

UNDERSTANDING THE FIRST AMENDMENT

LexisNexis Law School Publishing Advisory Board

Paul Caron

Professor of Law

Pepperdine University School of Law

Herzog Summer Visiting Professor in Taxation

University of San Diego School of Law

Bridgette Carr

Clinical Professor of Law

University of Michigan Law School

Olympia Duhart

Professor of Law and Director of Lawyering Skills & Values Program

Nova Southeastern University, Shepard Broad Law School

Samuel Estreicher

Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law

Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law

NYU School of Law

Steven I. Friedland

Professor of Law and Senior Scholar

Elon University School of Law

Carole Goldberg

Jonathan D. Varat Distinguished Professor of Law

UCLA School of Law

Oliver Goodenough

Professor of Law

Vermont Law School

Paul Marcus

Haynes Professor of Law

William and Mary Law School

John Sprankling

Distinguished Professor of Law

McGeorge School of Law

UNDERSTANDING THE FIRST AMENDMENT

Fifth Edition

Russell L. Weaver

*Professor of Law & Distinguished University Scholar
University of Louisville Louis D. Brandeis School of Law*

ISBN: 978-1-6304-3071-9

eBook ISBN: 978-1-6304-3072-6

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Weaver, Russell L., 1952- author
Understanding the First Amendment / Russell L. Weaver, Professor of Law and Distinguished University Scholar,
University of Louisville Louis D. Brandeis School of Law. -- Fifth Edition.
pages cm.
Includes index.
ISBN 978-1-6304-3071-9
1. United States. Constitution. 1st Amendment. 2. Freedom of expression--United States. I. Title.
KF4770.W43 2014
342.7308'5--dc23
2014008779

This publication is designed to provide authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are registered trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under license. Matthew Bender and the Matthew Bender Flame Design are registered trademarks of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2014 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of LexisNexis. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed by LexisNexis or Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material may be licensed for a fee from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

NOTE TO USERS

To ensure that you are using the latest materials available in this area, please be sure to periodically check the LexisNexis Law School web site for downloadable updates and supplements at www.lexisnexis.com/lawschool.

Editorial Offices

121 Chanlon Rd., New Providence, NJ 07974 (908) 464-6800
201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200
www.lexisnexis.com

MATTHEW  BENDER

Dedication

To Ben, Kate, and Laurence with love, RLW

Table of Contents

Chapter 1	THE ORIGINS AND NATURE OF THE FIRST AMENDMENT	1
§ 1.01	BACKDROP TO THE FIRST AMENDMENT	2
[A]	Pre-Colonial Developments	3
[B]	Colonial Developments	5
§ 1.02	ADOPTION OF THE FIRST AMENDMENT	6
§ 1.03	DEVELOPMENT OF THE FIRST AMENDMENT	7
[A]	An Early Tradition of Suppression	7
[B]	Judicial Review and the First Amendment	9
§ 1.04	FIRST AMENDMENT VALUES	10
§ 1.05	UNDERSTANDING AND APPLYING FIRST AMENDMENT STANDARDS OF REVIEW	13
[A]	Speech	13
[B]	Press	14
[C]	Religion	15
[1]	Establishment	15
[2]	Free Exercise	15
§ 1.06	A SAMPLE ANALYSIS	16
[A]	The Problem	16
[B]	An Analytical Roadmap	16
§ 1.07	THE FIRST AMENDMENT IN SUMMARY	17
Chapter 2	SPEECH ADVOCATING VIOLENT OR ILLEGAL ACTION	21
§ 2.01	FORMATIVE CASE LAW	21
§ 2.02	TOWARD A MORE SPEECH PROTECTIVE STANDARD	25
§ 2.03	DOCTRINAL UNCERTAINTY	27
§ 2.04	THE MODERN STANDARD OF REVIEW	28
Chapter 3	CONTENT REGULATION	33
§ 3.01	BASIC CONCEPTS AND APPLICATIONS	34
§ 3.02	FIGHTING WORDS	35
§ 3.03	DEFAMATION	38
[A]	Traditional Doctrine and Seeds of Change	38
[B]	Defamation as Protected Expression: The Actual Malice Requirement	39
[1]	Public Officials	39
[2]	Public Figures	42
[a]	The Outer Limits of the Actual Malice Standard	42

Table of Contents

[b]	The Public Figure Concept Refined	44
[3]	The Not Entirely Irrelevant Public Concern Factor	45
[4]	Second Thoughts on the Actual Malice Standard	46
[C]	Fact and Opinion	47
[D]	False Speech	47
§ 3.04	INTENTIONAL INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS	48
§ 3.05	PRIVACY	54
[A]	Publication of Personal Information	55
[B]	False Light Privacy	57
[C]	Right of Publicity	58
§ 3.06	OBSCENITY	58
[A]	The Definitional Challenge	59
[B]	Doctrinal Chaos	60
[C]	<i>Miller</i> Amplifications and Applications	62
[1]	Prurient Interest and Community Standards	62
[2]	Patent Offensiveness Specified	63
[3]	Speech Value	64
[D]	Obscenity’s Safe Harbor	64
Chapter 4	CONTENT REGULATION: OTHER CANDIDATES FOR CATEGORICAL EXCLUSION OR LIMITED PROTECTION	67
<hr/>		
§ 4.01	“OFFENSIVE” SPEECH	68
§ 4.02	CHILD PORNOGRAPHY	73
§ 4.03	PORNOGRAPHY AS DISCRIMINATION AGAINST WOMEN	79
§ 4.04	CRUSH VIDEOS	83
§ 4.05	VIOLENT VIDEOS	84
§ 4.06	SUPPORT FOR TERRORIST ORGANIZATIONS	86
§ 4.07	LIES REGARDING THE CONGRESSIONAL MEDAL OF HONOR	88
§ 4.08	REPARATIVE THERAPY	90
§ 4.09	COMMERCIAL SPEECH	91
[A]	The Backdrop to Modern Commercial Speech Doctrine	91
[B]	Commercial Speech as Protected Expression	92
[C]	The Standard of Review	93
[D]	Special Circumstances: Lawyer Advertising	99
Chapter 5	OVERBREADTH, VAGUENESS, AND PRIOR RESTRAINTS	103
<hr/>		
§ 5.01	OVERBREADTH AND VAGUENESS	104
[A]	Overbreadth	105
[B]	Vagueness	107

Table of Contents

§ 5.02	PRIOR RESTRAINTS	109
[A]	Licensing	109
[1]	Overview	109
[2]	Motion Picture Licensing	110
[3]	Non-Licensing Notifications	112
[4]	Parade Permits	112
[5]	Licensing Fundraisers	113
[6]	Newsrack Licensing	113
[B]	Injunctions	114
[1]	Overview	114
[2]	Prior Restraints and National Security	116
[3]	Injunctions Against Abortion Protests	118
[4]	Prior Restraints on Commercial Speech	122
Chapter 6		123
CONTENT NEUTRALITY		
§ 6.01	SPEECH INTERTWINED WITH CONDUCT	124
§ 6.02	SECONDARY EFFECTS	127
§ 6.03	PUBLIC FORA	129
[A]	Traditional Public Forum	131
[B]	Designated Public Forums	136
[C]	Reserved Forums	138
§ 6.04	PRIVATE PROPERTY	141
Chapter 7		145
TESTING THE BOUNDARIES OF DOCTRINE		
§ 7.01	RELIGIOUS SPEECH	145
§ 7.02	“HATE” SPEECH	150
[A]	Early Precedent	150
[B]	<i>R.A.V.</i>	151
[C]	Sentence Enhancement	154
[D]	Campus Speech Codes	156
§ 7.03	CAMPAIGN FINANCE LAWS	157
[A]	Contribution and Expenditure Limitations.	157
[B]	Corporate Contributions and Expenditures	167
[C]	Independent Political Action Committee Expenditures.	172
[D]	Toward a More Assertive First Amendment Principle	176
Chapter 8		181
FREEDOM OF ASSOCIATION AND COMPELLED EXPRESSION		
§ 8.01	THE RIGHT TO ASSOCIATE	182
[A]	Early Precedent	182

Table of Contents

[B]	The House Un-American Activities Committee	183
[C]	<i>Claiborne Hardware</i>	184
[D]	Compelled Admission to Membership	185
[E]	“Fusion” Political Candidates	191
[F]	Political Primaries	191
§ 8.02	THE RIGHT “NOT TO SPEAK”	192
[A]	Overview	192
[B]	The Solomon Amendment and Law School Placement Offices	195
[C]	Parade Inclusion — Exclusion	196
[D]	Compelled Financial Support for Expression	199
§ 8.03	UNCONSTITUTIONAL CONDITIONS	203
§ 8.04	THE OTHER SIDE OF THE RIGHT TO BE LET ALONE	206

Chapter 9 GOVERNMENT: EMPLOYER, EDUCATOR, AND SOURCE OF FUNDS 211

§ 9.01	FIRST AMENDMENT RIGHTS OF PUBLIC EMPLOYEES	212
[A]	Prohibiting Electioneering	212
[B]	Other Employee Speech	215
[C]	Governmental Employee Associational Rights	228
§ 9.02	THE FIRST AMENDMENT IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS	234
§ 9.03	GOVERNMENT FINANCED SPEECH	242
[A]	Overview	242
[B]	The National Endowment for the Arts	245
[C]	Legal Services Corporation Funding	247

Chapter 10 MEDIA AND THE FIRST AMENDMENT 251

§ 10.01	THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THE PRESS CLAUSE	253
§ 10.02	THE NEWSGATHERING FUNCTION	253
[A]	Reporter’s Privilege	253
[B]	Newsroom Searches	256
[C]	Access to Prisons	257
[D]	Access to Judicial Proceedings	258
[E]	The Problem of Prejudicial Publicity	260
[F]	Electronic Media in the Courtroom	262
§ 10.03	MEDIA TECHNOLOGY AND FIRST AMENDMENT STANDARDS	264
[A]	Print	265
[B]	Broadcasting	266
[1]	Fairness Regulation	266
[2]	Regulation of Indecent Programming	269
[C]	Cable	272

Table of Contents

[1]	Must Carriage	272
[2]	Regulation of Indecent Programming	274
[D]	Telephony	275
[1]	Common Carrier Status	275
[2]	Indecency Regulation	276
[E]	Internet	276
[1]	Blogs, Email, and Social Media	276
[2]	Regulation of Indecency	278
[F]	Video Games	279
[G]	Social Media	280
Chapter 11	THE ESTABLISHMENT CLAUSE	283
<hr/>		
§ 11.01	FINANCIAL AID TO RELIGION	285
[A]	Early Cases	285
[B]	The <i>Lemon</i> Test and Doctrinal Turmoil	288
[C]	Other Applications of the <i>Lemon</i> Test	290
[D]	Criticism of <i>Lemon</i> 's Three-Part Test	292
[E]	<i>Agostini</i> , <i>Mitchell</i> and Continued Doctrinal Turmoil	294
[1]	<i>Agostini</i> 's Modification of <i>Lemon</i>	294
[2]	<i>Mitchell</i> and Neutrality	298
[3]	<i>Agostini</i> and <i>Mitchell</i> 's Impact	300
§ 11.02	SCHOOL VOUCHERS	302
§ 11.03	STATE SPONSORED PRAYER	310
[A]	In Public Schools	310
[B]	Moment of Silence Laws	312
[C]	Legislative Prayer	314
[D]	Graduation Prayer	315
[E]	Prayer at Athletic Events	317
§ 11.04	CURRICULAR ISSUES	318
[A]	Bible Readings	318
[B]	Evolution	320
[C]	Balanced Treatment of Creation Science	321
[D]	Intelligent Design	324
§ 11.05	OFFICIAL ACKNOWLEDGMENT	324
[A]	The Ten Commandments	324
[B]	Church Vetoes	332
[C]	Holiday Displays	333
[D]	Swearing Belief in God	337
[E]	Day of Rest	338
§ 11.06	ESTABLISHMENT-FREE EXERCISE AND FREE SPEECH TENSION	338

Table of Contents

[A]	<i>Kiryas Joel</i> and Special School Districts	338
[B]	Prohibitions Against Discrimination	341
[C]	Armed Forces Chaplains	342
[D]	Speech and Religion	342
[E]	Religious Instruction in Public Schools	344
[F]	Use of Public School Facilities	344
[G]	Vocational Assistance to the Handicapped	345
[H]	Funding of Non-Profit Private Organizations	345
[I]	College Scholarships	346
Chapter 12	THE FREE EXERCISE CLAUSE	349
§ 12.01	BURDENS ON RELIGION	350
[A]	Early Cases	350
[B]	From <i>Sherbert</i> to <i>Smith</i>	352
[C]	Modern Cases	357
§ 12.02	DISCRIMINATION AGAINST RELIGION	367
TABLE OF CASES	TC-1	
INDEX	I-1	
