Dostoevsky and the Law
Dostoevsky and the Law

Amy D. Ronner
Dedicated to my husband, Michael P. Pacin, M.D., who, like Dostoevsky’s Elder Zosima, embodies the “experience of active love.”

All author royalties from the sale of this book are donated to the Professor Dr. Amy D. Ronner & Dr. Michael P. Pacin Therapeutic Jurisprudence Award, a scholarship for students enrolled in the Intercultural Human Rights Program at St. Thomas University School of Law.
Contents

Author’s Note ix
Acknowledgments xi

Chapter One · Inexpressible Ideas: A Multifaceted Life and Legal Lens 3
  I. Introduction 3
  II. The Life 6
  III. Critical Perspectives 34
  IV. The Legal Lens 44
  V. The Organization of The Book 55

Chapter Two · The Impenetrable Mental Capacity Doctrine:
  *The Double* 57
  I. Introduction 57
  II. Testamentary Freedom and the Mental Capacity Doctrine 62
    A. Lack of General Mental Capacity 65
    B. Insane Delusion 67
      1. The Bizarre 70
      2. The Non-Bizarre 73
  III. Dostoevsky’s *The Double* Debunks Our Mental Capacity and Insane Delusion Doctrines 86
    A. The Putative Story 86
    B. The Critics 90
    C. Indeterminate Reality 97
      1. Pre-Double 97
      2. Meeting the Double 103
      3. Post-Double 106
    D. Does the Double Truly Exist? 112
  IV. Conclusion: Golyadkin’s Human “Shriek” 118

Chapter Three · The Confessant Gene: *Crime and Punishment*
  and *The Brothers Karamazov* 123
  I. Introduction 123
  II. Confession Jurisprudence 126
CONTENTS

Chapter Four · Prisons of Coercion: Notes from The House of the Dead

I. Introduction

II. Dead House: Stripped of Free Will and Human Dignity

A. No Free Will

B. No Human Dignity

III. The Rise and Fall of Free Will and Human Dignity Under the Due Process Clause and Miranda

A. Due Process Before Miranda

1. Free Will and Human Dignity

2. The Denigration of Free Will and Human Dignity

B. Miranda Protection

1. Free Will and Human Dignity

2. The Denigration of Free Will and Human Dignity

IV. The Ouster Of Miranda From The Prison

A. Miranda Once Applied

B. Inmates Don’t Always Get Miranda

C. Inmates Never Get Miranda

V. The Recreation of Dead House

A. No Free Will

B. No Human Dignity

VI. Conclusion: Why Care?

Chapter Five · Conclusion: Stushevatsia and Other Expressed Ideas

Index
Author’s Note

Because Fyodor Dostoevsky’s works have been translated from Russian to English, his name and his characters’ names are spelled differently among the various translations. This Book refers to the author as “Dostoevsky,” however, other acceptable spellings include “Dostoevskij” and “Dostoyevsky.” These alternates are displayed in other sources referenced in this book. All variations refer to the same author. For consistency sake, this book has adopted most of the spellings contained in Joseph Frank’s five-volume biography of Dostoevsky: *Dostoevsky: The Seeds of Revolt*, 1821–1849 (Princeton University Press, 1979); *Dostoevsky: The Years of Ordeal*, 1850–1859 (Princeton University Press, 1983); *Dostoevsky: The Stir of Liberation*, 1860–1865 (Princeton University Press, 1986); *Dostoevsky: The Miraculous Years*, 1865–1871 (Princeton University Press, 1995); and *Dostoevsky: The Mantle of the Prophet*, 1871–1881 (Princeton University Press, 2002).
Acknowledgments

Because so many friends, colleagues, administrators, and scholars have helped me in numerous ways, there are too many wonderful people to thank. Nevertheless, I will consider this a start.

First, I cannot emphasize enough that this book would not have seen the light of day without the influence of my father, Walter Valentine Ronner, who, born in Mogilev in what is today Belarus, introduced me to Russian classics at an early age. Special appreciation goes out to my friend and mentor, Dr. Deborah A. Martinsen, past President of the International Dostoevsky Society (2007–2013) and Adjunct Associate Professor of Russian Literature at Columbia University, who has generously granted me access to her universe of Dostoevsky studies and, many times, has dropped whatever she is doing to respond to my cry for “help.” I extend another giant thank you to Professor James E. Robertson, the Editor-in-Chief of The Criminal Law Bulletin, Distinguished Faculty Scholar and Professor of Corrections, who has given me multiple gifts—friendship, support, and encouragement. I also extend a long-overdue thank you to Dr. Alan D. Perlis, my favorite undergraduate literature professor: he launched my Ph.D. studies, my first career as a literature professor, and forged the foundation for the teaching and interdisciplinary scholarship that I enjoy today.

I would like to recognize the late Professor Bruce J. Winick, along with Professors Michael L. Perlin, David Wexler, and David Yamata for helping me refine my scholarship over the years and for incorporating my work into their valuable courses. Law Professor Robert H. Sitkoff also deserves appreciation for acknowledging my perspective on Dostoevsky’s Golyadkin and welcoming my input into his latest edition of Wills, Trusts, and Estates. I am also grateful to Lawrence C. Levine, who, from my first year law teaching, has been a lifeline and promoter. A special thank you goes out to my dear friend and colleague, Dr. Roza Pati, whose labor of love, the Intercultural Human Rights Program, makes us all better people.

In addition to Dr. Martinsen, there is also a coterie of brilliant Russian literature scholars, including the late Robert Lamont Belknap, Paul J. Contino, Irina Reyfman, Tatyana Smoliarova, William Mills Todd III, and Nancy Workman, who were willing to include a law professor in the mix and encouraged
my endeavor to connect Dostoevsky's works with contemporary legal doctrines, policies, and procedures. I also thank Robin Feuer Miller, whose brilliant scholarship guided me through my many readings of multiple translations of *The Brothers Karamazov*.

I cannot emphasize enough how much this book depended on the support of other friends, family, and colleagues, including Rev. Msgr. Andrew Anderson, Rory Bahadur, Brett Barfield, Gordon Butler, John Campbell, Anna Chan, Gregory Chan, Renee Crawford, Meg Daniel, Steven and Susan Eisenberg, Lourdes Fernandez, Art Furia, Lauren Gilbert, Carson Gilmon, Marc-Tizoc Gonzalez, Alice Hector, John Hernandez, Lex Israel, John Min Kang, Gloria Kaplan, Peter T. Kelly, Jay, Justin, and Joanne Koren, Gary Kravitz, Ana Landa, Lenora Ledwon, Olga Leyva, Michael and Diane Liberman, Evelina Libhen, Beatriz A. Llorente, June Mary Makdisi, John Makdisi, Stanley Marcus, Jennifer Martin, Robert Mensel, Patricia Moore, Marcia Narine, Ira Nathenson, Amar Patel, Leonard Perny, Stephen Plass, Keith Rizzardi, Mily Rodriguez-Powell, Mahalia Pugatch, Elizabeth Schwartz, Jay Silver, Barbara Singer, Nadia Soree, Todd Sullivan, Michael Vantine, Susan Weiner, Siegfried Weissner, Mark Wolff, Robert Wolfson, Carol Zeiner, and Marc, Allison, and Landon Pacin. All of these beautiful souls, along with others (too many to enumerate), have helped propel me through a long arduous journey to completion. Also, very dear to my heart are Mitchell Kaplan and Cristina Noste of Books & Books, the very people who make life in Miami worthwhile.

Further, I am indebted to *Capital University Law Review* and *Mercer University Law Review* for publishing my articles, which I revised, expanded, and incorporated into Chapters II and III of this book. I also thank Thompson Reuters for granting me permission to incorporate into Chapter IV a revised and expanded version of my article, "Recreating Dead House: The Ouster of *Miranda* From Our Prisons," which was first published in 50 *Criminal Law Bulletin* 1 (2014).

Of course, I am deeply indebted to my talented Research Assistant, Glenys Domingo, who treated this Book as her own project, made it a top priority, and meticulously put it through a professional edit. I am also grateful to past Research Assistants, A. Starkey De Soto and Agnieszka N. Kwapisz, both of whom went beyond the call of duty to help me think, research, write, and edit. I give credit to our Law Librarian, Roy Balleste, who, like mythic Atlas, has the whole world on his shoulders and never stumbles. Specifically, Courtney Segota, our Reference and Faculty Services Librarian at my law school, deserves an accolade: she hunted down mounds of difficult-to-find interdisciplinary materials.
for this book, organized them, and then, as her grand finale, competently edited the entire manuscript.

No acknowledgement would ever be complete without highlighting my University President, Rev. Msgr. Franklyn Casale, who has brought St. Thomas University to new heights and consistently empowered faculty and students alike by promoting scholarship, free speech, and academic freedom. I also thank my Dean, Alfredo Garcia, and Associate Dean, Cece Dykas, for doing everything possible to assist faculty and foster scholarship. In addition, I thank my Faculty Assistant, the herculean Mariela Torres, who has been my right arm for more than two decades, along with two treasured relative newcomers, Karla Garcia and Marc Alcero who rescue me on a daily basis.

One of Dostoevsky’s predominant themes is our moral responsibility to others. I am so lucky to have found a publisher—Carolina Academic Press—that actually lives by that credo and consequently, is adored by scholars and readers all over the world: I thank Keith Sipe, Linda Lacy, Scott Sipe, Tim Colton, Ryland Bowman, Beth Hall, Jefferson Moors, Roberta O’Meara, Tasha Pippin, and Charlsey Rutan—the all-star CAP team—for helping me and others self-actualize. How can there be a greater gift?

Last, but definitely not least, I once again thank my awesome husband, Michael P. Pacin, M.D., for his unconditional love and super-human patience.