

# Poverty Law and Advocacy in America



# Poverty Law and Advocacy in America

---

## *Readings and Materials*

**Steven M. Virgil**

CLINICAL PROFESSOR OF LAW  
WAKE FOREST UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

**Sherri Lawson Clark**

ASSISTANT PROFESSOR  
DEPARTMENT OF ANTHROPOLOGY  
WAKE FOREST UNIVERSITY



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2021  
Carolina Academic Press, LLC  
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 978-1-61163-560-7  
eISBN 978-1-5310-1161-1  
LCCN 2020945384

Carolina Academic Press  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

# Contents

---

Table of Cases	xi
Acknowledgments	xiii
 <b>Part One · Poverty Law and Advocacy in America</b>	
Introduction	3
Poverty in America	3
Defining Poverty	4
Poverty in the United States by the Numbers	5
Welfare Programs in the United States	6
The Alternatives	8
The Structure of This Book	8
<b>Chapter One · What Is Poverty?</b>	11
A. Poverty by the Numbers in the United States	11
B. Defining Poverty	12
1. Introduction	13
2. The Need to Define Poverty	15
a. Categories of Definitions	16
i. The Monetary Approach	16
ii. The Comparative Approach	17
iii. The Capability Approach	18
iv. The Participatory Approach	19
v. The Subjective Approach	20
b. Measuring Poverty in the United States: The Federal Poverty Measure and Federal Poverty Line	20
i. The Federal Poverty Threshold and Federal Poverty Guidelines	21
ii. Criticisms of the Official Poverty Measure	26
iii. The Supplemental Poverty Measure	28
iv. The Measure of Basic Needs and the Goal of Economic Self-Sufficiency	29
v. The Basic Income Approach and the Family Economic Self-Sufficiency Standard	29
<b>Chapter Two · Spatial Dimensions of Poverty</b>	33
A. Place Matters	33
B. The Experiences of Poverty	34

C. The Spaces of Poverty in the United States	39
1. Where Poor People Live	39
2. Urban Poverty	41
a. Urban Renewal	42
<i>Moore v. City of East Cleveland</i>	43
3. Rural Poverty	47
4. Another Way Poor Places Differ: Environmental Justice	50
a. The “Right” to a Clean Environment	52
b. Executive Response	53
c. Applying Existing Laws to Environmental Justice	54
5. Poverty Beyond the United States	58
a. Measuring Global Poverty	59
i. How We Measure It: The Statistics	59
ii. The Framework of Global Poverty	60
b. Comparing Global Poverty to Poverty within the United States	62
<b>Chapter Three · A History of Poverty Policy in the United States</b>	65
A. The Origins and Causes of Poverty	65
1. The Individual Behavior Argument	65
2. The Structural and Systemic Inequalities Argument	66
B. A Brief History of Anti-Poverty Efforts in the United States	68
1. Introduction	68
a. Poverty and Citizenship in the Early United States	69
b. Early Public Poor Relief	70
c. Teaching the Poor to Help Themselves	72
2. 1890s–1920s: Progressive Era	72
3. Early Twentieth Century: The Depression and the Rise of the Welfare State	73
a. The New Deal	73
b. Social Security	74
4. The Mid-Twentieth Century and the War on Poverty	75
5. The Welfare Debate: Poverty Policy Since the 1980s	77
6. Poverty Policy Today — Welfare Reform 2.0	80
<b>Chapter Four · The Anomaly of Poverty Law</b>	83
A. Introduction	83
B. The Supreme Court Carve Out for Social and Economic Legislation	84
<i>Dandridge v. Williams</i>	84
C. Is Deferential Review Adequate?	90
1. Drug Testing the Poor	90
<i>Lebron v. Sec’y, Fla. Dep’t of Children &amp; Families</i>	91
2. Drug Testing the Poor to Qualify for Subsidized Housing	97
<i>Peery v. Chicago Hous. Auth.</i>	97
3. Poverty as Cause when Reducing the Procedural Rights for the Poor in the Landlord-Tenant Relationship	101

<i>Dep't of Housing and Urban Dev. v. Rucker</i>	101
4. Drug Abuse Is Not the Real Barrier to Economic Self-Sufficiency; The Real Barrier Is Social Inequality — Which Is Reinforced by Drug Testing Programs	104
Further Reading and Research	105
<b>Part Two · Anti-Poverty Programs and Interventions</b>	
<b>Chapter Five · Income Assistance</b>	109
A. A History of Cash Welfare Programs	111
1. Aid to Families with Dependent Children	111
2. Welfare “Rights” and the Limits of State Intervention in the Lives of Welfare Beneficiaries	113
<i>Goldberg v. Kelly</i>	113
<i>King v. Smith</i>	119
a. AFDC Reform Efforts Prior to 1996	123
b. The AFDC Waiver Program	125
c. The Earned Income Tax Credit (EITC)	127
B. TANF and Welfare Reform	130
1. The Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996	130
2. TANF Overview — Federal Block Grant	130
3. TANF Funding — State Funding	131
4. TANF as an Entitlement Program	132
5. Eligibility Criteria	133
6. Time Limits	134
7. Work Requirements	135
8. Sanctions	135
C. The Impact of TANF on Welfare Caseloads	136
D. What Do People Owe Each Other?	137
1. Leavers	137
2. Barriers to Economic Self-Sufficiency	141
E. Challenging Welfare Reform and Behavior Modification	141
1. TANF and Family Composition	142
<i>Williams v. Martin</i>	142
2. TANF Benefits and Criminal Behavior	147
<i>United States v. Littlejohn</i>	148
F. TANF, Immigration, and the Right to Travel	150
<i>Saenz v. Roe</i>	152
G. TANF and the Devolution of Poverty Policy	157
<b>Chapter Six · Food</b>	159
A. Hunger and Food Insecurity in the United States	159
1. Food Deserts	160
2. Federal Food Access Programs	161

a. Food Stamps and SNAP	161
b. School Lunch Program	165
c. Effect of NSLP on Food Insecurity	166
B. State Determinations Regarding Access to Food Stamps and SNAP	166
<i>Turner v. Glickman</i>	167
<i>Walton v. Hammons</i>	171
<i>Alvarino v. Wing</i>	176
<b>Chapter Seven • Housing</b>	177
<i>Lindsey v. Normet</i>	177
<i>Village of Belle Terre v. Boraas</i>	180
A. Homelessness Defined	182
1. The Affordable Housing Crisis	183
2. Homelessness and the Criminal Justice System	186
B. Policy Efforts and Early Public Housing	187
1. Housing Acts of 1937 and 1949	187
2. Rent Subsidies and Section 8 Tenant Assistance	192
C. Housing Authorities and Annual Contribution Contracts	195
1. Other Aspects of the ACC	197
2. The Cooperation Agreement	198
D. Public Housing — The Intersection of a Lack of Right and an Economic Policy	199
1. Public Housing: Who Gets It Right and Have We Gotten It Wrong?	201
E. HOPE VI: Homeownership and Opportunity for People Everywhere Program	202
1. Theory Guiding HOPE VI Policy	202
2. Legislative History	204
3. Who Receives HOPE VI Funds?	207
F. The Low-Income Housing Tax Credit — Investor Subsidies for Low-Income Housing Development	209
1. LIHTC Overview	210
2. Section 42 — The Details	211
a. Allocation	211
b. Calculating the Housing Tax Credit	212
c. Project Eligibility	213
d. Rent Restrictions	214
e. Operation Restrictions and Affordability Requirements	214
f. Syndication	214
g. Recapture	216
h. Tenant Protections	216
3. Tax Credit Allocation and Bid Process	217
4. A Critique	218
5. LIHTC Selection Processes and the Fair Housing Act	219



a. <i>Texas Department of Housing &amp; Community Affairs v. Inclusive Communities Project, Inc.</i>	219
i. Case Background and Relation to LIHTC	219
ii. The Supreme Court's Disparate Impact Analysis	220
<i>Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs v. The Inclusive Communities Project, Inc.</i>	222
G. Housing as a Fundamental Right	233
H. Fair Housing and Group Homes	234
<i>City of Edmonds v. Oxford House, Inc.</i>	235
<b>Chapter Eight · Health</b>	241
A. The Health of the Poor	241
B. Medicaid and Medicare	242
1. Eligibility	243
2. Services Provided by Medicaid	243
3. Medicaid's Costs and Funding	244
C. Medicaid and the Affordable Care Act	245
1. Medicaid and Work	245
2. The Affordable Care Act	245
<i>National Federation of Independent Business v. Sebelius</i>	247
D. The Children's Health Insurance Program (CHIP)	265
E. Access to Reproductive Healthcare	266
<b>Chapter Nine · Education</b>	269
A. Education and Social and Economic Mobility	270
B. The Right to a Public Education under the U.S. Constitution	271
<i>San Antonio Independent School District v. Rodriguez</i>	271
<i>Plyler v. Doe</i>	286
C. The Right to a Sound Basic Education under State Constitutions and Funding Public Education	293
<i>Knight v. Alabama</i>	295
<i>Papasan v. Allain</i>	305
<i>Leandro v. State</i>	315
<b>Part Three · Advocacy</b>	
<b>Chapter Ten · The Emergence of a New Property Right and the Rise of Legal Advocacy</b>	329
A. A Right to Welfare	329
1. A New Property Right	329
2. Finding a Right	330
<i>Goldberg v. Kelly</i>	330
<i>Jefferson v. Hackney</i>	336
<i>Mathews v. Eldridge</i>	339
B. Protecting the Individual Right to Benefits	346
<i>Wright v. City of Roanoke Redevelopment and Housing Authority</i>	347

<i>Blessing v. Freestone</i>	351
<i>Alexander v. Sandoval</i>	358
C. Access to Justice and Legal Aid	363
D. Filing Fees and Poverty	364
<i>Boddie v. Connecticut</i>	364
<i>M. L. B. v. S. L. J.</i>	368
E. Appointed Counsel in Civil Proceedings	377
<i>Turner v. Rogers</i>	377
<i>Lassiter v. Department of Social Services</i>	383
<i>In the Interest of T.M.</i>	392
F. Legal Aid Funding and Advocacy	405
<i>Legal Aid Society of Hawaii v. Legal Services Corporation</i>	407
<i>Legal Services Corporation v. Velazquez</i>	415
<b>Chapter Eleven · Access to Justice in the Criminal Justice System</b>	423
A. Mass Incarceration	423
<i>Rhodes v. Chapman</i>	424
B. Police Training	434
<i>Canton v. Harris</i>	434
C. Qualified Immunity	440
<i>Mullenix v. Luna</i>	441
<i>Richardson v. McKnight</i>	448
D. The Right to Appointed Counsel	460
<i>Gideon v. Wainwright</i>	460
<i>United States v. Cronin</i>	465
<i>Hurrell-Harring v. State of New York</i>	467
<i>State ex rel. Mo. Pub. Defender Comm'n v. Waters</i>	471
E. The Bail Bond System	475
<i>Odonnell v. Harris County</i>	475
<b>Chapter Twelve · Community Development</b>	483
A. Linking Community Development to Economic Growth	483
B. Community Development Block Grant Program	484
C. Blight and Gentrification	488
1. Gentrification's Process of Displacement	491
2. Origins and Causes of Gentrification	491
<i>Kelo v. City of New London</i>	492
3. Gentrification Winners and Losers	501
D. The Role of Community Benefit Agreements	502
1. Community Reinvestment Act	503
E. Community Economic Development	505
F. Taxes, Capital, and Banking	507
1. Access to Banking	507
Conclusion	510
Index	511

# Table of Cases

---

- Alexander v. Sandoval, 358  
Alvarino v. Wing, 176
- Blessing v. Freestone, 351  
Boddie v. Connecticut, 364
- Canton v. Harris, 434  
City of Edmonds v. Oxford House, Inc., 235
- Dandridge v. Williams, 84  
Dep't of Housing and Urban Dev. v. Rucker, 101
- Gideon v. Wainwright, 460  
Goldberg v. Kelly, 113  
Goldberg v. Kelly, 330
- Hurrell-Harring v. State of New York, 467
- In the Interest of T.M., 392
- Jefferson v. Hackney, 336
- Kelo v. City of New London, 492  
King v. Smith, 119  
Knight v. Alabama, 295
- Lassiter v. Department of Social Services, 383  
Leandro v. State, 315  
Lebron v. Sec'y, Fla. Dep't of Children & Families, 91
- Legal Aid Society of Hawaii v. Legal Services Corporation, 407  
Legal Services Corporation v. Velazquez, 415  
Lindsey v. Normet, 177
- M. L. B. v. S. L. J., 368  
Mathews v. Eldridge, 339  
Moore v. City of East Cleveland, 43  
Mullenix v. Luna, 441
- National Federation of Independent Business v. Sebelius, 247
- Odonnell v. Harris County, 475
- Papasan v. Allain, 305  
Peery v. Chicago Hous. Auth., 97  
Plyler v. Doe, 286
- Rhodes v. Chapman, 424  
Richardson v. McKnight, 448
- San Antonio Independent School District v. Rodriguez, 271  
Saenz v. Roe, 152  
State ex rel. Mo. Pub. Defender Comm'n v. Waters, 471
- Texas Department of Housing & Community Affairs v. Inclusive Communities Project, Inc., 219, 222  
Turner v. Glickman, 167  
Turner v. Rogers, 377

United States v. Cronic, 465	Walton v. Hammons, 171
United States v. Littlejohn, 148	Williams v. Martin, 142
Village of Belle Terre v. Boraas, 180	Wright v. City of Roanoke Redevelopment and Housing Authority, 347

# Acknowledgments

---

This text grew from my Poverty Law class at Wake Forest University School of Law, where it was first used as a loose set of materials for a class that considers poverty as a part of the structure of how we live together in the United States. The final text has greatly benefited from the contributions of students in this class between 2017 and 2019. Holly Ingraham and Zachary Irvine contributed early drafts of the chapters on Environmental Justice and the Criminal Justice system, respectively. Seth Williford, Emily Scotton, France Beard, Jojo Fina, Jessica Cannon, Hannah McGee, Connor Mitchell, Grayson Lowery and Christina Tabora offered revisions to the text and added their own voice to the work. Finally, Hannah Burgin took on the significant task of reviewing the entire text, running down citations, offering edits and suggesting further needed revisions. The finished product would not be where it is without her work. In total, their contributions and insights as law students critically engaged in questioning poverty and the legal system which maintains it were invaluable. Many thanks.

It has been a pleasure working with Dr. Sherri Clark to fulfill this project, which ended up taking longer than either of us expected. She is a great colleague and true friend.

