c. Family Mediation	6
d. Mediation in Education	8
e. Public Disputes	9
f. Organizational Initiatives	9
3. Institutionalizing Mediation’s Use (1989–2012)	9
a. State Courts	10
b. Federal Courts	11
c. The Internet	12
i. On-line Dispute Resolution (ODR): The Internet in the Cyberspace Commercial Setting	12
ii. Technology’s Impact on Public Dispute Resolution Programs	12
4. Transformative Years of Intersectional Values (2012 – Present)	13
C. Enduring Challenges and Opportunities	15
Notes and Questions	15
Chapter 2 · Negotiation Concepts for the Mediator	19
A. Overview	19
Note on Negotiation Terminology	19
B. Negotiation Strategies and Behavior	21
1. Principled & Integrative Negotiation	21
Russell Korobkin, <i>Against Integrative Bargaining</i>	22
Noam Ebner & Adam Kamp, <i>Relationship 2.0</i>	25
Ariel Eckblad, <i>In Pursuit of Fairness: Re-Negotiating Embedded Norms & Re-Imagining Interest-Based Negotiation</i>	29
Notes and Questions	35

2. Cooperative Versus Competitive Negotiation	36
Gary Goodpaster, <i>A Primer on Competitive Bargaining</i>	36
Gerald R. Williams, <i>Legal Negotiation and Settlement</i>	44
Notes and Questions	47
3. Problem-Solving Negotiation	47
Carrie Menkel-Meadow, <i>Toward Another View of Legal Negotiation: The Structure of Problem-Solving</i>	47
Notes and Questions	54
C. Psychological & Technological Considerations	54
Laura A. Frase, <i>Refining Our Thinking About Thinking: Battling the Sway of Cognitive Biases in Negotiation</i>	55
Noam Ebner, <i>The Human Touch in ODR: Trust, Empathy, and Social Intuition in Online Negotiation and Mediation</i>	61
Jean R. Sternlight & Jennifer K. Robbennolt, <i>In-Person or Via Technology?: Drawing on Psychology to Choose and Design Dispute Resolution Processes</i>	68
Notes and Questions	75
Chapter 3 · Mediation Process and Skills	79
A. Introduction	79
B. The Mediator and Mediator Functions	80
Notes and Questions	81
C. The Mediation Process	81
1. Beginning the Mediation Process	81
a. Preliminaries: Prior to Convening	81
i. Locale and Physical Arrangement	81
ii. Mediation Participants	83
iii. Pre-Meeting Information Review	83
Roselle L. Wissler and Art Hinshaw, <i>What Happens Before the First Mediation Session? An Empirical Study of Pre-Session Communications</i>	84
Notes and Questions	86
b. Mediator's Opening Remarks	87
i. Introductions	88
ii. Establishing Credibility and Impartiality	88
iii. Explaining Mediation and the Role of the Mediator	90
iv. Explaining the Procedures That Will Guide the Process	90
v. Checking in for Questions and Clarifications	92
2. Accumulating Information	92
a. The Parties' Opening Statements	93
b. Notes	93
c. Listening Skills	95
Joseph B. Stulberg & Lela P. Love, <i>The Middle Voice: Mediating Conflict Successfully</i>	95

d. Questioning	96
e. Non-Verbal Communication	98
3. Developing an Agenda	98
a. Characterizing the Issues	99
b. Structuring the Discussion	100
4. Generating Movement	101
a. Procedural Items	102
b. Informational Items	103
c. Relationship Issues	105
5. The Separate Session (Caucus)	105
a. Rationale and Sequence of Separate Sessions	106
b. Why Not Meet Separately?	107
c. Principles and Mechanics of the Separate Session	107
d. Second Caucus	109
6. Concluding the Mediation	111
a. Possible Endings	111
b. Closing When There Is No Agreement	112
c. Drafting an Agreement	112
d. Enforcement	114
Chapter 4 · Mediator Roles, Orientations, and Styles	115
A. Introduction	115
B. Mediator Role Conceptions	115
Lon L. Fuller, <i>Mediation — Its Forms and Functions</i>	116
Robert A. Baruch Bush, <i>Efficiency and Protection, or Empowerment and Recognition?: The Mediator's Role and Ethical Standards in Mediation</i>	117
Notes and Questions	122
C. Mediator Accountability	122
Lawrence Susskind, <i>Environmental Mediation and the Accountability Problem</i>	123
Joseph B. Stulberg, <i>The Theory and Practice of Mediation: A Reply to Professor Susskind</i>	125
<i>Core Values of Dispute Resolution: Is Neutrality Necessary?</i>	127
Notes and Questions	132
D. Mediator Orientations	135
1. Facilitative & Evaluative Mediation	135
Leonard L. Riskin, <i>Understanding Mediators' Orientations, Strategies, and Techniques: A Grid for the Perplexed</i>	136
Lela P. Love, <i>The Top Ten Reasons Why Mediators Should Not Evaluate</i>	140
Dwight Golann and Marjorie Corman Aaron, <i>Beyond Abstinence: The Need for Safe, Impartial Evaluation in Mediation</i>	144
Notes and Questions	147

2. Additional Mediation Orientations	149
a. Transformative Mediation	149
Robert A. Baruch Bush & Joseph P. Folger, <i>The Promise of Mediation: The Transformative Approach to Mediation</i>	150
b. Inclusive Mediation	157
Caroline Harmon-Darrow, Lorig Charkoudian, Tracee Ford, Michele Ennis & Erricka Bridgeford, <i>Defining Inclusive Mediation: Theory, Practice, and Research</i>	158
c. Understanding-Based Mediation	161
Gary Friedman & Jack Himmelstein, <i>Resolving Conflict Together: The Understanding-Based Model of Mediation</i>	161
Notes and Questions	164
E. Empirical Analysis of Mediator Style & Interventions	166
James J. Alfini, <i>Trashing, Bashing, and Hashing It Out: Is This the End of “Good Mediation”?</i>	167
Deborah Thompson Eisenberg, <i>What We Know and Need to Know About Court-Annexed Dispute Resolution</i>	171
Notes and Questions	174
Chapter 5 · Confidentiality	177
A. Introduction	177
B. Purpose and Policy	178
Ellen F. Deason, <i>The Need for Trust as a Justification for Confidentiality in Mediation: A Cross-Disciplinary Approach</i>	178
<i>National Labor Relations Board v. Macaluso</i>	182
Notes and Questions	186
<i>Cassel v. Superior Court</i>	186
Notes and Questions	188
C. Contract	189
Minnesota Department of Human Rights (MDHR), <i>Mediation Program: Agreement to Mediate</i>	189
Note	191
D. Evidentiary Exclusions	191
1. Introduction	191
2. Federal Rules of Evidence, Rule 408. Compromise Offers and Negotiation	191
Charles W. Ehrhardt, <i>Confidentiality, Privilege and Rule 408: The Protection of Mediation Proceedings in Federal Court</i>	192
Notes and Questions	194
E. Privilege	194
Uniform Mediation Act	195
Notes and Questions	196

<i>Facebook, Inc. v. Pacific Northwest Software, Inc.</i>	197
Notes and Questions	200
Sharon Press and Gregory Firestone, <i>Privadentiality: What Does It Mean and Why Do We Need It?</i>	202
F. Exceptions	204
Alan Kirtley, <i>The Mediation Privilege's Transition from Theory to Implementation: Designing a Mediation Privilege Standard to Protect Mediation Participants, the Process and the Public Interest</i>	205
Uniform Mediation Act	210
Notes and Questions	211
<i>Olam v. Congress Mortgage Company</i>	212
<i>In re Teligent, Inc.</i>	221
Notes and Questions	223
G. Confidentiality in Online Mediation	224
Note	226
Chapter 6 · Legal Issues in Mediation	227
A. Introduction	227
B. Agreements to Mediate and Statutory Requirements to Mediate	227
<i>Brosnan v. Dry Cleaning Station</i>	228
Notes and Questions	230
C. Judicial Power to Compel Mediation	231
<i>In re Atlantic Pipe Corporation</i>	231
Notes and Questions	238
D. Mediation in “Good Faith”	239
<i>Pitts v. Francis</i>	239
Notes and Questions	242
Peter N. Thompson, <i>Good Faith Mediation in the Federal Courts</i>	244
Notes and Questions	247
ABA Section of Dispute Resolution on Good Faith Requirements for Mediators and Mediation Advocates in Court-Mandated Mediation Programs	248
Notes and Questions	250
E. Enforceability of Mediated Agreements	251
<i>In re Marriage of Ames</i>	251
<i>Fidelity and Guaranty Insurance Co. v. Star Equipment Corp.</i>	254
Notes and Questions	256
<i>Silkey v. Investors Diversified Services, Inc.</i>	258
Notes and Questions	262
<i>Del Bosque v. AT & T Advertising</i>	265
Notes and Questions	267

Chapter 7 · Diversity, Power, and Justice	269
A. Introduction	269
B. Interrogating Bias, Considering Culture	271
1. Considerations for Bias & Culture	271
Carol Izumi, <i>Implicit Bias and Prejudice in Mediation</i>	272
Shino Yokotsuka, <i>Cultural Humility in Intercultural Mediation</i>	276
Notes and Questions	278
2. Bias & Culture: Mediator Perspectives	279
Nadine Tafoya, <i>Rage Is Not an Option: An Indigenous Woman's Path to Building Resiliency and Advocacy</i>	280
<i>A Conversation with Hasshan Batts</i>	282
Sukhsimranjit Singh, <i>Best Practices for Mediating Religious Conflicts</i>	285
Notes and Questions	287
C. Power Prejudice and the Resolution of Conflict	290
Richard Delgado, Chris Dunn, Pamela Brown, Helena Lee & David Hubbert, <i>Fairness and Formality: Minimizing the Risk of Prejudice in Alternative Dispute Resolution</i>	291
Trina Grillo, <i>The Mediation Alternative: Process Dangers for Women</i>	295
Sharon Press & Ellen E. Deason, <i>Mediation: Embedded Assumptions of Whiteness?</i>	305
Notes and Questions	311
Michelle Hermann, Gary LaFree, Christine Rack & Mary Beth West, <i>An Empirical Study of the Effects of Race and Gender on Small Claims Adjudication and Mediation</i>	313
Notes and Questions	317
D. Re-Examining Justice: Mediation and the Rule of Law	317
Owen Fiss, <i>Against Settlement</i>	318
Notes and Questions	323
Carrie Menkel-Meadow, <i>Whose Dispute Is It Anyway? A Philosophical and Democratic Defense of Settlement (In Some Cases)</i>	324
Notes and Questions	326
Jonathan M. Hyman & Lela P. Love, <i>If Portia Were a Mediator: An Inquiry into Justice in Mediation</i>	327
Isabelle Gunning, <i>Justice for All in Mediation: What the Pandemic, Racial Justice Movement, and the Recognition of Structural Racism Call Us to Do as Mediators</i>	329
Notes and Questions	330
Chapter 8 · Ethical Issues for Mediators	331
A. Introduction	331
B. Mediator Standards of Conduct	331
1. Self-Determination	332

a. Model Standards of Conduct for Mediators	333
Standard I. Self-Determination	333
b. Online Dispute Resolution Considerations	333
c. Mediation Dilemmas for Discussion	333
Notes and Questions	334
2. Impartiality/Conflicts of Interest	337
a. Model Standards of Conduct for Mediators	337
Standard II. Impartiality	337
Standard III. Conflicts of Interest	337
b. Mediation Dilemmas for Discussion	338
Notes and Questions	339
3. Mediator Competence	341
a. Model Standards of Conduct for Mediators	341
Standard IV. Competence	341
b. Online Dispute Resolution Considerations	342
c. Mediation Dilemmas for Discussion	342
Notes and Questions	343
4. Confidentiality	343
a. Model Standards of Conduct for Mediators	343
Standard V. Confidentiality	343
b. Online Dispute Resolution Considerations	344
c. Mediation Dilemmas for Discussion	344
5. Quality of Process	345
a. Timeliness	346
i. Model Standards of Conduct for Mediators	346
Standard VI. Quality of the Process	346
ii. Mediation Dilemmas for Discussion	346
Notes and Questions	346
b. Participation and Candor	347
i. Model Standards of Conduct for Mediators	347
Standard VI. Quality of the Process	347
ii. Online Dispute Resolution Considerations	347
iii. Mediation Dilemmas for Discussion	347
Notes and Questions	347
c. Advice, Opinions, Information	348
i. Model Standards of Conduct for Mediators	348
Standard VI. Quality of the Process	348
ii. Mediation Dilemmas for Discussion	349
Notes and Questions	350
d. Adjournment or Termination	352
i. Model Standards of Conduct	352
Standard VI. Quality of the Process	352
ii. Mediation Dilemmas for Discussion	353
Notes and Questions	354

6. Advertising/Solicitation	355
a. Model Standards of Conduct for Mediators	355
Standard VII. Advertising and Solicitation	355
b. Mediation Dilemmas for Discussion	356
Notes and Questions	356
7. Fees and Expenses	357
a. Model Standards of Conduct	357
Standard VIII. Fees And Other Charges	357
b. Mediation Dilemmas for Discussion	357
Notes and Questions	358
8. Obligations to the Profession	358
a. Model Standards of Conduct	358
Standard IX. Advancement of Mediation Practice	358
Notes and Questions	359
C. Enforcement of Ethical Standards	359
Michael Moffitt, <i>Ten Ways to Get Sued: A Guide for Mediators</i>	359
Notes and Questions	368
D. Mediation and the Legal System	370
1. Is Mediation the Practice of Law?	371
Carrie Menkel-Meadow, <i>Mediation and the Legal System,</i>	
<i>Is Mediation the Practice of Law?</i>	371
Bruce Meyerson, <i>Lawyers Who Mediate Are Not Practicing Law</i>	373
Notes and Questions	374
2. Confusing the Role of Lawyer and Mediator	375
Rule 2.4 Lawyer Serving as Third-Party Neutral	376
Notes and Questions	377
3. Conflict of Interest Issues Facing the Lawyer-Mediator	378
Rule 1.12 Former Judge, Arbitrator, Mediator,	
or Other Third-Party Neutral	378
Notes and Questions	378
4. Fee Sharing Issues Facing the Lawyer-Mediator	381
Notes and Questions	381
5. Advertising and Solicitation Issues Facing the Lawyer-Mediator	382
Notes and Questions	383
Chapter 9 · The Institutionalization of Mediation in the Courts	385
A. Introduction	385
B. Development of Institutionalization	386
Frank E.A. Sander, <i>The Future of ADR</i>	386
C. Institutionalization of Mediation in the Court Context:	
Policy Development	389
Robert A. Baruch Bush, <i>Mediation and Adjudication,</i>	
<i>Dispute Resolution and Ideology:</i>	
<i>An Imaginary Conversation</i>	390

Donna Shestowsky, <i>When Ignorance Is Not Bliss: An Empirical Study of Litigants' Awareness of Court-Sponsored Alternative Dispute Resolution Programs</i>	395
Art Hinshaw, <i>Regulating Mediators</i>	399
Notes and Questions	403
Sharon Press, <i>Institutionalization: Savior or Saboteur of Mediation?</i>	404
Notes and Questions	408
D. Empirical Evaluations	411
Lorig Charkoudian, Deborah Thompson Eisenberg and Jamie L. Walter, <i>What Difference Does ADR Make? Comparison of ADR and Trial Outcomes in Small Claims Court</i>	412
Notes and Questions	415
E. Critiques of Institutionalization	419
Carrie Menkel-Meadow, <i>Pursuing Settlement in an Adversary Culture: A Tale of Innovation Co-Opted or "The Law of ADR"</i>	419
Wayne D. Brazil, <i>Court ADR 25 Years After Pound: Have We Found a Better Way?</i>	425
Nancy A. Welsh, <i>Do You Believe in Magic?: Self-Determination and Procedural Justice Meet Inequality in Court-Connected Mediation</i>	430
Notes and Questions	438
Chapter 10 · Mediation and the Lawyer as Advocate	441
A. Introduction	441
B. The Relationship Between Mediation and Litigation	441
Julie Macfarlane, <i>The Evolution of the New Lawyer: How Lawyers Are Reshaping the Practice of Law</i>	443
Notes and Questions	448
C. Lawyers' Role in Mediation	449
Notes and Questions	450
1. Lawyers' Role in Selecting a Mediator	452
David Geronemus, <i>Mediation of Legal Malpractice Cases: Prevention and Resolution</i>	453
Jean R. Sternlight, <i>Lawyer's Representation of Clients in Mediation: Using Economics and Psychology to Structure Advocacy in a Nonadversarial Setting</i>	455
Notes and Questions	456
2. Does the Participation of Lawyers Benefit or Harm the Mediation Process?	457
Craig A. McEwen, Nancy H. Rogers & Richard J. Maiman, <i>Bring in the Lawyers: Challenging the Dominant Approaches to Ensuring Fairness in Divorce Mediation</i>	458

Uniform Mediation Act, Section 10	460
Notes and Questions	461
3. How Lawyers Advocate for Their Clients in Mediation	461
Jacqueline Nolan-Haley, <i>Lawyer Representation in Mediation</i>	462
Harold Abramson, <i>Mediation Representation: Advocating as a Problem-Solver in Any Country or Culture</i>	466
Jean R. Sternlight, <i>Lawyer's Representation of Clients in Mediation: Using Economics and Psychology to Structure Advocacy in a Nonadversarial Setting</i>	467
Notes and Questions	469
Jean R. Sternlight, <i>What's a Lawyer to Do in Mediation?</i>	469
Tom Arnold, <i>20 Common Errors in Mediation Advocacy</i>	472
Dwight Golann, <i>Sharing a Mediator's Powers — Effective Advocacy in Settlement</i>	477
Notes and Questions	481
4. What Ethical Constraints Apply to Lawyers in Mediation?	482
Formal Opinion 06-439, April 12, 2006	483
James Alfini, <i>Settlement Ethics and Lawyering in ADR Proceedings: A Proposal to Revise Rule 4.1</i>	484
Notes and Questions	485
Chapter 11 · Career Directions in Mediation	487
A. Introduction	487
B. Independent Mediation Practices	487
1. Small Claims Mediation and Neighborhood Justice Center Programs	488
2. Family and Dependency Mediation	489
3. "Civil Law Cases"	489
4. Elder Care	491
5. Probate	492
6. Peer Mediation	492
7. Bioethical Disputes	492
8. Environmental Disputes	493
9. Public Policy Disputes	493
10. Special Education Disputes	494
C. Organization-Based Employment Opportunities	494
1. Mediator Positions in Agencies and Organizations	494
2. Working for a Dispute Resolution Agency	495
a. Dispute Resolution Agencies That Provide Direct Service	496
b. Working for a DR Administrative or Provider Organization	496
D. Practitioner Profiles	497
Dana L. Curtis, <i>ADR Personalities and Practice Tips</i>	498
<i>Profiles in ADR: Grande Lum</i>	500
Zena Zumeta, <i>Profiles in ADR: Doug Van Epps</i>	501

Important Resources for Careers in Mediation	502
Notes and Questions	503
E. Mediation's Promise	503
Appendices	505
A. Model Standards of Conduct for Mediators	507
B. Reporter's Notes to Model Standards of Conduct for Mediators	515
C. Florida Rules for Certified and Court-Appointed Mediators	539
D. Uniform Mediation Act	561
References	569
Table of Cases	597
Index	599

Preface and Acknowledgments

A distinguishing feature of twenty-first century jurisprudence and legal practice has been the global embrace of mediation to resolve disputes. Many law schools worldwide include mediation courses as a staple in their curricular offerings. *Mediation in an Evolving World: Theory and Practice* offers a comprehensive text for the study of this increasingly important field.

This book is an outgrowth of *Mediation Theory and Practice*, a law school textbook authored by three of the contributors to this textbook. It has been their good fortune to be joined by three superb colleagues whose perspectives, abilities, and interests prompted the creation of this new work that captures the richness and complexities of this dynamic field. The theory and practice of mediation has been transformed by significant social and historical developments — the technology revolution of the internet and its use in conducting mediation sessions; a global Covid-19 pandemic; and intensified political and social polarization in many communities — and by the writings of a new generation of legal academics, social scientists and communication theorists that deepen our understanding and analysis of such topics as mediator roles, styles and orientations, confidentiality in mediation, mediator ethics, challenges in institutionalizing mediation, and diversity, power and justice. This text examines these and other matters by combining excerpts from seminal writings in the field with these contemporary contributions, offers notes and questions to enrich reflective practice, and discusses professional and career paths.

We are indebted to many who offered kind support and encouragement. The generosity of our home institutions cannot be overstated. We shamelessly took advantage of our colleague, Sharon Press, who appeared to us to have access to important resources, considering her position as Director of the Dispute Resolution Institute at Mitchell Hamline School of Law. Lindsay Hanson, Staff Attorney at the University of Florida Levin College of Law, was exceptionally generous in organizing and implementing a plan for obtaining permissions to publish excerpts from the writings of numerous scholars and commentators. We thank these authors for kindly granting us permission to share their knowledge and wisdom in this book. Our students also deserve our gratitude for giving us the opportunity to see if the book's materials met our pedagogical goals. Some of our students also rendered excellent research assistance. Thanks especially to Josh Fojtik, a 3L at South Texas College of Law Houston and Nina Hylton, a 3L at the University of Florida Levin College of Law. Finally, we thank Krystal Norton at Carolina Academic Press for her steady assistance in guiding us through the publication process.

Online Materials

Additional content for *Mediation in an Evolving World: Theory and Practice* is available on Carolina Academic Press's *Core Knowledge for Lawyers* (CKL) website.

Core Knowledge for Lawyers is an online teaching and testing platform that hosts practice questions and additional content for both instructors and students.

To learn more, please visit:
coreknowledgeforlawyers.com

Instructors may request complimentary access through the “Faculty & Instructors” link.

