

Discretionary Criminal Justice in a Comparative Context

Discretionary Criminal Justice in a Comparative Context

Edited by

Michele Caianiello

Jacqueline S. Hodgson



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright 2015
Carolina Academic Press
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Discretionary criminal justice in a comparative context / edited by Michele Caianiello and Jacqueline S. Hodgson.

pages cm

"This book contains the results of a 2013 conference in Ravenna ... organized by the University of Bologna (campus of Ravenna), the University of North Carolina, the University of Warwick, and the University of Basel ..."--
Acknowledgments.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-61163-773-1 (alk. paper)

1. Prosecution--Decision making--Congresses. 2. Judicial discretion--
Congresses. I. Caianiello, Michele, editor. II. Hodgson, Jacqueline, editor.

K5425.D57 2015
345'.05042--dc23

2015006499

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, NC 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Contents

Acknowledgments	xi
Chapter One · Introduction <i>Jacqueline S. Hodgson</i>	3
PART I · INVESTIGATION AND PROSECUTION	
Chapter Two · Discretionary Justice at the Initiation of a Criminal Investigation <i>Lorenzo M. Bujosa Vadell</i>	13
1 Preliminary Considerations	13
2 The Decision to Initiate Criminal Investigation	14
3 Discretion in the Establishment of Criminal Policy and the Initiation of Criminal Investigation	15
4 Methods of Initiating Criminal Investigation in Spain	16
5 The Initiation of Juvenile Court Proceedings—Greater Discretion	18
6 The 2013 Proposal for a New Code of Criminal Procedure— Discretion at the First Steps?	20
7 Conclusion	23
Bibliography	23
Abbreviations	26
Chapter Three · Prosecutorial Discretion in Three Systems: Balancing Conflicting Goals and Providing Mechanisms for Control <i>Sara Sun Beale</i>	27
1 Introduction	28
2 Prosecution in the United States	31
2.1 The Structure of Prosecutorial Authority and the Education and Selection of Prosecutors	31
2.2 Prosecutorial Discretion	34
3 Prosecution in France and Germany	37

3.1	France	38
3.2	Germany	44
4	Conclusion	50
4.1	Efficiency and Accuracy	51
4.2	Democratic Accountability and Prosecutorial Neutrality	52
4.3	Consistency and Equal Treatment	54
4.4	Mechanisms for Setting Policies and Priorities	56
Chapter Four · Investigative and Prosecutorial Discretion in Criminal Matters: The Contribution of the Italian Experience		
<i>Stefano Ruggeri</i>		59
1	Introduction	60
2	The Enactment of the Principle of Legality into the Italian Legal System: A Historical Overview	63
3	Evolution of the Principle of Mandatory Prosecution under the Current Italian Procedural Legal System	65
3.1	Developments of the Principle of Legality in Relation to Criminal Prosecutions in a Strict Sense	65
3.1.1	The Enhancement of Charging Discretion	66
3.1.2	The Enhancement of Balancing Conflicting Interests in the Decision Whether to Prosecute	67
3.2	Developments of the Principle of Legality in Relation to Criminal Prosecutions in a Broad Sense	69
3.2.1	Prosecutorial Discretion during the Preliminary Investigations	69
3.2.2	Prosecutorial Discretion in the Criminal Process	71
3.3	From Prosecutorial to Judicial Discretion	72
3.4	Prosecutorial Discretion in Transnational Cases	73
3.5	Interim Result	75
4	Guidelines to Govern Investigative and Prosecutorial Discretion from the Italian Perspective	75
4.1	Premise: Models to Tackle Prosecutorial Discretion in Comparative Law	75
4.2	Basic Characteristics of the Organisation of the Judiciary in Italy	76
4.3	Proposals to Govern Prosecutorial Discretion in a Fair Criminal Procedure	77
5	Conclusions	79
	Bibliography	81
	Abbreviations	85

PART II · NEGOTIATED JUSTICE

Chapter Five · The Principle of Legality, Discretionary Justice and Plea Agreements: The Practice in Spain	
<i>Lorena Bachmaier</i>	89
1 Introduction	89
2 Short Overview of Spanish Criminal Procedure	91
3 Discretionary Justice and Plea Agreements	95
3.1 The Legal Framework of Guilty Pleas	97
3.2 Judicial Control of the Plea Agreement	100
3.3 Appeal against the Judgment Rendered upon Agreement	102
4 The Practice of Plea Agreements	103
5 Plea Agreements, and the Principles and Aims of Criminal Procedure	105
5.1 Plea Agreements, Fairness, and the Principle of Legality	105
5.2 Plea Agreements and the Search for the Truth	107
6 Conclusions	108
Bibliography	110
Abbreviations	113
Chapter Six · Beyond Legitimate Grounds: External Influences and the Discretionary Power Not to Prosecute in the People's Republic of China	
<i>Yu Mou</i>	115
1 Introduction	115
2 The Legal Regulation of Non-prosecution in China: The Contextual Account	117
3 Undue Influences and the Decision Not to Prosecute	120
3.1 Prosecutorial Discretion, Vertical Instructions and Their Relationship to the Social Classes	120
3.2 The Coordination of the Political-Legal Committee	125
3.3 The Protest of the Victim	130
4 Conclusion	136
Bibliography	137
Abbreviations	139
Chapter Seven · Critical Aspects on the Italian Features Concerning “Negotiated Justice”	
<i>Daniele Vicoli</i>	141
1 Introduction: “Negotiated Justice” in the Italian System	141

2	An Overview of Constitutional Principles	143
3	Statutory Regulation of Negotiation (Application of Penalty upon the Request of the Parties)	144
4	The Role of the Public Prosecutor	146
5	Judicial Review Powers	147
6	The Ascertainment of Guilt	149
	Bibliography	151
PART III · PROCEDURAL ERRORS		
Chapter Eight · Water Always Finds Its Way—Discretion and the Concept of Exclusionary Rules in the Swiss Criminal Procedure Code		
	<i>Sabine Gless & Jeannine Martin</i>	159
1	Introduction	160
2	Terms and Rationale behind the Concept of Exclusionary Rules in Swiss Law	162
3	Exclusionary Rules—The Legal Framework	165
3.1	Relevant Statutes—General Legal Framework	166
3.2	Identifying Relevant Situations and Procedural Sanctions	167
3.2.1	<i>No</i> Discretion Provided—Article 141 (1) CPC	167
3.2.2	<i>Some</i> Discretion Provided—Article 141 (2) CPC	168
3.2.3	Leeway in Decision-Making, but <i>No</i> Discretion—Article 141 (4) CPC	169
3.3	Exclusionary Rules in Swiss Criminal Law—Interim Conclusion	171
4	Water Always Finds Its Way? Recent Case Law and Legal Reform	171
4.1	Undercover Investigations v. Enquiries—The Emergence of a New Instrument	171
4.1.1	The Case Law ‘Pulls a Trigger’	172
4.1.2	The Situation after the Adoption of the CPC	174
4.1.3	The Pressure to Change the Law	175
4.2	Fruit of the Poisonous Tree—Not So Deadly after All . . .	176
5	Findings	179
	Bibliography	181
	Abbreviations	183
Chapter Nine · Throw It All Out? Judicial Discretion in Dealing with Procedural Faults		
	<i>Thomas Weigend</i>	185
1	Introduction	185

2	Procedural Faults before Trial	187
3	Procedural Faults at Trial	197
4	Conclusion: Why Different Standards?	201
	Bibliography	202
	Abbreviations	204
Chapter Ten · Procedural Sanctions in the EU Framework: Toward a Harmless Error Doctrine and Practice?		
	<i>Michele Caianiello</i>	207
1	The Importance of Sanction in Criminal Procedure	207
2	General Criteria for the EU Procedural Sanctions	208
	2.1 Harmless Error Test	209
	2.2 Proportionality	210
3	Specific Sanctioning Provisions	211
	Bibliography	214
	Abbreviations	215
PART IV · SENTENCING		
Chapter 11 · Death and Discretion: The American Experiment in Capital Jurisprudence		
	<i>Erik Luna</i>	219
1	Introduction	220
2	The Rise of Capital Jurisprudence	222
	2.1 Legal Origins	222
	2.2 <i>Furman</i>	224
	2.3 <i>Gregg</i>	227
3	The Modern Death Penalty	229
	3.1 Principles and Structures	229
	3.2 Cracks in the Framework	230
	3.3 Problems of Aggravation and Mitigation	235
4	Death Penalty Actors	241
	4.1 Discretion and Its Discontents	241
	4.2 Prosecutors	242
	4.3 Juries	246
5	Concluding Thoughts	248
	Index	253

Acknowledgments

This book contains the results of a 2013 conference in Ravenna on the subject of discretionary justice. The conference was organized by the University of Bologna (campus of Ravenna), the University of North Carolina, the University of Warwick, and the University of Basel, all of which we sincerely wish to thank for their support in this initiative.

There are too many individuals to name, but we cannot fail to mention our friend and colleague Mike Corrado, Arch T. Allen Distinguished Professor of Law at the University of North Carolina, without whom this inspiring series of conferences would not have begun. His work and enthusiasm has ensured that these events continue to flourish, with the addition of a Young Scholars Section for the first time in 2013 in Ravenna.

We would also like to thank the European Union, the two Foundations of Ravenna, the Flaminia Foundation, the Foundation of the Mutual Savings Bank and the U.S. Department of Education, through the UNC Center for European Studies, whose co-funding, together with the four universities, made the conference possible.

We are also grateful to our publisher, Carolina Academic Press, for their support and their enthusiasm in taking up our project.

Comparative work can also be a test of linguistic skills and a special thank you must go to Nathan Shaal-Wilson, who assisted in language and copy editing, ensuring that nobody got left behind!

