

MASTERING PRODUCTS LIABILITY

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS MASTERING SERIES

RUSSELL WEAVER, SERIES EDITOR

For other titles, please go to caplaw.com.

Mastering Administrative Law, Second Edition

Linda D. Jellum

Mastering Adoption Law and Policy

Cynthia Hawkins DeBose

Mastering Alternative Dispute Resolution

Kelly M. Feeley, James A. Sheehan

Mastering Appellate Advocacy and Process, Second Edition

Donna C. Looper, George W. Kuney

Mastering Art Law, Second Edition

Herbert Lazerow

Mastering Bankruptcy

George W. Kuney

Mastering Civil Procedure, Fourth Edition

David Charles Hricik

Mastering Constitutional Law, Second Edition

John C. Knechtle, Christopher J. Roederer

Mastering Contract Law

Irma S. Russell, Barbara K. Bucholtz

Mastering Corporate Tax, Second Edition

Gail Levin Richmond, Reginald Mombrun, Felicia Branch

Mastering Corporations and Other Business Entities, Second Edition

Lee Harris

Mastering Criminal Law, Third Edition

Ellen S. Podgor, Cynthia E. Jones, Peter J. Henning,

Neil P. Cohen, Sanjay K. Chhablani

Mastering Criminal Procedure, Volume 1:

The Investigative Stage, Third Edition

Peter J. Henning, Cynthia E. Jones, Ellen S. Podgor,

Karen McDonald Henning, Sanjay K. Chhablani

Mastering Criminal Procedure, Volume 2:

The Adjudicatory Stage, Third Edition

Peter J. Henning, Cynthia E. Jones, Ellen S. Podgor,

Karen McDonald Henning, Sanjay K. Chhablani

Mastering Elder Law, Third Edition

Ralph C. Brashier

Mastering Employment Discrimination Law, Third Edition

Jeffrey M. Hirsch, Joseph A. Seiner, Sandra F. Sperino

Mastering Environmental Law

Joel A. Mintz, Tracy D. Hester

Mastering Evidence

Ronald W. Eades

Mastering Family Law

Janet Leach Richards

Mastering First Amendment Law

John C. Knechtle

Mastering Income Tax, Second Edition

Gail Levin Richmond, Christopher M. Pietruszkiewicz

Mastering Intellectual Property

George W. Kuney, Donna C. Looper

Mastering International Sales Law

Herbert Lazerow

Mastering Interviewing and Counseling

Kelly M. Feeley, Rebecca C. Morgan

Mastering Labor Law

Paul M. Secunda, Anne Marie Lofaso, Joseph E. Slater, Jeffrey M. Hirsch

Mastering Legal Analysis and Communication

David T. Ritchie

Mastering Legal Analysis and Drafting, Second Edition

George W. Kuney, Donna C. Looper

Mastering Legislation, Regulation, and Statutory Interpretation, Third Edition

Linda D. Jellum

Mastering Native American Law, Third Edition

Angelique Wambdi EagleWoman, Stacy L. Leeds

**Mastering Negotiable Instruments (UCC Articles 3 and 4)
and Other Payment Systems, Second Edition**

Michael D. Floyd

Mastering Negotiation

Michael R. Fowler

Mastering Partnership Taxation

Stuart Lazar

Mastering Products Liability, Second Edition

Tim Kaye

Mastering Professional Responsibility, Second Edition

Grace M. Giesel

Mastering Property Law, Second Edition

Darryl C. Wilson

Mastering Sales

Colin P. Marks, Jeremy Kidd

Mastering Secured Transactions: UCC Article 9, Third Edition

Grace M. Giesel

Mastering Tort Law, Third Edition

Russell L. Weaver, Edward C. Martin, Andrew R. Klein,

Paul J. Zwier, II, John H. Bauman

Mastering Trademark and Unfair Competition Law, Second Edition

Lars S. Smith, Llewellyn Joseph Gibbons

Mastering Trusts and Estates, Second Edition

Gail Levin Richmond

MASTERING PRODUCTS LIABILITY

SECOND EDITION

Tim Kaye

PROFESSOR OF LAW

STETSON UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2025
Tim Kaye
All Rights Reserved

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CATALOGING-IN-PUBLICATION DATA

Names: Kaye, Tim, 1961- author.
Title: Mastering products liability / Tim Kaye.
Other titles: Products liability law
Description: Second edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, 2025. | Series: Mastering series | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2025017986 | ISBN 9781531032050 (paperback) | ISBN 9781531032067 (ebook)
Subjects: LCSH: Products liability--United States.
Classification: LCC KF1296 .K39 2025 | DDC 346.7303/8--dc23/eng/20250411
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2025017986>

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
(919) 489-7486
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

CONTENTS

Series Editor's Foreword	xv
Preface	xvii
Chapter 1 · History and Background of Products Liability	3
History and Background Roadmap	3
1.1 What Is a Product?	3
1.2 Products vs Services	4
1.3 Early History	5
1.4 Six Theories of Liability	6
1.5 Contracts vs Torts	6
1.6 Fault vs Strict Liability	7
1.7 The Five Elements	9
1.8 Potential Defendants	10
1.9 Potential Plaintiffs	11
1.10 Opening the Floodgates?	11
1.11 Role of Federal Law	13
History and Background Checkpoints	14
Chapter 2 · Warranties	15
Warranties Roadmap	15
2.1 Express Contractual Warranties	15
2.1.1 Puffery	16
2.2 Implied Contractual Warranties	17
2.2.1 Implied Warranty of Merchantability	17
2.2.2 Implied Warranty of Fitness for Particular Purpose	18
2.2.3 Interplay Between Express and Implied Warranties	19
2.2.4 Unconscionability	19
2.2.5 Magnuson Moss Warranty Act	20

2.3 Relaxing Privity	21
2.3.1 Collateral Warranties	21
2.3.2 Vertical and Horizontal Privity	22
2.3.3 “Lemon” Laws	23
2.4 Third Party Beneficiaries	23
2.5 Contracts vs Torts Revisited	24
2.5.1 Limitation Period	25
2.5.2 Harm to the Defective Product Itself	25
2.5.3 Loss of Profits	26
2.5.4 Limitations on Damages	27
Warranties Checkpoints	27
Chapter 3 · Misrepresentation	29
Misrepresentation Roadmap	29
3.1 Circumventing Privity	29
3.2 Untrue Statements	31
3.2.1 Social Media and Celebrity Influencers	31
3.3 Materiality vs Puffery	32
3.4 Reliance	34
3.4.1 Substantial Factor	35
3.4.2 Silence	35
3.4.3 General Legal Obligation	36
3.4.4 Special or Fiduciary Relationship	36
3.4.5 Correcting a Previous Misstatement	37
3.5 Fraudulent Misrepresentation	38
3.5.1 Pleading with Particularity	39
3.5.2 Modifications to the Reliance Requirement	39
3.6 Conscious Misrepresentation	40
3.7 Negligent Misrepresentation	41
3.8 Innocent Misrepresentation	44
Misrepresentation Checkpoints	44
Chapter 4 · Negligence	47
Negligence Roadmap	47
4.1 Summary of the Original Common Law	47
4.2 Duty of Care to Users	48
4.3 Duty vs Standard of Care	50
4.4 Standard of Care and Breach of Duty	50
4.5 A Duty to Innovate?	52
4.6 <i>Res Ipsa Loquitur</i> and the Fault Requirement	53

4.6.1 Second vs Third Restatement	54
4.6.2 Food vs Other Products	56
4.7 Negligence Per Se	57
Negligence Checkpoints	59
Chapter 5 · Second vs Third Restatements	61
Second vs Third Restatements Roadmap	61
5.1 Contracts vs Torts Revisited (Again)	61
5.2 Fault vs Strict Liability Revisited	62
5.3 Change of Focus	63
5.4 The Second Restatement	65
5.5 The Third (or Products Liability) Restatement	66
5.6 When “Strict Liability” Is Not Strict	67
5.7 The Practical Implications of the Controversy	68
5.7.1 Multiple Defendants	68
Second vs Third Restatements Checkpoints	69
Chapter 6 · Manufacturing Defects	71
Manufacturing Defects Roadmap	71
6.1 Food	71
6.1.1 Consumer Expectations Test	72
6.1.2 Foreign-Natural Test	73
6.1.3 Emotional Distress	73
6.1.4 New Approach?	74
6.2 Strict Liability Reaffirmed	75
6.3 The Third (Products Liability) Restatement	76
6.3.1 Changing Back the Focus	77
6.3.2 Products Liability Restatement in Action	77
6.4 Used Products	78
6.5 Economic Loss Rule Revisited	79
6.6 Components	81
Manufacturing Defects Checkpoints	82
Chapter 7 · Design Defects	85
Design Defects Roadmap	85
7.1 Consumer Expectations Test	85
7.2 Risk-Utility Test	86
7.2.1 No Alternative?	87
7.2.2 Efficiency	88
7.2.3 Beyond Consumers’ Competence	89

7.3 Reasonable Alternative Design	90
7.3.1 Reasonableness	91
7.3.2 Proving a Negative	92
7.4 Compliance with Administrative Standards	92
7.5 Prescription Drugs and Medical Devices	93
7.6 State of the Art	94
7.7 Subsequent Remedial Measures	96
7.7.1 State Law	97
Design Defects Checkpoints	98
Chapter 8 · Failures to Warn	99
Failures to Warn Roadmap	99
8.1 Reasonable Warnings	99
8.1.1 The Sophisticated User	100
8.2 A Duty to Warn?	101
8.2.1 What to Say?	102
8.2.2 Where to Say It?	103
8.3 Pharmaceuticals	104
8.3.1 Learned Intermediary	104
8.4 The Heeding Presumption	105
8.5 Interaction with Other Products	106
8.6 Post-Sale Warnings	107
8.7 Recalls and Retrofits	108
Failures to Warn Checkpoints	108
Chapter 9 · Causation	109
Causation Roadmap	109
9.1 Harm	109
9.1.1 Enhanced Injuries	110
9.1.2 Latent Diseases and Medical Monitoring	110
9.2 Causation in Fact	111
9.2.1 Proximate Cause vs Scope of the Risk	112
9.3 General Causation	112
9.3.1 Judge vs Jury	113
9.3.2 General Causation vs Scope of the Risk	114
9.3.3 Uncertainty, Probability, and Inference	114
9.3.4 Epidemiology	115
9.3.5 Evidence of Causation	116
9.3.6 Asbestos	118

9.4 Specific Causation	118
9.4.1 But-For Test	119
9.4.2 Substantial Factor Test	120
9.4.3 Contribution to the Risk Test	121
9.4.4 Market Share Liability	121
9.4.5 Reading and Heeding Warnings	122
Causation Checkpoints	123
Chapter 10 · Expert Evidence	125
Expert Evidence Roadmap	125
10.1 A Question of Weight or Admissibility?	125
10.2 Probative or Prejudicial?	126
10.3 The <i>Frye</i> Test	127
10.4 The <i>Daubert</i> Test	127
10.5 Judge vs Jury Revisited	129
10.6 <i>Frye</i> vs <i>Daubert</i> in State Courts	130
10.7 Judge as Gatekeeper	131
Expert Evidence Checkpoints	132
Chapter 11 · Affirmative Defenses	133
Affirmative Defenses Roadmap	133
11.1 Types of Defenses	133
11.1.1 Justification or Excuse?	134
11.2 Defenses Based on the Victim's Own Conduct	135
11.2.1 Consent	135
11.2.2 Assumption of Risk	136
11.2.2.1 Express Assumption of Risk	136
11.2.2.2 Implied Assumption of Risk	137
11.2.3 Contributory Negligence	137
11.2.4 Comparative Fault	138
11.2.5 Comparative Causation	139
11.2.6 Comparative Fault as a Sword, Not a Shield	140
11.2.7 Failure to Mitigate	141
11.3 Government Contractors	142
11.3.1 Military Contractors	142
11.3.2 Non-Military Contractors	143
11.3.3 Applicability to Types of Defect	144

11.4 Defenses Based on Lapse of Time	145
11.4.1 Statutes of Limitation	145
11.4.1.1 Conflicting Limitation Periods	146
11.4.1.2 Tolling	146
11.4.2 Statutes of Repose	147
11.4.2.1 Constitutionality	148
Affirmative Defenses Checkpoints	149
Chapter 12 · Role of Federal Law	151
Role of Federal Law Roadmap	151
12.1 Pre-Emption	151
12.1.1 Conflicts	152
12.1.2 Agency Approaches	153
12.2 Mass Torts Litigation	154
12.2.1 Multi-District Litigation	154
12.2.2 Class Actions	155
12.3 Bankruptcy Protection	156
12.3.1 Automatic Stay	157
12.3.2 Liability Insurance	158
Role of Federal Law Checkpoints	159
Chapter 13 · Damages	161
Damages Roadmap	161
13.1 Types of Damages	161
13.1.1 Nominal Damages	161
13.1.2 Compensatory Damages	162
13.2 Property Damage	162
13.3 Personal Injury	163
13.3.1 Loss of Consortium	163
13.4 Economic Loss	164
13.4.1 Consequential Economic Loss	164
13.4.2 Pure Economic Loss	164
13.5 Emotional Distress	165
13.5.1 Primary Victims	165
13.5.1.1 Consequential Emotional Distress	166
13.5.1.2 Pure Emotional Distress	166
13.5.2 Secondary Victims	166

13.6 Punitive Damages	167
13.6.1 Guidance for Juries	167
13.6.2 Supreme Court Guidance	168
13.6.3 Likelihood of Payment	168
13.6.4 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations (RICO) Act	169
Damages Checkpoints	170
Mastering Products Liability Checklist	171
Index	175

SERIES EDITOR'S FOREWORD

The Carolina Academic Press *Mastering* Series is designed to provide you with a tool that will enable you to easily and efficiently “master” the substance and content of law school courses. Throughout the series, the focus is on quality writing that makes legal concepts understandable. As a result, the series is designed to be easy to read and is not unduly cluttered with footnotes or cites to secondary sources.

In order to facilitate student mastery of topics, the *Mastering* Series includes a number of pedagogical features designed to improve learning and retention. At the beginning of each chapter, you will find a “Roadmap” that tells you about the chapter and provides you with a sense of the material that you will cover. A “Checkpoint” at the end of each chapter encourages you to stop and review the key concepts, reiterating what you have learned. Throughout the book, key terms are explained and emphasized. Finally, a “Master Checklist” at the end of each book reinforces what you have learned and helps you identify any areas that need review or further study.

We hope that you will enjoy studying with, and learning from, the *Mastering* Series.

Russell L. Weaver
PROFESSOR OF LAW &
DISTINGUISHED UNIVERSITY SCHOLAR
UNIVERSITY OF LOUISVILLE,
LOUIS D. BRANDEIS SCHOOL OF LAW

PREFACE

My colleague, Lou Virelli, suggested that I write this book. It was written to the sound of Daniela, Paulina, and Alejandra Villarreal, collectively known as The Warning, whom I am delighted to support on Patreon.

I should also like to thank the exceptionally smart Ashley Gregory for reading and commenting on earlier drafts of what became chapters 1 to 4. She made numerous excellent suggestions, though we will never agree on the use of conjunctions! All errors and infelicities of expression that remain are, of course, of my own making and not hers.

Other exceptionally intelligent people contributed in their own ways, perhaps even without realizing it. Bob Bickel remains a constant source of encouragement for everything I do. Matt DiMasso ensures that my mind is constantly broadened, even if I sometimes wish it weren't. Helen Driscoll entertains me with tales of Portugal, house renovations, and a new spy. Gary Falasca makes sure I don't get too big for my britches, though I can now point out how badly Manchester City are playing. Anne Gary makes the most amazing baked goods. Andrea Hatton is always a breath of fresh air. Sage Iverson has caused me to know more about *The Bachelor* than I ever wanted. Lisa Johnston performs the most hilarious rants. Kelsey Krueger inspires me with her fearlessness and drive. Luz Nagle advocates for abused women in the Americas. Lauren Sloniger guides me through unfamiliar bits of popular culture.

Extra special thanks are due to Marguerite Boissonnault, Sharon Dearman, Nia Kaye, Abigail Lee (née Pressler), Allie Padin, and Kristina Self. To spell out precisely how much you mean to me would take too long, so I'll settle for this: I love you all.

