

# Crime Victim Rights and Remedies







# Crime Victim Rights and Remedies

---

Third Edition

Peggy M. Tobolowsky  
Douglas E. Beloof  
Mario T. Gaboury  
Arrick L. Jackson  
Ashley G. Blackburn



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  

---

Durham, North Carolina



Copyright © 2016  
Carolina Academic Press, LLC.  
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Tobolowsky, Peggy M., 1952-

Title: Crime victim rights and remedies / Peggy M. Tobolowsky, Douglas E.

Beloof, Mario T. Gaboury, Arrick L. Jackson, and Ashley G. Blackburn.

Description: Third edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2015050803 | ISBN 9781611636949 (alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Victims of crimes--Legal status, laws, etc.--United States.

Classification: LCC KF9763 .T63 2016 | DDC 344.7303/288--dc23

LC record available at <http://lccn.loc.gov/2015050803>

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS, LLC.

700 Kent Street

Durham, North Carolina 27701

Telephone (919) 489-7486

Fax (919) 493-5668

[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America



*Dedicated to our families.*







# Contents

---

Preface	xiii
<b>Chapter 1 · The Return of Crime Victim Rights and Remedies</b>	<b>3</b>
Introduction	3
The Crime Victim in Ancient and Pre-Modern Times	4
The Initial Role of the Crime Victim in the United States	5
The Renewal of Interest in Crime Victims	6
The Emergence of the Victims' Movement	8
The President's Task Force on Victims of Crime	10
Crime Victim Rights and Remedies: Then and Now	11
<b>Chapter 2 · Crime Victim Rights of Participation in the Criminal Justice Process: An Introduction</b>	<b>15</b>
The Definition of a "Victim"	16
The Definition of a "Crime"	21
Conclusion	22
<b>Chapter 3 · The Right to Notice of Proceedings and Outcomes in the Criminal Justice Process</b>	<b>25</b>
Notice of the Existence of Victim Rights	25
Constitutional and Legislative Action	25
Judicial Interpretation	27
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	28
Notice of Important Proceedings and Outcomes in the Criminal Justice Process	30
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i> Recommendations	30
Constitutional and Legislative Response	31
Judicial Interpretation	36
State Cases	36
Federal Cases	42
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	45
Conclusion	50



<b>Chapter 4 · The Right to Be Present at Criminal Justice Proceedings</b>	<b>51</b>
Introduction	51
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i> Recommendations	52
Constitutional and Legislative Response	54
Judicial Interpretation	57
State Cases	57
Federal Cases	62
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	65
Conclusion	67
 <b>Chapter 5 · The Right to Be Heard Regarding Charging Decisions and Pleas</b>	 <b>69</b>
The Right to Be Heard Regarding the Initiation or Dismissal of a Criminal Charge	70
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i> Recommendations	70
Constitutional and Legislative Response	71
Judicial Interpretation	73
Overview	73
State Cases	74
Federal Cases	78
Conclusion	79
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	80
Conclusion	82
The Right to Be Heard Regarding Plea Negotiations and Agreements	83
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i> Recommendations	83
Constitutional and Legislative Response	84
Judicial Interpretation	87
State Cases	87
Federal Cases	90
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	91
Conclusion	97
 <b>Chapter 6 · The Right to Be Heard Regarding Sentencing and Parole</b>	 <b>99</b>
The Right to Be Heard Regarding Sentencing	99
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i> Recommendations	99
Constitutional and Legislative Response	101



Judicial Interpretation	103
Capital Cases	104
Non-capital State Cases	109
Non-capital Federal Cases	113
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	117
Utilization of the Right	118
Impact on Criminal Justice System Administration and Efficiency	121
Impact on Sentencing Outcomes	122
Impact on Victim Satisfaction	127
Conclusion	129
The Right to Be Heard Regarding Parole	129
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from         the Field</i> Recommendations	129
Constitutional and Legislative Response	130
Judicial Interpretation	133
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	135
Conclusion	140
<b>Chapter 7 · Remedies for Crime Victim Rights Violations</b>	141
Constitutional and Legislative Action	142
Federal Provisions	142
State Provisions	144
Judicial Interpretation	149
State Cases	149
Federal Cases	154
Implementation and Analysis	156
Conclusion	163
<b>Chapter 8 · Restitution</b>	165
Introduction	165
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from         the Field</i> Recommendations	167
Constitutional and Legislative Response	169
Federal Provisions	169
State Provisions	171
Judicial Interpretation	174
Federal Cases	174
State Cases	178
Implementation and Analysis of the Remedy	180



Recovery of Victim Economic Loss	181
Recovery of Victim Psychological Loss and Victim Satisfaction	188
Reduced System Intrusiveness and Offender Recidivism	191
Reduced System Costs and Enhanced System Credibility	194
Conclusion	196
<b>Chapter 9 · Crime Victim Compensation</b>	197
Introduction	197
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i> Recommendations	198
Constitutional and Legislative Response	200
Judicial Interpretation	204
Implementation and Analysis of the Remedy	206
Utilization of the Remedy	208
Low Visibility of the Remedy	211
Limited Program Staff and Funding	213
Victim Cooperation and Satisfaction	216
Conclusion	218
<b>Chapter 10 · Civil Litigation</b>	221
Introduction	221
Constitutional and Legislative Action	223
Judicial Interpretation	225
Intentional Tort and Related Direct Actions	225
Third Party Actions	229
Special Relationships Creating Duties of Reasonable Care	230
Duty to Control or to Warn of the Conduct of Others	236
Implementation and Analysis of the Remedy	239
Conclusion	241
<b>Chapter 11 · Special Topics in Crime Victim Rights and Remedies</b>	243
Crime Victim Rights and Remedies in the United States Armed Services	243
Crime Victim Rights and Remedies Internationally	253
<b>Chapter 12 · The Future of Crime Victim Rights and Remedies</b>	257
Introduction	257
Visions of the Future	258
Conclusion	265



<b>Appendix 1 · President's Task Force on Victims of Crime</b>	
<b>Action Recommendations</b>	267
Proposed Executive and Legislative Action at the Federal and State Levels	267
Recommendations for Federal and State Action	267
Proposed Federal Action	269
Proposed Action for Criminal Justice System Agencies	269
Recommendations for Police	269
Recommendations for Prosecutors	270
Recommendations for the Judiciary	270
Recommendations for Parole Boards	271
Recommendations for Other Organizations	271
Recommendations for Hospitals	271
Recommendations for the Ministry	272
Recommendations for the Bar	272
Recommendations for Schools	272
Recommendations for the Mental Health Community	273
Recommendations for the Private Sector	273
A Proposed Amendment to the Constitution	274
 <b>Appendix 2 · Proposed Federal Victim Rights</b>	
<b>Constitutional Amendment</b>	275
House Joint Resolution 45	275
 <b>Appendix 3 · State Crime Victim Rights Constitutional Provisions</b>	277
Alabama	277
Alaska	277
Arizona	278
California	279
Colorado	284
Connecticut	284
Florida	285
Idaho	285
Illinois	286
Indiana	288
Kansas	288
Louisiana	289
Maryland	289
Michigan	290
Mississippi	290



Missouri	291
Montana	292
Nebraska	292
Nevada	293
New Jersey	293
New Mexico	294
North Carolina	295
Ohio	296
Oklahoma	296
Oregon	297
Rhode Island	301
South Carolina	301
Tennessee	303
Texas	304
Utah	305
Virginia	305
Washington	306
Wisconsin	307
 <b>Appendix 4 · Primary Federal and State Crime Victim Rights Provisions</b>	 309
 <b>Notes</b>	 311
Chapter 1 Notes	311
Chapter 2 Notes	316
Chapter 3 Notes	320
Chapter 4 Notes	325
Chapter 5 Notes	330
Chapter 6 Notes	337
Chapter 7 Notes	349
Chapter 8 Notes	356
Chapter 9 Notes	367
Chapter 10 Notes	372
Chapter 11 Notes	378
Chapter 12 Notes	381
 <b>Table of Cases</b>	 385
 <b>Index</b>	 393



# Preface

In 1982, President Ronald Reagan convened a Task Force on Victims of Crime. The recommendations made by this national Task Force have served as a guide for the development of crime victim rights and remedies in this country. In 2001, the initial edition of this text was published. It brought together a multifaceted set of materials reflecting the evolution of crime victim rights and remedies in the approximately twenty years since the Task Force's recommendations were published. The initial text described the applicable constitutional and statutory provisions addressing crime victim rights and remedies, as well as leading judicial opinions that interpreted them. In addition to presenting the current state of the law in this area, the text described the status of implementation of these rights and remedies, relevant empirical research, and a sampling of the pertinent policy analysis. This comprehensive portrait of the past and then current status of crime victim rights and remedies in this country was designed to inform the continued evolution of law and practice in this area.

In the years since the publishing of the initial edition of this text, the constitutional and statutory law in this area and judicial interpretation of it has continued to evolve, as well as the empirical research analyzing its development and implementation. Of particular note is the enactment of the federal Crime Victims' Rights Act of 2004, reflecting a significant expansion of federal statutory crime victim rights and remedies. Thus, the second edition of the text, published in 2010, extended and expanded the comprehensive description of crime victim rights and remedies provided in the initial edition.

Now, well over thirty years since the President's Task Force issued its recommendations, progress in their implementation can once again be measured. This third edition of the text brings together not only the current constitutional and statutory crime victim rights and remedies provisions and the most up-to-date judicial interpretations and research and policy analyses of them and their implementation, but it also adds a new chapter concerning crime victim rights and remedies in the United States armed services and internationally.

It is hoped that this new edition of the text will further facilitate the study of crime victim rights and remedies, and will serve as a general resource for those interested in crime victim rights and remedies in this country.