

Remedies

Remedies

An Integrated Approach

SECOND EDITION

David Charles Hricik

PROFESSOR OF LAW
MERCER UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2025
David Charles Hricik
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 978-1-5310-3165-7
eISBN 978-1-5310-3166-4
LCCN 2024946720

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
(919) 489-7486
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

This is dedicated to the many teachers and professors I have had who helped me to become a better reader and writer, to the lawyers and judges who mentored me to learn to simplify and organize complex material, and to Lisa and my family — who put up with me while I tried to use the skills that I have been given to write this book. I am grateful as well to Mercer University for grants which helped make this possible and to students who “test drove” earlier versions — and who helped me turn this course into something both practical and which can help pass the bar!

Contents

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Online Materials | xxi |
| Acknowledgments | xxiii |
| Note on Case Editing | xxv |
| Chapter 1 · Introduction | 3 |
| 1. An Integrated Approach | 3 |
| 2. The Three Basic Steps | 6 |
| A. What Is the Required Harm and the Measure of General Damages? | 6 |
| B. Did the Plaintiff Also Suffer “Consequential Damages” Recoverable for That Claim? | 8 |
| C. Are Money Damages “Inadequate” and, If So, Is an Equitable Remedy Available in the Court’s Discretion? | 9 |
| 3. A Diagram of the Analytical Framework for Damages Problems | 10 |
| Chapter 2 · The Remedies of Declaratory Judgments and Injunctions | 13 |
| 1. The Remedy of a Declaratory Judgment | 13 |
| <i>ABS Global, Inc. v. Inguran, LLC</i> | 14 |
| Notes and Questions | 17 |
| 2. Three Types of Injunctions | 19 |
| A. The Different Procedural Requirements for Injunctions | 20 |
| B. The Different Procedural Standards for Granting Injunctive Relief | 22 |
| <i>Guidance Endodontics, LLC v. Dentsply Int’l, Inc.</i> | 25 |
| Notes and Questions | 29 |
| C. Who Is Bound by — and the Remedies for Violating — an Injunction | 31 |
| <i>Porter v. Porter</i> | 31 |
| Notes and Questions | 33 |
| Problems | 33 |
| Chapter 3 · Remedies Triggered by Harm to the Plaintiff’s Body, Mind, or Both | 37 |
| 1. Overview | 37 |
| 2. The Required Harms for Negligence or Products Liability | 39 |

| | |
|---|----|
| A. What Is an “Impact” and Why Do Some States Require It for Negligence? | 39 |
| <i>Majors v. Hillebrand</i> | 41 |
| Notes and Questions | 43 |
| B. The Measure of Damages for the Pain and Suffering Caused by an Impact | 45 |
| <i>Hendrix v. Burns</i> | 45 |
| Notes and Questions | 46 |
| C. If an Impact Is not Required, What Instead Is Sufficient? | 49 |
| <i>Mower v. Baird</i> | 50 |
| Notes and Questions | 52 |
| D. Remedies for Mental Anguish Caused by Being a Bystander or Having Been in the Zone of Danger | 53 |
| I. Remedies for Having Been a Bystander to Another’s Injury | 53 |
| <i>Lee v. State Farm Mut. Ins. Co.</i> | 54 |
| <i>McDaniel v. Kidde Residential and Fire Co.</i> | 55 |
| <i>Philibert v. Kluser</i> | 57 |
| Notes and Questions | 58 |
| II. Remedies for Having Been in the Zone of Danger | 60 |
| <i>In re: Oil Spill by the Oil Rig Deepwater Horizon in the Gulf of Mexico, on April 20, 2010</i> | 60 |
| Notes and Questions | 62 |
| 3. Battery | 64 |
| <i>Johnson v. Jones</i> | 64 |
| <i>Myers v. Central Florida Inv. Inc.</i> | 66 |
| Notes and Questions | 68 |
| 4. Assault | 70 |
| <i>Olivero v. Lowe</i> | 70 |
| Notes and Questions | 71 |
| 5. Intentional (or Reckless) Infliction of Emotional Distress or “Outrageous Conduct” | 72 |
| <i>Turley v. ISG Lackawanna, Inc.</i> | 74 |
| Notes and Questions | 76 |
| 6. Harm to a Person That Later Harms Plaintiff’s Relationship with That Injured Person | 79 |
| A. Harm to a Marriage Caused by Defendant Injuring Plaintiff’s Spouse | 80 |
| <i>Steele v. Botticello</i> | 82 |
| Notes and Questions | 84 |
| B. Remedies for Harm to a Relationship Other Than Marriage | 86 |
| Notes and Questions | 88 |
| 7. Wrongful Death and Survival Claims | 89 |
| <i>Hern v. Safeco Ins. Co of Ill.</i> | 90 |
| Notes and Questions | 94 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 8. Whether the Jury Awarded Proper Monetary Remedies | 99 |
| A. Inconsistent Verdicts | 101 |
| <i>Wiltz v. Welch</i> | 101 |
| <i>McBeath v. Bustos</i> | 103 |
| Notes and Questions | 105 |
| B. Improper Verdicts | 106 |
| <i>Agiz v. Heller Indus. Parks, Inc.</i> | 106 |
| Notes and Questions | 108 |
| C. Excessive or Inadequate Verdicts | 108 |
| I. Controlling Excessive Verdicts through New Trials or Remittitur | 110 |
| <i>Averette v. Phillips</i> | 110 |
| Notes and Questions | 113 |
| II. Controlling Inadequate Verdicts through Additur | 115 |
| <i>Nelson v. Erickson</i> | 115 |
| <i>Gunno v. McNair</i> | 118 |
| <i>Ortega v. Belony</i> | 121 |
| Notes and Questions | 122 |
| D. The Scope of Any New Trial | 124 |
| <i>Smedberg v. Detlef's Custodial Serv. Inc.</i> | 124 |
| Notes and Questions | 128 |
| 9. When the Legal Remedy Is Inadequate: Enjoining Future Harm to Mind or Body | 129 |
| <i>Jennings Guest House v. Gibson</i> | 129 |
| <i>Ginsberg v. Blacker</i> | 130 |
| Notes and Questions | 133 |
| Problems | 134 |
| Chapter 4 · Remedies Triggered by Harm to Plaintiff's Reputation, Dignity, or Privacy, and Remedies to Prevent Government Acts That Harm a Plaintiff's First Amendment Rights | 137 |
| 1. The Process to Determine Monetary Remedies for Defamation | 138 |
| A. Whether a False Statement Was Defamatory Per Se or Per Quod | 138 |
| B. Whether Negligence or Actual Malice Is the Required Degree of Fault | 139 |
| C. Did the Defendant "Publish" a False Defamatory Statement? | 142 |
| D. Was the Publication Protected by an "Absolute" or Conditional Privilege? | 142 |
| 2. Monetary Remedies for Defamation | 143 |
| A. The Demanding Requirements of Defamation Per Se | 143 |
| <i>Hill v. Stubson</i> | 143 |
| Notes and Questions | 148 |
| B. The Measure of Damage for Harm to Reputation | 149 |
| <i>State Farm Fire & Cas. Co. v. Radcliff</i> | 150 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>Longbehn v. Schoenrock</i> | 153 |
| Notes and Questions | 155 |
| C. Special Damages Are Required for Defamation Per Quod and May Be Consequential Damages for Defamation Per Se | 156 |
| <i>Choctaw Town Square, LLC v. Kokh Licensee, LLC</i> | 157 |
| Notes and Questions | 158 |
| 3. Monetary Remedies Triggered by Harm to a Business's Reputation | 160 |
| 4. Monetary Remedies for Reputational Harm Caused by Breach of Contract | 161 |
| <i>Klaymen v. Judicial Watch, Inc.</i> | 161 |
| <i>Bakst v. Community Mem. Health Sys., Inc.</i> | 164 |
| Notes and Questions | 166 |
| 5. Monetary Remedies Triggered by Harm to Privacy or Similar Interests | 167 |
| A. The Four Distinct Harms | 167 |
| <i>Graboff v. Colleran Firm</i> | 168 |
| Notes and Questions | 172 |
| B. The Measure of Damages for Harm to Privacy Interests | 172 |
| <i>Roth v. Farner-Bocken Co.</i> | 173 |
| <i>Patel v. Hussain</i> | 175 |
| Notes and Questions | 177 |
| 6. When Monetary Remedies Are Inadequate | 178 |
| <i>Kinney v. Barnes</i> | 178 |
| Notes and Questions | 182 |
| 7. Enjoining Government Acts That Inhibit Free Speech | 183 |
| A. Identifying the Type of Forum and Content-Based Regulation | 184 |
| <i>Marilyn Manson, Inc. v. New Jersey Sports & Expo. Auth.</i> | 184 |
| Notes and Questions | 189 |
| B. Time, Place, and Manner Restrictions | 191 |
| <i>Central Park Sightseeing LLC v. New Yorkers for Clean, Livable & Safe Streets, Inc.</i> | 195 |
| Notes and Questions | 199 |
| Problems | 199 |
| Chapter 5 · Remedies Triggered by Harm to Freedom of Movement and Related Interests | 203 |
| 1. Monetary Remedies for False Imprisonment | 204 |
| <i>Dillard Dept. Stores, Inc. v. Silva</i> | 205 |
| Notes and Questions | 207 |
| 2. Monetary Remedies for False Arrest | 209 |
| <i>Wright v. Musanti</i> | 209 |
| Notes and Questions | 212 |
| 3. Monetary Remedies for Causing Wrongful Criminal or Civil Proceedings | 213 |
| <i>Bhatia v. Debek</i> | 215 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>Adams v. Aidoo</i> | 219 |
| Notes and Questions | 223 |
| 4. When Monetary Remedies Are Inadequate | 225 |
| A. Enjoining a Pending Criminal Prosecution | 225 |
| <i>Boyajian v. City of Atlanta</i> | 226 |
| Notes and Questions | 226 |
| B. Enjoining Threatened Criminal Prosecution | 227 |
| C. Enjoining Threatened Civil Litigation | 228 |
| <i>Camastro v. W. Va. Alcohol Bev. Control Comm'n</i> | 228 |
| Notes and Questions | 231 |
| Problems | 231 |
| Chapter 6 · Remedies Triggered by Harm to, or Interference with Rights in, Personal Property | 235 |
| 1. Monetary Remedies for Physical Harm to Personal Property | 236 |
| A. The General Measures of Damage | 236 |
| <i>Sykes v. Sin</i> | 238 |
| Notes and Questions | 240 |
| B. A Remedy for Sentimental Interests in Property | 243 |
| <i>Price v. High Pointe Oil Co.</i> | 244 |
| <i>Barking Hound Village, LLC v. Monyak</i> | 245 |
| Notes and Questions | 247 |
| C. Damages for Loss of Use | 251 |
| <i>J&D Towing, LLC v. Am. Alt. Ins. Corp.</i> | 251 |
| <i>Level 3 Commc'ns, LLC v. TNT Constr., Inc.</i> | 254 |
| Notes and Questions | 257 |
| 2. Monetary Remedies for the Harm of Interfering with Rights in Personalty | 260 |
| A. Monetary Damages for Interference with Rights in Tangible Personalty | 262 |
| <i>Mahana v. Onyx Acceptance Corp.</i> | 262 |
| <i>Lysenko v. Sawaya</i> | 263 |
| <i>U.S. Bank Tr. Nat'l. Ass'n. v. Venice Md LLC</i> | 265 |
| Notes and Questions | 266 |
| B. Damages for Interference with Rights in Intangible Personalty | 266 |
| <i>Porters Bldg. Centers, Inc. v. Sprint Lumber</i> | 266 |
| Notes and Questions | 268 |
| 3. When Monetary Remedies Are Inadequate | 271 |
| <i>Roy Bayer Tr. v. Red Husky, LLC</i> | 271 |
| <i>Havens Steel Co. v. Commerce Bank, N.A.</i> | 273 |
| Notes and Questions | 278 |
| Problems | 278 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Chapter 7 · Remedies Triggered by Harm to, or Interference with Rights in, Real Property | 281 |
| 1. Monetary Remedies for Entering or Interfering with Interests in Real Property | 282 |
| A. The Elements of Trespass — Including the Required Harm | 282 |
| <i>Democracy Partners, LLC v. Project Veritas Action Fund</i> | 283 |
| Notes and Questions | 285 |
| B. The Elements of Nuisance — Including the Required Harm | 286 |
| <i>Pestey v. Cushman</i> | 287 |
| Notes and Questions | 291 |
| C. Nominal Damages for Trespass | 292 |
| <i>Brown v. Smith</i> | 292 |
| Notes and Questions | 293 |
| 2. Monetary Remedies for Physical Harm to Real Property | 294 |
| A. Reasonable Restoration Costs or Diminution in Value | 296 |
| <i>Martin v. Bank of America</i> | 296 |
| Notes and Questions | 300 |
| <i>Muncie v. Wiesemann</i> | 302 |
| Notes and Questions | 303 |
| B. Damages for Loss of Use | 309 |
| <i>Newstone Dev., LLC v. E. Pac., LLC</i> | 309 |
| 3. Damages for Annoyance and Inconvenience | 311 |
| <i>Babb v. Lee County Landfill SC, LLC</i> | 312 |
| <i>H&L Farms LLC v. Silicon Ranch Corp.</i> | 313 |
| Notes and Questions | 316 |
| 4. When the Remedy at Law Is Inadequate | 318 |
| A. Removing Encroachments | 321 |
| <i>Rose Nulman Park Found. v. Four Twenty Corp.</i> | 321 |
| Notes and Questions | 324 |
| B. Preventing Future Harm to Health or Safety | 325 |
| <i>Bowling v. Nicholson</i> | 326 |
| <i>Walker v. Kingfisher Wind, LLC</i> | 329 |
| Notes and Questions | 330 |
| 5. Other Remedies for Harm to Interests in Real Property | 334 |
| A. Ejectment of an Unlawful Occupier of Plaintiff’s Real Property | 334 |
| <i>Davis v. Westphal</i> | 334 |
| Notes and Questions | 338 |
| B. Wrongful Ejectment or Forcible Detainer, and Constructive Eviction | 340 |
| <i>Marina Food Associates, Inc. v. Marina Restaurant, Inc.</i> | 340 |
| Notes and Questions | 341 |
| C. Quieting Title | 343 |
| <i>Kobza v. Tripp</i> | 344 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Notes and Questions | 345 |
| Problems | 346 |
| Chapter 8 · Remedies Triggered by Economic Loss | 351 |
| 1. Breach of Contract | 351 |
| A. The Three Types of Common Law Contract Damages and <i>Hadley's</i> Limitation on Two of Them | 351 |
| <i>Freeman v. Duhamel</i> | 357 |
| <i>Maine Rubber Int'l v. Environmental Mgmt. Group, Inc.</i> | 358 |
| Notes and Questions | 361 |
| <i>MVP Health Plan, Inc. v. OptumInsight, Inc.</i> | 363 |
| <i>Bonanza Rest. Co. v. Wink</i> | 364 |
| Notes and Questions | 365 |
| B. The UCC Measures of Damage | 367 |
| <i>Rexnord Indus., LLC v. Bigge Power Constructors, LLC</i> | 371 |
| Notes and Questions | 374 |
| C. Agreeing on the Amount of Damages: Liquidated Damages Clauses | 376 |
| I. Identifying Liquidated Damages Clauses | 376 |
| <i>VICI Racing, LLC v. T-Mobile USA, Inc.</i> | 376 |
| II. The Impact of Liquidated Damages Clauses on Monetary Remedies | 378 |
| <i>Energy Serv., Inc. v. Union Pacific Railroad Co.</i> | 378 |
| Notes and Questions | 381 |
| III. Invalidating Liquidated Damages Clauses as Penalties | 381 |
| <i>Barrie School v. Patch</i> | 381 |
| Notes and Questions | 386 |
| D. Other Contractual Limitations on Remedies and Invalidating Them | 387 |
| <i>HearBest, Inc. v. Adecco USA</i> | 387 |
| <i>Tokyo Ohka Kogyo Am., Inc. v. Huntsman Propylene Oxide LLC</i> | 390 |
| Notes and Questions | 401 |
| E. Who Can Recover Damages for Breach of Contract? | 404 |
| <i>United Parcel Serv. Co. v. DNJ Logistic Group, Inc.</i> | 405 |
| <i>Harris Moran Seed Co. v. Phillips</i> | 408 |
| Notes and Questions | 410 |
| F. When Monetary Remedies Are Inadequate | 411 |
| I. General Requirements for Specific Performance | 411 |
| a. A Reasonably Certain Contract | 411 |
| <i>Keatley v. Bruner</i> | 413 |
| <i>McKinney/Pearl Rest. Partners, L.P. v. Metro. Life Ins. Co.</i> | 415 |
| Notes and Questions | 416 |
| <i>Motion Control Sys., Inc. v. East</i> | 419 |
| <i>Deutsche Post Glob. Mail, Ltd v. Conrad</i> | 421 |
| Notes and Questions | 423 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| b. Plaintiff Must Have Performed, or Have Been Ready, Willing, and Able to Perform | 426 |
| c. Plaintiff's Remedy at Law Must Be Inadequate, and for Interlocutory Relief, Denial Must Cause Irreparable Harm | 426 |
| <i>EMF Gen. Contracting Corp. v. Bisbee</i> | 428 |
| Notes and Questions | 430 |
| <i>Mirion Techs. (Canberra), Inc. v. Sunpower, Inc.</i> | 432 |
| <i>Reed Found., Inc. v. Franklin D. Roosevelt Four Freedoms Park, LLC</i> | 435 |
| Notes and Questions | 436 |
| <i>Pepsi-Cola Bottling Co. of Pittsburg, Inc. v. Bottling Group, LLC</i> | 439 |
| Notes and Questions | 440 |
| d. Mutuality of Remedy, Unless Excepted | 441 |
| II. Contracting Around the Requirements for Specific Performance | 441 |
| III. Defenses to Specific Performance | 443 |
| a. Unreasonable Delay and Laches | 443 |
| <i>EMF Gen. Contracting Corp. v. Bisbee</i> | 443 |
| b. Election of Monetary Damages in Lieu of Specific Performance | 445 |
| <i>Ross Univ. Sch. of Med., Ltd. v. Brooklyn-Queens Health Care, Inc.</i> | 445 |
| c. Impossibility and Hardship | 446 |
| <i>Fazzio v. Mason</i> | 446 |
| Notes and Questions | 448 |
| d. The Statute of Frauds | 448 |
| <i>Ficke v. Wolken</i> | 448 |
| <i>LaRue v. Kalex Const. and Dev., Inc.</i> | 451 |
| Notes and Questions | 452 |
| e. Other Public Policies Barring Specific Enforcement | 453 |
| <i>Johnson v. Nelson</i> | 453 |
| Notes and Questions | 455 |
| IV. Reformation or Rescission | 455 |
| <i>Faivre v. DEX Corp. N.E.</i> | 456 |
| <i>SCI Minn. Fun. Serv., Inc. v. Washburn-McReavy Fun. Corp.</i> | 460 |
| 2. Tort Claims Triggered by Economic Loss | 465 |
| A. Monetary Remedies for Fraud and Fraudulent Inducement of Contract | 466 |
| I. Fraud | 466 |
| <i>Brown v. Bennett</i> | 467 |
| Notes and Questions | 468 |
| II. Fraudulent Inducement | 468 |
| <i>Caruthers v. Underhill</i> | 469 |
| Notes and Questions | 471 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| B. Tortious Interference with a Contract or a Business Relationship | 472 |
| I. Tortious Interference with Contract | 472 |
| <i>Harris Group, Inc. v. Robinson</i> | 473 |
| Notes and Questions | 478 |
| II. Tortious Interference with a Prospective Business Relationship | 479 |
| <i>Havilah Real Property Servs. LLC. v. VLK, LLC</i> | 481 |
| Notes and Questions | 484 |
| III. The Measure of Tortious Interference Damages: | |
| Contract Damages for a Tort? | 485 |
| <i>Fraidin v. Weitzman</i> | 486 |
| Notes and Questions | 489 |
| C. Negligent Misrepresentation | 493 |
| I. The Elements — Including the Required Harm | 493 |
| <i>Hernandez v. Coldwell Banker Sea Coast Realty</i> | 494 |
| Notes and Questions | 496 |
| II. The Measures of Damage | 498 |
| <i>Burke v. Harman</i> | 498 |
| Notes and Questions | 500 |
| 3. Key Differences between Contract and Tort Damages | 501 |
| <i>Kearl v. Rausser</i> | 502 |
| Notes and Questions | 505 |
| A. The Economic Loss Doctrine's Impact on Tort Remedies | 507 |
| <i>Fabbis Enterp., Inc. v. Sherwin-Williams Co.</i> | 508 |
| <i>In re Takata Airbag Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> | 510 |
| Notes and Questions | 513 |
| Problems | 515 |
| Chapter 9 · Remedies Triggered by Unjust Enrichment of the Defendant | 523 |
| 1. Promissory Estoppel | 523 |
| <i>Toscano v. Greene Music</i> | 524 |
| <i>Dynalectric Co. of Nev. Inc. v. Clark & Sullivan Constructors, Inc.</i> | 527 |
| Notes and Questions | 528 |
| 2. Restitutionary Remedies and Claims | 530 |
| A. <i>Quantum Meruit</i> or Unjust Enrichment? | 532 |
| <i>Young v. Young</i> | 532 |
| <i>Mogavero v. Silverstein</i> | 536 |
| Notes and Questions | 537 |
| B. Restitution or Disgorgement? | 540 |
| <i>Cross v. Berg Lumber Co.</i> | 541 |
| Notes and Questions | 545 |
| C. Constructive Trust or Equitable Lien? | 547 |
| <i>Lawry v. Palm</i> | 548 |
| <i>In re Courson</i> | 550 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| <i>Estate of Cowling v. Estate of Cowling</i> | 553 |
| Notes and Questions | 555 |
| 3. Resulting Trust | 557 |
| <i>Patterson v. Patterson</i> | 557 |
| 4. Equitable Indemnity or Equitable Subrogation | 559 |
| <i>Frymire Engr. Co. v. Jomar Int'l., Ltd.</i> | 559 |
| Notes and Questions | 562 |
| Problems | 565 |
| Chapter 10 · Vicarious and Derivative Liability | 569 |
| 1. Vicarious Liability for the Harm Caused by Another Person | 570 |
| A. An Employer Is Generally Vicariously Liable for Harm Caused by an Employee, but Not by an Independent Contractor | 570 |
| <i>Nathans v. Offerman</i> | 572 |
| <i>Hughes v. Metro. Gov't of Nashville and Davidson Cnty.</i> | 574 |
| <i>Bruntjen v. Bethalto Pizza, LLC</i> | 575 |
| Notes and Questions | 577 |
| B. Vicarious Liability Under the Family Purpose Doctrine | 579 |
| <i>Griffith v. Kuester</i> | 579 |
| Notes and Questions | 580 |
| 2. Claims That Partially Shift Damages | 581 |
| A. Negligent Hiring, Negligent Retention, and Negligent Supervision | 581 |
| <i>G4S Secure Sols. USA, Inc. v. Golzar</i> | 581 |
| Notes and Questions | 584 |
| B. Negligent Entrustment | 584 |
| <i>Snell v. Norwalk Yellow Cab, Inc.</i> | 584 |
| <i>Ali v. Fisher</i> | 586 |
| Notes and Questions | 588 |
| C. Negligence Claims Against Parents for Harm Caused by Their Child | 590 |
| <i>K.H. v. J.R.</i> | 590 |
| Notes and Questions | 592 |
| 3. Conspiracy and Aiding and Abetting | 592 |
| <i>In re Dicamba Herbicides Litig.</i> | 594 |
| Notes and Questions | 596 |
| Problems | 599 |
| Chapter 11 · Punitive Damages | 601 |
| 1. Whether a Punitive Damage Remedy Is Permitted | 601 |
| <i>Fenwick v. Oberman</i> | 603 |
| Notes and Questions | 605 |
| 2. Limitations on the Amount of Punitive Damages | 607 |
| A. Constitutional and Statutory Limitations | 607 |
| <i>Myers v. Central Florida Inv., Inc.</i> | 607 |
| Notes and Questions | 614 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| B. When a Punitive Damage Award Is Too High or Too Low: | |
| Remittitur and Additur | 617 |
| <i>Hollis v. Stonington Dev. LLC</i> | 617 |
| Notes and Questions | 621 |
| Problems | 622 |
| Chapter 12 · The Impact of <i>Res Judicata</i> and the Rule Against Claim | |
| Splitting on Remedies | 625 |
| 1. Once a Claim Accrues, a Plaintiff Must Assert All Claims and | |
| Seek Damages for All Past and Future Damages Arising Out | |
| of the Same Facts | 627 |
| <i>Hindmarsh v. Mock</i> | 628 |
| Notes and Questions | 630 |
| 2. Common Forms of Past and Future Damages | 638 |
| A. Lost Earnings, Diminished Earning Capacity, | |
| and Medical Expenses | 638 |
| <i>Albert v. Hampton</i> | 640 |
| <i>Pilgrim's Pride Corp. v. Cernat</i> | 645 |
| <i>Lee v. Smith</i> | 646 |
| <i>Volusia County v. Joynt</i> | 648 |
| Notes and Questions | 650 |
| B. Lost Profits | 652 |
| I. Different Approaches to Lost Profits | 653 |
| <i>Juice Ent., LLC v. Live Nation Ent., Inc.</i> | 653 |
| <i>BMK Corp. v. Clayton Corp.</i> | 654 |
| Notes and Questions | 656 |
| II. Causation and Amount of Lost Profits | 660 |
| <i>RSB Lab. Serv., Inc. v. BSI Corp.</i> | 662 |
| Notes and Questions | 665 |
| C. Mitigation Costs as Consequential Damages | 668 |
| <i>DeRosier v. Util. Sys. of Am., Inc.</i> | 669 |
| Notes and Questions | 671 |
| Problems | 673 |
| Chapter 13 · The One Recovery Rule and Election of Remedies | 675 |
| 1. The One Recovery Rule | 678 |
| <i>Arcangel v. Huntington A. Hotels, LLC</i> | 679 |
| <i>K.S. v. Detroit Public Schools</i> | 680 |
| Notes and Questions | 682 |
| 2. Election of Remedies | 682 |
| <i>Helf v. Chevron U.S.A., Inc.</i> | 684 |
| <i>AXE Properties & Management, LLC v. Merriman</i> | 688 |
| Notes and Questions | 696 |
| Problems | 697 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Chapter 14 · Pre- and Post-Judgment Interest | 699 |
| 1. Prejudgment Interest on Certain Past Damages | 699 |
| <i>Precision Heavy Haul, Inc. v. Trail King Indus., Inc.</i> | 701 |
| <i>Exmark Mfg. Co. v. Briggs & Stratton Corp.</i> | 704 |
| Notes and Questions | 704 |
| 2. Future Damages May Be Reduced to Present Value | 706 |
| A. Reducing Future Economic Losses to Present Value | 707 |
| <i>Wright v. Maersk Line, Ltd.</i> | 708 |
| Notes and Questions | 709 |
| B. Future Pain and Suffering and Mental Anguish May Be Reduced to Present Value | 710 |
| <i>CSX Transp., Inc. v. Begley</i> | 712 |
| Notes and Questions | 713 |
| 3. Post-Judgment Interest on the Judgment | 714 |
| <i>Hadley v. Maxwell</i> | 714 |
| Notes and Questions | 716 |
| Problems | 716 |
| Chapter 15 · Defenses | 719 |
| 1. Unclean Hands | 719 |
| <i>Hicks v. Gilbert</i> | 719 |
| Notes and Questions | 721 |
| 2. Buyer in the Ordinary Course | 722 |
| <i>Hockensmith v. Fifth Third Bank</i> | 723 |
| 3. Mitigation: Post-Injury Reasonable Care by Plaintiff | 724 |
| A. Reducing Damages to the Extent Plaintiff Failed to Mitigate | 724 |
| <i>Monahan v. Obici Med. Mgt. Serv., Inc.</i> | 725 |
| Notes and Questions | 727 |
| 4. The Collateral Source Rule | 727 |
| A. Applicability to Torts at Common Law | 727 |
| <i>ML Healthcare Serv., LLC v. Publix Super Markets, Inc.</i> | 729 |
| <i>Russell v. Haji-Ali</i> | 731 |
| Notes and Questions | 733 |
| B. Inapplicability to Contract Damages | 734 |
| <i>Hormel Foods Corp. v. Crystal Distrib. Serv., Inc.</i> | 734 |
| Notes and Questions | 735 |
| 5. Comparative Fault, Preexisting Conditions, and Apportionment | 736 |
| A. Comparative Fault and Apportioning Tort Damages | 737 |
| I. Comparative Fault and Preexisting Conditions | 737 |
| <i>Moore v. Fargo Pub. Sch. Dist. No. 1</i> | 737 |
| <i>McLaughlin v. BNSF Ry. Co.</i> | 739 |
| Notes and Questions | 744 |
| II. Apportionment to Non-parties and for Intentional Torts | 746 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| <i>Erdelyi v. Lott</i> | 746 |
| Notes and Questions | 749 |
| B. Comparative Fault or Apportionment of Contract Damages | 751 |
| <i>Trishan Air, Inc. v. Dassault Falcon Jet Corp.</i> | 752 |
| Notes and Questions | 753 |
| C. Conceptual Problems Created by Apportionment | 755 |
| <i>J.S. Searcy v. United States</i> | 755 |
| <i>Williams v. McCollister</i> | 757 |
| 6. The Workers' Compensation Exclusive Remedy Bar | 760 |
| <i>Mead v. W. Slate, Inc.</i> | 761 |
| Notes and Questions | 763 |
| 7. After-Acquired Evidence | 766 |
| <i>Ingwersen v. Planet Group, Inc.</i> | 766 |
| Problems | 768 |
| Chapter 16 · The Boundaries and Frontiers of Remedies | 769 |
| <i>Plowman v. Ft. Madison Community Hosp.</i> | 769 |
| <i>Tomlinson v. Metro. Pediatrics, LLC</i> | 779 |
| Notes and Questions | 783 |
| Problems | 784 |
| Table of Principal Cases | 785 |
| Index | 789 |

Online Materials

Additional content for *Remedies: An Integrated Approach* is available on Carolina Academic Press's Core Knowledge for Lawyers (CKL) website.

Core Knowledge for Lawyers is an online teaching and testing platform that hosts practice questions and additional content for both instructors and students.

To learn more, please visit:

coreknowledgeforlawyers.com

Instructors may request complimentary access through the "Faculty & Instructors" link.

Acknowledgments

Restatement (Second) of Agency copyright © 1958 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Restatement (Third) of Torts: Apportionment of Liability copyright © 2000 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Restatement (First) of Contracts copyright © 1932 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Restatement (Second) of Contracts copyright © 1981 by the American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Restatement of Restitution copyright © 1936 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

See Restatement of Restitution: Quasi Contracts and Constructive Trusts copyright © 1937 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

The Restatement (Third) of the Law of Restitution and Unjust Enrichment copyright © 2011 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Restatement (First) of Torts copyright © 1939 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Restatement (Second) of Torts copyright © 1979 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Restatement (Third) Torts copyright © 1998 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Restatement (Third) of Torts: Liability for Physical Harm copyright © 2005 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Uniform Commercial Code (excerpts from Article 2) copyright © 2011 by The American Law Institute and the National Conference on Uniform State Laws. Reproduced with the permission of the Permanent Editorial Board for the UCC. All rights reserved.

Note on Case Editing

Because this book is designed for upper-level students, all of the materials used have been edited for ease of reading and understanding, and often without indicating an omission or minor alteration. For example, many footnotes, citations, and quotation marks have been deleted. In addition, most cases begin with a summary of the facts, contained within brackets. All of this was done to shorten the text, to focus on remedies, and to increase readability. In no instance was the meaning of a case altered.

Table of Principal Cases

| | |
|--|--|
| ABS Global, Inc. v. Inguran, LLC, 14 | Choctaw Town Square, LLC v. Kokh Licensee, LLC, 157 |
| Adams v. Aidoo, 219 | Cross v. Berg Lumber Co., 541 |
| Agiz v. Heller Indus. Parks, Inc., 106 | CSX Transp., Inc. v. Begley, 712 |
| Albert v. Hampton, 640 | Davis v. Westphal, 282, 292, 334 |
| Ali v. Fisher, 586 | Democracy Partners, LLC v. Project Veritas Action Fund, 283 |
| Arcangel v. Huntington A. Hotels, LLC, 679 | DeRosier v. Util. Sys. of Am., Inc., 366, 669 |
| Averette v. Phillips, 110 | Deutsche Post Glob. Mail, Ltd v. Conrad, 421 |
| AXE Properties & Management, LLC v. Merriman, 688 | Dillard Dept. Stores, Inc. v. Silva, 205 |
| Babb v. Lee County Landfill SC, LLC, 311, 312 | Dynalectric Co. of Nev. Inc. v. Clark & Sullivan Constructors, Inc., 527 |
| Bakst v. Community Mem. Health Sys., Inc., 164 | EMF Gen. Contracting Corp. v. Bisbee, 428, 443 |
| Barking Hound Village, LLC v. Monyak, 245 | Entergy Serv., Inc. v. Union Pacific Railroad Co., 378 |
| Barrie School v. Patch, 381 | Erdelyi v. Lott, 746 |
| Bhatia v. Debek, 215 | Estate of Cowling v. Estate of Cowling, 553 |
| BMK Corp. v. Clayton Corp., 654 | Exmark Mfg. Co. v. Briggs & Stratton Corp., 704 |
| Bonanza Rest. Co. v. Wink, 364 | Fabbis Enterp., Inc. v. Sherwin-Williams Co., 508 |
| Bowling v. Nicholson, 326 | Faivre v. DEX Corp. N.E., 456 |
| Boyajian v. City of Atlanta, 226 | Fazzio v. Mason, 446 |
| Brown v. Bennett, 467 | Fenwick v. Oberman, 603 |
| Brown v. Smith, 292 | Ficke v. Wolken, 448 |
| Bruntjen v. Bethalto Pizza, LLC, 575 | Fraidin v. Weitzman, 486 |
| Burke v. Harman, 498 | Freeman v. Duhamel, 357 |
| Camastro v. W. Va. Alcohol Bev. Control Commn., 228 | |
| Caruthers v. Underhill, 469 | |
| Central Park Sightseeing LLC v. New Yorkers For Clean, 195 | |

- Frymire Engr. Co. v. Jomar Int'l., Ltd., 559
G4S Secure Sols. USA, Inc. v. Golzar, 581
Ginsberg v. Blacker, 130
Graboff v. Collieran Firm, 168
Griffith v. Kuester, 579
Guidance Endodontics, LLC v. Dentsply Int'l, Inc., 25
Gunno v. McNair, 118
H&L Farms LLC v. Silicon Ranch Corp., 313
Hadley v. Maxwell, 714
Harris Group, Inc. v. Robinson, 473, 699, 700
Harris Moran Seed Co. v. Phillips, 408, 411
Havens Steel Co. v. Commerce Bank, N.A., 273
Havilah Real Property Servs. LLC. v. VLK, LLC, 481
Hearbest, Inc. v. Adecco USA, 387
Helf v. Chevron U.S.A., Inc., 684, 765
Hendrix v. Burns, 45
Hern v. Safeco Ins. Co of Ill., 90
Hernandez v. Coldwell Banker Sea Coast Realty, 494
Hicks v. Gilbert, 719
Hill v. Stubson, 143
Hindmarsh v. Mock, 628
Hockensmith v. Fifth Third Bank, 723
Hollis v. Stonington Dev. LLC, 617
Hormel Foods Corp. v. Crystal Distrib. Serv., Inc., 734
Hughes v. Metro. Gov't of Nashville and Davidson Cnty., 574
Ingwersen v. Planet Group, Inc., 766
In re Courson, 550
In re Dicamba Herbicides Litig., 594
In re: Oil Spill by the Oil Rig Deepwater Horizon in the Gulf of Mexico, 60
In re Takata Airbag Prods. Liab. Litig., 510
J&D Towing, LLC v. Am. Alt. Ins. Corp., 251
J.S. Searcy v. United States, 755
Jennings Guest House v. Gibson, 129
Johnson v. Jones, 64
Johnson v. Nelson, 453
Juice Ent., LLC v. Live Nation Ent., Inc., 653
K.H. v. J.R., 590
K.S. v. Detroit Public Schools, 678
Kearl v. Rausser, 502
Keatley v. Bruner, 413
Kinney v. Barnes, 178
Klaymen v. Judicial Watch, Inc., 161
Kobza v. Tripp, 344
LaRue v. Kalex Const. and Dev., Inc., 451
Lawry v. Palm, 548
Lee v. Smith, 646
Lee v. State Farm Mut. Ins. Co., 40, 54
Level 3 Commun., LLC v. TNT Constr., Inc., 254
Longbehn v. Schoenrock, 153
Lysenko v. Sawaya, 263
Mahana v. Onyx Acceptance Corp., 262
Maine Rubber Int'l v. Environmental Mgmt. Group, Inc., 358
Majors v. Hillebrand, 41
Marilyn Manson, Inc. v. New Jersey Sports & Expo. Auth., 184
Marina Food Associates, Inc. v. Marina Restaurant, Inc., 340
Martin v. Bank of America, 296
McBeath v. Bustos, 103
McDaniel v. Kidde Residential and Fire Co., 55
McKinney/Pearl Rest. Partners, L.P. v. Metro. Life Ins. Co., 415
McLaughlin v. BNSF Ry. Co., 739
Mead v. W. Slate, Inc., 761
Mirion Techs. (Canberra), Inc. v. Sunpower, Inc., 432
ML Healthcare Serv., LLC v. Publix Super Markets, Inc., 729
Mogavero v. Silverstein, 536
Monahan v. Obici Med. Mgt. Serv., Inc., 725

- Moore v. Fargo Pub. Sch. Dist. No. 1, 737
Motion Control Sys., Inc. v. East, 29
Mower v. Baird, 50
Muncie v. Wiesemann, 302
MVP Health Plan, Inc. v. OptumInsight, Inc., 363
Myers v. Central Florida Inv. Inc., 66, 607
Nathans v. Offerman, 572
Nelson v. Erickson, 115
Newstone Dev., LLC v. E. Pac., LLC, 309
Olivero v. Lowe, 70
Ortega v. Belony, 121
Patel v. Hussain, 78, 175
Patterson v. Patterson, 557
Pepsi-Cola Bottling Co. of Pittsburg, Inc. v. Bottling Group, LLC, 439
Pestey v. Cushman, 287
Philibert v. Kluser, 57
Pilgrim's Pride Corp. v. Cernat, 645
Plowman v. Ft. Madison Community Hosp., 769
Porters Bldg. Centers, Inc. v. Sprint Lumber, 266
Porter v. Porter, 31
Precision Heavy Haul, Inc. v. Trail King Indus., Inc., 701
Price v. High Pointe Oil Co., 244
Reed Found., Inc. v. Franklin D. Roosevelt Four Freedoms Park, LLC, 435
Rexnord Indus., LLC v. Bigge Power Constructors, LLC, 371
Rose Nulman Park Found. v. Four Twenty Corp., 321
Ross U. Sch. of Med., Ltd. v. Brooklyn-Queens Health Care, Inc., 445
Roth v. Farner-Bocken Co., 173
Roy Bayer Tr. v. Red Husky, LLC, 271
RSB Lab. Serv., Inc. v. BSI Corp., 662
Russell v. Haji-Ali, 731
SCI Minn. Fun. Serv., Inc. v. Washburn-McReavy Fun. Corp., 460
Smedberg v. Detlef's Custodial Serv. Inc., 124
Snell v. Norwalk Yellow Cab, Inc., 584
State Farm Mut. Cas. Co. v. Radcliff, 150
Steele v. Botticello, 82
Sykes v. Sin, 238
Tokyo Ohka Kogyo Am., Inc. v. Huntsman Propylene Oxide LLC, 390
Tomlinson v. Metro. Pediatrics, LLC, 779
Toscano v. Greene Music, 524
Trishan Air, Inc. v. Dassault Falcon Jet Corp., 752
Turley v. ISG Lackawanna, Inc., 74
U.S. Bank Tr. Nat'l. Ass'n. v. Venice Md LLC, 261
United Parcel Serv. Co. v. DNJ Logistic Group, Inc., 405, 497
VICI Racing, LLC v. T-Mobile USA, Inc., 376, 724
Volusia County v. Joynt, 648
Walker v. Kingfisher Wind, LLC, 329
Williams v. McCollister, 589, 757
Wiltz v. Welch, 101
Wright v. Maersk Line, Ltd., 708
Wright v. Musanti, 209
Young v. Young, 529, 532, 580, 727, 750

