

THE FOUNDATIONS OF AMERICAN LAW

THE
FOUNDATIONS
OF
AMERICAN LAW

A Companion to the 1L Year

H. Jefferson Powell

PROFESSOR OF LAW
DUKE UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2024
H. Jefferson Powell
All Rights Reserved

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CATALOGING-IN-PUBLICATION DATA

Names: Powell, Jefferson, 1954- author.

Title: The foundations of American law : a companion to
the 1L year / H. Jefferson Powell.

Description: Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic
Press, LLC, 2024. | Includes bibliographical references
and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023053876 | ISBN 9781531029517
(paperback) | ISBN 9781531029524 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Law--United States--History. | Law--
United States--English influences. | Practice of law--
United States--History. | Common law--United States.

Classification: LCC KF380 .P685 2024 | DDC 349.73--
dc23/eng/20231201

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023053876>

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
(919) 489-7486
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

For Julian (born 1/19/2022) and Avalon (6/5/2013–10/19/2020)
With love and hope

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Introduction	3
ONE ★ The Life of the Law	7
TWO ★ The English Origins of American Law	23
Insularity	25
A Focus on Procedure	28
The Law as Reason	31
THREE ★ The Creation of American Law, or Making It up as We Go Along	39
The Development of American Law, ca. 1800 to ca. 1850	43
Slavery and the Law's Failure	53
The Formalization of American Law, ca. 1870 to ca. 1930	57
FOUR ★ Thinking Like a (Modern) Lawyer	71
1. The Law Is a Human Creation, and Therefore It Is a Historical Phenomenon	75
2. Judges Make Law	77
3. The Importance of External Perspectives	78
4. The Importance of Self-Awareness and Restraint in the Exercise of Power	80
5. Most Questions in Law Involve Differences of Degree	82

6. Most Questions in Law Involve Conflict between Competing and Legitimate Interests	85
Legal Realism	86
FIVE ★ Lawtalk 101: The Language and Arguments of Contemporary American Law	95
Lawtalk Is an Artificial Language; Legal Concepts Are the Tools of a Specific Craft	96
For Most Purposes in the Law, Arguments Must Always Be Translated into Lawtalk	99
Legal Thought Is a Form of Authority-Based Reasoning	100
Problems with Using Authority	103
How to Do Things with Statutes	110
How to Do Things with Cases	115
Talking about the Relationship between Institutions	123
Conclusion: The Law as a Calling	127
Endnotes	131
Additional Reading	141
Index	143

Acknowledgments

This book's immediate origins lie in a series of lectures I gave to first-year law students a number of years ago. More generally, the book is the product of many years trying to teach 1L classes: as is always the case, the students have taught the teacher in countless ways. I am grateful to them all.

Several of my colleagues attended the lectures. Many thanks to each of them, and particularly to Barak Richman for his painstaking attention, and to Curt Bradley and Neil Siegel for independently suggesting that the lectures might be the basis for a book.

Three members of my family patiently listened to each lecture as I practiced it. I benefitted greatly from the comments, criticism, and encouragement of my wife Sarah and my older daughter Sara.

The book is dedicated to two whom I love.

Avalon, our Doberman, was the third member of that family practice audience. She was indeed patient, but she made no comments on the substance: being a wise dog, she no doubt thought the entire affair simply one more example of how strange human beings are. Sarah and I miss her joyful presence every day.

The birth of our grandson Julian has enriched us immeasurably. There are no words to describe the wonder of having such a bright and loving spirit in our lives.

