Food, Farming, and Sustainability
Food, Farming, and Sustainability

Readings in Agricultural Law

SECOND EDITION

Susan A. Schneider

Professor of Law
University of Arkansas School of Law
Dedicated to my grandparents and my parents, for affording me the opportunity to be raised on a family farm; to my sister and her family for the care that they provide in preserving that farm; to my husband and colleague, Christopher Kelley, for his advice, inspiration and dedication to excellence; and to our students in the LL.M. Program in Agricultural & Food Law, past, present, and future.
# Contents

**Preface**  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Agriculture and Agricultural Law</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. The Agrarian Ideal or the Agrarian Myth?</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anne B. W. Effland, <em>U.S. Farm Policy: The First 200 Years</em></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Agrarianism and the Development of U.S. Agricultural Law</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Industrialization of Agricultural Production</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Large Scale Production of a Specialized Product</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Improved Agricultural Production Through Technology</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Vertical Integration</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Industrialization in Animal Agriculture</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigel Key and William D. McBride, <em>Technology, Larger Farm Size Increased Productivity on U.S. Hog Farms</em></td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Unanticipated Costs</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Sustainability</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gail Feenstra, Chuck Ingels, and David Campbell, with contributions from David Chaney, Melvin R. George, Eric Bradford, the staff and advisory committees of the UC Sustainable Agriculture Research and Education Program, <em>What Is Sustainable Agriculture?</em></td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary V. Gold, <em>Sustainable Agriculture: Definitions and Terms, Background</em></td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. What Is a Family Farm?</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. A Survey of Current U.S. Agricultural Production</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Number of Farms</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Number of Farmers and Farm Demographics</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Agricultural Production</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Type of Product</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Geographic Area</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Size of Farm and Concentration</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Organic Farming</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
II. Economic Support to Agriculture: The Federal Farm Programs, Federal Crop Insurance, and Disaster Assistance 61
A. Federal Farm Programs 62
1. The Statutory Framework: The Farm Bill 63
   Renée Johnson & Jim Monke, What Is the Farm Bill? 65
2. USDA Implementation of the Federal Farm Programs 70
   a. The Farm Service Agency 71
   b. The Commodity Credit Corporation 71
   c. The National Appeals Division 72
   Aageson Grain & Cattle v. USDA 74
3. The Price and Income Support Programs Under the 2014 Farm Bill 79
   Dennis A. Shields, Farm Commodity Provisions in the 2014 Farm Bill (P.L. 113-79) 80
   Notes 86
4. Who Should Receive Farm Program Payments — and How Much Should They Receive? 86
   Dennis A. Shields, Farm Commodity Provisions in the 2014 Farm Bill (P.L. 113-79) 89
   Payment Limitation and Payment Eligibility: Actively Engaged in Farming 93
5. Support for Specialty Crops 95
B. Federal Crop Insurance 97
1. Introduction to Federal Crop Insurance 99
2. The Basic Structure of Federal Crop Insurance 101
3. Types of Federal Crop Insurance Available to Farmers 102
   Dennis A. Shields, Federal Crop Insurance: Background 103
4. Loss Claims and the Payment of Indemnities 105
5. Program Costs 107
C. Disaster Assistance 111
1. The Noninsured Disaster Assistance Program (NAP) 111
   The Noninsured Crop Disaster Assistance Program for 2015 and Subsequent Years, 2014 Farm Bill Fact Sheet 112
2. Ad Hoc Disaster Assistance 117
D. Farm Programs and the Food System 119
III. Agriculture and Environmental Law 125
A. Agriculture’s Environmental Effects 125
   J.B. Ruhl, Farms, Their Environmental Harms, and Environmental Law 126
   Notes 141
B. Exceptions for Agricultural Operations Under Environmental Laws 146
   J.B. Ruhl, Farms, Their Environmental Harms, and Environmental Law 147
   Notes 166
C. Unique Aspects of Environmental Law as Applied to Agriculture 168
1. The Regulation of CAFOs 168
   Summary of the Second Circuit’s Decision in the CAFO Litigation 171
   Notes 175
## CONTENTS

2. USDA Conservation Programs 176  
      Megan Stubbs, *Conservation Compliance and U.S. Farm Policy* 179  
      *U.S. v. Dierckman* 182  
      Notes 191  
   b. Land Retirement Programs 192  
      Notes 193  
   c. Working Land Conservation Programs 196  
      Notes 198  
3. Developing Issues 200  
   a. Air Quality 200  
      Claudia Copeland, *Air Quality Issues and Animal Agriculture: A Primer* 201  
   b. Emerging Issues Related to Pesticide Use 206  
      1. Glyphosate 207  
      2. Neocotinoids and Pollinator Loss 210  
         The Whitehouse Pollinator Health Task Force, *National Strategy to Promote the Health of Honey Bees and Other Pollinators* 210  
      3. Atrazine 213  
   c. Nuisance and Right to Farm Laws 213  

### IV. Financing the Farming Operation 217

A. Distinct Attributes of Farm Finance 217  
   1. The Nature of Farm Production Inputs 217  
   2. The Special Risks Associated with Agricultural Production 221  
   3. The Typical Merger of Personal and Business Assets Associated with Family Farming 222  

B. Overview of Current Farm Finances 224  
   1. The Current Farm Economy 224  
   2. Farm Debt: Meeting the Capital Needs of the Farm 228  
      Notes 229  

C. Federal Credit Assistance Provided to the Agricultural Sector 230  
   1. The Farm Service Agency 231  
      a. The History of the USDA’s Lending Programs 231  
         *Curry v. Block* 233  
         Notes 239  
      b. Farm Service Agency Direct Loans 240  
         United States Code Title 7. Agriculture, Chapter 50 — Agricultural Credit, Subchapter IV — Administrative Provisions 242  
         Notes 249  
      c. Farm Service Agency Guaranteed Loans 249  
         *Fleet Bank of Maine v. Harriman* 256  
         Notes 258  
   2. The Farm Credit System 260  
      a. An Introduction to the Farm Credit System 261  
         Christopher R. Kelley and Barbara J. Hoekstra, *A Guide to Borrower Litigation Against the Farm Credit System and the Rights of Farm Credit System Borrowers* 261
Jim Monke, *Farm Credit System* 262

c. Borrowers’ Rights 268
   *Harper v. Federal Land Bank of Spokane* 269
   Notes 274

D. Agricultural Commercial Law: Secured Transactions Involving Farm Assets 274
   1. Crop Financing: Defining Crop Proceeds 275
      *Kingsley v. First American Bank of Casselton* 276
      *Bank of North Arkansas v. Owens* 280
      *Western Farm Service, Inc. v. Lynn J. Olsen, II* 285
   2. Livestock Sales and Purchase Money Security Interests 292
      *First National Bank in Munday v. Lubbock Feeders* 294
      Notes 299

V. Discrimination in Agricultural Lending 303
   A. History of African American Farmers in the United States 304
      Christopher R. Kelley, *Notes on African American Farmers* 304
   B. USDA Discrimination Against African American Farmers 312
      *Pigford v. Glickman* 313
   C. USDA Discrimination: Native American, Hispanic and Women Farmers 344
      1. Native American Farmers 344
      2. Women and Hispanic Farmers 346
   D. Current USDA Policy and Issues 350
      Lisa Shames, *U.S. Department of Agriculture: Recommendations and Options Available to the New Administration and Congress to Address Long-Standing Civil Rights Issues* 351

VI. Agricultural Labor Law 355
   A. Who Are America’s Farm Workers? 356
      Notes 370
   B. An Overview of Federal Labor and Employment Law 371
      1. The National Labor Relations Act 372
         *Holly Farms Corporation v. National Labor Relations Board* 373
      Notes 385
      Consolidated and Further Continuing Appropriations Act, 2015 385
      Division G — Departments of Labor, Health and Human Services, and Education, and Related Agencies Appropriations Act, 2015 385
   2. The Fair Labor Standards Act 386
      *Castillo v. Givens* 392
      3. The Migrant and Seasonal Agricultural Worker Protection Act 400
         *Charles v. Burton* 405
         *Flores v. Rios* 417
         Notes 427
   C. Additional Issues 428
CONTENTS

1. Child Labor 428
2. Pesticides and Farmworkers 429

GAO, Pesticides: Improvements Needed to Ensure the Safety of Farmworkers and Their Children 430
3. Slavery 431
4. The “Fair Food” Movement 432

VII. Livestock Production & Marketing 435
A. Structural Trends in the Livestock Industry 436

Renee Johnson and Geoffrey S. Becker, Livestock Marketing and Competition Issues 436
B. Introduction to the Packers and Stockyards Act 442

Christopher R. Kelley, An Overview of the Packers and Stockyards Act 442
C. Unfair, Unjustly Discriminatory, or Deceptive Practices Under the Packers and Stockyards Act: The Case Law 464

Picket v. Tyson Fresh Meats, Inc. 465
Benn v. OK Industries, Inc. 479
D. The 2008 Farm Bill Amendments to the Packers & Stockyards Act and the Battle over Regulation 487

Joel L. Greene, USDA’s “GIPSA Rule” on Livestock and Poultry Marketing Practices 490
Notes 494

VIII. Animal Welfare and Farm Animals Raised for Food 497
A. Efforts to Impose Welfare Standards on Livestock Production 500

1. Citizen Initiatives and State Legislation 500

Proposition 2, Proposition–Animals–Prevention of Farm Animal Cruelty Act 501
Notes 504
2. Defining “Humane” by Regulation 505

New Jersey Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals v. New Jersey Department of Agriculture 505

Notes 525
B. Humane Slaughter Standards 527

United States Code, Title 7. Agriculture 528
Chapter 48. Humane Methods of Livestock Slaughter 528
Lisa Shames, Humane Methods of Slaughter Act: Actions Are Needed to Strengthen Enforcement 528
Notes 543

IX. Biotechnology and Agricultural Law 547
A. An Introduction to the Regulation of Agricultural Biotechnology 547

Tadlock Cowan, Agricultural Biotechnology: Background, Regulation, and Policy Issues 547
Rebecca Bratspies, Some Thoughts on the American Approach to Regulating Genetically Modified Organisms 553
Tadlock Cowan, Agricultural Biotechnology: Background, Regulation, and Policy Issues 557
B. The Patenting of Genetically Engineered Seeds

1. Patenting Live, Human-Made Organisms
   
   *Diamond v. Chakrabarty*

   

3. Enforcing Patent Rights in Seed
   
   *Monsanto v. David*
   
   *Bowman v. Monsanto Co.*

4. Consolidation in the Seed Industry

C. Challenge to the Approval Process for New Genetically Engineered Seeds

*Geertson Seed Farms v. Johanns*

X. Food Safety

A. Tracking and Analyzing Foodborne Illness in the United States

B. The Structure of Government Regulation for Food Safety

  Renée Johnson, *The Federal Food Safety System: A Primer*

C. Special Issues Related to Meat and Poultry Safety Regulation

1. Overview of Meat and Poultry Regulation
   
   Geoffrey S. Becker, *Meat and Poultry Inspection: Background and Selected Issues*

2. Limitations to Legal Authority: An Ambivalent View of Pathogens
   
   *Supreme Beef Processors, Inc. v. U.S. Dept. of Agriculture*

3. Antibiotic Use in Livestock Production and Attempts to Regulate

D. Fresh Produce and Food Safety

  *Standards for Growing, Harvesting, Packing, and Holding of Produce for Human Consumption*

XI. Food and Agriculture: A Changing Climate

A. Organic Production

1. Introduction

2. The Regulation of Organic Food

3. Maintaining the Integrity of the Organic Label
   
   *In re Aurora Dairy Corp. Organic Milk Marketing and Sales Practices Litigation*
CONTENTS

William D. McBride and Catherine Greene, Despite Profit Potential, Organic Field Crop Acreage Remains Low 679
Notes 682

B. The Local Food Movement 683
Steve Martinez, Michael Hand, Michelle Da Pra, Susan Pollack, Katherine Ralston, Travis Smith, Stephen Vogel, Shellye Clark, Luanne Lohr, Sarah Low, and Constance Newman, Local Food Systems: Concepts, Impacts, and Issues 683
Notes 709

C. Food for the Future 711
1. Food Security 711
Notes 714
2. The Obesity Epidemic 714
Notes 715
3. Food Deserts 716
Michele Ver Ploeg, Vince Breneman, Tracey Farrigan, Karen Hamrick, David Hopkins, Phil Kaufman, Biing-Hwan Lin, Mark Nord, Travis Smith, Ryan Williams, Kelly Kinnison, Carol Olander, Anita Singh, and Elizabeth Tuckerman, Access to Affordable and Nutritious Food — Measuring and Understanding Food Deserts and Their Consequences 717
Notes 720

D. Climate Change: Food and Agriculture 720
Climate Change and Agriculture in the United States: Effects and Adaptation 721
Notes 731

Index 737
Preface

Agricultural law and policy, once of concern only to agricultural economists, farm commodity group lobbyists, and a handful of congressional aides, is now a topic of everyday discussion. And, to be certain, it is a controversial topic.

After years of claiming responsibility for “feeding the world,” farmers are caught between advice that their operations must be bigger, more efficient, and produce a more uniform product and criticism that they are too big and their practices unsustainable.

Some farm groups vigorously oppose any type of regulation; others clamor for additional regulatory protection.

Everyday news stories contrast the iconic image of the family farm with pictures of sheds that house tens of thousands of animals, manure lagoons, and watersheds threatened with runoff. Animal welfare advocates with secret video cameras film scenes that horrify the public. Food safety recalls seem common.

Our food system — with perhaps the cheapest and most abundant supply of a wide variety of food products in the world — is now linked to obesity and related diseases.

How can U.S. farm policy assure an adequate and healthy food supply in a manner that can be sustained for generations to come?

*Food, Farming, and Sustainability: Readings in Agricultural Law* attempts to make sense of these controversies by providing an issues-based study of some of the complex topics that make up the body of agricultural law. Each is presented in the context of one or more current policy issues. The readings raise difficult questions, provide contrasting information, and leave readers with the task of developing solutions for the future.

Because of the extent and variety of the legal issues involved in agricultural law today, many important issues are not included. These readings provide only a first step in an analysis that affects us all.

From its initial discussion of “agricultural exceptionalism” to its concluding remarks on food and agriculture, the book is written to spark thoughtful dialogue.

Some citations and footnotes have been eliminated from the original source in the editing process. Full source citation is generally provided in the text or note, and links to the sources are provided at the companion website, www.foodfarmingsustainability.com. This website also provides periodic updates and additional resources. The issues discussed are evolving, and new developments are often available.