

When Justice Fails

When Justice Fails
*Causes and Consequences of
Wrongful Convictions*

Robert J. Norris
GEORGE MASON UNIVERSITY

Catherine L. Bonventre
GUILFORD COLLEGE

James R. Acker
UNIVERSITY AT ALBANY, SUNY



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2018
Carolina Academic Press, LLC
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Norris, Robert J., author. | Bonventre, Catherine L., author. | Acker, James R., 1951- author.

Title: When justice fails : causes and consequences of wrongful convictions / Robert J. Norris, Catherine L. Bonventre, and James R. Acker.

Description: Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, [2018] | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017053794 | ISBN 9781611638561 (alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Judicial error--United States. | Criminal justice, Administration of--United States.

Classification: LCC HV9950 .N67 2018 | DDC 345.73/0122--dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017053794>

e-ISBN 978-1-53100-493-4

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS, LLC
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

To Saundra Westervelt, who sparked my interest in wrongful convictions as an undergraduate student a decade ago, and to Kirk Bloodsworth, who cemented my passion for justice. May this work and these stories do the same for others.

—RJN

To Mom and Papa Bear and to the Albany Four.

—CLB

*To three generations of family—
Jenny, Elizabeth, Anna, Andy, and Ethan—and to the continuing quest for justice in the courts and well beyond.*

—JRA

Contents

Acknowledgments	xiii
Chapter 1 • Wrongful Convictions: Introduction and Overview	3
Learning Objectives	3
Case Study: The Scottsboro Boys	3
Wrongful Convictions and American Criminal Justice	5
How Often Do Wrongful Convictions Occur?	7
Wrongful Convictions: Causes and Correlates	10
An Abbreviated History of the Innocence Movement	11
Administering Justice: Arrest, Prosecution, and Adjudication	12
Learning Objectives and Volume Preview	16
Key Terms and Concepts	17
Discussion Questions	18
References	19
Chapter 2 • Eyewitness Identification	23
Learning Objectives	23
Case Study: Ronald Cotton	23
Eyewitness Errors: Overview and Research	25
Estimator Variables	26
System Variables	27
Witness Confidence	29
False Memories	29
Eyewitness Identification and the Law	30
Reducing Witness Error: Eyewitness Identification Policy Reforms	46
Witness Instructions	46
Blind Procedures	47

Confidence Statements	47
Lineup Composition	48
Sequential Presentation	49
Recording Identification Procedures	49
Conclusion	49
Key Terms and Concepts	50
Discussion Questions	51
References	51
Chapter 3 • False Admissions: Interrogations, Confessions, and Guilty Pleas	55
Learning Objectives	55
Case Study: The Central Park Five	55
False Admissions: Overview and Research	57
Interrogations and False Confessions	59
Misclassification	60
Coercion	60
Contamination	62
Strength of Confession Evidence	62
False Guilty Pleas	63
Confessions, Guilty Pleas, and the Law	64
Police Interrogation and Confessions	65
Guilty Pleas	68
Reducing False Admissions: Interrogation and Plea Reforms	73
Recording Custodial Interrogations	73
Reforming Interrogation Practices	74
Protecting Vulnerable Suspects	75
Plea Reform	76
Conclusion	77
Key Terms and Concepts	77
Discussion Questions	78
References	78
Chapter 4 • Forensic Science Evidence	83
Learning Objectives	83
Case Study: Santae Tribble	83
Research on Forensic Science Errors	85
Mistakes and Intentional Misconduct in the Lab and at Trial	85
Cognitive Bias	87
Forensic Science Evidence and the Law	88

Forensic Science Reform	94
Conclusion	97
Key Terms and Concepts	97
Discussion Questions	98
References	98
Chapter 5 • Incentivized Informants and Snitches	103
Learning Objectives	103
Case Study: William Dillon	103
Incentivized Informants: Overview and Research	105
Incentivized Informants and the Law	109
Increasing Informant Reliability: Policy Reforms	114
Data Collection	114
Establishing Guidelines	114
Limits on Informants and Prosecutors	115
Recording Requirements	115
Discovery and Disclosure	115
Pretrial Reliability Hearings	116
Corroboration Requirements	117
Cautionary Jury Instructions	117
Conclusion	118
Key Terms and Concepts	118
Discussion Questions	119
References	119
Chapter 6 • Government Actors: Police and Prosecutors	121
Learning Objectives	121
Case Study: Derrick Hamilton	121
Research on Government Actors	122
Mass Exonerations and Police Misconduct	126
The Law	128
The Police and Probable Cause	128
Police Investigations and the Preservation of Evidence	129
The Prosecutor's Duty to Disclose Material Exculpatory Evidence	132
Prosecutorial Immunity from Civil Liability	135
Policy Implications and Reforms	139
Conclusion	140
Key Terms and Concepts	140
Discussion Questions	141
References	142

Chapter 7 • Defense Attorneys	145
Learning Objectives	145
Case Study: A Tale of Two Attorneys	145
Research on Inadequate Defense Representation	146
Misdemeanor Defense	147
Felony Defense	149
Defense Attorneys and the Law	151
Implications for Policy and Reform	161
Conclusion	162
Key Terms and Concepts	162
Discussion Questions	163
References	164
Chapter 8 • No-Crime Cases	169
Learning Objectives	169
Overview of No-Crime Cases	169
No-Crime Murder Convictions	170
Murder or Suicide? The Case of Cesar Munoz	170
Death by Arson: The Case of Han Tak Lee	172
Infanticide: The Case of Sabrina Butler	174
Shaken Baby Syndrome: The Case of Brandy Briggs	174
No-Crime Drug Convictions	176
Planted Evidence: The Westbrooks-Cruz Case	177
Faulty Field Tests: Harris County Drug Cases	177
No-Crime Child Sex Abuse Convictions	178
The Howard Dudley Case	179
Kern County Convictions	180
Conclusion	182
Key Terms and Concepts	182
Discussion Questions	182
References	183
Chapter 9 • Detecting and Correcting Miscarriages of Justice	185
Learning Objectives	185
Case Study: The Norfolk Four	185
The Courts	186
Appeals	187
State Post-Conviction Review	189
Federal Habeas Corpus	189

Executive Clemency	191
Special Tribunals and Commissions	192
Preservation and Production of Evidence	192
Conclusion	193
Key Terms and Concepts	193
Discussion Questions	194
References	194
Chapter 10 · The Aftermath of Wrongful Convictions: Reintegration and Compensation	197
Learning Objectives	197
Case Study: Kirk Bloodsworth	197
Life after Exoneration	199
Redress for Wrongful Conviction	201
Methods of Compensation	202
Compensation Statutes: Strengths and Weaknesses	203
Improving Reentry Assistance for Exonerees	206
Official Accountability	207
Key Terms and Concepts	208
Discussion Questions	209
References	209
Chapter 11 · Actual Perpetrators: Public Safety and Monetary Considerations	213
Learning Objectives	213
Case Study: Levon Brooks and Kennedy Brewer	213
Additional Victims	215
Monetary Costs	219
Policy Implications	220
Key Terms and Concepts	223
Discussion Questions	224
References	224
Chapter 12 · Wrongful Convictions: Continuing and Future Challenges	227
Learning Objectives	227
Introduction	227
A Focus on Justice Systems	228
Actors and Organizations	228
Misdemeanors	229

Social and Structural Factors	230
Politics and Public Opinion	230
Race and Gender	231
Researching Miscarriages of Justice	231
Conclusion	232
Key Terms and Concepts	233
Discussion Questions	233
References	233
Glossary	235
Index	243

Acknowledgments

We first wish to thank the good folks at Carolina Academic Press, who have been a pleasure to work with. Beth Hall has shepherded us through the process from the outset with enthusiasm, constructive feedback, and unwavering support. We also gratefully acknowledge the careful and thorough assistance provided by TJ Smithers in helping prepare our manuscript for publication. Any lingering errors, of course, are ours alone.

We also are thankful to our many colleagues in wrongful conviction scholarship and teaching, whose work has inspired this book and made it possible.

We must also acknowledge those whose stories are covered in this volume. The wrongly convicted withstand nearly unimaginable suffering, yet they manage to survive and endure with grace and dignity. We hope this book will help educate students, scholars, practitioners, advocates, and the public, and be a small contribution toward improving the justice system and reducing further injustices. And to those who advocate on behalf of the wrongly convicted and are in the trenches advocating for an improved justice system, we continue to admire your work and hope this volume will help accelerate needed reforms.

RJN, CLB & JRA

