THE COUNSELOR-AT-LAW: A COLLABORATIVE APPROACH TO CLIENT INTERVIEWING AND COUNSELING
Third Edition
LexisNexis Law School Publishing
Advisory Board

Paul Caron
Professor of Law
Pepperdine University School of Law
Herzog Summer Visiting Professor in Taxation
University of San Diego School of Law

Bridgette Carr
Clinical Professor of Law
University of Michigan Law School

Olympia Duhart
Professor of Law and Director of Lawyering Skills & Values Program
Nova Southeastern University, Shepard Broad Law School

Samuel Estreicher
Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law
Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law
NYU School of Law

Steven I. Friedland
Professor of Law and Senior Scholar
Elon University School of Law

Carole Goldberg
Jonathan D. Varat Distinguished Professor of Law
UCLA School of Law

Oliver Goodenough
Professor of Law
Vermont Law School

Paul Marcus
Haynes Professor of Law
William and Mary Law School

John Sprankling
Distinguished Professor of Law
McGeorge School of Law
THE COUNSELOR-AT-LAW: A COLLABORATIVE APPROACH TO CLIENT INTERVIEWING AND COUNSELING

Third Edition

Robert F. Cochran, Jr.
Director, The Herbert and Elinor Nootbaar Institute on Law, Religion, and Ethics
Louis D. Brandeis Professor of Law
Pepperdine University School of Law

John M.A. DiPippa
Dean Emeritus and Distinguished Professor of Law and Public Policy
University of Arkansas at Little Rock
William H. Bowen School of Law

Martha M. Peters
Professor of Legal Education, Emerita
Elon University School of Law
Cochran, Robert F., 1951 — author.
A collaborative approach to client interviewing and counseling
Robert F. Cochran, Jr., Director, the Herbert and Elinor Nootbaar Institute on Law, Religion, and Ethics and Louis D.
Brandeis Professor of Law, Pepperdine University School of Law; John M.A. DiPippa, Dean Emeritus and Distinguished
Professor of Law and Public Policy, University of Arkansas at Little Rock William H. Bowen School of Law; Martha M.
Peters, Professor of Legal Education, Elon University School of Law. — Third Edition
pages cm
Includes index.
Peters, Martha M., author. III. Title.
KF311.C63 2014
347.73'504—dc23
2014030269

This publication is designed to provide authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold
with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional
services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be
sought.
LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are registered trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under
license. Matthew Bender and the Matthew Bender Flame Design are registered trademarks of Matthew Bender
Properties Inc.
Copyright © 2014 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of LexisNexis. All Rights Reserved.
No copyright is claimed by LexisNexis or Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., in the text of statutes, regulations, and
excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material may be licensed for a fee from
the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.
Dedication

To my mentors, Tom Shaffer and John Acuff, who taught me to love my clients. — R.F.C.

To Karen, who brings light to my day, and Joel, Andrew, Micah, and Nikolai, who make the day worthwhile, and for my parents, John and Theresa DiPippa, whose love and devotion I can never repay. — J.D.P.

For Lara Lazette Fitch and Griffin Samuel Fitch. — M.M.P.
Acknowledgment

Many hands have helped bring this book to fruition. We want to thank: Karen DiPippa, Margot Barg, Gail Harris, Jessie Cranford, Terri Yeakley, Rod Smith, Lynn Foster, Tony Baker, Lee Boyd, Paul Zwier, Don Peters, Michelle Jacobs, Nancy Lyn Jones, Kenneth Nunn, and Lynda Ruf.
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 1

**THREE MODELS OF LEGAL COUNSELING**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 1-1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1-2</td>
<td>THE AUTHORITARIAN MODEL</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1-3</td>
<td>THE CLIENT-CENTERED COUNSELING MODEL</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1-4</td>
<td>THE COLLABORATIVE DECISION-MAKING MODEL</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 2

**HOW LAWYERS CONTROL CLIENTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 2-1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2-2</td>
<td>TRANSFORMING THE CLIENT’S CASE</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2-3</td>
<td>CONTROLLING THE CONVERSATION</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2-4</td>
<td>INSIDER STATUS FOR SALE</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2-5</td>
<td>STRUGGLING FOR POWER</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2-6</td>
<td>TRANSLATING THE CLIENT’S STORY</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2-7</td>
<td>CRAFTING THE LAWYER-CLIENT RELATIONSHIP THROUGH COLLABORATIVE NEGOTIATION</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2-8</td>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 3

**COMMUNICATION SKILLS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 3-1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 3-2</td>
<td>LISTENING</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a) Paying Attention</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a)(1) Paying Attention Physically</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a)(2) Paying Attention Mentally by Active Listening</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b) Actively Listening to the Client’s Nonverbal Messages</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b)(1) Body Language</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b)(2) Eyes</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b)(3) Facial Expressions</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b)(4) Using Knowledge of Body Language</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(c) Using Knowledge of Psychological Type</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 3-3</td>
<td>BUILDING RAPPORT</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a) Mirroring</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a)(1) Mirroring the Client</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a)(2) Mirroring the Client’s Language</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 3-4</td>
<td>WHAT TO AVOID</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a) Professional Blindness</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b) Hardening of the Categories</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

§ 3-5 VERBALLY RESPONDING TO THE CLIENT ........................................ 36
   (a) Responsive Statements .................................................. 37
       (a)(1) Clarification Responses ........................................ 37
       (a)(2) Reflective Statements ......................................... 38
   (b) Kinds of Reflective Statements ..................................... 38
       (b)(1) Paraphrasing ................................................... 38
       (b)(2) Reflecting Content Alone .................................... 39
       (b)(3) Reflecting Emotion Alone ..................................... 39
       (b)(4) Reflecting Both Content and Emotion ....................... 40
   (c) Summarizing .................................................................. 42
   (d) Silence ...................................................................... 44
§ 3-6 ASKING QUESTIONS .............................................................. 44
   (a) Closed-Ended Questions ............................................... 45
   (b) Open-Ended Questions .................................................. 46
   (c) General Guidelines for Using Open and Closed Questions .... 47
       (c)(1) The Advantages and Disadvantages of Each Type of Question 47
       (c)(2) Asking These Questions in Context ........................... 48
       (c)(3) Summary ............................................................. 48
   (d) Leading Questions .......................................................... 48
§ 3-7 FINAL WORDS .................................................................. 50

Chapter 4 BEGINNING THE LEGAL INTERVIEW ................................. 51

§ 4-1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 51
§ 4-2 EFFECTIVE LEGAL INTERVIEWING: BUILDING RAPPORT AND GATHERING INFORMATION ........................................... 51
§ 4-3 THE GENERAL ELEMENTS OF AN EFFECTIVE LEGAL INTERVIEW ................................................................. 52
§ 4-4 THE STRUCTURE OF AN EFFECTIVE LEGAL INTERVIEW ................................................................. 54
   (a) Overall Goals ................................................................. 54
   (b) Structure .................................................................. 54
§ 4-5 THE OPENING STAGE OF THE CLIENT INTERVIEW ............... 55
   (a) Physical Surroundings .................................................... 55
       (a)(1) The Office Building .............................................. 56
       (a)(2) The Lawyer’s Office .............................................. 56
   (b) Opening the Interview ................................................... 56
       (b)(1) General Guidelines ............................................... 56
       (b)(2) Building Rapport: Conveying Acceptance ............... 57
   (c) Opening the Interview: Meeting and Greeting the Client .... 58
       (c)(1) Introductions ....................................................... 58
       (c)(2) Ice Breaking .......................................................... 58
Table of Contents

Model for the Opening Moments of Client Interviews .......................... 59
Gay Gellhorn, Law and Language: An Empirically Based
Model for the Opening Moments of Client Interviews .......................... 61
(c)(3) Time Constraints and Purposes of the Interview ......................... 62
§ 4-6 EXPLANATIONS ................................................................. 63
(a) Confidentiality ................................................................. 63
(a)(1) Discussing Confidentiality ............................................... 63
(a)(2) Talking About Confidentiality at the Initial Interview .................. 64
(b) Fees ................................................................................. 65
(b)(1) Talking About Fees ....................................................... 65
(b)(2) Talking About Fees at the Initial Interview ......................... 65
§ 4-7 SAMPLE DIALOGUE TO OPEN A CLIENT INTERVIEW ................. 66
§ 4-8 CONCLUSION ................................................................. 66

Chapter 5 HEARING THE CLIENT’S STORY ................................. 69
§ 5-1 THE FRAMING STATEMENT ................................................ 69
§ 5-2 GETTING THE CLIENT’S STORY ........................................... 70
(a) Opening Questions ......................................................... 70
(b) Avoiding Narrow Frames ................................................... 72
(c) Providing Context ........................................................... 73
Gay Gellhorn, Law and Language: An Empirically Based
Model for the Opening Moments of Client Interviews .......................... 74
§ 5-3 HEARING THE CLIENT’S STORY .......................................... 75
(a) Getting Past Framing Statements ......................................... 75
Gay Gellhorn, Law and Language: An Empirically Based
Model for the Opening Moments of Client Interviews .......................... 76
(b) Identifying the Client’s Goals and Interests ............................... 77
§ 5-4 LAWYER DISTORTIONS .................................................. 78
(a) Interruptions ................................................................. 78
Linda F. Smith, Interviewing Clients: A Linguistic Comparison of the
“Traditional” Interview and the “Client-Centered” Interview ................. 79
(b) Narrow Questions and Premature Diagnosis ............................ 82
(c) Cross-Examination .......................................................... 82
§ 5-5 CLIENT DISTORTIONS ...................................................... 83
§ 5-6 SUMMARY ................................................................. 83

Chapter 6 DEVELOPING THE CLIENT’S STORY ............................ 85
§ 6-1 FRAMING STATEMENT: REPEATING THE HIGH POINTS .............. 85
§ 6-2 CLARIFYING AND EXPLORING THE CLIENT’S STORY .............. 85
(a) Funnel Sequences ........................................................... 86
### Table of Contents

(b) Helping Clients Explore Their Memories ........................................... 87  
(c) Statements of Understanding .......................................................... 89  
§ 6-3 AN EXAMPLE OF SUCCESSFULLY EXPLORING A CLIENT’S CASE ........ 89  
   Gay Gellhorn, Law and Language: An Empirically Based  
   Model for the Opening Moments of Client Interviews ......................... 90  
§ 6-4 ENDING THE INITIAL INTERVIEW .................................................... 94  
(a) Defining the Role of the Attorney ..................................................... 94  
(b) Things to Do at the End of Every Interview ...................................... 95  
(c) Things to Do When No Decision About the Case is Made at the End  
   of the Initial Interview ...................................................................... 96  
(d) Things to Do When a Decision About the Case is Made at the Initial  
   Interview ............................................................................................ 96  
§ 6-5 CONCLUSION .................................................................................... 97  

Chapter 7  DECISION-MAKING ................................................................. 99  
§ 7-1 LEGAL AND THERAPEUTIC COUNSELING: SIMILARITIES AND  
   DIFFERENCES ....................................................................................... 99  
§ 7-2 APPROACHES TO LEGAL COUNSELING ......................................... 102  
(a) The Client-Centered Approach .......................................................... 102  
(b) The Authoritarian Approach .............................................................. 102  
(c) The Decision-Counselor Approach .................................................... 103  
(d) Collaborative Legal Counseling ......................................................... 103  
§ 7-3 COMMON ELEMENTS OF EFFECTIVE LEGAL COUNSELING .......... 104  
(a) Relationship Building Practices ....................................................... 104  
(b) Decision Process Practices ............................................................... 107  
§ 7-4 FACTORS THAT INTERFERE WITH EFFECTIVE  
   DECISION-MAKING ............................................................................. 108  
(a) Satisficing ......................................................................................... 110  
(b) Elimination by Aspects ....................................................................... 111  
(c) Information Processing Flaws: Heuristics and Biases ....................... 112  
   (c)(1) Heuristics .................................................................................. 112  
   (c)(2) Biases ...................................................................................... 113  
   (c)(2)(i) Availability Biases .................................................................. 113  
   (c)(2)(ii) Representative Biases ............................................................ 114  
   (c)(2)(iii) Anchoring and Adjustment Biases ......................................... 115  
§ 7-5 DEALING WITH UNCERTAINTY ..................................................... 116  
(a) Risk ................................................................................................. 116  
(b) Framing Gains or Losses ................................................................. 116  
(c) Guidelines for Accurately Framing Risk .......................................... 123  
§ 7-6 CONCLUSION .................................................................................. 124  

---

*Table of Contents*
Table of Contents

Chapter 8  CLIENT COUNSELING ........................................ 125

§ 8-1  THE LAWYER’S RESPONSIBILITIES IN COUNSELING CLIENTS  ... 125
§ 8-2  THE RHYTHM OF COUNSELING ................................. 127
§ 8-3  DESCRIPTION .................................................... 127
(a) Accuracy, Objectivity, and Completeness ............................. 128
(a)(1) Assess the Client’s Case ........................................... 129
(a)(2) Identify the Alternatives .......................................... 130
(a)(2)(i) Minimal Acceptance Criteria .................................. 131
(a)(2)(ii) Cover a Wide Range of Options .............................. 132
(a)(2)(iii) Generality of Options ....................................... 134
§ 8-4  DISCUSSION ..................................................... 134
(a) Client/Lawyer Collaborative Deliberation ............................ 136
(b) Structuring the Discussion .......................................... 136
(b)(1) Agree on the Options Under Discussion ......................... 136
(b)(2) Agree on the Criteria Used to Evaluate the Options .......... 137
(b)(3) Apply the Criteria in a Rigorous and Systematic Fashion .... 138
(c) The Decision Sheet .................................................. 139
(c)(1) The Consequences to the Client ................................. 140
(c)(2) The Consequences to Others .................................... 140
(c)(3) Consequences for the Client’s Self-Image ...................... 141
(c)(4) Consequences for the Client’s Reputation ..................... 141
(c)(5) Reviewing the Decision Sheet ................................... 142
§ 8-5  DECISION ....................................................... 143
(a) Choosing the Option that Best Meets the Client’s Values and Goals ... 143
(a)(1) Making an Optimal Choice ....................................... 143
(a)(2) Making Comparative Judgements ............................... 145
(a)(3) Making the Decision ............................................. 145
(a)(4) Reviewing the Decision ......................................... 146
(b) How to Structure the Decision Phase .............................. 147
§ 8-6  GIVING CLIENTS BAD NEWS ................................. 149
§ 8-7  CONCLUSION ..................................................... 150

Chapter 9  MORAL CHOICES IN THE LAW OFFICE: WHO GETS HURT? AND WHO DECIDES? ............. 153

§ 9-1  INTRODUCTION .................................................. 153
§ 9-2  AUTHORITARIAN LAWYERS: THE GURU AND THE GODFATHER .. 154
(a) The Lawyer as Guru ................................................ 154
Harrop Freeman, The Rabbi and the Horse-whip Lawyer ............ 154
(b) The Lawyer as Godfather ........................................... 158
§ 9-3  CLIENT-CENTERED COUNSELORS: THE LAWYER AS HIRED GUN . 160
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 9-4</td>
<td>COLLABORATIVE LAWYERS: THE LAWYER AS FRIEND</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Anthony T. Kronman, <em>The Lost Lawyer</em></td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 9-5</td>
<td>AVOIDING LAWYER DOMINATION</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 9-6</td>
<td>MORAL DISCOURSE WITH CORPORATE CLIENTS</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 9-7</td>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 10-1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 10-2</td>
<td>COUNSELING CLIENTS ABOUT NEGOTIATION</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 10-3</td>
<td>COUNSELING CONCERNING ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11-1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11-2</td>
<td>THE IMPACT OF DIFFERENCES ON THE LAWYER-CLIENT RELATIONSHIP</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a) Cultural Encapsulation</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b) Sensitivity to Different Cultural Rapport-Building Rituals and Patterns</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11-3</td>
<td>STEPS TO BECOMING MORE AWARE OF CULTURAL ENCAPSULATION</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a) Expectations</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b) Empathy</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11-4</td>
<td>CAUTION NOT TO STEREOTYPE BY ATTRIBUTING GROUP PREFERENCES TO INDIVIDUALS</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11-5</td>
<td>DO’S AND DON’TS</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11-6</td>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 12-1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 12-2</td>
<td>AN OVERVIEW OF PSYCHOLOGICAL TYPE THEORY</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a) Two Mental Functions, Perception and Judgment, Influence</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Communication Between Lawyers and Clients</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b) Two Directions of Energy: Extraverting or Introverting</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(c) Two Lifestyles</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 12-3</td>
<td>REFLECTING ON YOUR TYPE PREFERENCES</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 12-4</td>
<td>VALUE OF TYPE KNOWLEDGE</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 12-5</td>
<td>TYPE AND SKILL DEVELOPMENT</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>