

# Mastering Adoption Law and Policy

**CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS MASTERING SERIES**

RUSSELL WEAVER, SERIES EDITOR

**Mastering Administrative Law**

William R. Andersen

**Mastering Adoption Law and Policy**

Cynthia Hawkins DeBose

**Mastering Alternative Dispute Resolution**

Kelly M. Feeley & James A. Sheehan

**Mastering American Indian Law**

Angelique Townsend EagleWoman & Stacy L. Leeds

**Mastering Appellate Advocacy and Process, Revised Printing**

Donna C. Looper & George W. Kuney

**Mastering Art Law**

Herbert Lazerow

**Mastering Bankruptcy**

George W. Kuney

**Mastering Civil Procedure, 2d e**

David Charles Hricik

**Mastering Constitutional Law, 2d e**

John C. Knechtle & Christopher J. Roederer

**Mastering Contract Law**

Irma S. Russell & Barbara K. Bucholtz

**Mastering Corporate Tax**

Reginald Mombrun, Gail Levin Richmond & Felicia Branch

**Mastering Corporations and Other Business Entities, 2d e**

Lee Harris

**Mastering Criminal Law, 2d e**

Ellen S. Podgor, Peter J. Henning & Neil P. Cohen

**Mastering Criminal Procedure, Volume 1: The Investigative Stage, 2d e**

Peter J. Henning, Andrew Taslitz, Margaret L. Paris,

Cynthia E. Jones & Ellen S. Podgor

**Mastering Criminal Procedure, Volume 2: The Adjudicatory Stage, 2d e**

Peter J. Henning, Andrew Taslitz, Margaret L. Paris,

Cynthia E. Jones & Ellen S. Podgor

**Mastering Elder Law, 2d e**

Ralph C. Brashier

**Mastering Employment Discrimination Law**

Paul M. Secunda & Jeffrey M. Hirsch

**Mastering Evidence**

Ronald W. Eades

**Mastering Family Law**

Janet Leach Richards

**Mastering Income Tax**

Christopher M. Pietruszkiewicz & Gail Levin Richmond

**Mastering Intellectual Property**

George W. Kuney & Donna C. Looper

**Mastering Labor Law**

Paul M. Secunda, Anne Marie Lofaso,

Joseph E. Slater & Jeffrey M. Hirsch

**Mastering Legal Analysis and Communication**

David T. Ritchie

**Mastering Legal Analysis and Drafting**

George W. Kuney & Donna C. Looper

**Mastering Negotiable Instruments (UCC Articles 3 and 4)  
and Other Payment Systems**

Michael D. Floyd

**Mastering Partnership Taxation**

Stuart Lazar

**Mastering Products Liability**

Ronald W. Eades

**Mastering Professional Responsibility, 2d e**

Grace M. Giesel

**Mastering Property Law, Revised Printing**

Darryl C. Wilson & Cynthia H. DeBose

**Mastering Secured Transactions (UCC Article 9), 2d e**

Richard H. Nowka

**Mastering Statutory Interpretation, 2d e**

Linda D. Jellum

**Mastering Tort Law**

Russell L. Weaver, Edward C. Martin, Andrew R. Klein,

Paul J. Zwier II, Ronald W. Eades & John H. Bauman

**Mastering Trademark and Unfair Competition Law**

Lars S. Smith & Llewellyn Joseph Gibbons



# Mastering Adoption Law and Policy

**Cynthia Hawkins DeBose**

PROFESSOR OF LAW  
STETSON UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2015  
Cynthia Hawkins DeBose  
All Rights Reserved.

**Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data**

DeBose, Cynthia Hawkins, author.

Mastering adoption law and policy / Cynthia Hawkins DeBose.

pages cm. -- (Carolina Academic Press Mastering Series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-59460-619-9 (alk. paper)

1. Adoption--Law and legislation--United States. 2. United States. Indian Child Welfare Act of 1978. I. Title.

KF545.D43 2015

344.7303'2734--dc23

2015021361

Carolina Academic Press  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, NC 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

*My sincere thanks and appreciation to my immediate and extended family members who have supported and encouraged me throughout the lengthy process from the germination of my initial idea to final publication.*

*We Did It With God's Help!*

*Cynthia Hawkins DeBose*





# Contents

<b>Series Editor’s Foreword</b>	<b>xix</b>
<b>Chapter 1 · History of Adoption</b>	<b>3</b>
Roadmap	3
I. Babylonia and Rome	3
II. Ancient Greece and Egypt	4
III. The Western Continent	4
IV. The “New World” and the United States	4
V. The Orphan Train Era	7
VI. Modern Adoption Practices and the Child Welfare System	10
Checkpoints	11
<b>Chapter 2 · The History of the Child Welfare System and Foster Care</b>	<b>13</b>
Roadmap	13
I. Child Welfare Prior to the Enactment of Child Protection Services	13
II. Child Welfare and Nongovernmental Protection Societies	14
III. Child Welfare and Government-Sponsored Child Protection Services	15
IV. Foster Care in the United States	18
Checkpoints	27
<b>Chapter 3 · Types of Adoption: Public Agency (Foster Care), Private Agency, and Independent (Non-Agency)</b>	<b>29</b>
Roadmap	29
I. Public Agency Adoption (Foster Care)	30
II. Private Agency Adoption	31
III. Independent Adoption (Non-Agency)	33
A. General Information	33
B. The Regulation of Independent Adoptions	34
1. Regulation of Intermediaries	35
2. Regulation of Fees and Expenses	36

i. Expenses to Birth Parents	37
ii. Agencies as Intermediaries—Fees and Costs	37
3. Regulation of the Exchange of Information	38
C. Baby Broker Acts	38
D. Advertising	38
IV. Additional Legal Issues	39
A. Birth Father Rights and Putative Father Registries	39
B. Birth Parent Revokes Consent	40
C. Birth Parent Contests the Adoption and Sues to Regain Custody	40
D. Internet Adoption—Caveat Emptor	40
Checkpoints	41
<b>Chapter 4 · Consent</b>	43
Roadmap	43
I. Who May Give Consent	43
A. Biological Parent(s)	43
B. Child’s Legal Guardian or Custodian	44
II. When Consent Can Be Executed	44
III. Termination of Parental Rights	44
IV. Revocation of Consent	46
V. Unwed Biological Parents	47
A. Unwed Biological Mothers	47
B. Unwed Biological Fathers	47
VI. Surrogacy and Consent	51
Checkpoints	52
<b>Chapter 5 · Open Adoption</b>	55
Roadmap	55
I. History of Record Keeping Regarding Adopted Children	55
II. The Advent of Open Adoption	56
III. Statutorily Conditioned Access to Birth Records	57
A. “Good Cause” Statutes	57
B. Mutual Consent Registries	58
C. “Search and Consent” Procedures	58
D. Affidavits and Vetoes	58
IV. Protecting the Privacy of Birth Parents vs. the Adoptee’s Right to Know	59
A. Birth Parents’ Privacy Interests	59

---

B. Adoptee's Right to Know	60
V. Enforceability of Open Adoption Agreements	61
A. Forms of Open Adoption	61
1. Informal Agreements	61
2. Post-Adoption Contact Agreements	61
3. Court-Imposed Open Adoption	62
B. States With Completely Open Records	62
C. States Without Completely Open Records	62
VI. The Benefits and Risks of Open Adoptions	63
A. Birth Parents	63
1. Benefits	63
2. Risks	63
B. Adoptive Parents	63
1. Benefits	63
2. Risks	63
C. Adoptees	64
1. Benefits	64
2. Risks	64
VII. The Current Trend	64
Checkpoints	67
<b>Chapter 6 · Transracial Adoption</b>	<b>69</b>
Roadmap	69
I. History	70
A. General Background	70
B. The 1904 Arizona Orphan Train: The Wrong Way on a One-Way Track	70
C. Transracial Adoption in Modern Times	72
II. The Federal Statutory Framework: The Multi-Ethnic Placement Act of 1994 (MEPA) and the Removal of Barriers to Interethnic Adoption Act of 1996 (IEAA)	74
A. General Background	74
B. MEPA	74
C. IEAA	75
D. Legal Implications and Considerations for MEPA/IEAA	76
III. Arguments in Opposition to and in Support of Transracial Adoption	77
A. Arguments in Opposition to Transracial Adoption	77
1. One-Way Nature	77

2. Racial Identity	77
3. Cultural Genocide	78
4. African American Adoptive Parents	78
5. Federal Legislation: MEPA and IEAA	79
B. Arguments in Support of Transracial Adoption	80
1. Statistics	80
2. Race Matching Harms Children	80
3. Success Rate of TRA	81
4. Self-Identity and White Privilege	81
5. Federal Legislation: MEPA and IEAA	82
IV. Studies of Transracial Adoptees and Their Families	82
V. Strategies to Facilitate a Transracial Adoption	86
Checkpoints	86
<b>Chapter 7 · Same Sex Adoption</b>	89
Roadmap	89
I. History of Same Sex Adoption	89
II. Methods of Adoption for Same Sex Couples	90
III. The Court's Test for the Adoption of a Child—Best Interests of the Child	91
IV. Arguments against Same Sex Adoption	92
V. Arguments Supporting Same Sex Adoption	92
VI. The Use of the Full Faith and Credit Clause in Same Sex Adoption	93
VII. The Children of Gay/Lesbian Adoptive Parents	94
A. The Studies	94
B. Inheritance Issues	94
VIII. Recognition of Same Sex Marriage	95
IX. Florida—A Historically Anti-Gay Adoption State: A Case Study	98
A. The Root of Florida's Discriminatory Intent	98
B. The Legal Challenges to Florida's Ban on Lesbi-Gay Adoption	99
1. <i>Seebol v. Farie</i> , 16 Fla. L. Weekly C52 (Fla. 16th Jud. Cir. Ct. 1991).	99
2. <i>State v. Cox</i> , 627 So. 2d 1210 (S. D. Fla. 1993).	99
3. <i>Matthews v. Weinberg</i> , 645 So. 2d 487 (1994).	99
4. <i>Lofton v. Kearney</i> , 157 F. Supp. 2d 1372 (S.D. Fla.2001).	100
5. <i>In re Adoption of John Doe, Minor</i> , 2008 WL 4212559 (Fla. Cir. Ct. Aug. 29, 2008).	100

6. <i>In Re: Matter of the Adoption of X.X.G. and N.R.G.</i> , 45 So. 3d 79 (Fla. 3d DCA 2010).	102
7. <i>D.M.T. v. T.M.H.</i> , 129 So. 3d 320 (Fla. 2013).	104
8. <i>A.A.B. v. B.O.C.</i> , 112 So. 3d 761 (Fla. App. 2 Dist. 2013).	104
C. Constitutional Implications Support Lifting the Ban on Lesbi-Gay Adoption	104
1. Due Process and Privacy Rights	104
2. Equal Protection	106
D. Repealing the Ban Is the Only Appropriate Remedy	107
1. Guardianship	107
2. Protective Supervision	107
3. Planned Permanent Living Arrangement	108
4. Lesbi-Gay Adoption of Established Foster Children Only	108
5. Deny Sexual Orientation on Adoption Application	109
Checkpoints	109
<b>Chapter 8 · The Indian Child Welfare Act of 1978 (ICWA)</b> (25 U.S.C. §§ 1901–1963 (2014))	111
Roadmap	111
I. The History of ICWA: What Can Be Learned from It?	111
II. ICWA—Provisions and Requirements	112
A. Child-Focused	112
B. Indian Family Preference	113
C. Procedural Issues in Accordance With ICWA	114
D. <i>Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians v. Holyfield</i> , 490 U.S. 30 (1989).	115
E. Tribal Jurisdiction	115
F. Parental Consent	116
III. Circumventing the Act—The History of the Existing Family Exception	116
A. <i>In re Adoption of Baby Boy L.</i> , 643 P.2d 168 (Kan. 1982).	116
B. Effects of <i>Baby Boy L</i> Case	117
C. <i>In re Bridget R.</i> , 49 Cal. Rptr. 2d. 507, 536 (Ct. App. 1996).	118
D. <i>In re Santos Y</i> , 112 Cal. Rptr. 2d 692, 699 (Cal. 2d Dist. App. 2001).	119
IV. Current Applicability of ICWA	120
A. Proposed Amendments	120
B. <i>In re A.J.S.</i> , 204 P.2d 543, 549 (Kan. 2009).	120
C. Other Recent Cases	121

V. Cultural Identity Is Worth Preserving	122
Checkpoints	123
<b>Chapter 9 · Step-Parent and Second Parent Adoption</b>	125
Roadmap	125
I. Step-Parent Adoption	125
A. Definition and History	125
B. The Legal Issues of Step-Parenthood	126
C. Step-Parent Visitation Rights	127
D. Step-Parent Adoption—Requirements	127
E. Step-Parent Adoption—Procedure	127
F. Step-Parent Adoption—Inheritance Rights	129
1. <i>Crumpton v. Mitchell</i> , 303 N.C. 657 (1981).	129
2. <i>Sefcik v. Mouyos</i> , 171 Ohio App. 3d 14 (2007).	129
3. “Gifts” Allowed	130
II. Second Parent Adoption	130
A. Definition of Second Parent Adoption	130
B. Where Is Second Parent Adoption Recognized?	130
C. Cases	131
1. <i>Adoption of Tammy</i> , 416 Mass. 205 (1993).	131
2. <i>In re Jacob</i> , 660 N.E.2d 937 (1995).	131
3. <i>In re Adoption of Luke</i> , 263 Neb. 365, 366 (Neb. 2002).	132
4. <i>In re Adoption of T.K.J.</i> , 931 P.2d 488 (Colo. Ct. App. 1996).	132
5. <i>Russell v. Bridgens</i> , 647 N.W. 2d 56 (2002).	132
6. <i>Boseman v. Jarrell</i> , 364 N.C. 537 (2010).	133
7. <i>In the Matter of Adoption of Doe</i> , 156 Idaho 345 (S.C. Idaho 2014).	134
Checkpoints	134
<b>Chapter 10 · Kinship Care and Adoption</b>	137
Roadmap	137
I. Kinship Care Defined	137
II. History and Background	139
III. Requirements to Become a Kinship Foster Caregiver	142
IV. The Statutory Framework and Case Law	143
V. Current Trends in Kinship Care	148
VI. Interim and Alternative Programs	150
VII. Kinship Adoption	150

---

Checkpoints	152
<b>Chapter 11 · Safe Haven Laws</b>	153
Roadmap	153
I. History of Safe Haven Laws	153
II. The Purpose of Safe Haven Laws	154
III. Arguments for Safe Haven Laws	155
A. Safe Haven Laws Protect and Save Lives of Unwanted Newborns	155
B. Safe Haven Laws Prevent Crimes from Happening	156
C. Safe Haven Laws Create More Adoptable Infants	156
IV. Arguments Against Safe Haven Laws	157
A. Safe Haven Laws Are Ineffective and Encourage Birth Parents to Abandon their Newborns	157
B. Safe Haven Babies Are Deprived of Their Right to Family Medical History	157
C. What about the Birth Father?	158
D. Safe Haven Laws Are Unnecessary	158
E. Legal Implications—No Valid Consent	159
Checkpoints	160
<b>Chapter 12 · Snowflake Adoption</b>	161
Roadmap	161
I. What Is Embryo, a.k.a. “Snowflake,” Adoption?	161
A. Process of in vitro Fertilization	161
B. Unutilized Embryos	162
C. Snowflake/Embryo Adoption	162
1. Nightlight Christian Adoptions	162
2. The Process	163
3. Federal Regulations and Federal and State Funding	164
D. Advantages of Snowflake Adoptions	165
E. Disadvantages of Snowflake Adoptions	165
II. Legal Ramifications of Snowflake Adoptions	166
A. Early Cases	166
1. Disputes between Clinics and Genetic Couples—Misuse of Embryos	166
2. Genetic Couples Divorcing—What Happens to the Embryos	166
B. Legal Status of Embryos	167
1. As Human Beings	167

2. As Property	168
3. As a Hybrid—More than a Property Interest, but Not a Human Being	168
Checkpoints	169
<b>Chapter 13 · Wrongful Adoption Tort</b>	171
Roadmap	171
I. History	171
II. Causes of Action	172
A. Fraud: Intentional Misrepresentation	172
B. Deliberate Concealment/Intentional Non-Disclosure	174
C. Negligent Misrepresentation	175
D. Negligent Non-Disclosure	176
E. Other Causes of Action: Negligent Failure to Investigate, Negative Placement, and Breach of Contract	177
III. Constitutional Claims	178
IV. Damages	178
V. Defenses	179
A. Statute of Limitations	179
B. Confidentiality Statutes	179
Checkpoints	180
<b>Chapter 14 · Adoption Reforms</b>	181
Roadmap	181
I. Uniform Adoption Act of 1994	181
A. Direct Placement Adoptions	181
B. Consent	182
C. Birth Fathers' Rights	182
D. Confidentiality and Birth Records	183
II. Adoption and Safe Families Act of 1997 (Pub. L. 105-89)	183
A. Permanent Placement	184
B. "Reasonable Efforts"	184
C. State Compliance with ASFA	184
D. Prospective Foster or Adoptive Parents	185
III. Foster Care Independence Act of 1999	185
IV. Child Abuse Prevention and Enforcement Act of 2000	186
V. Promoting Safe and Stable Families Amendments of 2001	186
VI. Keeping Children and Families Safe Act of 2003	187
VII. Adoption Promotion Act of 2003	187



VIII.	Fair Access Foster Care Act of 2005	187
IX.	Deficit Reduction Act of 2005	188
X.	Safe and Timely Interstate Placement of Foster Children Act of 2006	188
XI.	Adam Walsh Child Protection and Safety Act of 2006	188
XII.	Child and Family Services Improvement Act of 2006	189
XIII.	Tax Relief and Health Care Act of 2006	189
XIV.	Fostering Connections to Success and Increasing Adoptions Act of 2008	189
XV.	Protecting Incentives for the Adoption of Children with Special Needs Act of 2009	190
XVI.	Child Abuse Prevention and Treatment Reauthorization Act of 2010	190
XVII.	Preventing Sex Trafficking and Strengthening Families Act of 2014	190
XVIII.	Proposed Bills	191
	Checkpoints	192
<b>Chapter 15 · 2007 National Survey of Adoptive Parents (NSAP): Domestic Transracial Adoption</b>		193
	Roadmap	193
I.	2007: Background	194
	A. Three Ways to Adopt in the United States	195
	1. Foster Care Adoption	195
	2. Private Adoption	195
	3. International Adoption	195
	B. Race of Adoptee by Adoption Type	195
	C. NSAP: Transracial Adoptions	196
	D. 2007 NSAP: Gender	196
	E. Household Composition	196
	F. 2007 NSAP: Birth Family Contact	197
	G. 2007 NSAP: Demographics	197
	H. 2007 NSAP: Health Status	198
	I. NSAP: School Performance	199
	J. NSAP: Parental Aggravation	199
	K. NSAP: Connection to Adoption	199
II.	DeBose-Adkison Study: Overview	199
	A. DEB-ADK Study: Subjects	200
	B. DEB-ADK Study: Demographics	200

C. DEB-ADK Study: Post-Adoptive Training	200
1. Research Question 1	200
D. DEB-ADK Study: Support Groups	201
1. Research Question 2	201
Checkpoints	201
<b>Mastering Adoption Law and Policy Master Checklist</b>	<b>203</b>
<b>Appendix A · 50 State Comparison &amp; National Survey of State Laws</b>	<b>207</b>
<b>Appendix B · Synopsis of Major Federal Legislation (04/12)</b>	<b>239</b>
<b>Appendix C · Uniform Adoption Act (1994)</b>	<b>265</b>
<b>Appendix D · Florida Adoption Statute (2014)</b>	<b>331</b>
<b>Appendix E · Avoiding Adoption Scams</b>	<b>383</b>
<b>Appendix F · Selected Bibliography</b>	<b>391</b>
Constitution	391
Statutes	391
Case Law	391
Books	393
Articles	394
Websites	399
<b>Index</b>	<b>403</b>

# Series Editor's Foreword

The Carolina Academic Press Mastering Series is designed to provide you with a tool that will enable you to easily and efficiently “master” the substance and content of law school courses. Throughout the series, the focus is on quality writing that makes legal concepts understandable. As a result, the series is designed to be easy to read and is not unduly cluttered with footnotes or cites to secondary sources.

In order to facilitate student mastery of topics, the Mastering Series includes a number of pedagogical features designed to improve learning and retention. At the beginning of each chapter, you will find a “Roadmap” that tells you about the chapter and provides you with a sense of the material that you will cover. A “Checkpoint” at the end of each chapter encourages you to stop and review the key concepts, reiterating what you have learned. Throughout the book, key terms are explained and emphasized. Finally, a “Master Checklist” at the end of each book reinforces what you have learned and helps you identify any areas that need review or further study.

We hope that you will enjoy studying with, and learning from, the Mastering Series.

Russell L. Weaver  
Professor of Law & Distinguished University Scholar  
University of Louisville, Louis D. Brandeis School of Law

