

# Catholic Legal Perspectives



# Catholic Legal Perspectives

SECOND EDITION

**Bill Piatt**

PROFESSOR OF LAW AND FORMER DEAN  
ST. MARY'S UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2012, 2015  
Bill Piatt  
All Rights Reserved

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Piatt, Bill, author.

Catholic legal perspectives / Robert William Piatt, Jr. -- Second edition.  
pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-61163-664-2 (alk. paper)

1. Religion and law--United States. 2. Catholic Church--United States. 3. Church and social problems--Catholic Church. I. Title.

KF4869.C2P53 2014  
349.73088'282--dc23

2014037523

Carolina Academic Press  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, NC 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

To my grandchildren:  
Fallyn, Max, Rory, William, Julia, Noah, Caroline, and Eva

To my children:  
Seana, Bob, and Alicia

To my mom, Betty  
And to my wife, Chris



# Contents

---

Acknowledgments	xi
<b>Chapter 1 · Introduction to the Sources of Law and Catholic Perspectives</b>	<b>3</b>
A. Our Approach	3
B. For Further Thought	7
<b>Chapter 2 · Family Issues</b>	<b>9</b>
A. Marriage	9
1. Marriage and the Legal System	9
2. The Catholic Church Views Marriage	13
B. Same-Sex Marriage	19
1. State Approaches and the Federal Response	19
2. The Catholic Church Opposes Same-Sex Marriage	23
3. Constitutional Issues	31
a. DOMA declared unconstitutional	31
<i>United States v. Schlain Windsor, et al.</i>	31
b. Full Faith and Credit	39
<i>In the Matter of the Marriage of J.B. and H.B.</i>	40
<i>State v. Naylor</i>	48
c. Equal Protection	52
<i>Loving v. Commonwealth of Virginia</i>	53
<i>Varnum v. Brien</i>	56
4. Children of Same-Sex Couples	63
a. Child Custody Suits	63
b. Gay and Lesbian People as Adoptive Parents	66
(1) Individual Adoptions	66
(2) Second-Parent and Joint Adoptions	67
c. The Catholic Church Opposes Adoptions by Same-Sex Couples	68
C. Divorce, Annulment, and Separation	71
1. The Legal System	71
2. Teachings of the Church Regarding Divorce, Separation, and Annulment	74
3. The Dilemma, and the Solutions, for Catholics Who Face the Breakdown of a Marriage	77

4. The Role of the Catholic Lawyer or Judge in Divorce Proceedings	78
D. For Further Thought	81
<b>Chapter 3 · Life and Death</b>	<b>83</b>
A. Abortion	83
1. Catholic Church Position	84
2. Historical Perspectives	89
3. <i>Roe v. Wade</i>	93
<i>Roe v. Wade</i>	93
4. Upholding Some Abortion Restrictions	106
<i>Casey v. Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania</i>	107
<i>Gonzales v. Carhart</i>	114
5. Judicial Bypass	128
6. Abortion, Demographics, and Race	130
7. Harm to Women	132
B. Stem Cell Research	135
<i>Sherley v. Sebelius</i>	138
C. Miscellaneous Life Issues	146
D. Eugenics and Sterilization	155
<i>Buck v. Bell</i>	158
<i>Skinner v. Oklahoma</i>	160
E. Euthanasia	163
<i>Washington v. Glucksberg</i>	166
<i>Gonzales v. Oregon</i>	174
<i>Bush v. Schiavo</i>	178
F. Death Penalty	185
<i>Gregg v. Georgia</i>	190
G. For Further Thought	207
<b>Chapter 4 · Who Is Allowed to Live and Work in the U.S.A.? Immigration Issues</b>	<b>209</b>
A. The Catholic Church Views on Immigration	209
B. United States Immigration Law and Policy	210
1. Who Are We?	211
2. Extreme Positions: Bill Piatt, <i>Immigration Reform from the Outside In</i>	212
a. Historical Extremes	212
b. Contemporary Extremes	214
(1) Closed border approaches	214
(2) Open border plus amnesty	216
3. Formal Legal Structure	216
a. Citizenship	216
b. Permanent Residents	220
(1) Family Relationships	220
(2) Employment-Based Immigrants	222
(3) Diversity Immigrants	223
(4) Refugees & Asylees	223
c. Non-Immigrant Categories	223
d. Exclusions & Removals	223
C. The American Bishops Respond	224
1. USCCB: Welcoming the Stranger Among Us: Unity in Diversity	224



A Statement of the U.S. Catholic Bishops	224
2. USCCB: Frequently Asked Questions About the Catholic Church's Position on Immigration	227
D. Toward Reform	228
1. USCCB Views Reform	228
2. Bill Piatt: <i>Immigration Reform from the Outside In</i>	231
a. Moving Inward	231
b. Hope for Resolution	233
c. Conclusion	234
3. Voices From the Bishops of the Border Region	234
E. For Further Thought	235
<b>Chapter 5 · Feeding the Hungry, Sheltering the Homeless, Treating the Sick</b>	239
A. Feeding the Hungry	239
B. Housing	242
C. Health Care	243
<i>National Federation of Independent Business v. Sebelius</i>	251
<i>Burwell v. Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc.</i>	271
D. Education	285
<i>Goss v. Lopez</i>	285
<i>Plyler v. Doe</i>	286
<i>Texas v. Certain Named and Unnamed Undocumented Alien Children</i>	286
<i>Zelman v. Simmons-Harris</i>	289
E. Public Assistance	296
<i>Fuentes v. White</i>	297
F. For Further Thought	300
<b>Chapter 6 · Applications</b>	301
A. The Role of Education and Educators	301
1. Law Schools	301
a. Bill Piatt: <i>Catholicism and Constitutional Law: More Than Privacy           in the Penumbra</i>	304
2. Undergraduate Institutions	318
3. Student Involvement	318
<i>Hastings Christian Fellowship v. Martinez</i>	319
B. The Role of Bench and Bar	327
1. Lawyers	327
<i>Town of Greece, New York v. Galloway</i>	331
2. Judges	336
C. The Role of the Church	337
D. Next Steps	339
E. For Further Thought	341
<b>Selected Bibliography</b>	343
Books	343
Articles	343
Reports	346
Statements & Press Releases	348
Roman Catholic Church Publications & Documents	348

Statutes & Acts	352
Cases	353
Blogs & Opinions	354
Websites Generally	354
<b>Index</b>	<b>357</b>

# Acknowledgments

---

I am grateful to my research assistant, Jonathan Torres, and to my secretary, Maria Vega, for their assistance.

The following entities and publications granted permission to reprint portions of previously-published material included in this book. I wish to thank them for the permission, and for their cooperation and assistance:

- Archdiocese of San Antonio, Texas
- The Journal of Catholic Social Thought
- The Scholar: St. Mary's Law Review on Minority Issues
- United States Conference of Catholic Bishops

