



Jean v. Nelson:
**A Civil Rights
Revolution in
Immigration**

Titles in the Deep Dive Series

Copyright

Burrow-Giles v. Sarony (US 1884)

Jane C. Ginsburg

Criminal Procedure

Five Words That Changed America: Miranda v. Arizona

Amos N. Guiora and Louisa M.A. Heiny

Federal Courts/Civil Rights

Federal Courts and Civil Rights: Juidice v. Vail

Jane Bloom Gris  and Michelle C. Gris 

First Amendment

New York Times v. Sullivan

Eric B. Easton

Immigration Law

Jean v. Nelson: A Civil Rights Revolution in Immigration

Irwin P. Stotzky

Securities Law

Securities and Exchange Commission v. Cuban

Marc I. Steinberg

Jean v. Nelson:
A Civil Rights
Revolution in
Immigration

Irwin P. Stotzky



Copyright © 2021 Twelve Tables Press

ISBN: 978-1-946074-34-8

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be used or reproduced in any manner whatsoever or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner:

Twelve Tables Press
P.O. Box 568
Northport, New York 11768
www.twelvetablespress.com

All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America.

Cover photo: Haitian migrants rest aboard the U.S. Coast Guard Cutter Harriet Lane after being interdicted at sea on their way to Florida December 1, 1991, in the Caribbean Sea. The refugees will be taken to camps in Guantanamo Bay, Cuba for repatriation. US Coast Guard Photo / Alamy Stock Photo

For Ace, Amber, Audrey, Jacob, and Joshua

*With love and appreciation for taking on the burdensome task
of keeping me sane during the many years
I have worked on this project.*

Contents

Table of Documents.....	ix
Acknowledgments	xi
About the Author	xiii
Chapter I: Introduction.....	1
Chapter II: A Broad View: The Cases	9
Chapter III: <i>Jean v. Nelson</i>	13
Affidavit of Steven Forrester, Haitian Refugee Center Attorney.....	20
Chapter IV: Pretial Work.....	23
Emergency Habeas Corpus Petition	24
Amended Petition for Writ of Habeas Corpus and Complaint for Declaratory, Injunctive, and Mandatory Relief	32
<i>Jean v. Meissner</i> , 90 F.R.D. 658 (1981), 32 Fed.R.Serv.2d 1570.....	50
Memorandum in Support of Motion for Class Action Certification <i>Louis v. Meissner</i> Case No. 81-1260-CIV-ALH (1981).....	57
Motion for Preliminary Injunction <i>Louis v. Meissner</i>	72
Memorandum in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction <i>Louis v. Meissner</i>	74
Opinion on Plaintiff’s Renewed Motion for Temporary Restraining Order <i>Louis v. Meisner</i> , 530 F.Supp. 924 (1981) (<i>Louis I</i>).....	104
Judge Spellman’s Opinion <i>Louis v. Meissner</i> , 532 F.Supp. 881 (1982) (<i>Louis II</i>).....	116
Chapter V: The Trial.....	133
Judge Spellman Final Judgement <i>Louis v. Nelson</i> , 544. F.Supp. 1004 (1982) (<i>Louis IV</i>).....	134

Chapter VI: The Appeals	143
Appeal, Motion for Partial Stay	
<i>Jean v. Nelson</i> , 683 F.2d 1311 (11th Cir. 1982).....	144
Rehearing en banc	
<i>Jean v. Nelson</i> , 727 F.2d 957 (11th Cir. 1984) (<i>Jean II</i>).....	146
Masters Report and Recommendation	
<i>Louis v Meissner</i> , Case No. 81-1260-Civ-EPS	200
Supreme Court	
Petition for Writ of Certiorari, <i>Jean</i> (No. 84-5240).....	219
Brief for the Respondents, <i>Jean</i> (No. 84-5240).....	244
Reply Brief of Petitioners, <i>Jean</i> (No. 84-5240).....	265
Petition for Certiorari granted, <i>Jean</i> , 469 U.S. 1071	
(No. 84-5240).....	275
Oral Argument Tr. <i>Jean v. Nelson</i> , 472 U.S. 846 (1985)	
(No. 84-5240).....	276
<i>Jean v. Nelson</i> , 472 U.S. 846 (1985) (<i>Jean</i>).....	299
 Chapter VII: Attorney’s Fee Litigation:	
<i>Commissioner v. Jean</i>	325
 Chapter VIII: Conclusion: Legacy	349

Table of Documents

Affidavit of Steven Forrester, Haitian Refugee Center Attorney	20
Emergency Habeas Corpus Petition	24
Amended Petition for Writ of Habeas Corpus and Complaint for Declaratory, Injunctive, and Mandatory Relief	32
Jean v. Meissner, 90 F.R.D. 658 (1981), 32 Fed.R.Serv.2d 1570	50
Memorandum in Support of Motion for Class Action Certification <i>Louis v. Meissner</i> Case No. 81-1260-CIV-ALH (1981)	57
Motion for Preliminary Injunction <i>Louis v. Meissner</i>	72
Memorandum in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction <i>Louis v. Meissner</i>	74
Opinion on Plaintiff’s Renewed Motion for Temporary Restraining Order <i>Louis v. Meisner</i> , 530 F.Supp. 924 (1981) (<i>Louis I</i>)	104
Judge Spellman’s Opinion <i>Louis v. Meissner</i> , 532 F.Supp. 881 (1982) (<i>Louis II</i>)	116
Judge Spellman Final Judgement <i>Louis v. Nelson</i> , 544. F.Supp. 1004 (1982) (<i>Louis IV</i>).....	134
Appeal, Motion for Partial Stay <i>Jean v. Nelson</i> , 683 F.2d 1311 (11th Cir. 1982)	144
Rehearing en banc <i>Jean v. Nelson</i> , 727 F.2d 957 (11th Cir. 1984) (<i>Jean II</i>)	146
Masters Report and Recommendation <i>Louis v Meissner</i> , Case No. 81-1260-Civ-EPS.....	200
Supreme Court Petition for Writ of Certiorari, <i>Jean</i> (No. 84-5240)	219
Brief for the Respondents, <i>Jean</i> (No. 84-5240)	244
Reply Brief of Petitioners, <i>Jean</i> (No. 84-5240).....	265
Petition for Certiorari granted, <i>Jean</i> , 469 U.S. 1071 (No. 84-5240).....	275
Oral Argument Tr. <i>Jean v. Nelson</i> , 472 U.S. 846 (1985) (No. 84-5240)	276
<i>Jean v. Nelson</i> , 472 U.S. 846 (1985) (<i>Jean</i>)	299

Acknowledgments

I wish to thank all of the Haitian refugees who were subjected to harsh and unconstitutional treatment by the government of the United States, in contradiction to our national values, for their courage in the face of persecution both in Haiti and in the United States. I also wish to thank the Haitian community in Miami and worldwide for their help in the case and their commitment to freedom.

The attorneys who worked on this case for over a decade deserve special praise. Ira Kurzban, who spearheaded the litigation, has been an unstinting advocate for the fair treatment of Haitian refugees for five decades. Other attorneys who deserve praise for their work on this case include Steve Forrester, Robert Juceam, Cheryl Little, Michael Rosen, and Vera Weisz. I also wish to thank the memory of Christopher Keith Hall and the memory of Bruce Winick, who played important roles in the litigation of this case.

Erin Berhan, a third-year student at the University of Miami School of Law, and Devin Weinberg, a third-year student at the University of Chicago Law School, did an outstanding job as my research assistants. They deserve special praise. The University of Miami Library staff was always helpful. I am particularly grateful to Pamela Lucken, Head of Reference and Lecturer in Law, for her research help.

About the Author

Irwin P. Stotzky is currently Professor of Law at the University of Miami School of Law. He is the founder and served as the Director of the University of Miami Center for the Study of Human Rights from 1993 to 2010. He received his J.D. from the University of Chicago Law School in 1974. In 1986-88, he was a Visiting Scholar at the Yale Law School. In 1991-1993, Professor Stotzky was a Fulbright Scholar in Argentina. In 2001, he was a Distinguished Visiting Professor and Scholar at the State University of New York at Buffalo School of Law. In 2007, he was a Distinguished Visiting Professor and Scholar at Emory University School of Law. For over four decades, he has represented Haitian and other refugees on constitutional and human rights issues in many cases, including several cases in the United States Supreme Court. Professor Stotzky has served as an adviser to the Alfonsín regime in Argentina on what steps to take, including human rights trials, against those who committed massive human rights abuses during the so-called “dirty war.” For many years, he served as an attorney and adviser to the first democratically elected president in the history of Haiti, Haitian President Jean-Bertrand Aristide, and as an adviser to President René Préval’s administration. In this capacity, he organized and directed the investigations into the massive human rights violations committed in Haiti during the illegal military regime’s reign, between 1991 and 1994. This led to the first conviction for human rights crimes in the 200-year history of Haiti. From 2000 to 2003, he served as the Chairman of an international Presidential Commission to help Haiti confront its drug problems.

Professor Stotzky has published numerous articles and books on democracy and human rights, criminal law and procedure, and the role of the judiciary in the transition to democracy. His books include *The Theory and Craft of American Law: Elements* (with Soia Mentschikoff) (1981), *Transition to Democracy in Latin America: The Role of the Judiciary* (1993), *Silencing the Guns in Haiti: The Promise of Deliberative Democracy* (1997), *Law as Justice: The Moral Imperative of Owen Fiss’s Scholarship* (2009), and *Send Them Back* (2019). He teaches in the areas of constitutional law and theory, criminal procedure, immigration law, and philosophy.

Professor Stotzky has received human rights awards from the American Immigration Lawyers Association and the Haitian Refugee Center for his representation of refugees in a series of cases before the United States Supreme Court and his human rights work abroad. For his involvement in investigating human rights abuses worldwide and his scholarship, he

received the *Inter-American Law Review's* 1997 Lawyer of the Americas award. He has been nominated for the Society of American Law Teachers (SALT) Human Rights Award for career achievements. For thirty-eight years, he served as the Director of the Soia Mentschikoff Legal Research and Writing Program. For twenty-five years, he served as the Director of the James Weldon Johnson/Robert H. Waters Summer Institute.

Professor Stotzky is a founding member and member of the Board of Directors of the Institute for Justice and Democracy in Haiti, a human rights institute that researches and distributes objective and accurate information on the human rights conditions in Haiti. He is a member of the editorial board, and special editor for "Deliberative Commentary: The Nexus of Democratic Theory and Law," for the journal *Democratic Theory*.