LexisNexis Law School Publishing
Advisory Board

Bridgette Carr
Clinical Professor of Law
University of Michigan Law School

Steven I. Friedland
Professor of Law and Senior Scholar
Elon University School of Law

Carole Goldberg
Jonathan D. Varat Distinguished Professor of Law
UCLA School of Law

Oliver Goodenough
Professor of Law
Vermont Law School

Paul Marcus
Haynes Professor of Law
William and Mary Law School

John Sprankling
Distinguished Professor of Law
McGeorge School of Law
JURISPRUDENCE CASES AND MATERIALS
An Introduction to the Philosophy of Law and Its Applications

Third Edition

STEPHEN E. GOTTLIEB
Professor of Law
Albany Law School

BRIAN H. BIX
Frederick W. Thomas Professor of Law and Philosophy
University of Minnesota

TIMOTHY D. LYTON
Albert & Angela Farone Distinguished Professor of Law
Albany Law School

ROBIN L. WEST
Professor of Law
Georgetown University Law Center
Acknowledgments

Steve Gottlieb would like to acknowledge the research assistance of Deborah Buchanan.

Timothy Lytton would like to thank Rachel Anisfeld, Pamela Barmash, Beth Berkowitz, Peter Berkowitz, Charles Donahue, and Natalie Dohrmann for helpful comments on Part I of the text, as well as Alexandra Harrington and Kelly Egan for essential research assistance.

Robin West would like to acknowledge the assistance of Lisa Jabaily, Laura Alexander, and Scott Meisler.
# Table of Contents

## Part I

### THE ORIGINS OF LAW AND JURISPRUDENCE

- **INTRODUCTION**
  - 1

## Chapter 1

### THE ORIGINS OF LAW IN THE ANCIENT NEAR EAST

- **A. MESOPOTAMIAN LAW COLLECTIONS**
  - 3
  - Time Line of Ancient Near Eastern History from 9000 B.C.E. to 1750
  - 4
  - Historical Introduction
  - 4
  - Introductory Exercise
  - 5
  - Laws of Ur-Namma (LU)
  - 5
  - Laws of Lipit-Ishtar (LL)
  - 7
  - Laws of Hammurabi (LH)
  - 9
  - Inscription of Yahdun-Lim (IY)
  - 16
  - Study Questions
  - 17

- **B. THE HEBREW BIBLE**
  - 18
  - Historical Introduction
  - 18
  - The Ten Commandments and the Book of the Covenant: Exodus 19–23
  - 19
  - Study Questions
  - 24

## Chapter 2

### THE BIRTH OF JURISPRUDENCE IN THE ANCIENT WORLD

- **A. GREEK**
  - 28
  - Time Line of Greek History from 1700 B.C.E. to 323 B.C.E.
  - 28
  - Historical Introduction
  - 29
  - 1. The Trial of Socrates
    - 29
    - Apology
    - 30
    - Study Questions
    - 38
    - Euthyphro
    - 39
    - Study Questions
    - 46
    - Crito
    - 46
    - Study Questions
    - 51
  - 2. Aristotle’s Nicomachean Ethics, Book V and Politics, Book V
    - 52
    - Nicomachean Ethics, Book V
    - 53
    - Politics, Book V
    - 59
    - Study Questions
    - 60

- **B. ROMAN**
  - 61
Table of Contents

Time Line of Roman History from 753 B.C.E. to 1453 C.E. .................. 61
Historical Introduction ..................................................... 62
1. Cicero’s on the Commonwealth, Book III and on the Laws,
   Books I & II ................................................................. 62
   Cicero, on the Commonwealth, Book III ............................. 63
   Cicero, on the Laws, Book I ........................................... 67
   Cicero, on the Laws, Book II ......................................... 73
   Study Questions .......................................................... 75
2. Justinian’s Institutes ..................................................... 76
   Introductory Exercise .................................................. 77
   Institutes 3:13, 14, 15, 21, 22 ................................. 78
   Study Questions .......................................................... 81
C. RABBINIC ................................................................. 82
   Time Line of Israelite and Rabbinic History from 1200S B.C.E.
to 600 C.E. ................................................................. 82
   Historical Introduction ................................................. 83
1. Commentary on the Covenant at Sinai .............................. 84
   Babylonian Talmud, Shabbat 88a .................................... 84
   Study Questions .......................................................... 84
2. The Law of the Stubborn and Rebellious Son ................. 85
   The Biblical Law of the Stubborn and Rebellious Son:
   Deuteronomy 21:18–21 .................................................. 85
   Elaboration of the Law of the Stubborn and Rebellious Son:
   Mishnah Sanhedrin 8:1–5 ................................................. 85
   Commentary on the Law of the Stubborn and Rebellious Son:
   Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 71A .................................. 86
   Study Questions .......................................................... 87
3. The Oven of Achnai ...................................................... 87
   Babylonian Talmud, Bava Metsia 59A–59B ...................... 87
   Study Questions .......................................................... 89

PART II  ANALYTICAL LEGAL PHILOSOPHY .................. 91
INTRODUCTION ............................................................. 91

Chapter 3  QUESTIONS OF APPROACH .................. 93
A. OVERVIEW OF METHODOLOGICAL QUESTIONS ............. 93
B. H.L.A. HART ................................................................. 94
   H.L.A. Hart, Persistent Questions .............................. 94
   Questions for Discussion .......................................... 104
C. CONCEPTUAL ANALYSIS ............................................. 104
   Brian Bix, Conceptual Questions and Jurisprudence .......... 104
Table of Contents

Chapter 4 LEGAL POSITIVISM .......................... 117

A. AN OVERVIEW OF LEGAL POSITIVISM ............ 117
B. H.L.A. HART ............................................. 118
   Questions for Discussion ................................ 136
C. THE DETAILS OF HART’S THEORY ................. 137
D. NOTE ON INCLUSIVE AND EXCLUSIVE LEGAL POSITIVISM ... 140
E. SCOTT SHAPIRO’S PLANNING THEORY ............... 143
   Scott J. Shapiro, *Summary* .................................. 143
   Questions for Discussion .................................. 144
F. HANS KELSEN ............................................ 145
   Questions for Discussion .................................. 151
G. NOTE ON KELSEN ...................................... 151
H. NOTE ON HART AND KELSEN ......................... 154
   Suggested Further Readings ............................... 155

Chapter 5 CRITICS OF LEGAL POSITIVISM ............... 157

A. OVERVIEW .............................................. 157
B. NATURAL LAW THEORY ............................... 157
C. ST. THOMAS AQUINAS ................................. 160
   ST. THOMAS AQUINAS, SUMMA THEOLOGIAE ................. 160
   Questions for Discussion .................................. 165
D. JOHN FINNIS .......................................... 165
   John Finnis, *On the Incoherence of Legal Positivism* ....... 165
   Questions for Discussion .................................. 176
E. LON L. FULLER ........................................ 176
   Lon L. Fuller, *Positivism and Fidelity to Law — A Reply to Professor Hart* .... 176
   Questions for Discussion .................................. 198
F. NOTE ON FULLER’S THEORY, AND ITS CRITICS .... 198
G. NOTE: FULLER AND THE LEGAL PROCESS SCHOOL .... 200
H. RONALD DWORKIN .................................... 202
   Ronald Dworkin, *Legal Theory and the Problem of Sense* .... 202
   Questions for Discussion .................................. 209
## Table of Contents

### Chapter 6 JUSTICE .................................................. 219

A. OVERVIEW ...................................................... 219
B. JOHN RAWLS AND SOCIAL CONTRACT THEORY .......... 220
C. JOHN RAWLS AND DISTRIBUTIVE JUSTICE ............. 223
   Questions for Discussion .................................. 239
D. JEREMY WALDRON .............................................. 239
   Jeremy Waldron, *The Plight of the Poor in the Midst of Plenty* ........................................................................... 239
   Questions for Discussion .................................. 245
E. SUSAN MOLLER OKIN ........................................... 245
   Susan Moller Okin, *Justice and Gender: An Unfinished Debate* .............................................................................. 245
   Questions for Discussion .................................. 263
F. OTHER APPROACHES TO JUSTICE ......................... 263
   Suggested Further Readings ................................ 266

### Chapter 7 THE NATURE AND SIGNIFICANCE OF RIGHTS .... 267

A. NOTE ON RIGHTS .................................................. 267
B. JOEL FEINBERG .................................................. 271
   Questions for Discussion .................................. 281
C. N.E. SIMMONDS .................................................. 281
   N.E. Simmonds, *The “Will” and “Interest” Theories* .... 281
   Suggested Further Readings ................................ 283

### PART III CRITICAL JURISPRUDENCE ............................... 285

INTRODUCTION ................................................... 285

### Chapter 8 LEGALISM .................................................. 289

A. LEGALISM AS A PROFESSIONAL IDEOLOGY ............ 289
   JUDITH SHKLR, *LEGALISM: LAW, MORALS, AND POLITICAL TRAILS* ......................................................... 289
   PAUL KAHN, *THE CULTURAL STUDY OF LAW: RECONSTRUCTING LEGAL SCHOLARSHIP* .......................... 293
   Questions on Shklar and Kahn ................................ 297
B. LEGALISM AND OBJECTIVITY ................................ 298
   Owen Fiss, *Objectivity and Interpretation* .................. 299
   Paul D. Carrington, *Of Law and River* ..................... 307
Table of Contents

Questions on Fiss and Carrington .......................... 310

C. LEGALISM AS TRADITIONALISM .......................... 311
   Anthony Kronman, Precedent and Tradition .............. 311
   Comments and Questions on Kronman ..................... 320
   Thomas Paine, Rights of Man: Part Two .................. 321
   Justice Oliver Wendell Holmes, Path of the Law .......... 322
   Comments and Questions on Kronman ..................... 323

D. LEGALISM AS FORMALISM ................................. 324
   ANTHONY T. KRONMAN, THE LOST LAWYER: FAILING IDEALS
   OF THE LEGAL PROFESSION ............................... 325
   Comments on Langdellian Formalism, and an Introduction to
   Legal Realism ........................................... 328

E. LEGALISM AS LIBERALISM ................................ 335
   JOHN RAWLS, A THEORY OF JUSTICE ..................... 336
   Question on Rawls ....................................... 340

Chapter 9 CRITICAL JURISPRUDENCE: AN OVERVIEW
       OF THE MOVEMENTS .................................. 341

A. THE LEGAL REALIST MOVEMENT .......................... 342
   Justice Oliver Wendell Holmes, Path of the Law .......... 343
   JUSTICE OLIVER WENDELL HOLMES, THE COMMON LAW ....... 349
   Lochner v. New York ..................................... 350
   Karl Llewellyn, Some Realism About Realism .............. 351
   Notes and Comments on Legal Realism ..................... 359
   LON FULLER, THE LAW IN QUEST OF ITSELF ............... 360
   ROSCOE POUND, JUSTICE ACCORDING TO LAW ............. 363
   Notes and Comments on Legal Realism ..................... 364

B. THE CRITICAL LEGAL STUDIES MOVEMENT ............... 365
   Roberto Unger, The CLS Movement ......................... 368
   Duncan Kennedy, Legal Training as Training for Hierarchy
   Robert W. Gordon, Unfreezing Legal Reality: Critical
   Approaches to Law ....................................... 379
   Questions and Comments on Critical Legal Studies ........ 381

C. IDENTITY-BASED CRITIQUES ............................... 382
   1. Some Historical Examples ............................... 385
      State v. Mann ........................................... 385
      ROBERT COVER, JUSTICE ACCUSED: ANTI SLAVERY AND
      THE JUDICIAL PROCESS ................................ 388
      Bradley v. State ......................................... 392
      Bradwell v. Illinois .................................... 393
      Suggestions for Further Reading ......................... 395
# Table of Contents

## 1. Law and Humanities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>ROBERT FERGUSON, LAW AND LETTERS IN AMERICAN CULTURE</td>
<td>479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions on Law and Humanities</td>
<td>483</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 2. Law and Literature

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>James Boyd White, Law and Literature: No Manifesto</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Robin L. West, The Literary Lawyer</td>
<td>492</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions and Comments on Law and Literature</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 3. Law and Interpretation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Ronald Dworkin, Law as Interpretation</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Owen Fiss, Objectivity and Interpretation</td>
<td>511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stanley Fish, Fish v. Fiss</td>
<td>514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Steven Knapp and Walter Benn Michaels, Against Theory</td>
<td>521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Robert Cover, The Violence and the Word</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions on Law and Interpretation</td>
<td>530</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 4. Law and Economics

### a. Normative Law and Economics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions and Comments on the Economic Analysis of Justice</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### b. Descriptive Law and Economics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Justice O.W. Holmes, Path of the Law</td>
<td>543</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

Learned Hand, *United States v. Carroll Towing Co.* ............... 545  
Questions and Comments on the Historical Project ............... 548  

**c. The Coase Theorem** ........................................ 549  
**MITCHELL A. POLINSKY, AN INTRODUCTION TO LAW AND ECONOMICS** ............... 549  
Questions Regarding the Coase Theorem ......................... 553  
Notes and Comments on Other Disciplines ...................... 554  
Naomi Mezey, *Law as Culture* .................................. 555  
Further Readings .............................................. 562  

## Chapter 10 CRITICAL JURISPRUDENCE: A CONCEPTUAL APPROACH  

### A. LIBERAL LEGAL SKEPTICISM  

1. **The Rights Critique** ........................................ 566  
   Morton J. Horwitz, *Rights* .................................... 567  
   Mark Tushnet, *An Essay on Rights* .......................... 572  
   Questions on the Rights Critique ............................. 582  

2. **Critiques of Formal Equality** ............................... 583  
   Catharine A. MacKinnon, *Sex Equality: On Difference and Dominance* ............... 584  
   Eva Feder Kittay, *Taking Dependency Seriously: The Family and Medical Leave Act Considered in Light of the Social Organization of Dependency Work and Gender Equality* ............... 597  
   Questions on Formal Equality ................................. 605  

3. **The Autonomy Critique** ..................................... 606  
   Robert Hale, *Coercion and Distribution in a Supposedly Non-Coercive State* ............... 608  
   Morris Cohen, *Property and Sovereignty* .................... 613  

4. **The Privacy Critique** ....................................... 623  
   Robin West, *Lifting the Veil of the Right to Be Let Alone* ............... 623  
   Questions and Comments on Autonomy and Privacy ........... 630  

### B. CRITICAL THEORY ........................................ 630  

1. Hegemony and Legitimation .................................... 631  
   Kimberlé Williams Crenshaw, *Race, Reform, and Retrenchment: Transformation and Legitimation in Antidiscrimination Law* ............... 632  

2. False Necessity ............................................. 640  
   Robert W. Gordon, *Unfreezing Legal Reality: Critical Approaches to Law* ............... 640  
   Questions on Critical Theory ................................ 652  

### C. POSTMODERNISM: INDETERMINACY AND INTERSECTIONALITY  

................................................................. 653
## Table of Contents

1. The Indeterminacy Thesis ........................................... 654  
   MICHEL FOUCAULT, THE ORDER OF THINGS, AND  
   ARCHEOLOGY OF HUMAN SCIENCES, INTRO., ................... 654  
   MARK V. TUSHNET, RED, WHITE AND BLUE: A CRITICAL  
   ANALYSIS OF CONSTITUTIONAL LAW ............................ 656  

2. Intersectionality, Anti-Essentialism and Perspectivial Theories of  
   Knowledge .......................................................... 661  
   Mari J. Matsuda, When the First Quail Calls: Multiple  
   Consciousness as Jurisprudential Method, ................. 661  
   Kimberlé Crenshaw, Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality,  
   Identity Politics, and Violence Against Women of Color .... 666  
   Questions on Indeterminacy and Intersectionality .......... 677  
   Owen Fiss, The Death of the Law .............................. 681  
   Questions on Indeterminacy and Intersectionality .......... 685  

D. PRAGMATISM AND UTILITARIANISM ............................. 685  
   Robin West, The Other Utilitarians ......................... 686  
   Richard A. Posner, Pragmatic Adjudication ............... 702  
   Questions on Pragmatism and Utilitarianism ............... 715  

### PART IV JURISPRUDENCE IN BLACK ROBES ..................... 719  
INTRODUCTION ...................................................... 719  

#### Chapter 11 IS MEANING FOUND OR IMPUTED? ................. 721  

A. CONSENT AND COERCION, WELCOME, AND  
   DISAGREEABLE ................................................... 721  
   Meritor Savings Bank, FSB v. Vinson ...................... 721  
   Notes ........................................................... 726  

B. PRIVATE INTENT .................................................. 727  
   Michelle Marvin v. Lee Marvin .............................. 727  
   Notes ........................................................... 731  
   Akers v. Baldwin .............................................. 731  
   Notes ........................................................... 756  

C. LAWGIVERS' INTENT .............................................. 758  
   Alden v. Maine .................................................. 758  
   Notes ........................................................... 759  
   Stephen Breyer, On the Uses of Legislative History in  
   Interpreting Statutes ........................................... 761  
   Notes ........................................................... 763  

xii
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 12  MORAL ASSUMPTIONS IN LAW  .............................................. 765

A. IMPLICIT IN CURRENT LAW? .......................................................... 765
   
   *Kurowski v. Krajewski* ................................................................. 765

   Notes ......................................................................................... 768

B. IMPLICIT IN THE CLAIM TO OBEDIENCE? ....................................... 769

   *Bell v. Maryland* ................................................................. 769

   Notes ......................................................................................... 780

   Trial of the Major War Criminals Before the International Military
   Tribunal ......................................................................................... 781

   Trial of the Major War Criminals Before the International Military
   Tribunal ......................................................................................... 792

   Notes ......................................................................................... 794

C. IMPLICIT POSITION ON CONSEQUENCES? ........................................ 795

   *Herrera v. Collins* ................................................................. 795

   Notes ......................................................................................... 826

## Chapter 13  WHAT MORAL CLAIMS COUNT? ........................................ 827

A. OUR SIBLINGS’ KEEPERS? ................................................................. 827

   *National Federation of Independent Business v. Sebelius* ............. 827

   Notes ......................................................................................... 833

B. SLAVERY, FREEDOM, AND PHYSICAL SECURITY? ......................... 834

   *The Antelope, The Vice-Consuls of Spain and Portugal, Libellants* . 834

   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 842

   *Kircher v. City of Jamestown* .................................................... 843

   Notes ......................................................................................... 854

C. THE LIBERAL PARADIGM ................................................................. 854

   1. Freedom Unless Others Are Hurt? ........................................... 854

      *Lawrence v. Texas* ................................................................. 854

      Notes ..................................................................................... 871

   2. What Counts as an Injury? ......................................................... 873

      *Valley Forge Christian College v. Americans United for
      Separation of Church and State, Inc.* ........................................ 873

      Notes ..................................................................................... 877

D. DEMOCRACY? .................................................................................. 877

   *San Antonio Independent School District v. Rodriguez* ................ 879

   Notes ......................................................................................... 889

E. DISTRIBUTIVE JUSTICE vs. SELF-REGARDING RIGHTS .................... 890

   1. Property? .................................................................................... 890

      *Seawall Associates v. City of New York* .................................... 890

      Notes ..................................................................................... 910

   2. Freedom and Community ............................................................ 912
Table of Contents

Ian Shapiro, *Notes Toward a Conditional Theory of Rights and Obligations in Property* ........................................ 913
Notes and Questions .................................................. 915

3. “Neutral,” “Universal” or Defensible Rules and Outcomes, and the Treatment of Gender ........................................ 915
   *De La Cruz v. Tormey* ............................................. 916
   Notes ................................................................. 929

4. State Action and Remedies for Inequality and Subordination .... 929
   *City of Richmond v. J.A. Croson Co.* .......................... 929
   Notes ................................................................. 939
   *Grutter v. Bollinger* ............................................. 944
   Notes ................................................................. 977

F. HOW FAR DO MORAL CLAIMS REACH? ......................... 978
   *McCain v. Koch* ................................................ 978
   Notes ................................................................. 982

INDEX .............................................................................. I-1