

Understanding Employment Law

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Understanding Series

- UNDERSTANDING
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW
Seventh Edition
Kristin E. Hickman
- UNDERSTANDING ALTERNATIVE
DISPUTE RESOLUTION
Second Edition
Kristen M. Blankley and
Maureen A. Weston
- UNDERSTANDING ANIMAL LAW
Adam Karp
- UNDERSTANDING
ANTITRUST AND ITS ECONOMIC
IMPLICATIONS
Seventh Edition
E. Thomas Sullivan and Jeffrey L. Harrison
- UNDERSTANDING
BANKRUPTCY
Fourth Edition
Jeffrey Ferriell and Edward J. Janger
- UNDERSTANDING
CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY
PROPERTY LAW
Second Edition
Jo Carrillo
- UNDERSTANDING
CAPITAL PUNISHMENT LAW
Fifth Edition
Linda E. Carter, Ellen S. Kreitzberg,
Scott W. Howe, and
Celestine Richards McConville
- UNDERSTANDING CIVIL PROCEDURE
Seventh Edition
Gene R. Shreve, Peter Raven-Hansen,
and Charles Gardner Geyh
- UNDERSTANDING CIVIL PROCEDURE
The California Edition
Walter W. Heiser,
Gene R. Shreve, Peter Raven-Hansen,
and Charles Gardner Geyh
- UNDERSTANDING
CIVIL RIGHTS LITIGATION
Third Edition
Howard M. Wasserman
- UNDERSTANDING
CONFLICT OF LAWS
Fourth Edition
William M. Richman, William L. Reynolds,
and Chris A. Whytock
- UNDERSTANDING
CONSTITUTIONAL LAW
Sixth Edition
William D. Araiza
- UNDERSTANDING CONTRACTS
Fifth Edition
Jeffrey Ferriell
- UNDERSTANDING
COPYRIGHT LAW
Eighth Edition
Marshall A. Leaffer
- UNDERSTANDING
CORPORATE LAW
Sixth Edition
Arthur R. Pinto and
James A. Fanto
- UNDERSTANDING
CORPORATE TAXATION
Fifth Edition
Leandra Lederman and Emily Cauble
- UNDERSTANDING CRIMINAL LAW
Ninth Edition
Joshua Dressler
- UNDERSTANDING CRIMINAL
PROCEDURE VOL. 1:
INVESTIGATION
Eighth Edition
Joshua Dressler, Alan C. Michaels,
and Ric Simmons
- UNDERSTANDING
CRIMINAL PROCEDURE VOL. 2:
ADJUDICATION
Fifth Edition
Joshua Dressler, Alan C. Michaels,
and Ric Simmons
- UNDERSTANDING
DISABILITY LAW
Fourth Edition
Mark C. Weber

UNDERSTANDING
ELECTION LAW AND VOTING RIGHTS
Michael R. Dimino, Bradley A. Smith,
and Michael E. Solimine

UNDERSTANDING
EMPLOYEE BENEFITS LAW
Second Edition
Kathryn L. Moore

UNDERSTANDING
EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION LAW
Third Edition

Thomas R. Haggard and
Bruce N. Cameron

UNDERSTANDING
EMPLOYMENT LAW
Fourth Edition
Richard A. Bales, Jeffrey M. Hirsch, and
Paul M. Secunda

UNDERSTANDING
ENVIRONMENTAL LAW
Fourth Edition
Kevin A. Reilly and Philip Weinberg

UNDERSTANDING
ESTATE AND GIFT TAXATION
Third Edition
Brant J. Hellwig and
Robert T. Danforth

UNDERSTANDING EVIDENCE
Sixth Edition
Paul C. Giannelli and Jules Epstein

UNDERSTANDING
FAMILY LAW
Fourth Edition
John Gregory, Peter N. Swisher,
and Robin Wilson

UNDERSTANDING
FEDERAL AND CALIFORNIA
EVIDENCE
Paul C. Giannelli

UNDERSTANDING
FEDERAL COURTS AND JURISDICTION
Second Edition
Linda Mullenix, Martin H. Redish,
and Georgene Vairo

UNDERSTANDING
FEDERAL INCOME TAXATION
Seventh Edition
J. Martin Burke and Michael K. Friel

UNDERSTANDING
THE FIRST AMENDMENT
Eighth Edition
Russell L. Weaver

UNDERSTANDING
IMMIGRATION LAW
Third Edition
Kevin R. Johnson, Raquel Aldana,
Bill Ong Hing, Leticia M. Saucedo, and
Enid Trucios-Haynes

UNDERSTANDING
INSURANCE LAW
Seventh Edition
Robert H. Jerry, II and Douglas Richmond

UNDERSTANDING
INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW
Fourth Edition
Tyler T. Ochoa, Shubha Ghosh,
and Mary LaFrance

UNDERSTANDING
INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS AND
FINANCIAL TRANSACTIONS
Fourth Edition
Jerold A. Friedland

UNDERSTANDING
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW
Fourth Edition
Ellen S. Podgor, Roger S. Clark,
and Lucian E. Dervan

UNDERSTANDING
INTERNATIONAL LAW
Third Edition
Stephen C. McCaffrey

UNDERSTANDING JEWISH LAW
Second Edition
Steven H. Resnicoff

UNDERSTANDING JUVENILE LAW
Fifth Edition
Martin Gardner

UNDERSTANDING LABOR LAW
Sixth Edition
Douglas E. Ray, Robert N. Strassfeld, and
Ariana Levinson

UNDERSTANDING
THE LAW OF TERRORISM
Second Edition
Erik Luna and Wayne McCormack

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS UNDERSTANDING SERIES, *continued*

- UNDERSTANDING
THE LAW OF ZONING AND
LAND USE CONTROLS
Third Edition
Barlow Burke
- UNDERSTANDING LAWYERS' ETHICS
Sixth Edition
Monroe H. Freedman and Abbe Smith
- UNDERSTANDING
LOCAL GOVERNMENT
Second Edition
Sandra Stevenson
- UNDERSTANDING
MODERN REAL ESTATE
TRANSACTIONS
Fourth Edition
Alex M. Johnson, Jr.
- UNDERSTANDING
NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS AND
PAYMENT SYSTEMS
Second Edition
William H. Lawrence
- UNDERSTANDING
NONPROFIT AND TAX EXEMPT
ORGANIZATIONS
Third Edition
Nicholas P. Cafardi and
Jaclyn Fabean Cherry
- UNDERSTANDING
PARTNERSHIP AND LLC TAXATION
Fifth Edition
Jerold A. Friedland
- UNDERSTANDING PATENT LAW
Fourth Edition
Amy L. Landers
- UNDERSTANDING PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LAW
Second Edition
Bruce L. Ottley, Rogelio A. Lasso,
and Terrence F. Kiely
- UNDERSTANDING PROPERTY LAW
Fifth Edition
John G. Sprankling
- UNDERSTANDING REMEDIES
Fourth Edition
James M. Fischer
- UNDERSTANDING
SALES AND LEASES OF GOODS
Third Edition
William H. Henning, William H. Lawrence,
and Henry Deeb Gabriel
- UNDERSTANDING
SECURED TRANSACTIONS
Sixth Edition
William H. Henning, R. Wilson Freyermuth,
and Brook E. Gotberg
- UNDERSTANDING SECURITIES LAW
Eighth Edition
Marc I. Steinberg
- UNDERSTANDING SPORTS LAW
Timothy Davis and N. Jeremi Duru
- UNDERSTANDING
TAXATION OF BUSINESS ENTITIES
Second Edition
Walter D. Schwidetzky and Fred B. Brown
- UNDERSTANDING TORTS
Seventh Edition
John L. Diamond, Lawrence C. Levine,
and Anita Bernstein
- UNDERSTANDING
TRADE SECRET LAW
John G. Sprankling and
Thomas G. Sprankling
- UNDERSTANDING
TRADEMARK LAW
Fourth Edition
Mary LaFrance
- UNDERSTANDING
TRUSTS AND ESTATES
Seventh Edition
Roger W. Andersen and Susan N. Gary
- UNDERSTANDING
WHITE COLLAR CRIME
Fifth Edition
J. Kelly Strader and Todd Haugh

Understanding Employment Law

FOURTH EDITION

Richard A. Bales

PROFESSOR OF LAW

OHIO NORTHERN UNIVERSITY PETTIT COLLEGE OF LAW

Jeffrey M. Hirsch

GENEVA YEARGAN RAND DISTINGUISHED PROFESSOR OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA SCHOOL OF LAW

Paul M. Secunda

PARTNER AT WALCHESKE & LUZI, LLC



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2025
Carolina Academic Press, LLC
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 978-1-5310-3279-1
eBook ISBN 978-1-5310-3280-7

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Bales, Richard A., author. | Hirsch, Jeffrey M., author. | Secunda, Paul M., author.
Title: Understanding employment law / Richard A. Bales, Jeffrey M. Hirsch, Paul M. Secunda.
Description: Fourth edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, 2025. | Series: Understanding series | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2024052026 | ISBN 9781531032791 (paperback) | ISBN 9781531032807 (ebook)
Subjects: LCSH: Labor laws and legislation—United States.
Classification: LCC KF3455 .B354 2025 | DDC 344.7301—dc23
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024052026>

Carolina Academic Press, LLC
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
(919) 489-7486
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

RAB:

With love to Dennis and Emma

JMH:

To Lynn, Noah, and Naomi, with love

PMS:

With love to Sandi, Jake, Izzy, Alex, Lauren, and Livi

Contents

Preface	xvii
Acknowledgments	xix
Chapter 1 • Introduction	3
§ 1.01 Historical Overview and the Multi-Layered Nature of Employment Law	3
[A] At-Will Employment	3
[B] Workers' Compensation	4
[C] New Deal Federal Legislation	4
[D] Federal Antidiscrimination Legislation	5
[E] Federal Legislation Setting Workplace Standards	5
[F] State Legislation and Common Law	6
§ 1.02 Scope of This Book	7
Chapter 2 • Legal Boundaries of the Employment Relationship	9
§ 2.01 Employees versus Independent Contractors	9
[A] Introduction	9
[B] The Control Test	10
[C] The Economic Realities Test	12
[D] The ABC Test	15
[E] Applying the Tests to Employment Laws	16
§ 2.02 Covered Employees	17
[A] Exclusion by Statute	17
[B] Exclusion by Contract	19
[C] Contingent Workers	21
[D] On-Demand Employees	22
§ 2.03 Covered Employers	24
[A] Statutory Exemptions	24
[1] Certain Types of Employers	24
[2] The "Small Employer" Exemption	25
[B] Joint Employees	25
[C] Leased Employees	27
Chapter 3 • Historical Foundations of Employment at Will	29
§ 3.01 Introduction	29
§ 3.02 English Origins	29

§ 3.03	Horace Wood's Treatise	31
[A]	Contrasting Approaches	31
[B]	Flexibility	32
[C]	As Legal Scholarship	32
[D]	Explanations for the Rule	33
§ 3.04	Historical Application	34
§ 3.05	Modern Application	35
§ 3.06	Evaluating the At-Will Rule	35
Chapter 4	• Contract Erosions of Employment at Will	37
§ 4.01	Express Modification of At-Will Contracts, Written and Oral	37
[A]	Definite-Term Contracts	38
[B]	Oral Contracts	39
[C]	Statute of Frauds	41
§ 4.02	Promissory Estoppel	43
§ 4.03	Reliance and Implied-in-Fact Contracts	45
§ 4.04	Employment Manuals	47
[A]	Disclaimers	49
[B]	Amendments	50
§ 4.05	Contract Damages	52
Chapter 5	• Tort Erosions of Employment at Will	53
§ 5.01	Introduction	53
§ 5.02	Wrongful Discharge in Violation of Public Policy	54
[A]	Defining Public Policy	55
[B]	Pigeonholing Public Policy Claims	55
[1]	Refusing to Commit an Unlawful Act	56
[2]	Exercising a Statutory Right	56
[3]	Fulfilling a Public Obligation	57
[4]	Whistleblowing	57
[a]	Source of Legal Protection	57
[b]	Scope of Legal Protection	58
[c]	Burdens of Proof	59
[d]	The Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002	60
[e]	Whistleblowing Lawyers	61
§ 5.03	Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress	62
[A]	Introduction	63
[B]	Elements	63
[1]	Extreme and Outrageous Conduct	64
[2]	Severe Emotional Distress	65
Chapter 6	• Good Faith and Fair Dealing	67
§ 6.01	Implied Covenant of Good Faith and Fair Dealing	67
[A]	Good Faith Not Applicable to At-Will Employment	67
[B]	Good Faith Protects Earned Benefits	68

[C]	Good Faith Requires General Fairness	69
[D]	The <i>Restatement</i> Approach	70
Chapter 7 • The Future of Wrongful Discharge Law		71
§ 7.01	A Brief Reprise of the At-Will Rule	71
§ 7.02	Defending the At-Will Rule	73
§ 7.03	Critiquing the At-Will Rule	74
§ 7.04	Alternatives to the At-Will Rule	75
§ 7.05	Dismissal Standards in Other Countries	76
Chapter 8 • Employee Free Speech and Political Protections		77
§ 8.01	Introduction	77
§ 8.02	The Public Workplace	78
[A]	Public Employee Equal Protection Claims	79
[B]	Public Employee Political Affiliation Protections	81
[C]	Public Employee Free Speech: The <i>Connick/Pickering/Garcetti</i> Line of Cases	82
§ 8.03	The Private Workplace	85
[A]	<i>Novosel v. Nationwide Insurance Co.</i> and Using Public Policy Torts for Political Protection	85
[B]	Private Sector Employee Free Speech, the National Labor Relations Act, and Off-Duty Conduct Statutes	86
Chapter 9 • Employee Privacy Protections		89
§ 9.01	Introduction	89
§ 9.02	Privacy Claims on the Job	90
[A]	Public Employment	90
[B]	The Tort of Invasion of Privacy	93
[C]	Wiretap Act and Electronic Communications Privacy Act (ECPA)	94
§ 9.03	Privacy Claims off the Job	97
[A]	Legal Off-Duty Conduct	97
[1]	Common Law Protections	97
[2]	The Union Context	98
[3]	State Off-Duty Conduct Statutes	98
[B]	Romantic Relationships	99
[C]	Public Employee Sexual Privacy Claims in Light of <i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	100
§ 9.04	Drug Testing	101
[A]	Public Employees and the Fourth Amendment	102
[B]	Private Employees and Invasion of Privacy	103
§ 9.05	Polygraphs and Honesty Testing	106
[A]	Polygraph Testing	106
[B]	Honesty Testing	107
§ 9.06	Genetic Testing	109

Chapter 10 • Defamation and Employment References	111
§ 10.01 Introduction	111
§ 10.02 The Tort of Defamation	112
[A] The Basic Framework	112
[1] False and Defamatory Statement	112
[2] Publication and Self-Publication	113
[3] Fault	113
[4] Special Harm	113
[B] Conditional Privileges and Abuse of Privilege	114
[C] False Light Claims	115
§ 10.03 Employment References	116
§ 10.04 Invasion-of-Privacy Claims	118
Chapter 11 • The Duty of Loyalty, Trade Secrets, Covenants Not to Compete, and Employee Inventions	119
§ 11.01 Introduction	120
§ 11.02 The Theory of Human Capital and High-Velocity Markets	120
[A] Rubin and Shedd on Human Capital	121
[B] Hyde on High-Velocity Markets	121
§ 11.03 The Duty of Loyalty and the Misappropriation of Trade Secrets	122
[A] Common Law Duty of Loyalty	122
[B] The Tort of Misappropriation of Trade Secrets	125
§ 11.04 Covenants Not to Compete	129
[A] Factors to Consider for Enforceability	130
[1] Employer’s Legitimate Interest and Employee’s Unique Skills	130
[2] Duration of Covenant	131
[3] Geographic Scope of Covenant	132
[4] Adequate Consideration	133
[B] Special Issues under Covenants Not to Compete Law	133
[1] Employees Who Are Terminated	133
[2] Blue-Penciling and Other Responses to Overbroad Covenants	134
[3] Confidentiality and Non-Solicitation Agreements	135
[4] Covenants in Employee Severance Agreements	135
[5] Employer Suits against Subsequent Employers	135
§ 11.05 Employee Inventions	136
[A] The Common Law: The Duty to Assign and the Shop Right Rule	136
[B] Contractual Agreements	137
[C] Statutory Law: The Case of California	138
Chapter 12 • Regulation of Compensation and Leave Time	139
§ 12.01 Introduction	140
§ 12.02 Fair Labor Standards Act	141
[A] Coverage	141

[B]	Child Labor	145
[C]	Minimum Wage	147
[D]	Overtime	149
[1]	Salary Basis Test	151
[2]	Duties Test	153
[a]	Executive Exemption	154
[b]	Administrative Exemption	156
[c]	Professional Exemption	158
[E]	Determining Wage Rates	160
[F]	Enforcement	165
§ 12.03	Wage Payment Laws	166
[A]	Overview	166
[B]	Form of Wage Payment	166
[C]	Wage Payment after Separation	167
[D]	Restrictions on Assignment and Garnishment	168
[E]	Tips	170
§ 12.04	Family and Medical Leave Act	171
[A]	Coverage	172
[B]	FMLA Rights	172
[1]	Leave and Restoration	173
[2]	Health Benefits	175
[3]	Interference and Retaliation Prohibitions	175
[C]	Serious Health Condition	177
[D]	Notice and Certification Requirements	178
[E]	Enforcement	182
Chapter 13 • Unemployment and WARN		185
§ 13.01	Introduction	185
§ 13.02	Unemployment Insurance	186
[A]	History and Overview of Unemployment Insurance in the United States	186
[B]	Disqualifications from Benefits	188
[1]	Voluntary Separation	189
[2]	Willful Misconduct	191
[3]	Work Search Requirement	192
§ 13.03	Worker Adjustment and Retraining Notification Act of 1988 (WARN)	194
[A]	Coverage and Notice Requirement	194
[B]	Exceptions	196
[1]	Faltering Company	197
[2]	Unforeseen Business Circumstances	197
[3]	Natural Disaster	198
[C]	Enforcement	199

Chapter 14 • Employee Benefit Plans under ERISA	201
§ 14.01 Introduction	202
§ 14.02 Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974 (ERISA)	204
[A] Statutory Structure	204
[B] ERISA Plans	205
[1] Types of ERISA Plans	205
[2] Plans Exempt from ERISA	206
[C] Plan Documents, Trust Requirements, and Plan Amendments	206
[D] Summary Plan Description (SPD) and Reporting and Disclosure Requirements	207
§ 14.03 Retirement Plans	208
[A] Types of Retirement Plans	208
[1] Defined Benefit Plans	209
[2] Defined Contribution Plans	209
[3] Cash Balance Plans	211
[B] Participation and Vesting Standards	211
[1] Minimum Participation Standards	211
[2] Minimum Vesting Standards	212
[C] Plan Termination Issues and the PBGC	213
[1] Distress Terminations with Insufficient Assets	214
[2] Standard Terminations with Sufficient Assets	215
§ 14.04 Health and Welfare Plans	216
[A] Introduction	216
[B] Insured versus Self-Insured Health Plans	216
[C] Health Savings Accounts and High-Deductible Health Plans	217
[D] Retiree Health Care Issues	218
[E] COBRA and Continuation of Health Coverage	219
[F] Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA)	220
[G] Affordable Care Act of 2010 (ACA)	221
§ 14.05 Common Issues to Retirement and Welfare Plans	223
[A] Fiduciary Duties under ERISA	223
[1] The Definition of an ERISA Fiduciary	224
[2] Responsibilities of ERISA Fiduciaries	225
[a] Basic Fiduciary Duties	225
[b] Co-Fiduciary Liability and Prohibited Transactions	226
[3] Duty to Inform Cases	227
[a] Early Retirement Plan Cases	227
[b] Participant Communication Cases	228
[B] ERISA Preemption	229
[1] Section 514 “Relates to” Language	229
[2] The Savings Clause	232
[3] The Deemer Clause	233

[C] ERISA Civil Enforcement Actions	234
[1] Overview and Jurisdictional Issues	234
[2] Claims for Benefits	235
[3] Claims for Fiduciary Breaches under Section 502(a)(2)	237
[4] Claims for Equitable Relief under the Catch-All Provision	239
[5] Discrimination Claims under Section 510	241
Chapter 15 • Safety and Health	243
§ 15.01 Introduction	244
§ 15.02 Occupational Safety and Health Act (OSHAct)	244
[A] Coverage	244
[B] OSHA Administration	245
[C] General Duty Clause	245
[D] OSHA Standards	246
[1] Promulgation of Standards	247
[2] Interim Standards	247
[3] Emergency Temporary Standards	248
[4] Permanent Standards	249
[5] Variances	251
[6] Substantive Criteria for Evaluating and Challenging Standards	251
[a] Technological Feasibility	252
[b] Economic Feasibility	254
[c] Benefit to Employees' Health and Safety	255
[d] Cost-Benefit Analysis	256
[E] Employee Rights	257
[F] Employer Responsibilities	259
[G] Enforcement	261
[1] Procedures	262
[2] Recordkeeping and Inspections	262
[3] Penalties	264
[4] Imminent Danger	265
[5] State Regulation of Safety and Health	266
Chapter 16 • Enforcing Employment Rights	269
§ 16.01 Introduction	269
§ 16.02 Remedies	269
§ 16.03 Choice of Enforcement Forum: Agencies or Courts	270
[A] Administrative Agencies	270
[1] Compensation versus Fines	270
[2] Agency versus Court Adjudication	271
[B] Individual Enforcement	271
[C] Hybrid Enforcement	272

Chapter 17 • Arbitration of Employment Disputes	273
§17.01 Arbitration Generally	273
§17.02 A Brief History of Arbitration in Labor and Employment Law	275
§17.03 Employment Arbitration Law Today	276
§17.04 Current Issues in Employment Arbitration	279
§17.05 The Advantages and Disadvantages of Employment Arbitration	282
Table of Cases	285
Index	293

Preface

Barely 30 years ago, what today is known as “employment law” was known as “master-servant law.” The change of nomenclature is telling. Historically, “regulation” of the workplace amounted to little more than market forces and employer whims. The modern workplace, however, is governed by a complex and multifaceted legal framework that is continually evolving both as a result of federal and state statutes and as a result of decisions by state courts.

This book strikes a balance between comprehensiveness and selectivity. It provides the substantive material needed to succeed in practice and in the classroom and on final examinations, without overwhelming the reader with details that are unduly esoteric or tangential. The book begins with common-law employment doctrines such as employment at-will, employment contracts, employment torts, workplace privacy issues, and restrictive covenants. It then turns to federal and state statutory regulation of the workplace, covering topics such as compensation (including wage and hour legislation and unemployment insurance), employee benefits (including leave time, pensions, and health insurance), and workplace safety legislation.

Acknowledgments

The authors wish to acknowledge their intellectual debt to Steven Willborn, Stewart Schwab, John Burton, and Gillian Lester. Their casebook *EMPLOYMENT LAW: CASES AND MATERIALS* was the foundation upon which much of this *UNDERSTANDING* book was built.

Professor Bales thanks his co-authors, Jeff Hirsch and Paul Secunda, for their inspiration, gentle prodding, fine editing, and never-ending words of encouragement.

Professor Hirsch thanks his co-authors, Rick Bales and Paul Secunda, for their diligence, great editing, and, most importantly, good cheer throughout this project. He also is indebted to Steven Willborn for providing him the opportunity to take part in this project and to Leslia Caia and Casey Turner for their excellent research assistance.

Professor Secunda thanks his wonderful co-authors, Dean Joseph Kearney for his continual financial and institutional support of my work, and the authors of the fifth edition of the Willborn, Schwab, Burton & Lester book for providing a wonderful template for our own work.

