Understanding Criminal Procedure

VOLUME 2: ADJUDICATION

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS UNDERSTANDING SERIES

UNDERSTANDING
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Seventh Edition

Kristin E. Hickman

UNDERSTANDING

ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION

Kristen M. Blankley and Maureen A. Weston

UNDERSTANDING ANIMAL LAW
Adam Karp

UNDERSTANDING

ANTITRUST AND ITS ECONOMIC

IMPLICATIONS

Seventh Edition

E. Thomas Sullivan and Jeffrey L. Harrison

UNDERSTANDING

BANKRUPTCY

Fourth Edition

Jeffrey Ferriell and Edward J. Janger

UNDERSTANDING

CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY

PROPERTY LAW

Second Edition

Jo Carrillo

UNDERSTANDING

CAPITAL PUNISHMENT LAW

Fourth Edition

Linda E. Carter, Ellen S. Kreitzberg, and Scott W. Howe

UNDERSTANDING CIVIL PROCEDURE

Seventh Edition

Gene R. Shreve, Peter Raven-Hansen,

and Charles Gardner Geyh

UNDERSTANDING CIVIL PROCEDURE

The California Edition

Walter W. Heiser,

Gene R. Shreve, Peter Raven-Hansen,

and Charles Gardner Geyh

UNDERSTANDING

CIVIL RIGHTS LITIGATION

Third Edition

Howard M. Wasserman

UNDERSTANDING

CONFLICT OF LAWS

Fourth Edition

William M. Richman, William L. Reynolds,

and Chris A. Whytock

UNDERSTANDING

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

Fifth Edition

William D. Araiza

UNDERSTANDING CONTRACTS

Fifth Edition

Jeffrey Ferriell

UNDERSTANDING COPYRIGHT LAW

Seventh Edition

Marshall A. Leaffer

UNDERSTANDING CORPORATE LAW

Sixth Edition

Arthur R. Pinto and

James A. Fanto

UNDERSTANDING

CORPORATE TAXATION

Fourth Edition

Leandra Lederman and Michelle Kwon

UNDERSTANDING

CRIMINAL LAW

Ninth Edition

Joshua Dressler

UNDERSTANDING CRIMINAL PROCEDURE VOL. 1:

INVESTIGATION

Eighth Edition

Joshua Dressler, Alan C. Michaels,

and Ric Simmons

UNDERSTANDING

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE VOL. 2:

ADJUDICATION

Fifth Edition

Joshua Dressler, Alan C. Michaels,

and Ric Simmons

UNDERSTANDING DISABILITY LAW

Fourth Edition

Mark C. Weber

UNDERSTANDING

ELECTION LAW AND VOTING RIGHTS

Michael R. Dimino, Bradley A. Smith,

and Michael E. Solimine

UNDERSTANDING

EMPLOYEE BENEFITS LAW

Second Edition

Kathryn L. Moore

UNDERSTANDING

EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION LAW

Third Edition

Thomas R. Haggard and

Bruce N. Cameron

UNDERSTANDING EMPLOYMENT LAW

Third Edition

Paul M. Secunda, Richard A. Bales, and Jeffrey M. Hirsch

UNDERSTANDING

ENVIRONMENTAL LAW

Fourth Edition

Kevin A. Reilly and Philip Weinberg

UNDERSTANDING

ESTATE AND GIFT TAXATION

Third Edition

Brant J. Hellwig and

Robert T. Danforth

UNDERSTANDING EVIDENCE

Sixth Edition

Paul C. Giannelli and Jules Epstein

UNDERSTANDING FAMILY LAW

Fourth Edition

John Gregory, Peter N. Swisher, and Robin Wilson

UNDERSTANDING

FEDERAL AND CALIFORNIA

EVIDENCE

Paul C. Giannelli

UNDERSTANDING

FEDERAL COURTS AND JURISDICTION

Second Edition

Linda Mullenix, Martin H. Redish, and Georgene Vairo

UNDERSTANDING

FEDERAL INCOME TAXATION

Seventh Edition

J. Martin Burke and Michael K. Friel

UNDERSTANDING

THE FIRST AMENDMENT

Eighth Edition

Russell L. Weaver

UNDERSTANDING IMMIGRATION LAW

Third Edition

Kevin R. Johnson, Raquel Aldana, Bill Ong Hing, Leticia M. Saucedo, and

Enid Trucios-Haynes

UNDERSTANDING INSURANCE LAW

Sixth Edition

Robert H. Jerry, II and Douglas Richmond

UNDERSTANDING

INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW

Fourth Edition

Tyler T. Ochoa, Shubha Ghosh, and Mary LaFrance

UNDERSTANDING

INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS AND

FINANCIAL TRANSACTIONS

Fourth Edition

Jerold A. Friedland

UNDERSTANDING

INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW

Fourth Edition

Ellen S. Podgor, Roger S. Clark, and Lucian E. Dervan

UNDERSTANDING

INTERNATIONAL LAW

Third Edition

Stephen C. McCaffrey

UNDERSTANDING JEWISH LAW

Second Edition

Steven H. Resnicoff

UNDERSTANDING JUVENILE LAW

Fifth Edition

Martin Gardner

UNDERSTANDING LABOR LAW

Fifth Edition

Douglas E. Ray, Calvin William Sharpe, and Robert N. Strassfeld

UNDERSTANDING

THE LAW OF TERRORISM

Second Edition

Erik Luna and Wayne McCormack

UNDERSTANDING THE LAW OF ZONING AND

LAND USE CONTROLS

Third Edition
Barlow Burke

UNDERSTANDING LAWYERS' ETHICS

Sixth Edition

Monroe H. Freedman and Abbe Smith

UNDERSTANDING
LOCAL GOVERNMENT

Second Edition

Sandra Stevenson

UNDERSTANDING

MODERN REAL ESTATE

TRANSACTIONS

Fourth Edition

Alex M. Johnson, Jr.

UNDERSTANDING

NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS AND

PAYMENT SYSTEMS

Second Edition

William H. Lawrence

UNDERSTANDING

NONPROFIT AND TAX EXEMPT

ORGANIZATIONS

Third Edition

Nicholas P. Cafardi and

Jaclyn Fabean Cherry

UNDERSTANDING

PARTNERSHIP AND LLC TAXATION

Fifth Edition

Jerold A. Friedland

UNDERSTANDING PATENT LAW

Third Edition

Amy L. Landers

UNDERSTANDING PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LAW

Second Edition

Bruce L. Ottley, Rogelio A. Lasso, and Terrence F. Kiely

.....

UNDERSTANDING PROPERTY LAW

Fifth Edition

John G. Sprankling

UNDERSTANDING REMEDIES

Fourth Edition

James M. Fischer

UNDERSTANDING

SALES AND LEASES OF GOODS

Third Edition

William H. Henning, William H. Lawrence,

and Henry Deeb Gabriel

UNDERSTANDING

SECURED TRANSACTIONS

Fifth Edition

William H. Lawrence, William H. Henning,

and R. Wilson Freyermuth

UNDERSTANDING SECURITIES LAW

Eighth Edition

Marc I. Steinberg

UNDERSTANDING SPORTS LAW

Timothy Davis and N. Jeremi Duru

UNDERSTANDING

TAXATION OF BUSINESS ENTITIES

Second Edition

Walter D. Schwidetzky and Fred B. Brown

UNDERSTANDING TORTS

Seventh Edition

John L. Diamond, Lawrence C. Levine,

and Anita Bernstein

UNDERSTANDING

TRADE SECRET LAW

John G. Sprankling and

Thomas G. Sprankling

UNDERSTANDING

TRADEMARK LAW

Fourth Edition

Mary LaFrance

UNDERSTANDING

TRUSTS AND ESTATES

Seventh Edition

Roger W. Andersen and Susan Gary

UNDERSTANDING

WHITE COLLAR CRIME

Fifth Edition

J. Kelly Strader and Todd Haugh

Understanding Criminal Procedure

VOLUME 2: ADJUDICATION

FIFTH EDITION

Joshua Dressler

Distinguished University Professor Emeritus Michael E. Moritz College of Law The Ohio State University

Alan C. Michaels

Edwin M. Cooperman Chair in Law Dean Emeritus Michael E. Moritz College of Law The Ohio State University

Ric Simmons

JACOB E. DAVIS AND JACOB E. DAVIS II CHAIR IN LAW
ASSOCIATE DEAN FOR FACULTY AND INTELLECTUAL LIFE
MICHAEL E. MORITZ COLLEGE OF LAW
THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY



Copyright © 2024 Carolina Academic Press, LLC All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Dressler, Joshua, author. | Michaels, Alan C., author. | Simmons, Ric, author.

Title: Understanding criminal procedure. Volume 1, Investigation / by Joshua Dressler, Alan C. Michaels, Ric Simmons.

Description: Eighth edition. | Durham : Carolina Academic Press, 2021. |

Series: Understanding series | Includes index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021013491 (print) | LCCN 2021013492 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781531021535 (v. 1; paperback) | ISBN 9781531021542 (v. 1; ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Criminal procedure—United States.

Classification: LCC KF9619 .D74 2021 (print) | LCC KF9619 (ebook) | DDC 345.73/05_dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021013491

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021013492

Vol. 2 ISBN 978-1-61163-937-7 Vol. 2 E-ISBN 978-1-61163-993-3

> Carolina Academic Press 700 Kent Street Durham, North Carolina 27701 (919) 489-7486 www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

To Dottie: You Make Life Possible

—J.D.

To Mom and Dad: Thank You for Everything

—A.C.M.

To My Family

—R.S.

Contents

Preface		xxiii
Chapter 1	○ Introduction to Criminal Procedure	3
§ 1.01	The Relationship of "Criminal Law" to "Criminal Procedure"	3
§1.02	Sources of Procedural Law	4
	[A] Formal Sources	4
	[B] Informal Sources: A Taste of Reality	6
§1.03	Stages of a Criminal Prosecution	7
	[A] In General	7
	[B] Investigatory Stage	8
	[1] Search and Seizure	8
	[2] Interrogation	8
	[3] Identification Procedures	9
	[4] Arrest	9
	[C] Adjudicatory Stage	9
	[1] Issuance of a Complaint	9
	[2] Probable Cause (Gerstein) Hearing	9
	[3] First Appearance Before the Magistrate	10
	[4] Preliminary Hearings and Grand Jury Proceedings	11
	[5] Arraignment	12
	[6] Pretrial Motions	12
	[7] Trial	13
	[8] Sentencing and Post-Trial Proceedings	13
	[a] Sentencing	13
	[b] Appeal	14
	[c] Collateral Attack of a Conviction: <i>Habeas Corpus</i>	14
§1.04	Studying Constitutional Law Cases	15
	[A] Read Concurring and Dissenting Opinions	16
	[B] Learn Case Names	16
	[C] Count Votes	16
	[D] Learn the Views of Individual Justices	17
	[E] Be Sensitive to Supreme Court History	18
Chapter 2	2 · Overarching Policy Issues in Criminal Procedure	23
§ 2.01	Norms of the Criminal Process	23

x CONTENTS

\$ 2.02	Alternative Models of Criminal Justice	25
	[A] Overview	25
	[B] Crime Control Model of Criminal Justice	26
	[C] Due Process Model of Criminal Justice	27
\$ 2.03	The Role of "Truth" in the Criminal Justice System	28
\$2.04	Accusatorial versus Inquisitorial Systems of Justice	31
\$ 2.05	Race, Gender, and Economic Class in the Law	33
\$2.06	Who Should Devise the Rules of Criminal Procedure?	35
§ 2.07	Formulating the Rules of Criminal Procedure: Some	
	Overarching Controversies	36
	[A] Bright-Line Rules versus Case-by-Case Adjudication	36
	[B] Subjectivity versus Objectivity: Rule-Making to Avoid	
	Pretextual Conduct	39
Chapter	3 · Incorporation of the Bill of Rights	43
§ 3.01	_	43
	[A] Nature of the Issue	43
	[B] Importance of the Debate	44
§ 3.02	Incorporation Theories	45
	[A] Full Incorporation	45
	[B] Fundamental Rights	45
	[C] Full-Incorporation-Plus	46
	[D] Selective Incorporation	46
§ 3.03	The Incorporation Debate	47
	[A] Overview of the Debate	47
	[B] What Did the Framers Intend?	47
	[C] Textual Claims: What Does "Due Process" Mean?	48
	[D] Which Doctrine Is More Libertarian?	48
	[E] Which Theory Is Structurally Preferable?	49
\$3.04	Which Theory Has "Won" the Debate?	49
Chapter -	4 · The Right to Counsel: At Trial and on Appeal	51
§ 4.01	Overview: The Importance of Defense Lawyers in the	
	Adversary System	51
§ 4.02	When the Right to Counsel Applies	52
§ 4.03	The Right to Counsel: At Trial	53
	[A] The Right to Employ Counsel	53
	[B] Indigents: The Right to Appointed Counsel	53
	[1] Overview	53
	[2] The Road to <i>Gideon</i>	55
	[a] Powell v. Alabama	55
	[b] Johnson v. Zerbst	56
	[c] Betts v. Brady	56
	[3] Gideon v. Wainwright	57

CONTERNIE	
CONTENTS	X1

	[4] Post-Gideon Law: The Misdemeanor Cases	58
	[a] Argersinger v. Hamlin	58
	[b] Scott v. Illinois	60
	[c] Alabama v. Shelton	61
	[d] Two More Cases: Gagnon and Nichols	62
	[5] Implementing the Right to Appointed Counsel	63
§ 4.04	The Right to Counsel: On Appeal	64
	[A] Inapplicability of the Sixth Amendment	64
	[B] First Appeal (as of Right)	65
	[1] In General	65
	[2] Special Problem: Frivolous Appeals	66
	[C] Subsequent (Discretionary) Appeals	67
	[D] First (Discretionary) Appeal After a Guilty Plea	69
§ 4.05	The Right of Self-Representation	70
	[A] The Defense: Who Is in Charge?	70
	[B] Faretta v. California	71
	[1] Recognition of the Right	71
	[2] Reflections on Faretta	72
	[3] Current Status of Faretta	73
	[C] Procedural Issues	75
	[1] Competence	75
	[2] Making the Choice of Self-Representation	76
	[3] Timeliness of the Request	77
	[4] Hybrid Representation	77
	[5] Standby Counsel	77
	[6] Legal Significance of Poor Self-Representation	78
	[7] Legal Effect of an Erroneous Denial of the Right	78
§ 4.06	The Right to Representation by One's Preferred Attorney	79
	[A] In General	79
	[B] Special Problem: Seizing Lawyers' Fees	80
	Interference with the Right to Counsel	83
§ 4.08	Effective Assistance of Counsel: General Principles	84
	[A] Nature of the Issue	84
	[B] "Ineffective Assistance": The Strickland Test	85
	[1] Overview	85
	[2] The First Prong: Deficiency of Representation	87
	[a] The Standard	87
	[b] Deficiency: Supreme Court Case Law	88
	[i] Failure to Perform Ordinary Tasks—Held Not	
	Unreasonable	88
	[ii] Failure to Perform Ordinary Tasks—Held	
	Unreasonable	90
	[iii] Ignorance of Relevant Law	92

xii CONTENTS

	[3] The Second Prong: Prejudice	92
	[a] The Standard	92
	[b] Prejudice: Supreme Court Case Law	94
	[c] Prejudice: Special Problems	96
	[i] The Factually Guilty Defendant	96
	[ii] The Sleeping Lawyer	98
	[iii] Racially Tainted Evidence	98
§ 4.09	Effective Assistance of Counsel: Conflicts of Interest	100
	[A] Nature of the Issue	100
	[B] Pretrial Procedures to Avoid Conflicts	100
	[C] Post-Trial Proof of a Conflict	101
	[D] Waiver of the Right to Conflict-Free Representation	102
§ 4.10	Effective Assistance: The Role of Ethical Canons	103
Chapter	5 · Pretrial Release and Pretrial Detention	105
§ 5.01	Pretrial Release: Procedural Context and Overview	105
§ 5.02	Pretrial Release: Interests at Stake	107
	[A] The Community's Interest	107
	[B] The Arrestee's Interest	108
§ 5.03	Pretrial Release: Eighth Amendment	109
§ 5.04	Pretrial Release: Statutory Law	110
	[A] Cash Bail and Bail Bondsmen	110
	[B] State and Federal Bail Reforms	111
§ 5.05	Preventive Detention	113
	[A] Federal Bail Reform Act of 1984	113
	[1] Overview	113
	[2] Impact of the 1984 Act	113
	[3] The 1984 Act: Procedures	114
	[B] The Policy Debate	115
	[1] Criticisms	115
	[2] Defenses	117
	[C] The Constitutional Debate: U.S. v. Salerno	118
	[1] The Holding	118
	[2] Due Process	118
	[a] Substantive	118
	[b] Procedural	120
	[3] Eighth Amendment	120
	[4] Dissenting Opinions	121
§ 5.06	Bail Hearings and Risk Assessment	122
Chapter	6 · Charging Decisions	125
§ 6.01	The Scope and Exercise of Prosecutorial Discretion	125
	[A] The Scope of Discretion	125
	[B] The Exercise of Prosecutorial Discretion	127

CONTENTS	3/111
CONTENIS	XIII

	[1] Factors Influencing Charging Decisions	127
	[2] Channeling the Exercise of Discretion	128
§ 6.02	Prosecutorial Discretion: The Policy Debate	129
	[A] Criticisms of Prosecutorial Discretion	129
	[B] Defenses of Prosecutorial Discretion	130
\$ 6.03	Constitutional Limits on Prosecutorial Discretion	131
	[A] Selective Prosecution	131
	[B] Vindictive Prosecution	133
	[1] Overview	133
	[2] Blackledge v. Perry	133
	[3] Limitations on the Vindictiveness Presumption:	
	United States v. Goodwin	134
§ 6.04	Felony Charging Procedures: Overview	135
§ 6.05	Preliminary Hearings	137
	[A] Preliminary Hearing Procedures	137
	[B] Functions of the Preliminary Hearing	138
\$6.06	Grand Juries	139
	[A] Overview	139
	[B] The Screening Function	139
	[1] Constitutional Requirement	139
	[2] Procedures	139
	[3] Grand Jury Screening: The Policy Debate	141
	[C] The Investigatory Function	143
§ 6.07	Joinder and Severance: Offenses	144
	[A] Overview	144
	[1] Terminology	144
	[2] The Parties' Interests	145
	[a] The Prosecution	145
	[b] The Defense	146
	[B] Joinder Rules	147
	[C] Severance Rules	148
	[D] Multiplicity and Duplicity	149
\$6.08	Joinder and Severance: Defendants	150
	[A] Overview	150
	[B] The Federal Rules	151
	[1] Joinder	151
	[2] Severance	152
Chapter	7 · Discovery	153
§ 7.01	Constitutional Discovery Rights of the Defendant: Overview	153
§ 7.02		154
	[A] Favorable Nature of the Evidence	154
	[B] Suppression of the Evidence by the State	155
	[C] Prejudice—The Materiality Standard	156

xiv CONTENTS

	[1] Agurs	156
	[2] Bagley	157
	[3] Implications of a Materiality Standard	158
§ 7.03	Brady and Plea Bargains	160
§ 7.04	The State's Duty to Preserve Evidence	161
§ 7.05	Statutory Discovery by the Defense: Overview	163
§ 7.06	What the Defense May Discover	164
	[A] Statements by Defendant and Co-Defendants	164
	[B] Physical Evidence	165
	[C] Witness Information	165
	[D] The Defendant's Criminal Record	166
	[E] Scientific Tests and Examinations	166
	[F] "Brady Material"	166
§ 7.07	Discovery by the Defense—Policy Considerations	167
§ 7.08	Discovery by the Prosecution	168
	[A] Discovery by the Prosecution—Constitutional Issues	169
	[1] Self-Incrimination	169
	[2] Due Process	170
	[3] Compulsory Process	171
	[B] Rules Governing Discovery by the Prosecution	171
	[1] Significance of Defense Discovery Request	171
	[2] What the Prosecution Can Discover	172
Chapter 8	8 · Speedy Trial	173
\$8.01	Defendant's Right to a Speedy Disposition: Overview	173
\$8.02	Constitutional Right to a Speedy Trial	175
	[A] Overview	175
	[B] When the Right Attaches	175
	[C] Determining Speedy Trial Right Violations: Barker v. Wingo	176
	[1] Overview	176
	[2] The Barker Factors	177
	[a] Length of the Delay	177
	[b] Reason for the Delay	177
	[c] Defendant's Assertion of the Right	178
	[d] Prejudice	178
	[3] Application of the <i>Barker</i> Test	179
	[D] Remedy	179
\$8.03	Statutory Speedy Trial Rights	180
	[A] Time Limits	181
	[B] Tolling Provisions	181
	[C] Remedy	182
\$8.04	Unconstitutional Pre-Accusation Delay	182
\$8.05	Statutes of Limitation	183

CONTENTS xv

	[A] Overview	183
	[B] Justifications	184
Chapter !	9 · Plea Bargaining and Guilty Pleas	187
§ 9.01	Guilty Pleas: Overview	187
	[A] Procedural Context	187
	[B] Constitutional and Policy Context	188
\$ 9.02	Validity of a Guilty Plea: Constitutional Principles	189
	[A] Overview	189
	[B] Voluntariness of the Plea	190
	[C] Knowing (Intelligent) Nature of the Plea	193
	[1] In General	193
	[2] Nature of the Charges	193
	[3] Penal Consequences of the Plea	194
	[4] Nature of the Rights Being Waived	195
	[5] Incorrect or Incomplete Legal Advice:	
	How It Affects the Intelligence of the Plea	196
	[D] Factual Basis of the Plea: <i>Alford</i> Pleas	198
\$ 9.03	Obtaining a Valid Guilty Plea: Federal Procedures	199
	[A] Ensuring Voluntariness	199
	[B] Ensuring an Intelligent Plea	200
	[C] Determining the Factual Basis of the Plea	201
\$ 9.04	Effect of a Guilty Plea on Prior Constitutional Claims	201
	[A] General Rule	201
	[B] Exceptions to the General Rule	202
	[C] Conditional Pleas	204
\$ 9.05	Plea Bargaining: General Principles	204
	[A] Overview	204
	[B] Types of Plea Agreements	205
	[C] Federal Plea Agreement Procedures	205
	[D] Judicial Participation in Plea Negotiations	206
	[E] Ineffective Assistance of Counsel in Plea Negotiations	209
	[1] Applicability of Strickland	209
	[2] Deficiency	210
	[3] Prejudice	211
	[4] Remedy	211
\$ 9.06	Plea Bargaining: Policy Debate	213
	[A] Is Plea Bargaining Inevitable?	213
	[B] Is Plea Bargaining Good in Principle?	214
	[1] In Support of Plea Bargaining	214
	[2] In Opposition to Plea Bargaining	216
	[a] Overview: Serving the Interests of the Powerful?	216
	[b] Sentencing Differential	216

xvi CONTENTS

	[c] Prosecutorial Overcharging	217
	[d] Inadequate Representation	217
	[e] Conviction of the Innocent	218
§ 9.07	Plea Bargaining: Broken Deals and Withdrawn Offers	219
	[A] Broken Deals	219
	[1] Consequences of Breach	219
	[2] Definition of Breach	220
	[B] Withdrawn Offers	221
Chanter 1	0 · The Right to Trial by Jury	223
_	Overview	223
-	When the Right to Trial by Jury Applies	225
y 10.02	[A] What Crimes the Right Applies To	225
	[1] Offenses with Defined Penalties	225
	[a] The Rule	225
	[b] Comparison to Right to Counsel	226
	[2] Offenses without Defined Penalties: Contempt	227
	[3] Aggregation of Multiple Offenses	227
	[B] What Issues the Right Applies To: Juries and Sentencing	229
	[1] The Apprendi Rule	229
	[2] Mandatory Minimum Sentences	230
	[3] Prior Convictions	231
	[C] Special Issue: Jury Waivers and Bench Trials	231
§ 10 03	Jury Size	233
	Fair Cross-Section Requirement	235
	Voir Dire and Challenges for Cause	238
	Peremptory Challenges	240
y 10.00	[A] Overview	240
	[B] The Road to <i>Batson</i>	242
	[C] Batson v. Kentucky	244
	[1] The Batson Decision	244
	[2] The <i>Batson</i> Framework	245
	[3] Extensions of <i>Batson</i>	247
	[a] Black Juror/White Defendant	247
	[b] Race-Based Use of Peremptories by the Defendant	247
	[c] Peremptory Strikes Based on Gender	248
	[d] Peremptory Strikes Based on Religion or Other Factors	248
	1 ,	240
	[4] Evaluating <i>Batson</i> [a] <i>Batson</i> Claims in Practice	249
	[b] Batson Goes Too Far	
		250
	[c] Batson Does Not Go Far Enough	250
-	1 · Confrontation Clause	253
§ 11.01	Overview	253

CONTERNIE	••
CONTENTS	XV11

§11.02	Out-of-Court Statements Barred by the Confrontation Clause	255
	[A] Background and the <i>Roberts</i> Test	255
	[B] Crawford v. Washington	256
	[1] The Decision	256
	[2] The Crawford Exceptions: When Out-of-Court	
	Testimonial Statements Are Not Barred by the	
	Confrontation Clause	258
	[a] Unavailability and Prior Cross-Examination	258
	[b] Forfeiture by Wrongdoing and Dying Declarations	259
	[C] Subsequent Development of the Crawford Doctrine	260
	[1] The Meaning of "Testimonial"	260
	[a] Expansion then Contraction of "Testimonial" with	
	Regard to Witness Statements: Davis and Hammon,	
	Bryant, and Clark	260
	[b] Expansion and Contraction of "Testimonial" with	
	Regard to Forensic Reports: Melendez-Diaz,	
	Bullington, and Williams	264
	[2] The Confrontation Clause and "Non-Testimonial" Hearsay	267
§ 11.03	The Confrontation Clause and the Manner of Testimony:	
	Child Witnesses	269
	[A] Overview	269
	[B] Coy v. Iowa	269
	[C] Maryland v. Craig	270
	[D] Craig and Crawford	271
§ 11.04	Special Rule: <i>Bruton</i> and the Statements of Codefendants	272
	[A] The Issue	272
	[B] Bruton v. United States	273
	[C] Richardson v. Marsh	273
	[D] Gray v. Maryland	275
	[E] Samia v. United States	277
Chapter 1	2 · The Privilege against Compelled Self-Incrimination:	
-	Issues in Adjudication	279
§12.01	Fifth Amendment Self-Incrimination Clause: Overview	279
§12.02	The Origins of the Privilege against Self-Incrimination	280
§12.03	Is The Privilege a Good Idea? The Controversy	283
	[A] In General	283
	[B] The Modern Debate	284
	[1] The "Cruel Trilemma" Thesis	284
	[2] Compelled Self-Accusation as a Moral Wrong	285
	[3] The Privilege as a Critical Component of the	
	Adversary System	286
	[4] Protection of the Innocent	287

xviii CONTENTS

§12.04	The Fifth Amendment Privilege: The Elements	289
	[A] "No Person"	289
	[B] "Shall Be Compelled"	290
	[C] "In Any Criminal Case"	291
	[D] "To Be a Witness Against Himself"	291
	[1] What Makes a Person a "Witness"	292
	[a] "Testimonial or Communicative" Evidence: The Rule	292
	[b] Application of the Rule	292
	[c] A Closer Look at the Rule: Pennsylvania v. Muniz	294
	[2] Seriousness of the Threat of Incrimination	294
§12.05]	Invoking and Overcoming the Privilege	296
	[A] Invoking the Privilege	296
	[B] Overcoming the Privilege: Grants of Immunity	297
§12.06]	Documents and the Privilege against Self-Incrimination	299
	[A] The Content of Documents	299
	[1] Overview	299
	[2] Required-Records Doctrine	300
	[B] The Act-of-Production Doctrine	301
	[1] In General	301
	[2] United States v. Hubbell	303
§12.07]	Reference at Trial to the Defendant's Silence	304
	[A] Griffin v. California	304
	[B] Scope of the <i>Griffin</i> Rule	305
	[C] Prearrest Silence	306
Chapter 13	3 · Burden of Proof and Verdict Issues	309
§13.01]	Burden of Proof	309
	[A] Meaning of "Beyond a Reasonable Doubt"	309
	[B] What the Burden Applies To	311
§13.02 \	Unanimous and Nonunanimous Verdicts	312
	[A] Overview	312
	[B] Nonunanimous Juries Allowed in the States	313
	[C] Nonunanimous Juries Prohibited	314
§13.03 l	Multi-Theory Verdicts: Elements versus Means	316
§13.04]	Inconsistent Verdicts	318
§13.05]	Deadlocked Juries	320
§13.06]	Tury Nullification	322
	[A] The Issue	322
	[B] The Debate	322
	[C] The Law	324
	[D] Race-Based Nullification	325
Chapter 14	↓ · Double Jeopardy	327
§ 14.01 (General Principles	327

CONTENTS	X1X

	[A] Constitutional Text	327
	[1] In General	327
	[2] "In Jeopardy"	327
	[3] "Of Life or Limb"	328
	[a] Generally	328
	[b] Civil versus Criminal Proceedings and Penalties	328
	[B] "Dual Sovereignty" Doctrine	330
	[C] Guarantees of the Double Jeopardy Clause	333
	[D] Values Underlying the Double Jeopardy Clause	334
§14.02	Reprosecution After a Mistrial	335
	[A] General Principles	335
	[B] Mistrials Over the Defendant's Objection	336
	[1] The "Manifest Necessity" Standard	336
	[2] "Manifest Necessity": The Case Law	336
	[a] The Early Cases	336
	[b] The Temporary "Radical Transformation"	337
	[c] The Supreme Court Turns Direction Again	338
	[3] Making Sense of the Case Law	341
	[C] Mistrials with the Defendant's Consent	341
	[1] General Rule	341
	[2] Exception: Intent to Provoke a Mistrial Motion	342
§ 14.03	Reprosecution After an Acquittal	344
	[A] Rule	344
	[1] In General	344
	[2] Appealing an Acquittal	346
	[B] Should the Rule Be Modified?	347
§ 14.04	Reprosecution After a Dismissal	349
	[A] Nature of a "Dismissal"	349
	[B] General Rules	349
	[1] Dismissal on the Defendant's Motion	349
	[2] Dismissal Without the Defendant's Consent	350
§ 14.05	Reprosecution After a Conviction	350
	[A] General Rule	350
	[B] When Reprosecution Is Barred	351
	[1] Insufficiency of the Evidence	35]
	[a] The Burks Principle	351
	[b] When <i>Burks</i> Does Not Apply	351
	[2] Prosecutorial Misconduct	352
	[C] Special Problem: Convictions with Implied Acquittals	353
	[1] Verdict Acquittal	353
	[2] Sentence "Acquittal"	353
	Government Appeals of Criminal Sentences	355 356
§ 14.07	7 Multiple Prosecutions of the "Same Offense"	

xx CONTENTS

	[A] An Overview of the Problems Ahead	356
	[B] "Same Offense": The <i>Blockburger</i> Rule	358
	[C] "Same Offense": Beyond Blockburger	359
	[1] <i>Harris v. Oklahoma</i> : A Minor Extension of <i>Blockburger</i>	359
	[2] United States v. Dixon: Broadening Harris	360
	[D] Exceptions to the General Rule	361
	[1] Second Crime Not Complete	361
	[2] First Prosecution Ends in Mistrial or Conviction	
	Reversed on Appeal	362
	[3] Defendant Forfeits Double Jeopardy Claim by	
	Consenting to Separate Charges	362
§14.08	Excessive or Multiple Punishments for the "Same Offense"	363
	[A] Excessive Punishment	363
	[1] In General	363
	[2] Credit for Time Served	364
	[B] Multiple Punishments	364
	[1] In General	364
	[2] Sentence Enhancement for Uncharged Criminal Conduct	365
§ 14.09	Collateral Estoppel	366
	[A] Nature of the Doctrine	366
	[B] Limits on Application of the Doctrine	367
Chapter 1	5 · Sentencing	371
§ 15.01	Overview	371
	[A] The Subject of Sentencing	371
	[B] The Purposes of Punishment	372
	[1] The Role of the Purposes of Punishment	372
	[2] Retribution	373
	[3] Deterrence	374
	[4] Incapacitation	375
	[5] Rehabilitation	375
	[6] Mixed Theories of Punishment	376
	[C] Types of Sentences	376
	[1] In General	376
	[2] Indeterminate versus Determinate Sentences	377
	[3] Mandatory versus Discretionary Sentences	378
§ 15.02	Constitutional Limits on Sentencing Procedures	379
	[A] Overview	379
	[B] The Original Framing of the Debate: Williams v. New York	380
	[C] Trial Rights Held <i>Inapplicable</i> at Sentencing	381
	[1] Burden of Proof Beyond a Reasonable Doubt	381
	[2] Confrontation	381

CONTENTS	XX

	[3] Double Jeopardy	382
	[4] Jury	384
	[D] Trial Rights Held Applicable at Sentencing	384
	[1] Counsel	384
	[2] Disclosure of Exculpatory Evidence	385
	[3] Privilege Against Self-Incrimination	385
§ 15.03	The Federal Sentencing Guidelines	386
	[A] The Sentencing Guidelines: A Brief History	386
	[B] How the Guidelines Work	387
	[C] Criticisms of the Sentencing Guidelines	389
	[1] Real-Offense Sentencing	390
	[2] Prosecutorial Control	390
	[3] Sentence Severity	391
	[4] Racial Disparity	391
§15.04	Constitutional Limits on Guidelines Systems: Apprendi and	
	Its Progeny	392
	[A] Overview	392
	[B] Apprendi v. New Jersey	393
	[C] Blakely v. Washington	395
	[D] United States v. Booker	396
	[1] Issue 1: Constitutionality of the Federal Sentencing	
	Guidelines	396
	[2] Issue 2: Remedy for the Constitutional Problem	396
	[3] The Meaning of <i>Booker</i>	398
	[a] Overview	398
	[b] Rita v. United States	398
	[c] Gall v. United States and Kimbrough v. United States	399
	[E] Apprendi and Mandatory Minimums	401
	[F] The Prior-Conviction Exception	401
§ 15.05	Judicial Vindictiveness	403
	[A] The Pearce Principle	403
	[B] The Supreme Court Narrows the Vindictiveness Rules	403
	[1] Pearce Becomes a Rebuttable Presumption	403
	[2] When Does the Presumption Apply?	404
	[3] How May the Presumption Be Rebutted?	405
Chapter 1	16 · Appeals	407
§16.01 In General		407
§16.02	Proof of Guilt	409
	[A] Sufficiency of the Evidence	409
	[B] Weight of the Evidence	410
§16.03	Plain Error	411

xxii CONTENTS

	A] Background to the Plain Error Exception	411
[[B] Elements of the Plain Error Exception	412
\$16.04 H	Harmless Error	414
[[A] Overview	414
[[B] Non-Constitutional Errors	416
[[C] Constitutional Errors	417
	[1] Direct Appeals	417
	[a] "Structural Error" versus "Trial Error"	417
	[b] Constitutional Trial Errors: Standard of Harmlessness	420
	[2] Collateral Appeals (Habeas Corpus Proceedings)	421
[[D] Criticisms of Harmless Error Doctrine	422
[[E] Summary of Standards of Review	423
§16.05 Retroactivity		424
[[A] Explanation of the Issue	424
[[B] Common Law of Retroactivity	426
[[C] Current Retroactivity Law	426
	[1] Cases Not Yet Final: Direct Review	426
	[2] Cases Already Final: Collateral Review	427
	[a] General Rule	427
	[b] Meaning of "New Rule"	429
Table of Ca	ises	431
Federal Ru	les of Criminal Procedure	443
Federal Rules of Evidence		445
Table of Statutes		447
Index		449

Preface

The fifth edition of *Understanding Criminal Procedure: Adjudication* brings the volume up to date with the many legal developments since the last edition. Recent years have brought important changes and new debates to the forefront, both in areas governed by constitutional doctrine, such as the Confrontation Clause and the Trial by Jury provision of the Sixth Amendment, and in matters largely governed at the local level, such as the use of algorithms and big data in bail hearings and new rules on discovery. The new edition explains this entire landscape, in carefully organized chapters describing where we are, how we got here and where further developments may be expected.

As before, this volume covers the criminal process after the police investigation ends and the adjudicative process commences. This book is useful in criminal procedure courses (variously entitled *Criminal Procedure II; Criminal Procedure: Adjudication*; etc.) that follow the criminal process through the various stages of adjudication, commencing with pretrial issues—such as counsel, charging, pretrial release and discovery—and continuing with the trial itself and then post-conviction proceedings: sentencing and appeals. Its counterpart, *Understanding Criminal Procedure: Investigation*, is intended to be used in criminal procedure courses that focus primarily or exclusively on police investigatory process. The two books share the first three introductory chapters, as well as the chapter on defendant's right to counsel, since those chapters cover issues that arise in both courses.

Understanding Criminal Procedure: Adjudication is primarily designed for law students. We have written the Text so that students can use it with confidence that it will assist them in course preparation, and professors can recommend or assign the volumes to students with confidence that they will improve classroom dialogue.

The treatise covers the most important United States Supreme Court cases in the adjudicatory portion of criminal procedure and, where pertinent, the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, federal statutes, and lower federal and state court cases are considered. The book addresses overarching policy issues of criminal procedure and considers in depth and objectively some of the hottest debates in the field. The authors have also included citations to important scholarship, both classic and recent, into which readers may delve more deeply regarding specific topics.

Readers should find the Text user-friendly. Students who want a thorough grasp of a topic can and should read the relevant chapter in its entirety. However, each chapter is divided into subsections, so that readers with more refined research needs xxiv PREFACE

can find answers to their questions efficiently. We also include citations to important scholarship, both classic and recent, into which readers may delve more deeply regarding specific topics. And, because so many of the topics interrelate, cross-referencing footnotes are included, so that readers can easily move from one part of the Text to another, if necessary.

Gender policy of the Text. Obviously, both men and women fill all the roles in the criminal justice system: lawyer, judge, police officer, legislator, criminal suspect, and victim. In the past, we have alternated between using male and female pronouns; in the new edition, consistent with what is now a common practice, we use the non-gendered "they" when discussing a hypothetical or generic party.

Acknowledgments. Many persons helped make these volumes possible. We can name only a few here. Professors Lee Lamborn and the late Joseph Grano read and commented on every page of every chapter of the manuscript for the first edition. Professor George Thomas did the same with the second edition. Many people commented on drafts of chapters of the third edition. The text is much better because of their generous assistance. Mistakes and omissions are the result of our stubborn refusal to listen to advice.

For this fifth edition, we are also grateful for the research assistance of a great bunch of law students at The Ohio State University's Moritz College of Law: Kristen Adams ('25), Em Lowes ('25), and Michael Rienzo.

We thank our families for their love and support.

Joshua Dressler Alan C. Michaels Ric Simmons December 2023