

# **New York Legal Research**

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
LEGAL RESEARCH SERIES

Suzanne E. Rowe, Series Editor



- Arizona, Second Edition—Tamara S. Herrera  
Arkansas—Coleen M. Barger  
California, Second Edition—Hether C. Macfarlane, Aimee Dudovitz  
& Suzanne E. Rowe  
Colorado—Robert Michael Linz  
Connecticut—Jessica G. Hynes  
Federal, Second Edition—Mary Garvey Algero, Spencer L. Simons,  
Suzanne E. Rowe, Scott Childs & Sarah E. Ricks  
Florida, Fourth Edition—Barbara J. Busharis, Jennifer LaVia  
& Suzanne E. Rowe  
Georgia—Nancy P. Johnson, Elizabeth G. Adelman & Nancy J. Adams  
Idaho, Second Edition—Tenielle Fordyce-Ruff & Kristina J. Running  
Illinois, Second Edition—Mark E. Wojcik  
Iowa—John D. Edwards, M. Sara Lowe, Karen L. Wallace  
& Melissa H. Weresh  
Kansas—Joseph A. Custer & Christopher L. Steadham  
Kentucky—William A. Hilyerd, Kurt X. Metzmeier & David J. Ensign  
Louisiana, Second Edition—Mary Garvey Algero  
Massachusetts—E. Joan Blum  
Michigan, Second Edition—Pamela Lysaght & Cristina D. Lockwood  
Minnesota—Suzanne Thorpe  
Mississippi—Kristy L. Gilliland  
Missouri, Third Edition—Wanda M. Temm & Julie M. Cheslik  
New York, Third Edition—Elizabeth G. Adelman, Theodora Belniak,  
Courtney L. Selby & Brian T. Detweiler  
North Carolina, Second Edition—Scott Childs & Sara Sampson  
Ohio, Second Edition—Sara Sampson, Katherine L. Hall  
& Carolyn Broering-Jacobs  
Oklahoma—Darin K. Fox, Darla W. Jackson & Courtney L. Selby  
Oregon, Third Edition—Suzanne E. Rowe  
Pennsylvania—Barbara J. Busharis & Bonny L. Tavares  
Tennessee—Sibyl Marshall & Carol McCrehan Parker  
Texas, Revised Printing—Spencer L. Simons  
Washington, Second Edition—Julie Heintz-Cho, Tom Cobb  
& Mary A. Hotchkiss  
West Virginia—Hollie Schwartz Temple  
Wisconsin—Patricia Cervenka & Leslie Behroozi  
Wyoming—Debora A. Person & Tawnya K. Plumb



# New York Legal Research

Third Edition

Elizabeth G. Adelman  
Theodora Belniak  
Courtney L. Selby  
Brian T. Detweiler

Suzanne E. Rowe, Series Editor



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

---

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2015  
Carolina Academic Press  
All Rights Reserved.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Adelman, Elizabeth, author.

New York legal research / Elizabeth G. Adelman, Theodora Belniak, Courtney L. Selby, and Brian Detweiler. -- Third Edition.

pages cm -- (Legal research series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-61163-668-0 (alk. paper)

1. Legal research--New York (State) I. Belniak, Theodora, author. II. Selby, Courtney, author. III. Detweiler, Brian, author. IV. Title.

KFN5074.A34 2015  
340'.0720747--dc23

2015010272

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America.

*In memory of Nancy P. Johnson.*

*E.G.A.*

*To the Fordniaks. Your love and encouragement helped make  
my contributions to this book a reality.*

*T.B.*

*For the Hofstra Law Library team, with gratitude for all  
you continue to teach me.*

*C.L.S.*

*To my wife, Sharon, for putting up with me.*

*B.T.D.*



# Summary of Contents

List of Tables and Figures	xix
Series Note	xxiii
Preface to the Third Edition	xxv
Chapter 1 · The Research Process and Legal Analysis	3
Chapter 2 · Legal Research Techniques	13
Chapter 3 · Secondary Sources	43
Chapter 4 · Researching Judicial Opinions	67
Chapter 5 · Statutes, Constitutions, Local Laws, and Court Rules	99
Chapter 6 · Legislative History	123
Chapter 7 · Administrative Law	147
Chapter 8 · Updating with Citators	167
Chapter 9 · New York City Legal Research	185
Chapter 10 · Legal Ethics Research	201
Chapter 11 · Research Strategies and Organization	211
Appendix A · Legal Citation	225

Appendix B · Selected Bibliography	231
About the Authors	233
Index	235



# Contents

List of Tables and Figures	xix
Series Note	xxiii
Preface to the Third Edition	xxv
<b>Chapter 1 · The Research Process and Legal Analysis</b>	<b>3</b>
I. New York Legal Research	3
II. The Intersection of Legal Research and Legal Analysis	3
III. Types of Legal Authority	4
IV. Overview of the Research Process	5
A. Frame the Question(s) and Develop Search Terms	7
B. Identify, Prioritize, and Consult Relevant Sources	9
1. Secondary Sources	9
2. Primary Authorities	9
C. Expand and Update Your Research	10
D. Make Sure Your Research Is Responsive to the Question(s) Presented	10
E. Know When to Stop	10
V. Organization of This Book	11
<b>Chapter 2 · Legal Research Techniques</b>	<b>13</b>
I. Introduction to Commercial Databases	13
A. Natural Language Searching versus Terms and Connectors Searching	14
B. Segment and Field Searching	15

C. Table of Contents Searching	16
D. Keeping Current with Alerts	16
E. Organizational Tools: Folders and Workspaces	17
II. Bloomberg Law	17
A. Keyword Searching on Bloomberg Law	18
B. Browsing Sources on Bloomberg Law	19
C. Federal Dockets on Bloomberg Law	20
D. Creating Alerts on Bloomberg Law	21
E. Bloomberg Law App	21
III. Lexis Advance	22
A. Keyword Searching on Lexis Advance	22
B. Browsing Sources on Lexis Advance	23
C. Creating Alerts on Lexis Advance	24
D. Lexis Advance App	25
IV. WestlawNext	26
A. Keyword Searching on WestlawNext	27
B. Browsing Sources on WestlawNext	28
C. Creating Alerts on WestlawNext	29
D. WestlawNext App	30
V. Fastcase	31
VI. Open Access Resources	32
A. Case Law on Google Scholar	33
B. New York State Statutes on the State Legislature Website	34
C. New York Codes, Rules, and Regulations, Provided by Thomson Reuters	35
D. Additional State Administrative Law Resources	35
E. Federal Primary Law Materials on FDsys	36
F. <i>United States Code</i> on the Office of the Law Revision Counsel Website	36
G. <i>Code of Federal Regulations</i> on the e-CFR	37
H. Additional Federal Administrative Law Resources	38
VII. Making the Most of Your Local Law Library	38
VIII. Print Research Techniques	39
A. Table of Contents Searching in Print Resources	39
B. Searching with a Print Index	40
C. Updating Print Resources	40

IX. Conclusion	41
<b>Chapter 3 · Secondary Sources</b>	<b>43</b>
I. Introduction	43
II. Encyclopedias	43
A. State Encyclopedias	44
B. Multijurisdictional Encyclopedias	46
C. Using Legal Encyclopedias	46
III. Practice Materials	48
A. Bar Association Materials	48
1. New York State	48
2. National	49
3. Finding Bar Association Materials	49
B. CLE Materials	49
C. Forms	50
D. Pattern Jury Instructions	52
E. Finding and Using Practice Materials	53
IV. Legal Periodicals	54
A. Academic and Commercial Legal Periodicals	54
B. Finding Law Review and Journal Articles	55
1. Indexes	55
2. Online Journal and Law Review Databases	56
3. Freely Available Journals and Law Reviews	56
V. <i>American Law Reports</i>	57
A. ALR in Print	59
B. Online Access to ALR	59
VI. Treatises, Hornbooks, and Nutshells	59
VII. Restatements, Model Codes, and Uniform Laws	60
A. Restatements	60
B. Model Codes and Uniform Laws	62
VIII. Loose-Leaf and Newsletter Services	64
A. Loose-Leafs in Print	64
B. Loose-Leafs Online	64
IX. Using Secondary Sources	65
A. Choosing a Secondary Source	65
B. Citing a Secondary Source	66

<b>Chapter 4 · Researching Judicial Opinions</b>	<b>67</b>
I. Court Systems	67
A. New York State Unified Court System	69
B. Federal Courts	69
II. Reporters	70
A. Reporters for New York Cases	70
1. Citing New York Cases	72
2. Features of a Reported Case as Published by West Publishing (Thomson Reuters)	73
3. Advance Sheets	78
4. Other Sources for New York Cases	78
B. Reporters for Federal Cases	79
III. Finding Cases	80
A. Retrieving Cases by Citation	80
1. Commercial Databases	81
2. PACER for Federal Cases and Case Filings	81
3. Using Free Online Sources	82
a. Court Websites	82
b. Google Scholar	82
4. Print	83
B. Finding and Retrieving Cases Referenced in Other Sources	84
1. From Secondary Sources	84
2. From Other Cases	84
a. The One Good Case Approach Using WestlawNext	84
b. The One Good Case Approach Using Lexis Advance	86
C. Online Search Strategies	87
1. Choose the Right Database	87
2. Natural Language versus Boolean or Advanced Search	88
3. Searching within Results	89
D. Finding and Retrieving Cases in Print	90
E. Unpublished Opinions	92
F. Updating and Validating Cases	92
IV. Reading and Analyzing Cases	92
A. Reading Cases Effectively	93
B. Analyzing the Substance of Cases	93
Appendix 4-A. Case Excerpt from Official Reporter	
<i>People v. Lewis</i> , 68 N.Y.2d 923 (N.Y. 1986)	96

<b>Chapter 5 · Statutes, Constitutions, Local Laws, and Court Rules</b>	<b>99</b>
I. New York Statutes	100
A. Consolidated and Unconsolidated Laws Defined	101
B. Sources of Consolidated Laws	102
1. <i>New York Consolidated Laws Service</i> and <i>McKinney's Consolidated Laws of New York Annotated</i>	102
2. <i>Consolidated Laws of New York</i> (formerly <i>Gould's</i> )	105
C. Sources of Unconsolidated Laws	105
1. Current Sources of Unconsolidated Laws	105
2. Historical Source of Unconsolidated Laws	105
D. The Research Process Using Print Codes	105
1. Develop a List of Research Terms	106
2. Search the Index	106
3. Find and Read the Statutory Language	106
4. Update the Section of the Code	107
5. Find Cases that Interpret or Apply Statutes	108
E. Chapter Laws and Session Laws	108
F. Using Online Codes and Session Laws	109
1. Using the Online Codes and Chapter Laws on Lexis Advance and WestlawNext	109
2. Using LRS Online to Retrieve Current Codes and Session Laws	110
3. Using Bloomberg Law to Retrieve Unannotated Codes and Session Laws	111
G. <i>Uniform Laws Annotated</i>	112
II. New York Constitutions	112
A. Researching in Print	113
B. Researching Online	113
III. Local Laws, Special Laws, and Ordinances	113
A. New York City	114
B. Other Jurisdictions in New York	114
C. Sources of Local Laws, Special Laws, and Ordinances	115
IV. Court Rules	115
V. Federal Research	117
A. Federal Codes	117
1. Print Sources of the Federal Codes	117

2. <i>United States Code</i>	118
3. <i>United States Code Annotated</i> and <i>United States Code Service</i>	118
4. Finding Federal Statutes	119
B. Session Laws	119
C. United States Constitution	120
D. Federal Court Rules	120
<b>Chapter 6 · Legislative History</b>	<b>123</b>
I. Introduction to the Legislative Process	123
A. Overview of the New York Legislative Process	124
B. Categories of Bills	127
C. Resolutions	128
II. Bill Tracking	128
III. New York Legislative History Research	130
A. Sources of New York Legislative History	132
B. Process of New York Legislative History Research	137
C. Additional New York Legislative History Sources	140
IV. Federal Legislative Research	141
A. Brief Overview of the Federal Legislative Process	141
B. Federal Bill Tracking	142
C. Federal Legislative History	142
1. Sources of Federal Legislative History	142
2. Compiled Legislative History	143
3. Print Sources for Federal Legislative History	143
4. Online Sources for Federal Legislative History	143
Appendix 6-A. Bibliography and Contact Information for New York Legislative History Research	145
<b>Chapter 7 · Administrative Law</b>	<b>147</b>
I. Introduction to Administrative Law and Governmental Agencies	147
II. Administrative Rules	148
A. Overview	148
B. The Rulemaking Process	150
III. Administrative Law Research	151
A. Researching the Enabling Act	151

B. Locating Rules	152
C. Exploring Regulatory Intent	153
D. Judicial Interpretation of Rules	156
E. Updating and Tracking Tools	156
IV. Researching Agency Decisions	156
V. Researching Attorney General Opinions	158
VI. Researching Governors' Executive Orders and Proclamations	161
VII. Other Resources for Researching New York Administrative Law	162
VIII. Federal Administrative Law	162
A. <i>Code of Federal Regulations</i>	163
B. <i>Federal Register</i>	165
C. Updating Federal Regulations	165
D. Agency Decisions	165
E. Judicial Opinions	166
<b>Chapter 8 · Updating with Citators</b>	167
I. Why Update	167
II. When to Update	168
III. How to Update Case Law Using Online Citators	168
A. Updating Cases with BCite on Bloomberg Law	168
B. Updating Cases with Shepard's on Lexis Advance	170
C. Updating Cases with KeyCite on WestlawNext	174
D. Authority Check on Fastcase	177
E. How Cited on Google Scholar	179
IV. Updating Statutes and Regulations with Online Citators	182
A. Updating Statutes and Regulations Using Shepard's	183
B. Updating Statutes and Regulations Using KeyCite	183
V. Online Citators for Law Review Articles	184
A. Updating Law Review Articles on Lexis Advance	184
B. Updating Law Review Articles on WestlawNext	184
<b>Chapter 9 · New York City Legal Research</b>	185
I. Introduction	185
II. New York City's Charter	185

A. The Current Charter	185
B. Revisions to the Charter	186
C. Finding the Charter and Related Documents	187
1. In Print	187
2. Online	187
3. Charter Revision Commission Documents	188
D. Historical Background of Charter Sections	188
III. New York City's Legislative Structure	189
A. Legislation	189
B. Finding Council Bills and Meeting Minutes	190
1. Bills	190
2. Meeting Minutes	191
IV. New York City's Administrative System	192
A. Origin of the Administrative Code	192
B. The Administrative Code	192
C. Finding the Administrative Code	192
1. In Print	192
2. Online	193
V. New York City's Rules	194
A. Origin of Rules and Authority to Promulgate	194
B. Organization of Rules	195
C. Sources of Rules	195
1. In Print	195
2. Online	195
D. Opinions and Rulings	195
1. Agency Rulings	195
2. Actions Against Agencies, Opinions of the Corporation Counsel	196
VI. New York City's Court System	197
A. Court Structure	197
1. New York City Civil Court	197
2. New York City Criminal Court	197
3. Other Courts in New York City	197
B. Court Rules	198
C. Case Law of New York City	199
1. In Print	199
2. Online	199



<b>Chapter 10 · Legal Ethics Research</b>	201
I. Introduction to Legal Ethics Research	201
II. The Model Code and Model Rules: A Brief History	201
III. Comparing the Style of the Old Rules to the <i>New York Rules of Professional Conduct</i>	203
A. <i>New York Lawyer’s Code of Professional Responsibility</i>	203
B. <i>New York Rules of Professional Conduct</i>	204
IV. The Process of Legal Ethics Research	205
A. Preparation for Research	205
B. New York’s Model Rules, New York Statutes, and Other Laws	206
C. New York Opinions	208
1. Ethics Opinions	208
2. Disciplinary Proceedings	208
D. Other Jurisdictions	209
E. Precedent from Other Jurisdictions and Secondary Sources	210
<b>Chapter 11 · Research Strategies and Organization</b>	211
I. Developing a Research Strategy	211
A. Review the Research Process	211
B. Think Through the Practical Considerations	211
C. Take Notes that Make a Difference	213
D. Choose a Strategy that Fits	214
1. The Fresh Search	215
2. Starting with a Case, Statute, or Regulation on Point	216
3. Using an Iterative Approach	217
4. Researching within Time Constraints	217
E. Cost-Effective Research Methods	217
1. Consider the Format	217
2. Consider Free Sources	218
F. Sample Strategy	218
II. Organization	220
A. Organizing Authorities	220
B. Organizing Analysis	221
III. Ending Research	221

<b>Appendix A · Legal Citation</b>	225
I. New York Citation	225
A. Citation Placement and Appearance	226
B. Case Citation	227
C. Statutory Citation	229
II. Citations Not Covered by a Manual	230
<b>Appendix B · Selected Bibliography</b>	231
<b>About the Authors</b>	233
<b>Index</b>	235

## List of Tables and Figures

### Tables

Table 1-1.	Essential Elements of the Research Process	6
Table 1-2.	Developing Search Terms	8
Table 2-1.	Commonly Used Terms and Connectors	15
Table 2-2.	Advanced Search Symbols on Google Scholar	34
Table 2-3.	Free Federal Legislative Resources	37
Table 2-4.	Additional Commercial Databases	39
Table 3-1.	Restatement Areas and Topics of Law	62
Table 4-1.	Reporters for New York Cases	72
Table 4-2.	Reporters for Federal Court Cases	79
Table 5-1.	Researching Enacted Law	100
Table 5-2.	Examples of Citation Formats for McKinney's and CLS	103
Table 5-3.	Researching New York Statutes in Print	106
Table 5-4.	Online Sources of New York's Consolidated Laws	109
Table 5-5.	Selected Print and Online Sources of New York Court Rules	116
Table 6-1.	Outline for Bill Tracking	129
Table 6-2.	Bill Tracking Resources	132
Table 6-3.	Summary of How a Bill Becomes a Law and Documents Associated with the Process	133

Table 6-4.	Text of Statute with History Line, <i>New York Consolidated Laws Service</i> and McKinney's	137
Table 6-5.	Checklist for New York Legislative History Research	139
Table 7-1.	Outline for New York Administrative Law Research	148
Table 7-2.	Online Sources of Agency Rules: NYCRR and <i>State Register</i>	153
Table 7-3.	Historical Note from New York Rule 9 NYCRR § 7005.5	153
Table 7-4.	Online Sources of New York Agency Decisions	158
Table 7-5.	Print Sources of New York Attorney General Opinions	160
Table 7-6.	Online Sources of Attorney General Opinions	161
Table 7-7.	Current Sources of Governors' Executive Orders Online	162
Table 8-1.	Treatment Indicators for Selected Online Citators	173
Table 9-1.	New York City Charter Excerpt	186
Table 9-2.	Locations of Current and Past Intros and Local Laws	191
Table 9-3.	Administrative Code Excerpt	192
Table 9-4.	Agency Decisions Included in New York Law School's CityAdmin	196
Table 10-1.	Timeline of Historical Development of Rules of Professional Ethics	202
Table 10-2.	Legal Ethics Research Steps	205
Table 10-3.	Selected Online Sources for the <i>New York Rules of Professional Conduct</i>	207
Table 10-4.	Disciplinary Committees of the Appellate Division	209
Table 11-1.	Sample Research Strategy	219
Table 11-2.	Organizing Research Results with Analysis	222
Table A-1.	Citation with the <i>New York Law Reports Style Manual</i>	227
Table A-2.	Preferred Reporters Under the <i>New York Style Manual</i>	229

## Figures

Figure 2-1.	Corporate/M&A Practice Center on Bloomberg Law	19
Figure 2-2.	Searching Dockets on Bloomberg Law	20
Figure 2-3.	Table of Contents View on Lexis Advance	23
Figure 2-4.	Browsing Sources on the Lexis Advance App	25
Figure 2-5.	Advanced Search Fields for Cases on WestlawNext	27
Figure 2-6.	Practitioner Insights Page for New York Family Law on WestlawNext	29
Figure 2-7.	Search Results Viewed in Overview Screen on WestlawNext App	31
Figure 3-1.	New York Jur General Table of Contents on WestlawNext	44
Figure 3-2.	Carmody-Wait, 2d Table of Contents on WestlawNext	45
Figure 3-3.	Main Search Screen on WestlawNext	47
Figure 3-4.	<i>Bender's Forms for the Consolidated Laws of New York</i> on Lexis Advance	51
Figure 3-5.	<i>American Law Reports</i> Annotation	58
Figure 3-6.	Example of a Restatement	61
Figure 4-1.	Civil Court Structure	68
Figure 4-2.	Case from WestlawNext, <i>People v. Lewis</i> , 502 N.E.2d 988 (N.Y. 1986)	75
Figure 4-3.	Example of a Headnote as Displayed on Lexis Advance	86
Figure 4-4.	Excerpt from the Descriptive-Word Index in <i>West's New York Digest, 4th</i>	91
Figure 5-1.	Excerpt of New York Statute from McKinney's	107
Figure 5-2.	LRS Search Interface	111
Figure 6-1.	How a Bill Becomes a Law in New York	125
Figure 6-2.	Bill Status	129
Figure 6-3.	Bill Text Comparison on the Legislative Retrieval System	131

Figure 7-1.	Example of a New York Agency Rule and Historical Note	149
Figure 7-2.	Reproduction of Notice of Agency Action from the <i>State Bulletin</i>	155
Figure 7-3.	Examples of Federal Regulations	164
Figure 8-1.	BCite Case Analysis on Bloomberg Law	170
Figure 8-2.	Shepard's Report Citing Decisions on Lexis Advance	172
Figure 8-3.	List of Cases in KeyCite Citing References Tab	176
Figure 8-4.	Accessing Authority Check on Fastcase	178
Figure 8-5.	Authority Check Report on Fastcase	179
Figure 8-6.	How Cited on Google Scholar	181
Figure 8-7.	List of Citing Documents Accessed from Google Scholar's How Cited Page	182
Figure 9-1.	New York City Council Process Flowchart	190
Figure 11-1.	Template for Research Notes	215

## Series Note

The Legal Research Series published by Carolina Academic Press includes titles from states around the country as well as a separate text on federal legal research. The goal of each book is to provide law students, practitioners, paralegals, college students, laypeople, and librarians with the essential elements of legal research in each jurisdiction. Unlike more bibliographic texts, the Legal Research Series books seek to explain concisely both the sources of legal research and the process for conducting legal research effectively.





## Preface to the Third Edition

The goal of *New York Legal Research* is to explore concisely both the sources of New York state law research and the process of conducting research using these sources. New to the third edition is a much greater emphasis on online sources and online research process while continuing to discuss print research.

Writing a book like this is a collaborative effort, and that approach is as true in this edition as it was in previous editions. In the third edition, Elizabeth Adelman took a leading role in updating the chapters on legislative history, administrative law, and legal ethics. Theodora Belniak took a leading role in updating the chapters on secondary sources, statutes, and New York City law. We welcomed two new co-authors in this edition: Courtney Selby was responsible for a complete re-write of the chapters on the process of legal research, case law research, and research strategies and organization. Brian Detweiler was responsible for a complete re-write of the chapters on legal research techniques and updating. In addition, he took the leading role in updating the citation appendix. Suzanne Rowe, a co-author of the first two editions, contributed to each chapter in this third edition in her role as series editor. In addition, Chapter 4, Part IV is drawn from *Oregon Legal Research*, authored by Suzanne Rowe. Other portions of this edition continue to be drawn from other books in the Legal Research Series and are used with permission. Please note that reproduction of this work is prohibited.

Elizabeth G. Adelman  
Theodora Belniak  
Courtney L. Selby  
Brian T. Detweiler  
February 2015

