



***Burrow-Giles
v. Sarony
(US 1884)***

***Copyright Protection
for Photographs, and
Concepts of Authorship
in an Age of Machines***

Titles in the Deep Dive Series

Copyright

Burrow-Giles v. Sarony (US 1884), by Jane C. Ginsburg

Criminal Procedure

Miranda v. Arizona, by Amos N. Guiora and Louisa M.A. Heiny

Federal Courts/Civil Rights

Juidice v. Vail, by Jane Bloom Gris  and Michelle C. Gris 

First Amendment

New York Times v. Sullivan, by Eric B. Easton

Immigration

Jean v. Nelson, by Irwin P. Stotzky

Securities

Securities and Exchange Commission v. Cuban, by Marc I. Steinberg

***Burrow-Giles
v. Sarony
(US 1884)***

***Copyright Protection
for Photographs, and
Concepts of Authorship
in an Age of Machines***

Jane C. Ginsburg

Columbia Law School



TWELVE TABLES PRESS

XII

Copyright © 2020 Twelve Tables Press

ISBN: 978-1-946074-29-4

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be used or reproduced in any manner whatsoever or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner:

Twelve Tables Press
P.O. Box 568
Northport, New York 11768
www.twelvetablespress.com

Back cover computer-manipulated photograph by Luke Ali Budiardjo.

Printed in the United States of America.

*To George
and Paul, Francesca and Lucrezia,
and Clara and Rory (and Wallace)*

Contents

Table of Photographs.....	xiii
Acknowledgments	xvii
About the Author	xix
Introduction: Composing the Picture.....	1
Part I: Before <i>Burrow-Giles Lithographic Co. v. Sarony</i>	7
(A) Before Congress Included Photographs in the Subject Matter of Copyright	9
Note.....	10
Copyright Act of 1831, ch. 16, 4 Stat. 436.....	11
<i>Wood v. Abbott</i> , 30 F. Cas. 424 (C.C.S.D.N.Y. 1866) (No. 17,938)	12
<i>Rossiter v. Hall</i> , 20 F. Cas. 1253 (C.C.E.D.N.Y. 1866) (No. 12,082).....	14
(B) The United Kingdom Adds Photographs to the Subject Matter of Copyright: Fine Arts Copyright Act, 1862 (U.K.).....	17
Note.....	18
Text of Act Fine Arts Copyright Act, 1862, 25 & 26 Vict., c. 68 (U.K.).....	19
Debates in Parliament 165 PARL. DEB., H.C. (3d ser.) (1862) 1890–91 (U.K.)	23
166 PARL. DEB., H.C. (3d ser.) (1862) 2013–20 (U.K.).....	26
Note.....	31
<i>Nottage v. Jackson</i> , [1883] 11 Q.B.D. 627	32
(C) The U.S. Congress Includes Photographs in the Subject Matter of U.S. Copyright: The 1865 Amendment	45
Note.....	46
John Moran, <i>The Relation of Photography to the Fine Arts</i> , 2 PHILA. PHOTOGRAPHER 33 (1865)	48
Text of 1865 Amendment Act of Mar. 3, 1865, ch. 126, 13 Stat. 540.....	51
Legislative History CONG. GLOBE, 38th Cong., 2d Sess. 981 (1865)	52

(D) A Lawsuit Before Sarony's: <i>Gutekunst v. Weise</i> (1868)	53
<i>Can a Photograph be Copyrighted?</i> , 5 PHILA. PHOTOGRAPHER 379 (1868).....	55
Notes and Questions.....	58
Part II: The Sarony Case	59
Background to <i>Burrow-Giles Lithographic Co. v. Sarony</i> , 111 U.S. 53 (1884).....	60
(A) Action Before the Circuit Court for the Southern District of New York.....	65
Docket Entry.....	66
Complaint	67
Summons	74
Answer	75
Stipulations to Waive Jury Trial and Limit Defenses	77
Decision by Judge Coxe <i>Sarony v. Burrow-Giles Lithographic Co.</i> , 17 F. 591 (C.C.S.D.N.Y. 1883).....	80
Note on <i>Schreiber v. Thornton</i> , 17 F. 603 (E.D. Pa. 1883), referenced in Judge Coxe's Decision	82
Judgment Entered for Sarony	83
(B) Appeal to the U.S. Supreme Court	83
Assignment of Error/Joinder in Error/Citation.....	90
Summons to Sarony.....	92
Statement and Brief for Plaintiff in Error	93
Brief for Defendant in Error.....	115
Commentary Contemporaneous with Oral Argument: Did Sarony Invent Oscar Wilde?, N.Y. TIMES, Dec. 14, 1883, at 4	134
Opinion of the Court <i>Burrow-Giles Lithographic Co. v. Sarony</i> , 111 U.S. 53 (1883).....	135
The Supreme Court Comes to Sarony ... To be Photographed in His New York Studio, for the Feb. 4, 1890 Celebration of the Centenary of the Federal Judiciary (1890).....	144
Postscript: The Sarony Studio and Trademark.....	146
(C) Dramatis Personae	149
(1) Napoleon Sarony	149
Portraits: Susan B. Anthony and Elizabeth Cady Stanton (c. 1870); Oscar Wilde (1882); Mark Twain (1882); Self-portrait (1895)	150

Contemporary News Accounts About Sarony	
A Morning at Sarony’s, 4 GALAXY 408 (1870)	151
Sarony, 34 WILSON’S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAGAZINE 65 (1897)	155
Postscript	158
(2) The Lawyers for Sarony	159
Augustus T. Gurlitz	160
<i>Mark Twain a Witness: Summoned in Rudyard Kipling’s</i> <i>Copyright Suit Against Publishers</i> , N.Y. TIMES, Mar. 14, 1901, at 3	161
<i>Augustus Gurlitz, Lawyer, Dies at 85: Specialized in</i> <i>Copyright and Patent Cases for More than Half a</i> <i>Century</i> , N.Y. TIMES, Oct. 22, 1928, at 25	164
Guernsey Sackett	165
CHARLES H. WEYGANT, THE SACKETTS OF AMERICA: THEIR ANCESTORS AND DESCENDANTS, 1630–1907, at 377 (1907)	165
(3) The Lawyers for Burrow–Giles	167
David Calman and Marcus Stine	168
<i>The Suspension of Calman</i> , N.Y. TRIB., Dec. 15, 1899, at 4	169
<i>New York Man Sues for Sum of \$1,000,000</i> , DETROIT FREE PRESS, Mar. 20, 1901, at 2	170
Notes and Questions	171
Part III: After Sarony	175
(A) <i>Sarony’s Immediate Aftermath: Pre-1909 Act Cases</i>	177
Benjamin Falk: Sarony’s Successor as Celebrity Photographer, and as a Leading Litigant	178
Falk v. Donaldson, 57 F. 32 (S.D.N.Y. 1893)	181
(B) Legislation, 1895–1909	185
Introductory Note	186
(1) 1895 Amendment Setting Damages Limit	190
(a) Text	
Act of Mar. 2, 1895, ch. 194, 28 Stat. 965	190
(b) Committee Report	
H.R. REP. NO. 53-1733 (1895)	191
(c) Contemporary Commentary	
<i>Copyright and Blackmail</i> , N.Y. HERALD, Sept. 4, 1893	193
<i>Amendment to the Covert Bill</i> , N.Y. TIMES, Feb. 28, 1895, at 7	196

Photographers' Copyright League of America, <i>Concerning Copyright</i> , 32 WILSON'S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAG. 221, 221–23 (1895)	197
B.J. Falk, <i>Photography vs. the Press</i> , 32 WILSON'S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAG. 389, 389–90 (1895).....	200
(2) 1898 Shafroth-Hicks Bills to Exclude Photographs from the Subject Matter of Copyright	202
(a) Text	
H.R. 5866, 55th Cong. (2d Sess. 1898)	202
H.R. 6348, 55th Cong. (2d Sess. 1898)	204
(b) Contemporary Commentary	
Charles E. Bolles, <i>A Copyright Crisis</i> , 35 WILSON'S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAG. 97, 97–98 (1898)	207
<i>Danger Ahead</i> , 10 AM. AMATEUR PHOTOGRAPHER 167 (1898)	209
(3) 1909 Act Setting Damages Limit for Unlicensed Uses of Photographs by Newspapers.....	210
(a) Text	
Act of Mar. 4, 1909, ch. 320, § 25, 35 Stat. 1075.....	210
(b) Legislative History.....	212
(i) House Report on Damages for Infringement of Photographers' Copyright	
H.R. REP. NO. 60-2222, at 15 (1909).....	212
(ii) Hearings	
<i>Copyright Hearings, December 7 to 11, 1906: Arguments Before the Comms. on Patents of the S. and H.R., Conjointly, on the Bills S. 6330 and H.R. 19853 to Amend and Consolidate the Acts Respecting Copyright</i> , 59th Cong. 170 (1906) (letter from Publishers' Association of New York City).....	217
<i>Copyright Hearings, December 7 to 11, 1906: Arguments Before the Comms. on Patents of the S. and H.R., Conjointly, on the Bills S. 6330 and H.R. 19853 to Amend and Consolidate the Acts Respecting Copyright</i> , 59th Cong. 169 (1906) (letter from Copyright Committee of the American Newspaper Publishers' Association)	217
<i>Copyright Hearings, December 7 to 11, 1906: Arguments Before the Comms. on Patents of the S. and H.R., Conjointly, on the Bills S. 6330 and H.R. 19853 to Amend and Consolidate the Acts Respecting Copyright</i> , 59th Cong. 388–89 (1906) (letter from Photographers' Copyright League of America).....	218

	<i>Revision of Copyright Laws: Hearings Before the Comms. on Patents of the S. and H.R. on Pending Bills to Amend and Consolidate the Acts Respecting Copyright, March 26–28, 1908, 60th Cong. 150–55 (1908) (statement of Copyright Committee of the American Newspaper Publishers Association)</i>	219
(c)	Contemporary Commentary	224
	(i) From the Photographers’ Perspective	224
	<i>More About Photographic Copyright</i> , 36 WILSON’S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAG. 52, 52–53 (1899)	224
	<i>The American Photographer and the Copyright Law</i> , 44 WILSON’S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAG. 1, 1–2 (1907)	226
	Photographers’ Copyright League of America, <i>The New Copyright Law</i> , 46 WILSON’S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAG. 145, 145–46 (1909).....	228
	(ii) From the Newspapers’ Perspective	230
	A.G. Anderson, <i>Photography and the Daily Press</i> , 42 WILSON’S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAG. 217 (1905)	230
(C)	Selected Cases on the Copyrightability of Photographs Under the 1909 and 1976 Acts	231
	Introductory Note.....	232
	(1) Under the 1909 Act (Selected Excerpts)	236
	<i>Gross v. Seligman</i> , 212 F. 930 (2d Cir. 1914)	236
	<i>Pagano v. Chas. Beseler Co.</i> , 234 F. 963 (S.D.N.Y. 1916).....	238
	<i>Altman v. New Haven Union Co.</i> , 254 F. 113 (D. Conn. 1918)	239
	<i>Time Inc. v. Bernard Geis Associates</i> , 293 F. Supp. 130 (S.D.N.Y. 1968).....	239
	(2) Under the 1976 Act (Selected Excerpts).....	243
	<i>Los Angeles News Service v. Tullo</i> , 973 F.2d 791 (9th Cir. 1992).....	243
	<i>Bridgeman Art Library v. Corel Corp.</i> , 36 F. Supp. 2d 191 (S.D.N.Y. 1999).....	245
	<i>Ets-Hokin v. Skyy Spirits, Inc.</i> , 225 F.3d 1068 (9th Cir. 2000).....	246
	<i>SHL Imaging, Inc. v. Artisan House, Inc.</i> , 117 F. Supp. 2d 301 (S.D.N.Y. 2000).....	249
	<i>Oriental Art Printing, Inc. v. Goldstar Printing Corp.</i> , 175 F. Supp. 2d 542 (S.D.N.Y. 2001).....	251
	<i>Mannion v. Coors Brewing Co.</i> , 377 F. Supp. 2d 444 (S.D.N.Y. 2005)	254
	<i>Schrock v. Learning Curve Int’l, Inc.</i> , 586 F.3d 513 (7th Cir. 2009).....	261

<i>Pohl v. MH Sub I LLC</i> , 770 Fed. App'x 482 (11th Cir. 2019).....	263
Notes and Questions.....	267
Conclusion: What Copyright in Photographs Can Teach Us About Authorship and Enforcement of Copyright in an Age of Digital Machines	270
Discussion Questions	277
Bibliography	279

Table of Photographs

PART I

p. 54

Frederick Gutekunst, *Ulysses S. Grant, Lieutenant-General, U.S.A.* (1865), in Lynn Berger, *Photography Distinguishes Itself: Law and the Emerging Profession of Photography in the Nineteenth-Century United States*, at 198 (2016) (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University), <https://doi.org/10.7916/D8222TM3>.

Alphonse Bigot, *Portrait of General Ulysses Grant* (1868), in Lynn Berger, *Photography Distinguishes Itself: Law and the Emerging Profession of Photography in the Nineteenth-Century United States*, at 198 (2016) (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University), <https://doi.org/10.7916/D8222TM3>.

PART II

pp. 61-63

Burrow-Giles Lithographic Co. v. Sarony, 111 U.S. 53 (1884)

Napoleon Sarony, *Oscar Wilde, No. 18* (1882), in *Oscar Wilde*, METROPOLITAN MUSEUM OF ART, <https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/283247> (last visited June 3, 2020).

Burrow-Giles Lithographic Co., *Oscar Wilde “Compliments of Ehrich Bros 8th Ave. & 24th St.”* [front] (ca. 1882), in *Sarony Photograph 18*, OSCAR WILDE IN AM., <https://www.oscarwildeinamerica.org/sarony/sarony-18.html> (last visited June 3, 2020). Archival research by John Cooper.

Burrow-Giles Lithographic Co., *Oscar Wilde “Compliments of Ehrich Bros 8th Ave. & 24th St.”* [back] (ca. 1882), in *Sarony Photograph 18*, OSCAR WILDE IN AM., <https://www.oscarwildeinamerica.org/sarony/sarony-18.html> (last visited June 3, 2020). Archival research by John Cooper.

pp. 144-145

Napoleon Sarony, *Chief Justice and Associate Justices of the Supreme Court of the United States* (1890), in *Portrait of the 1890 Supreme Court*, GETTY IMAGES, <https://www.gettyimages.com/detail/news-photo/portrait-of-the-chief-and-associate-justices-of-the-supreme-news-photo/640490163> (last visited June 5, 2020).

Napoleon Sarony, *Justice Samuel Freeman Miller* (1890), Supreme Court of the United States, Office of the Curator.

p. 150

Napoleon Sarony, *Susan B. Anthony and Elizabeth Cady Stanton—Carte de visite* (ca. 1870), in HERITAGE AUCTIONS, <https://historical.ha.com/itm/photography/suffragettes-elizabeth-cady-stanton-and-susan-b-anthony-carte-de-visite-two-great-suffragettes-elizabeth-cady-stanton-and/a/625-26176> (last visited June 3, 2020).

Napoleon Sarony, *Oscar Wilde No. 19* (ca. 1882), in *The Sarony Photographs*, OSCAR WILDE IN AM., <https://www.oscarwildeinamerica.org/sarony/sarony-photographs-of-oscar-wilde-1882.html> (last visited June 3, 2020). Archival research by John Cooper.

Napoleon Sarony, *Mark Twain* (ca. 1884), in *Mark Twain*, WIKIMEDIA COMMONS, https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Mark_Twain_by_Sarony,_1884.JPG (last visited June 3, 2020).

Napoleon Sarony, *Self-Portrait* (ca. 1895), in *Napoleon Sarony: Celebrity Photographer*, MUSEUM OF THE CITY OF N.Y., <https://wp.me/p1kGOJ-2PM> (last visited June 3, 2020).

pp. 156-157

Sarony from an early daguerrotype (1842), in *Sarony*, 34 WILSON'S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAG. 65, 66 (1897).

Sarony from a sketch by himself, in *Sarony*, 34 WILSON'S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAG. 65, 67 (1897).

PART III

p. 178

The Byron Company, *Uncle Joe Byron, Pirie MacDonald, Colonel Marceau, Pop Core, Ben Falk* (1920), in *Byron Company*, MUSEUM OF THE CITY OF N.Y., https://collections.mcny.org/Collection/Uncle-Joe-Byron,-Pirie-MacDonald,-Colonel-Marceau,-Pop-Core,-Ben-Falk-New-York-Dec.-1920.-2F3XC58B7S_O.html (last visited June 3, 2020).

p. 179

Benjamin J. Falk, *Geraldine Ulmar as Yum-Yum* (1886), in *Collections*, MUSEUM OF THE CITY OF N.Y., <https://collections.mcny.org/Collection/Geraldine%20Ulmar%20as%20Yum-Yum-2F3HRGMHX6RE.html> (last visited June 3, 2020).

p. 180

Benjamin J. Falk, *Josie Sadler and Child* (1888), in LIBR. OF CONGRESS, <https://lccn.loc.gov/96512874> (last visited June 3, 2020).

p. 181

Benjamin J. Falk, *Julia Marlowe* (1888), in *Julia Marlowe: Esteemed American Stage Actress*, CABINET CARD GALLERY, <https://cabinetcardgallery.com/2014/05/23/julia-marlowe-esteemed-american-stage-actress/> (last visited June 3, 2020).

p. 184

NAPOLEON SARONY from the bust in bronze by D'AMORE, now the property of Benj. J. Falk, Esq., in 34 WILSON'S PHOTOGRAPHIC MAG. (1897), facing p. 65.

p. 237

Gross v. Seligman, 212 F. 930, 931 (2d Cir. 1914):

Rochlitz, *Grace of Youth*, in *Can You Copyright A Pose?*, WRITTEN DESCRIPTION, <https://writtendescription.blogspot.com/2018/02/can-you-copyright-pose.html> (last visited June 3, 2020).

Rochlitz, *Cherry Ripe*, in *Can You Copyright A Pose?*, WRITTEN DESCRIPTION, <https://writtendescription.blogspot.com/2018/02/can-you-copyright-pose.html> (last visited June 3, 2020).

p. 247

Ets-Hokin v. Skyy Spirits, Inc., 225 F.3d 1068 (9th Cir. 2000)

Joshua Ets-Hokin, Photographs of SKYY® Vodka Bottle (1993), in Jacka Declaration, *Ets-Hokin v. Skyy Spirits, Inc.*, No. C 96-3690, 1998 WL 690856 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 28, 1998), ECF No. 106, *rev'd*, 225 F.3d 1068 (9th Cir. 2000).

p. 256

Mannion v. Coors Brewing Co., 377 F. Supp. 2d 444 (S.D.N.Y. 2005)

Jonathan Mannion, Photograph of Kevin Garnett (1999), in *Above the Clouds*, SLAM, Dec. 1999, *reprinted in Mannion v. Coors Brewing Co.*, 377 F. Supp. 2d 444, 464 (S.D.N.Y. 2005).

Photograph of Iced Out Comp Board (ca. 2001), in *Mannion v. Coors Brewing Co.*, 377 F. Supp. 2d 444, 465 (S.D.N.Y. 2005).

p. 264

Pohl v. MH Sub I LLC, 770 Fed. App'x 482 (11th Cir. 2019)

Mitchell A. Pohl, Before-and-After Photographs of Belinda's Teeth, in *Pohl v. MH Sub I, LLC*, 314 F. Supp. 3d 1225, 1228 (N.D. Fla. 2018), *rev'd*, 770 Fed. App'x 482 (11th Cir. 2019); *see also* *Dental Photos Case Shows Copyright Threshold Has Bite*, LAW360 (July 11, 2018, 2:03 PM), <https://www.law360.com/articles/1062046/dental-photos-case-shows-copyright-threshold-has-bite>.

p. 278

Luke Ali Budiardjo via deepdreamgenerator.com, *Oscar Wilde No. 18/Vincent van Gogh, Starry Night Mashup* (on file with author).

Acknowledgments

I greatly appreciate the superlative research of Zander Weiss, Columbia Law School class of 2018, and of Ben Minkoff, Columbia Law School class of 2019, in gathering many of the documents collected in this volume. Many thanks as well to Anna Iskikian and Brandon Zamudio, both Columbia Law School class of 2020, for further excellent research in locating documents. I am especially indebted to Brandon Zamudio for assistance in drafting or editing many of the notes accompanying the documents. I am grateful as well to Luke Ali Budiardjo, Esq., and to Mickey H. Osterreicher, Esq. General Counsel, National Press Photographers Association (NPPA), for further ideas and information. Finally, much appreciation to Jessica Copland for administrative assistance.

Jane C. Ginsburg
July 2020

About the Author

Jane C. Ginsburg, University of Chicago, BA 1976, MA 1977; Harvard, JD 1980; Université de Paris II, Diplôme d'études approfondies 1985 (Fulbright Scholar), Doctorat en droit 1995, is the Morton L. Janklow Professor of Literary and Artistic Property Law at Columbia University School of Law, and Faculty Director of its Kernochan Center for Law, Media and the Arts. She teaches Copyright Law, International Copyright Law, Trademark Law, Legal Methods, and Statutory Interpretation, and is an author of casebooks in all five subjects, as well as of many books, articles and book chapters on domestic and international copyright and trademark law. She was a co-Reporter for the American Law Institute's *Principles Governing Jurisdiction, Choice of Law and Judgments in Transnational Intellectual Property Disputes*. She is a Corresponding Fellow of the British Academy, a Member of the American Philosophical Society, a Member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, an Honorary Fellow of Emmanuel College, University of Cambridge, and was an Affiliated Fellow and a Resident at the American Academy in Rome.

