

A Student Electronic Discovery Primer

A Student Electronic Discovery Primer

An Essential Companion for
Civil Procedure Courses

William F. Hamilton
&
Jennifer M. Smith



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2016
Carolina Academic Press, LLC
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Hamilton, William, (Law teacher), author. | Smith, Jennifer M., (Law teacher), author.

Title: A student electronic discovery primer : an essential companion for civil procedure courses / William Hamilton, Jennifer M. Smith.

Description: Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2015048074 | ISBN 9781611637403 (alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Electronic discovery (Law)--United States.

Classification: LCC KF8902.E42 H35 2016 | DDC 347.73/6--dc23

LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2015048074>

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS, LLC
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America.

*To my wife, Cindy, for her inspiration and belief
that love and dedication will always prevail.*

—Bill

*To my beautiful mother, Dianne Gaines, the first lawyer
in our family and my best role model of a great lawyer.*

—Jen

Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| PART I: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF ELECTRONIC DISCOVERY | 3 |
| Chapter 1 · The Modern Electronic Computer and the Emergence of Electronically Stored Information | 5 |
| Electronically Stored Information | 7 |
| Electronic Discovery Terminology: Bits and Bytes | 8 |
| Key Characteristics of Electronically Stored Information | 10 |
| Voluminous | 10 |
| Searchable | 11 |
| Rich Information Including Metadata | 11 |
| Location Dispersal | 12 |
| Fragile and Recoverable | 12 |
| The Electronic Discovery Reference Model | 13 |
| The Electronic Discovery Best Practices Model | 14 |
| Managing the Electronic Discovery Process | 15 |
| PART II: ILLUSTRATIVE ELECTRONIC DISCOVERY CASE LAW | 17 |
| <i>Zubulake</i> Background | 17 |
| Chapter 2 · Accessible and Inaccessible Data | 19 |
| <i>Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC</i> , 217 F.R.D. 309 (S.D.N.Y. 2003) (Zubulake I) | 19 |
| Case Post-Script | 33 |
| Chapter 3 · Cost-Sharing/Cost-Shifting | 35 |
| <i>Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC</i> , 16 F.R.D. 280 (S.D.N.Y. 2003) (Zubulake III) | 35 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Chapter 4 · Duty to Preserve Electronic Documents, Trigger Date, Spoliation | 49 |
| <i>Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC</i> , 220 F.R.D. 212 (S.D.N.Y. 2003), (Zubulake IV) | 49 |
| Case Post-Script | 61 |
| Chapter 5 · Counsel Duties, Litigation Holds, Record Retention, Sanctions | 63 |
| <i>Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC</i> , 229 F.R.D. 422 (S.D.N.Y. 2004), (Zubulake V) | 63 |
| Case Post-Script | 84 |
| Chapter 6 · Search Methods and Clawback Agreements | 85 |
| <i>Victor Stanley, Inc. v. Creative Pipe, Inc.</i> , 250 F.R.D. 251 (D.Md. 2008) | 85 |
| Chapter 7 · E-Discovery Budgeting and the Obligation to Meet and Confer Regarding Electronic Discovery | 97 |
| <i>Mancia, et al. v. Mayflower Textile Servs. Co.</i> , 253 F.R.D. 354 (D.Md. 2008) | 97 |
| Case Post-Script | 108 |
| Chapter 8 · Computer Forensics, Confidentiality, and Experts | 109 |
| <i>In re Wesley F. Honza, Jr. and Robert A. Honza</i> , 242 S.W.3d 578 (Tex. App. 2008) | 109 |
| Chapter 9 · Machine Learning, The Black Box Problem, Keyword Searching | 117 |
| <i>Moore v. Publicis Groupe</i> , 287 F.R.D. 182 (S.D.N.Y. 2012) | 117 |
| PART III: CHART OF PRINCIPAL AMENDMENTS OF THE FEDERAL CIVIL PROCEDURE RULES RELATING TO ELECTRONIC DISCOVERY | 131 |
| PART IV: SAMPLE FORMS | 133 |
| About the Authors | 157 |
| Index | 159 |