

Tribal Justice

Tribal Justice

*Twenty-Five Years as
a Tribal Appellate Justice*

Frank Pommersheim

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH DAKOTA
SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2016
Frank Pommersheim
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Pommersheim, Frank, author.

Tribal justice : twenty-five years as a tribal appellate justice / Frank Pommersheim.
pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-61163-665-9 (alk. paper)

1. Indians of North America--Legal status, laws, etc.--Cases. 2. Indian courts--United States. 3. Pommersheim, Frank. 4. Indian judges--United States--Biography. I. Title.

KIE110.P66 2015

347.73'28--dc23

[B]

2015021366

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, NC 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Dedicated to

All Tribal Judges

*—past, present, and future—
with admiration and respect*

Contents

Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction · From the City to the Prairie; From Outside Law to Inside Jurisprudence	3
A. From New York City to the Rosebud Sioux Reservation	4
B. A Model of Tribal Court Jurisprudence	9
1. Craft	10
2. Culture	11
3. Narrative	11
4. Literacy Primer	12
5. ‘The Extended Hand’	13
6. The Standards of Review	14
C. The Process of Collaboration and Collegiality in Tribal Judicial Decision-Making	16
D. Evolution of a Tribal Judging Philosophy	17
Part I · From Tribal Court to Federal Court	23
A. Background: The Bookends of <i>Montana</i> and <i>National Farmers Union</i>	23
B. The Cases	30
<i>Estate of Tasunke Witko (aka Crazy Horse) v. Heileman Brewery</i>	30
Notes on <i>In the Matter of the Estate of Tasunke Witko (a/k/a Crazy Horse) v. G. Heileman Brewing Co. (1996)</i>	55
<i>Plains Commerce Bank v. Long Family Land and Cattle Company, Inc.</i>	61
Notes on <i>Plains Commerce Bank v. Long Family Land and Cattle Co., Inc. (2004)</i>	77

<i>Doe v. Dollar General Corp., Dolgencorp, Inc., and Dale Townsend</i>	81
Notes on <i>Doe v. Dollar General Corp.</i> (2008)	90
<i>Flandreau Santee Sioux Tribe v. Sioux Falls Construction</i>	92
Notes on <i>Flandreau Santee Sioux Tribe v. Sioux Falls Construction</i> (2011)	101
Part II · From the People to Tribal Court and Back to the People and the Community	105
A. Background: Individual Civil Rights and Rights of Political Participation	105
B. The Cases	110
Enrollment and Disenrollment	110
<i>Snowden v. Saginaw Chippewa Tribe</i>	110
Notes on <i>Snowden v. Saginaw Chippewa Indian Tribe of Michigan</i> (2005)	120
Political Processes—Elections	134
<i>Chamberlain v. Peters</i>	134
Notes on <i>Chamberlain v. Peters</i> (1999)	171
Political Processes—Reapportionment	176
<i>Woods v. Cheyenne River Sioux Tribal Council</i>	176
Notes on <i>Woods v. Cheyenne River Sioux Tribal Council</i> (2012)	185
Political Processes—Referendum	189
<i>In the Matter of Tribal Council Ordinance 14</i>	189
Notes on <i>In the Matter of Tribal Council Ordinance 14</i> (2004)	198
Criminal Law and Criminal Procedure — Ineffective Assistance of Counsel and <i>Miranda</i> Warnings	203
<i>Rosebud Sioux Tribe v. Luxon</i>	203
Notes on <i>Rosebud Sioux Tribe v. Luxon</i> (2009)	211
Criminal Law and Criminal Procedure—The Rights of Juveniles	221
<i>In the Interest of R.K., minor child and concerning, M.K.</i>	221
Notes on <i>In the Interest of R.K., minor child and concerning M.K.</i> (2011)	228
Tradition and Custom	234
<i>In the Matter of the Probate of Tasunke Witko a.k.a. Crazy Horse</i>	234
Notes on <i>In the Probate of the Estate of Tasunke Witko</i> (2007)	237
Due Process—Law and Culture from Both Worlds	245

Conclusion · Accomplishment and the Continuing Challenge of Justice, Tradition, and Respect	251
Table of Cases	255
Index	265

Acknowledgments

This book, whatever its merits, rests on the shoulders of my many judicial colleagues during this past quarter century, as well as the many unacknowledged tribal appellate clerks working in the trenches to prepare and to advance the docket.

Without *all* of you, justice wavers, slips through the cracks, and is put at risk.

The list of individuals is too long to reprint without fear of unintended omissions, but you know who you are!

