

**JURISPRUDENCE CASES
AND MATERIALS:
An Introduction to the
Philosophy of Law and
Its Applications**

LexisNexis Law School Publishing Advisory Board

Bridgette Carr

Clinical Professor of Law
University of Michigan Law School

Steven I. Friedland

Professor of Law and Senior Scholar
Elon University School of Law

Carole Goldberg

Jonathan D. Varat Distinguished Professor of Law
UCLA School of Law

Oliver Goodenough

Professor of Law
Vermont Law School

Paul Marcus

Haynes Professor of Law
William and Mary Law School

John Sprankling

Distinguished Professor of Law
McGeorge School of Law

JURISPRUDENCE CASES AND MATERIALS

An Introduction to the Philosophy of Law and Its Applications

Third Edition

STEPHEN E. GOTTLIEB

*Professor of Law
Albany Law School*

BRIAN H. BIX

*Frederick W. Thomas Professor of Law and Philosophy
University of Minnesota*

TIMOTHY D. LYTTON

*Albert & Angela Farone Distinguished Professor of Law
Albany Law School*

ROBIN L. WEST

*Professor of Law
Georgetown University Law Center*

ISBN: 978-1-6328-0961-2

Ebook ISBN: 978-0-3271-7830-9

Looseleaf ISBN: 978-1-6328-0962-9

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Jurisprudence cases and materials : an introduction to the philosophy of law and its applications / Stephen E. Gottlieb, Professor of Law, Albany Law School, Brian H. Bix, Frederick W. Thomas Professor of Law and Philosophy, University of Minnesota Timothy D. Lytton, Professor of Law, Albany Law School, Robin L. West, Professor of Law, Georgetown University Law Center.— Third edition.

pages cm

Includes index.

ISBN 978-1-63280-961-2 (hardbound)

1. Jurisprudence — United States — Cases. 2. Law — United States — Cases. I. Gottlieb, Stephen E. II. Bix, Brian III.

Lytton, Timothy D., 1965- IV. West, Robin, 1954-

KF379.G68 2015

349.73—dc23

2014046768

This publication is designed to provide authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are registered trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under license. Matthew Bender and the Matthew Bender Flame Design are registered trademarks of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2015 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of LexisNexis. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed by LexisNexis or Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material may be licensed for a fee from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

NOTE TO USERS

To ensure that you are using the latest materials available in this area, please be sure to periodically check the LexisNexis Law School web site for downloadable updates and supplements at www.lexisnexis.com/lawschool.

Editorial Offices

630 Central Ave., New Providence, NJ 07974 (908) 464-6800

201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200

www.lexisnexis.com

MATTHEW  BENDER

Acknowledgments

Steve Gottlieb would like to acknowledge the research assistance of Deborah Buchanan.

Timothy Lytton would like to thank Rachel Anisfeld, Pamela Barmash, Beth Berkowitz, Peter Berkowitz, Charles Donahue, and Natalie Dohrmann for helpful comments on Part I of the text, as well as Alexandra Harrington and Kelly Egan for essential research assistance.

Robin West would like to acknowledge the assistance of Lisa Jabaily, Laura Alexander, and Scott Meisler.

Table of Contents

Part I	THE ORIGINS OF LAW AND JURISPRUDENCE	1
	INTRODUCTION	1
Chapter 1	THE ORIGINS OF LAW IN THE ANCIENT NEAR EAST	3
A.	MESOPOTAMIAN LAW COLLECTIONS	3
	Time Line of Ancient Near Eastern History from 9000 B.C.E. to 1750 B.C.E.	4
	Historical Introduction	4
	Introductory Exercise	5
	Laws of Ur-Namma (LU)	5
	Laws of Lipit-Ishtar (LL)	7
	Laws of Hammurabi (LH)	9
	Inscription of Yahdun-Lim (IY)	16
	Study Questions	17
B.	THE HEBREW BIBLE	18
	Historical Introduction	18
	The Ten Commandments and the Book of the Covenant: Exodus 19–23	19
	Study Questions	24
Chapter 2	THE BIRTH OF JURISPRUDENCE IN THE ANCIENT WORLD	27
A.	GREEK	28
	Time Line of Greek History from 1700 B.C.E. to 323 B.C.E.	28
	Historical Introduction	29
1.	The Trial of Socrates	29
	Apology	30
	Study Questions	38
	Euthyphro	39
	Study Questions	46
	Crito	46
	Study Questions	51
2.	Aristotle’s Nicomachean Ethics, Book V and Politics, Book V	52
	Nicomachean Ethics, Book V	53
	Politics, Book V	59
	Study Questions	60
B.	ROMAN	61

Table of Contents

	Time Line of Roman History from 753 B.C.E. to 1453 C.E.	61
	Historical Introduction	62
1.	Cicero's on the Commonwealth, Book III and on the Laws, Books I & II	62
	Cicero, on the Commonwealth, Book III	63
	Cicero, on the Laws, Book I	67
	Cicero, on the Laws, Book II	73
	Study Questions	75
2.	Justinian's Institutes	76
	Introductory Exercise	77
	Institutes 3:13, 14, 15, 21, 22	78
	Study Questions	81
C.	RABBINIC	82
	Time Line of Israelite and Rabbinic History from 1200S B.C.E. to 600 C.E.	82
	Historical Introduction	83
1.	Commentary on the Covenant at Sinai	84
	Babylonian Talmud, Shabbat 88a	84
	Study Questions	84
2.	The Law of the Stubborn and Rebellious Son	85
	The Biblical Law of the Stubborn and Rebellious Son: Deuteronomy 21:18–21	85
	Elaboration of the Law of the Stubborn and Rebellious Son: Mishnah Sanhedrin 8:1–5	85
	Commentary on the Law of the Stubborn and Rebellious Son: Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 71A	86
	Study Questions	87
3.	The Oven of Achnai	87
	Babylonian Talmud, Bava Metsia 59A–59B	87
	Study Questions	89
<hr/>		
PART II	ANALYTICAL LEGAL PHILOSOPHY	91
	INTRODUCTION	91
<hr/>		
Chapter 3	QUESTIONS OF APPROACH	93
A.	OVERVIEW OF METHODOLOGICAL QUESTIONS	93
B.	H.L.A. HART	94
	H.L.A. Hart, <i>Persistent Questions</i>	94
	Questions for Discussion	104
C.	CONCEPTUAL ANALYSIS	104
	Brian Bix, <i>Conceptual Questions and Jurisprudence</i>	104

Table of Contents

D.	BRIAN LEITER	110
	D. Brian Leiter, <i>Beyond the Hart/Dworkin Debate:</i>	
	<i>The Methodology Problem in Jurisprudence</i>	110
	Questions for Discussion	115
	Suggested Further Readings	116
Chapter 4	LEGAL POSITIVISM	117
A.	AN OVERVIEW OF LEGAL POSITIVISM	117
B.	H.L.A. HART	118
	H.L.A. Hart, <i>Positivism and the Separation of Law and Morals</i>	118
	Questions for Discussion	136
C.	THE DETAILS OF HART’S THEORY	137
D.	NOTE ON INCLUSIVE AND EXCLUSIVE LEGAL POSITIVISM	140
E.	SCOTT SHAPIRO’S PLANNING THEORY	143
	Scott J. Shapiro, <i>Summary</i>	143
	Questions for Discussion	144
F.	HANS Kelsen	145
	Hans Kelsen, <i>What Is the Pure Theory of Law?</i>	145
	Questions for Discussion	151
G.	NOTE ON Kelsen	151
H.	NOTE ON HART AND Kelsen	154
	Suggested Further Readings	155
Chapter 5	CRITICS OF LEGAL POSITIVISM	157
A.	OVERVIEW	157
B.	NATURAL LAW THEORY	157
C.	ST. THOMAS AQUINAS	160
	ST. THOMAS AQUINAS, <i>SUMMA THEOLOGIAE</i>	160
	Questions for Discussion	165
D.	JOHN FINNIS	165
	John Finnis, <i>On the Incoherence of Legal Positivism</i>	165
	Questions for Discussion	176
E.	LON L. FULLER	176
	Lon L. Fuller, <i>Positivism and Fidelity to Law — A Reply to</i>	
	<i>Professor Hart</i>	176
	Questions for Discussion	198
F.	NOTE ON FULLER’S THEORY, AND ITS CRITICS	198
G.	NOTE: FULLER AND THE LEGAL PROCESS SCHOOL	200
H.	RONALD DWORKIN	202
	Ronald Dworkin, <i>Legal Theory and the Problem of Sense</i>	202
	Questions for Discussion	209

Table of Contents

I.	NOTE: DWORKIN AND HIS CRITICS	209
	Suggested Further Readings	216
Chapter 6 JUSTICE		219
A.	OVERVIEW	219
B.	JOHN RAWLS AND SOCIAL CONTRACT THEORY	220
C.	JOHN RAWLS AND DISTRIBUTIVE JUSTICE	223
	John Rawls, <i>Distributive Justice: Some Addenda</i>	223
	Questions for Discussion	239
D.	JEREMY WALDRON	239
	Jeremy Waldron, <i>The Plight of the Poor in the Midst of Plenty</i>	239
	Questions for Discussion	245
E.	SUSAN MOLLER OKIN	245
	Susan Moller Okin, <i>Justice and Gender: An Unfinished Debate</i>	245
	Questions for Discussion	263
F.	OTHER APPROACHES TO JUSTICE	263
	Suggested Further Readings	266
Chapter 7 THE NATURE AND SIGNIFICANCE OF RIGHTS		267
A.	NOTE ON RIGHTS	267
B.	JOEL FEINBERG	271
	Joel Feinberg, <i>The Nature and Value of Rights</i>	271
	Questions for Discussion	281
C.	N.E. SIMMONDS	281
	N.E. Simmonds, <i>The “Will” and “Interest” Theories</i>	281
	Suggested Further Readings	283
PART III CRITICAL JURISPRUDENCE		285
	INTRODUCTION	285
Chapter 8 LEGALISM		289
A.	LEGALISM AS A PROFESSIONAL IDEOLOGY	289
	JUDITH SHKLAR, LEGALISM: LAW, MORALS, AND POLITICAL TRIALS	289
	PAUL KAHN, THE CULTURAL STUDY OF LAW: RECONSTRUCTING LEGAL SCHOLARSHIP	293
	Questions on Shklar and Kahn	297
B.	LEGALISM AND OBJECTIVITY	298
	Owen Fiss, <i>Objectivity and Interpretation</i>	299
	Paul D. Carrington, <i>Of Law and River</i>	307

Table of Contents

	Questions on Fiss and Carrington	310
C.	LEGALISM AS TRADITIONALISM	311
	Anthony Kronman, <i>Precedent and Tradition</i>	311
	Comments and Questions on Kronman	320
	Thomas Paine, <i>Rights of Man: Part Two</i>	321
	Justice Oliver Wendell Holmes, <i>Path of the Law</i>	322
	Comments and Questions on Kronman	323
D.	LEGALISM AS FORMALISM	324
	ANTHONY T. KRONMAN, THE LOST LAWYER: FAILING IDEALS OF THE LEGAL PROFESSION	325
	Comments on Langdellian Formalism, and an Introduction to Legal Realism	328
E.	LEGALISM AS LIBERALISM	335
	JOHN RAWLS, A THEORY OF JUSTICE	336
	Question on Rawls	340
Chapter 9	CRITICAL JURISPRUDENCE: AN OVERVIEW OF THE MOVEMENTS	341
<hr/>		
A.	THE LEGAL REALIST MOVEMENT	342
	Justice Oliver Wendell Holmes, <i>Path of the Law</i>	343
	JUSTICE OLIVER WENDELL HOLMES, THE COMMON LAW	349
	<i>Lochner v. New York</i>	350
	Karl Llewellyn, <i>Some Realism About Realism</i>	351
	Notes and Comments on Legal Realism	359
	LON FULLER, THE LAW IN QUEST OF ITSELF	360
	ROSCOE POUND, JUSTICE ACCORDING TO LAW	363
	Notes and Comments on Legal Realism	364
B.	THE CRITICAL LEGAL STUDIES MOVEMENT	365
	Roberto Unger, <i>The CLS Movement</i>	368
	Duncan Kennedy, <i>Legal Training as Training for Hierarchy</i>	377
	Robert W. Gordon, <i>Unfreezing Legal Reality: Critical Approaches to Law</i>	379
	Questions and Comments on Critical Legal Studies	381
C.	IDENTITY-BASED CRITIQUES	382
1.	Some Historical Examples	385
	<i>State v. Mann</i>	385
	ROBERT COVER, JUSTICE ACCUSED: ANTISLAVERY AND THE JUDICIAL PROCESS	388
	<i>Bradley v. State</i>	392
	<i>Bradwell v. Illinois</i>	393
	Suggestions for Further Reading	395

Table of Contents

2.	Critical Race Theory	395
	Mari Matsuda, <i>Looking to the Bottom</i>	399
	Charles Lawrence III, <i>The Id, The Ego, and Equal Protection: Reckoning with Unconscious Racism</i>	403
	Questions on Critical Race Theory	410
3.	Feminist Legal Theory	411
	Wendy W. Williams, <i>Notes from a First Generation</i>	414
	Christine A. Littleton, <i>Reconstructing Sexual Equality</i>	422
	CATHERINE A. MACKINNON, FEMINISM UNMODIFIED: DISCOURSES ON LIFE AND LAW	428
	Questions and Comments on Feminist Legal Theory	436
D.	QUEER THEORY	439
	Janet E. Halley, <i>Sexuality Harassment</i>	440
	Marc Spindelman, <i>Discriminating Pleasures</i>	457
	Questions and Comments on Queer Theory	467
E.	INTERDISCIPLINARITY: THE STUDY OF LAW AND LEGALISM	468
	Cass R. Sunstein, <i>On Analogical Reasoning</i>	469
	Notes on Analogic Reasoning	474
1.	Law and Humanities	478
	ROBERT FERGUSON, LAW AND LETTERS IN AMERICAN CULTURE	479
	Questions on Law and Humanities	483
2.	Law and Literature	484
	James Boyd White, <i>Law and Literature: No Manifesto</i>	486
	Robin L. West, <i>The Literary Lawyer</i>	492
	Questions and Comments on Law and Literature	500
3.	Law and Interpretation	503
	Ronald Dworkin, <i>Law as Interpretation</i>	503
	Owen Fiss, <i>Objectivity and Interpretation</i>	511
	Stanley Fish, <i>Fish v. Fiss</i>	514
	Steven Knapp and Walter Benn Michaels, <i>Against Theory</i>	521
	Robert Cover, <i>The Violence and the Word</i>	525
	Questions on Law and Interpretation	530
4.	Law and Economics	531
a.	<i>Normative Law and Economics</i>	531
	Richard A. Posner, <i>The Ethical and Political Basis of the Efficiency Norm in Common Law Adjudication</i>	534
	Questions and Comments on the Economic Analysis of Justice	539
b.	<i>Descriptive Law and Economics</i>	543
	Justice O.W. Holmes, <i>Path of the Law</i> ,	543

Table of Contents

	Learned Hand, <i>United States v. Carroll Towing Co.</i>	545
	Questions and Comments on the Historical Project	548
c.	<i>The Coase Theorem</i>	549
	MITCHELL A. POLINSKY, AN INTRODUCTION TO LAW AND ECONOMICS	549
	Questions Regarding the Coase Theorem	553
	Notes and Comments on Other Disciplines	554
	Naomi Mezey, <i>Law as Culture</i>	555
	Further Readings	562
Chapter 10	CRITICAL JURISPRUDENCE: A CONCEPTUAL APPROACH	565
A.	LIBERAL LEGAL SKEPTICISM	566
1.	The Rights Critique	567
	Morton J. Horwitz, <i>Rights</i>	567
	Mark Tushnet, <i>An Essay on Rights</i> ,	572
	Questions on the Rights Critique	582
2.	Critiques of Formal Equality	583
	Catharine A. MacKinnon, <i>Sex Equality: On Difference and Dominance</i> ,	584
	Eva Feder Kittay, <i>Taking Dependency Seriously: The Family and Medical Leave Act Considered in Light of the Social Organization of Dependency Work and Gender Equality</i>	597
	Questions on Formal Equality	605
3.	The Autonomy Critique	606
	Robert Hale, <i>Coercion and Distribution in a Supposedly Non-Coercive State</i>	608
	Morris Cohen, <i>Property and Sovereignty</i>	613
4.	The Privacy Critique	623
	Robin West, <i>Lifting the Veil of the Right to Be Let Alone</i>	623
	Questions and Comments on Autonomy and Privacy	630
B.	CRITICAL THEORY	630
1.	Hegemony and Legitimation	631
	Kimberlé Williams Crenshaw, <i>Race, Reform, and Retrenchment: Transformation and Legitimation in Antidiscrimination Law</i>	632
2.	False Necessity	640
	Robert W. Gordon, <i>Unfreezing Legal Reality: Critical Approaches to Law</i>	640
	Questions on Critical Theory	652
C.	POSTMODERNISM: INDETERMINACY AND INTERSECTIONALITY	653

Table of Contents

1.	The Indeterminacy Thesis	654
	MICHEL FOUCAULT, THE ORDER OF THINGS, AND	
	ARCHEOLOGY OF HUMAN SCIENCES, INTRO.,	654
	MARK V. TUSHNET, RED, WHITE AND BLUE: A CRITICAL	
	ANALYSIS OF CONSTITUTIONAL LAW	656
2.	Intersectionality, Anti-Essentialism and Perspectival Theories of	
	Knowledge	661
	Mari J. Matsuda, <i>When the First Quail Calls: Multiple</i>	
	<i>Consciousness as Jurisprudential Method</i> ,	661
	Kimberlé Crenshaw, <i>Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality,</i>	
	<i>Identity Politics, and Violence Against Women of Color</i>	666
	Questions on Indeterminacy and Intersectionality	677
	Owen Fiss, <i>The Death of the Law</i>	681
	Questions on Indeterminacy and Intersectionality	685
D.	PRAGMATISM AND UTILITARIANISM	685
	Robin West, <i>The Other Utilitarians</i>	686
	Richard A. Posner, <i>Pragmatic Adjudication</i>	702
	Questions on Pragmatism and Utilitarianism	715

PART IV JURISPRUDENCE IN BLACK ROBES 719

 INTRODUCTION 719

Chapter 11 IS MEANING FOUND OR IMPUTED? 721

A.	CONSENT AND COERCION, WELCOME, AND	
	DISAGREEABLE	721
	<i>Meritor Savings Bank, FSB v. Vinson</i>	721
	Notes	726
B.	PRIVATE INTENT	727
	<i>Michelle Marvin v. Lee Marvin</i>	727
	Notes	731
	<i>Akers v. Baldwin</i>	731
	Notes	756
C.	LAWGIVERS' INTENT	758
	<i>Alden v. Maine</i>	758
	Notes	759
	Stephen Breyer, <i>On the Uses of Legislative History in</i>	
	<i>Interpreting Statutes</i>	761
	Notes	763

Table of Contents

Chapter 12	MORAL ASSUMPTIONS IN LAW	765
A.	IMPLICIT IN CURRENT LAW?	765
	<i>Kurowski v. Krajewski</i>	765
	Notes	768
B.	IMPLICIT IN THE CLAIM TO OBEDIENCE?	769
	<i>Bell v. Maryland</i>	769
	Notes	780
	Trial of the Major War Criminals Before the International Military Tribunal	781
	Trial of the Major War Criminals Before the International Military Tribunal	792
	Notes	794
C.	IMPLICIT POSITION ON CONSEQUENCES?	795
	<i>Herrera v. Collins</i>	795
	Notes	826
Chapter 13	WHAT MORAL CLAIMS COUNT?	827
A.	OUR SIBLINGS' KEEPERS?	827
	<i>National Federation of Independent Business v. Sebelius</i>	827
	Notes and Questions	833
B.	SLAVERY, FREEDOM, AND PHYSICAL SECURITY?	834
	<i>The Antelope. The Vice-Consuls of Spain and Portugal, Libellants</i> ...	834
	Notes and Questions	842
	<i>Kircher v. City of Jamestown</i>	843
	Notes	854
C.	THE LIBERAL PARADIGM	854
1.	Freedom Unless Others Are Hurt?	854
	<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	854
	Notes	871
2.	What Counts as an Injury?	873
	<i>Valley Forge Christian College v. Americans United for</i> <i>Separation of Church and State, Inc.</i>	873
	Notes	877
D.	DEMOCRACY?	877
	<i>San Antonio Independent School District v. Rodriguez</i>	879
	Notes	889
E.	DISTRIBUTIVE JUSTICE vs. SELF-REGARDING RIGHTS	890
1.	Property?	890
	<i>Seawall Associates v. City of New York</i>	890
	Notes	910
2.	Freedom and Community	912

Table of Contents

	Ian Shapiro, <i>Notes Toward a Conditional Theory of Rights and Obligations in Property</i>	913
	Notes and Questions	915
3.	“Neutral,” “Universal” or Defensible Rules and Outcomes, and the Treatment of Gender	915
	<i>De La Cruz v. Tormey</i>	916
	Notes	929
4.	State Action and Remedies for Inequality and Subordination	929
	<i>City of Richmond v. J.A. Croson Co.</i>	929
	Notes	939
	<i>Grutter v. Bollinger</i>	944
	Notes	977
F.	HOW FAR DO MORAL CLAIMS REACH?	978
	<i>McCain v. Koch</i>	978
	Notes	982
	INDEX	I-1
