International Legal Research in a Global Community
Carolina Academic Press
International Legal Research Series
Mark E. Wojcik, Series Editor

Anthony S. Winer, Mary Ann E. Archer, & Lyonette Louis-Jacques
International Law Legal Research

Paul Kossof
Chinese Legal Research

Heidi Frotestad Kuehl & Megan A. O’Brien
International Legal Research in a Global Community
International Legal Research in a Global Community

Heidi Frotestad Kuehl
Law Library Director and Associate Professor of Law
Northern Illinois University College of Law

Megan A. O’Brien
Foreign, Comparative, and International Law Librarian
Adjunct Professor of Law
Marquette University Law School

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
Contents

Series Note xiii
Preface xv

Chapter 1 • Public International Legal Research 3
I. Introduction and Foundation Principles 3
II. Definition of Public International Law 5
III. Legal Personality: States, International Organizations, and Individuals 6
IV. Sources of Public International Law 9
   A. Article 38 of the Statute of the International Court of Justice 10
   B. Jus Cogens 11
   C. U.N. General Assembly Resolutions Passed Unanimously or Near Unanimously 12
   D. Soft Law 12
V. Conclusion 14

Chapter 2 • Treaty Research and Treaty Implementation 15
I. Introduction 15
   A. International Agreements 16
   B. Between States 16
   C. In Written Form 17
   D. Governed by International Law 18
II. Collections of Treaties 19
   A. General Treaty Collections 19
   B. Historical Treaty Collections 20
   C. National Treaty Collections 22
   D. Regional Treaty Collections 23
   E. Subject Treaty Collections 24
   F. Combination Treaty Collections 25
III. Treaty Research Process 25
   A. Find an Authoritative Text 25
      i. Find Authoritative Texts and Subsequent and
         Related Treaty Actions 27
      ii. Use Comprehensive Treaty Indexes to Find
         Authoritative Texts 29
   B. Identify the Depositary 30
   C. Check the Status of the Treaty 31
      i. Identify Signatories and Parties to the Treaty 32
      ii. Determine Entry into Force Date 34
      iii. Find and Read the Reservations, Understandings
           and Declarations (RUDs) 35

IV. U.S. Treaty Implementation 37
   A. Sources for U.S. Treaty Implementation 41
   B. Treaty Implementation Research Process through
      Selected Examples 42
      i. Chemical Weapons Convention 42
      ii. Paris Act Relating to the Berne Convention for the
          Protection of Literary and Artistic Property 44
      iii. Kyoto Protocol to the United Nations Framework
           Convention on Climate Change 47

V. Conclusion 49

Chapter 3 • The Use of Travaux Préparatoires for International
Legalesearch 51
I. Introduction 51
II. U.S. Treaty Interpretation at the Federal Level & Legislative
    History Research 53
III. U.S. Treaty Interpretation at the Federal Level & Use of
     Travaux Préparatoires 54
IV. The Legal Research Process 56
V. Conclusion 59

Chapter 4 • Customary International Law 61
I. Introduction 61
II. Definition of Customary International Law 62
III. General State Practice 64
IV. Accepted as Law 66
V. Actions in Contravention of Customary International Law 68
VI. Jus Cogens 69
VII. Sources & Legal Research Process for Customary International Law 70
   A. Subsidiary Means for the Determination of an Existing Rule of Customary International Law 70
      i. Research to Find Judicial Decisions to Show Evidence of Existing Customary International Law 71
      ii. Research to Find the Teachings of the Most Highly Qualified Publicists to Show Evidence of Existing Customary International Law 72
      iii. Research to Find Codification Treaties to Show Evidence of Existing Customary International Law 73
   B. Updating Subsidiary Sources of Customary International Law 75
   C. Finding Evidence of Rules of Customary International Law That Have Yet to Be Identified or Are New Rules 75
      i. Treaties and Other Diplomatic Acts and Correspondence to Show State Practice and Opinio Juris 77
      ii. National Legislation 78
      iii. National Decisions and State Filings in International Tribunals 80
      iv. Conduct in Connection with Resolutions Adopted by an International Organization or at an Intergovernmental Conference 81
      v. Employing a Subject Matter Approach 83
   VIII. Conclusion 83

Chapter 5 • General Principles Accepted as Law 85
   I. Background 85
   II. Research Process 88
   III. Conclusion 92

Chapter 6 • Teachings of Highly Qualified Publicists as Subsidiary Sources 93
   I. Introduction 93
   II. Sources for Teachings of Highly Qualified Publicists 96
      A. Restatements of the Law 96
      B. International Law Association Materials 97
      C. Institut de Droit International Materials 98
      D. International Law Commission Materials 98
      E. Law Reviews 99
CONTENTS

i. Sources for Law Reviews 100
ii. Searching for Law Review Articles Full Text 100
iii. Searching for Law Review Articles Using an Index 101
iv. Updating Law Review Articles 102
F. Legal Treatises 102
i. Finding Legal Treatises 103
ii. Updating Legal Treatises 103
G. Finding Law Reviews and Treatises (Writings of Highly Qualified Publicists) in a Foreign Jurisdiction 103

III. Conclusion 104

Chapter 7 • World Judicial Decisions 107
I. Introduction 107
II. Growth in the Number of International Courts and Tribunals 107
III. Weight of Authority of Judicial Decisions & The Doctrine of Stare Decisis 110
IV. Compulsory Jurisdiction and Enforcement of Judgments 111
VI. Selected Examples of Resources for World Judicial Decisions 114
A. International Court of Justice and Permanent Court of International Justice 114
B. International Criminal Court 115
C. International Criminal Tribunal for Yugoslavia / International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda 117
D. European Court of Justice and European Court of Human Rights 118
E. Specialty International Tribunals 119
F. Regional Courts — Africa/Americas/Asia 120
VII. Conclusion 121
Appendix — Chart of International Judicial Decisions 122

Chapter 8 • Secondary Sources 125
I. Introduction 125
II. Types of Secondary Sources 126
A. Dictionaries 126
B. Legal Encyclopedias 128
C. Words and Phrases 130
D. American Law Reports 131
E. Bar Journals 131
F. Practice Materials 132
G. Legal Blogs 132
H. Newspapers 133
I. Secondary Sources often used for Customary International Law Research: Commentaries, Government Gazettes, Yearbooks, Restatements, Law Reviews and Legal Treatises 133

III. General Research Strategy for Secondary Sources 134

IV. Conclusion 135

Chapter 9 • Use of Finding Aids, Arrangement of the Law, and Search Techniques 137

I. Introduction 137
II. Retrieval of a Source with a Known Citation 138
III. Search Using Finding Aids 140
   A. Spine of Book 140
   B. Indexes 141
      i. Back of Book Index 141
      ii. Bibliographic Index 142
   C. Specialty Indexes 143
   D. Table of Contents 144
   E. List of Acronyms 144
   F. Table of Authorities 144
   G. Table of Cases 145
   H. Conversion Tables and Translation Tables 145
   I. Popular Name Table 146
   J. Catalogs 146
   K. Abstracts 147
IV. Search by Subject and Topic 147
   A. Arrangement of ASIL’s Electronic Information System for International Law 148
   B. Arrangement of the United Nations Multilateral Treaties Deposited with the Secretary General 149
   C. Arrangement of United States Treaties in Force 151
   D. Library of Congress Subject Headings 152
   E. West’s Topic & Key Number Arrangement 153
   F. Digests 154
IV. Natural Language Search and Boolean Search 155
CONTENTS

i. Natural Language Search 155
ii. Boolean Search 156
iii. Multiple Language Synonyms 157
iv. Search by Field in Online Subscription Databases 158
v. Search by Field Online 160
vi. Search by Command 161

V. Comparing Search Approaches and Tools 162
VI. Control Strategies for Various Search Techniques 163
VII. Conclusion 164

Chapter 10 • Planning and Recording Research 165
I. Introduction 165
II. Elements of a Plan 167
A. Time Constraints & Deadlines 167
B. Format of the End Product 167
C. Cost Considerations 168
D. Relevant Facts 168
E. Search Terms 169
F. Assessment of What Is Known 171
G. Preliminary Issue Statements & Jurisdiction Considerations 171
H. Research Guides & Tools to Consult during the Planning Phase 172
i. Research Guides 173
ii. Tools to Identify Legal Traditions 174
iii. Tools to Handle Citations and Abbreviation Decoding Strategies 175
iv. Translation Tools 176
I. Identification of the Titles of the Sources of Law & the Publications or Online Databases That Contain Those Sources of Law 176
J. Updating 177
K. Summary 177

III. Research Logs—Implementing the Plan 178
A. Order for Carrying Out the Research Plan 178
B. Keeping Track of Research in a Log 179
C. Level of Detail Included in Log 180
i. Source Field of the Research Log 180
ii. How Accessed Field of the Research Log 181
iii. Results Field of the Research Log 181
CONTENTS

iv. Notes/Thoughts Field of the Research Log 181
v. Current-Through Field of the Research Log 183

IV. Conclusion 183

Chapter 11 • Cultural Competencies 185
I. Introduction 185
II. Codes of Conduct, Ethical Rules, and Bar Admission Requirements 187
III. Researching and Understanding Selected Legal Systems and Traditions 188
IV. Sources of Law in Common Law Legal Traditions 189
V. Sources of Law in Civil Law Legal Traditions 189
VI. Sources of Law in Religious-Based Legal Systems 191
VII. Sources of Law in Custom-Based Legal Systems 192
VIII. Source of Law in Mixed Legal Traditions or Pluralistic Legal Traditions 192
IX. Resources and Research Process for Selected Jurisdictions 193
   A. Argentinian Law Research 194
      i. Human Rights: Argentina 194
   B. Brazilian Law and Research 196
      i. Human Rights: Brazil 197
   C. Chinese Law and Research 198
      i. Human Rights: China 198
   D. Japanese Law and Research 199
      i. Human Rights: Japan 200
X. Conclusion 201

Index 203
Most lawyers and law students would benefit from a deeper understanding of international law and how to research it. International law is part of the law of the United States and, indeed, every other legal system in the world. Many cases depend upon rules of international law, even when lawyers do not initially realize that a treaty or a rule of customary international law controls their case. Outside of special seminar courses, the legal research and writing courses in most law schools devote little, if any, time to explaining how researchers should find and use international or comparative law. Bar associations, for the most part, offer few continuing legal education courses on how to research and use international or foreign law. Judges and their law clerks often do not have the resources or training to research international and foreign law, confronting international legal issues for the first time in briefs submitted by the parties. Scholars writing law review articles may lack the confidence to research how international or foreign law impact the subjects of their scholarship. And lawyers working in legislatures or administrative agencies may not realize that many problems confronting them have already been dealt with in foreign or international contexts. Although foreign statutes or international resolutions may not dictate a result in another country, it is at least useful to researchers and policymakers to know what other countries and international bodies have done.

This new book, *International Legal Research in a Global Community*, provides both substantive context and practical tips for legal researchers. The authors are Professors Heidi Froestad Kuehl (Associate Professor of Law and Director of the David C. Shapiro Memorial Law Library at Northern Illinois University School of Law, and previously the Associate Director for Research and Reference Services and Foreign, Comparative, and International Law at Northwestern University School of Law’s Pritzker Legal Research Center in Chicago) and Megan A. O’Brien (the Foreign, Comparative, and International Law Librarian and Adjunct Professor of Law at Marquette University School of Law, and a founding member of the International Legal Research Interest Group of the American Society of International Law). These professors have taught international legal research for many years and worked closely with in-
individual researchers on issues of public and private international law. They have helped students competing in the Philip C. Jessup International Law Moot Court Competition and other international law competitions. And they have assisted lawyers whose cases involve some aspect of international law. Readers of this book are thus the direct beneficiaries of years of experience in researching international, foreign, and comparative law.

*International Legal Research in a Global Community* is a welcome addition to the International Legal Research Series published by Carolina Academic Press. Books in this series are intended to help attorneys, students, and policymakers find the source materials they need for specific research issues in international, foreign, and comparative law. This book serves that need by providing researchers with the substantive knowledge and practical tips that will enable them to research treaties, customary international law, and other sources of international law.

Mark E. Wojcik
Professor of Law
The John Marshall Law School—Chicago
Series Editor, International Legal Practice Series
Series Editor, International Legal Research Series
Preface—International Legal Research in a Global Community

We embarked on this project to build on existing international legal research texts. We have both taught international legal research over the years and have found students need a foundation in the law to understand why and how to carry out the research. This book offers that foundation as well as a revised approach to handling some of the sources of international law based on the development of the law as explained in the Restatement of the Law (Fourth) Foreign Relations Law of the United States (tentative drafts)\(^1\) and in the 2016 Annual Report of the International Law Commission.\(^2\) We hope the ideas and strategies offered within will prove useful to law students taking an advanced legal research course in international law, or other seminar courses that require writing a paper on issues related to public international law. As well, we trust that those law students involved with the Philip C. Jessup Moot Court Competition will find this book helpful. In addition, we hope that this book will be useful to lawyers practicing in the United States when confronted with an issue that implicates public international law. We have deliberately offered a U.S.-centric approach and recognize the difficulties of gaining true cultural competency in another jurisdiction.

As with any book that attempts to tackle a topic of this breadth, we struggled with the choice of what to include and what to forego. We decided to follow the structure of Article 38 of the Statute of the International Court of Justice.

---

(ICJ)\(^3\) and have provided a chapter for each of its enumerated sources. These sources include: international conventions, international custom, the general principles of law recognized by civilized nations, and as a subsidiary means judicial decisions and the teachings of the most highly qualified publicists.\(^4\) Although this book is ordered according to the sources listed in Article 38 of the Statute of the ICJ, we acknowledge that this is not always the best order in which to tackle a research project. Often, it is more productive to consult secondary sources at the outset. For this reason, we invite researchers to consult the chapters in the order that is most useful for their particular research project.

Chapter 1 provides an overview of public international legal research. It includes a definition of public international law; and an introduction to the Article 38 sources as well as *jus cogens* norms; the impact of U.N. General Assembly resolutions on the development of international law; and, an introduction to the concept of soft law. Chapter 2 provides in-depth coverage of treaty sources and research strategies for finding them. The U.S. treaty implementation process is explained in detail for the legal researcher. Chapter 2 also includes select research examples to highlight the research strategies in action. These examples illustrate the nuances related to the implementation of public international law at a national level. The third chapter goes further and delves into the difficult concept of researching and locating *travaux préparatoires*. The *travaux* are valuable for resolving any ambiguity in the text of a treaty and also for discerning *opinio juris* when dealing with a customary international law issue.

Chapters 4, 5, and 6 are meant to be read together. Chapter 4 covers customary international law concepts by providing a foundation at a level that is suitable for carrying out legal research. We recognize that there are multivolume sets that provide thorough coverage of customary international law. Admittedly, we have sanded down the rough edges of the substantive law. This was done so that researchers could focus on the legal research strategies. Chapter 4 furthers the existing body of literature on the legal research process because it incorporates strategies consistent with the development of the law articulated by the International Law Commission in its 2016 Annual Report. Chapter 5 covers General Principles of Law and highlights the difference between general principles of law used as a gap filler and general principles of law that serve as overarching principles governing public international law. Chapters 6 and 7 cover the subsidiary sources of law: the writings of highly

---

4. *Id.*
qualified publicists and judicial decisions. The use of subsidiary sources as evidence of the law is generally a research approach that is unfamiliar to the U.S. legal researcher. These chapters work together and offer ways to help the researcher understand the unique manner in which these sources are used.

Chapters 8 through 10 comprehensively cover secondary sources, search strategies, and essential research planning. These chapters might easily be consulted first for those approaching an international legal research project for the first time.

Finally, we included a chapter on cultural competencies to help the legal researcher truly appreciate the challenges faced when tackling public international legal research projects. Chapter 11 might well have appeared at the front of the book as it is necessary for researchers to acknowledge the need to continually evolve their understanding of other cultures, or remain at a disadvantage. Placing it last was a way for us to bookend our effort to stress to the U.S. legal researcher the importance of situating oneself in the international community. By closing our book with a chapter that underscores that we live and work in a global community, we hope to encourage researchers to remain humble and appreciate the challenges of researching and working in worldwide legal systems.

Readers will find that we have included many research tips, strategies, charts, and checklists throughout the chapters. These are meant to help by providing a useful means for remembering complex concepts and sophisticated research strategies. Although international legal research may initially be overwhelming to researchers, we have attempted to distill the main international legal principles and the accompanying strategies for handling the sources of law into manageable portions.

We would like to thank our families, friends, and colleagues who have had great patience and provided support throughout the duration of this project. We would like to also thank the great international legal scholars in the U.S. and abroad who tremendously informed our work. Most especially, we would like to thank Mary Rumsey and Marci Hoffman, whose work and friendship have served as inspiration for this book. We would also like to thank Susan Goard, law librarian at the United Nations, who arranged for us to visit the Dag Hammarskjold Library and attend various training sessions. Special thanks to Susan Trimble at Carolina Academic Press, and Professor Mark Wojcik, of John Marshall Law School, the series editor for Carolina Academic Press’ International Legal Research Series. Your support and attention to detail have been invaluable.

We would like to thank the David C. Shapiro Memorial Law Librarians and staff (especially Therese A. Clarke Arado who assumed additional duties while
Heidi was writing this book and Cheryl Korth who provided proofreading assistance), colleagues on the faculty and in the extremely supportive administration at the Northern Illinois University (NIU) College of Law (especially former Dean Jennifer Rosato Perea, Current Interim Dean Mark Cordes, Associate Dean Marc Falkoff, Tita Kaus, and members of the NIU College of Law writing group who reviewed numerous drafts of this project—namely, Professors Laurel A. Rigertas, Dan S. McConkie, Jr., and Jeff A. Parness). Thanks also to research assistant, Zachary Bock, for thorough editing and research assistance. Heidi also wishes to thank the tremendous and wonderfully skilled law librarians at the Pritzker Legal Research Center who taught her so much about foreign and international law collections and how to be a well-rounded law librarian, especially Kathryn Hensiak Amato, Pegeen Bassett, Irene Berkey, Marcia Lehr, Jim McMasters, Maribel Nash, Audrey Chapuis, Eric Parker, Jamie Sommer, and Eloise Vondruska and the many terrific scholars at the Northwestern Pritzker School of Law who encouraged my research over the years.

We would also like to thank the entire faculty at Marquette University Law School, including Dean Kearney; Ryan Scoville, who read an early draft of the customary international law chapter; and Patricia Cervenka, the former Law Library Director of the Ray & Kay Eckstein Law Library. To the teaching librarians at Marquette Law School—Kathryn Amato, Leslie Behroozi, Deborah Darin, and Elana Olson—Megan wishes to say, my teaching, writing, and thinking is influenced and improved by our collective efforts. Thank you! Sincere thanks to the Marquette library staff whose patience and support were much appreciated. Thank you to law students, Paul A. Miller, for research support on Chapter 4 and Elisabeth Lambert for providing a valuable reader response. Library colleagues who provided helpful editorial support include Martin Kluge, Kayla Kasprzak, Leslie Behroozi, and Deborah Darin. Many thanks to you all.

We could not have completed this undertaking without the loving support and guidance of our families. We would like to thank the family of Heidi Frostestad Kuehl, especially her husband, Robert, and daughter, Grace. Thanks also to her loving parents, Eulyn and Franklin, brothers and family, Eric and Kathy, David and Emily, and supportive mother-in-law and father-in-law, Linda and John, and her uncle Ronald—who recently passed away prior to the publishing of this text but engaged in numerous conversations about the book.

We would also like to thank the family of Megan A. O’Brien, especially her husband, Mike, and her children, Michael Jr., Margaret, John, and Grace. We are grateful to the entire Kendall and O’Brien clans: Walter and Jacquelyn, Jude
and Anne, Christopher and Jennifer, Sarah and Craig, Thomas and Sharon, Jeff and Elaine, Tim and Ann, and Jimmy and Jackie. Special thanks to Megan’s father and brother, Walter J. Kendall, III and Christopher C. Kendall, both lawyers, who provided valuable feedback on early drafts of this book. Heartfelt thanks to Sarah Kendall Hughes for unending support, as only a sister can provide.

Heidi Frotestad Kuehl, DeKalb, IL
Megan A. O’Brien, Milwaukee, WI