

Law in American History (And in Mine)

Law in American History (And in Mine)

C. Evan Stewart



Copyright © 2025 Twelve Tables Press

ISBN 978-1-946074-45-4

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be used or reproduced in any manner whatsoever or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner:

Twelve Tables Press
P.O. Box 568
Northport, New York 11768
www.twelvetablespress.com

All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America.

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

The cover photograph is of Carl Newton performing magic tricks at the Donovan Leisure 1977 Christmas Dinner. The back cover photograph is of Ken Hart and the author, December 1985. Both photographs are from the author's collection.

To:

*My Mother, my Father, my Sister, and my Daughter
–and–*

*My colleagues at Donovan Leisure, who made it such
a special place: Ken Hart, Sam Murphy, Reg Koehler,
Dan Murdock, Jim Hayes, John Baity, Jim Withrow,
Owen McGivern, John Hendricks, Dave Versfelt,
Louise Parent, Oscie Thomas, Bob Siverd, Jean Prewitt,
Curt Gimson, Sara Moss, Meg Gifford, Cam Cowan,
Tom Ahlf, Orin McCluskey, Peter Chaffetz,
Lloyd Blankfein, John Schwolsky, Kristen Lewis,
Tim O'Neil, Rose Suel, Ann Papp, Al Borner,
Bill Hancock, Chief Korves & Tracy Russell*

Contents

Preface	xi
Chapter I. The Law Firm of “Wild Bill” Donovan.....	1
Chapter II. Sam Murphy: The John Wayne of Lawyerdome.....	7
Chapter III. Walter Mansfield: Lawyer, Judge, Warrior	15
Chapter IV. The Associate’s Dilemma: Joe Fortenberry, Mahlon Perkins, and the Kodak Antitrust Trial.....	25
Chapter V. The Associate’s Dilemma: Regulation U.....	37
Chapter VI. The Associate’s Dilemma: Obeying Dumb Orders.....	45
Chapter VII. How to Handle Your First Pro Bono Matter?.....	53
Chapter VIII. Ken Hart: Extraordinary Lawyer, Legal Mentor, and Good Friend	59
Chapter IX. The Most Publicized Trial in History, and the Case with Perhaps the Most Legal Errors	69
Chapter X. Mrs. Palsgraf and the Long Island Railroad: Did Cardozo Get It Wrong?.....	81
Chapter XI. The Trial of Anthony Burns and the Coming of the Civil War.....	89

Chapter XII. The Supreme Court Gets It Right (Twice): The Trials of the “Scottsboro Boys”	101
Chapter XIII. New York at Its Nadir? The Trial of Bernhard Goetz	109
Chapter XIV. The Trials of “Scooter” Libby: Justice Run Amok?.....	117
Chapter XV. Edward Bennett Williams’s Last Great Trial.....	125
Chapter XVI. The Trials of Alger Hiss	135
Chapter XVII. Alger Hiss (Redux)	141
Chapter XVIII. McCarthyism Meets the Law, and Loses	151
Chapter XIX. Litigating <i>Profiles In Courage</i>	163
Chapter XX. The Twentieth Century’s Most Infamous Crime: Solved Without A Trial	171
Chapter XXI. Bobby Kennedy’s Department of Justice: RFK and His Greatest Nemesis	179
Chapter XXII. Chappaquiddick: Did the Justice System Work?.....	187
Chapter XXIII. Attorneys in the White House	201
Chapter XXIV. FDR’s “Trial” of Jimmy Walker.....	217
Chapter XXV. Lincoln: A Great Lawyer (And Our Greatest President)	225
Chapter XXVI. William Henry Seward: A Great Lawyer (And Great Statesman)	231

Chapter XXVII. A Friendship That Helped Win the Civil War	241
Chapter XXVIII. George Patton and Military Law	253
Chapter XXIX. The Serendipity of History: Henry Stimson and the Saving of Kyoto	261
Chapter XXX. The Court-Martial of Captain Charles McVay	269
Chapter XXXI. William Evarts: The Man to See (In the Nineteenth Century)	275
Chapter XXXII. Elihu Root: Legal Icon, American Statesman, and Fierce “TR” Partisan	287
Chapter XXXIII. John McCloy: The “Wise Man”	295
Chapter XXXIV. Tom Dewey’s Brilliant Legal Career	301
Chapter XXXV. The Man Who Mentored Lawyers.....	315
Chapter XXXVI. Simon Rifkind and the Lawyer’s Role and Responsibility	325
Chapter XXXVII. Simon Rifkind and the Case of the Maligned Author	329
Chapter XXXVIII. Theresienstadt: My Exposure to Nazi “Justice”	339
Chapter XXXIX. Making Up Her Own Mind	347
Chapter XL. Juris Imprudence	355
Appendix. Selected Correspondence from a 47-Plus-Year Legal Career	357

Preface

I started law practice as a first-year associate on September 26, 1977, at the renowned law firm Donovan Leisure Newton & Irvine. The firm had been started in 1929 by then-titled Colonel “Wild Bill” Donovan, the most decorated veteran of World War I (and more recently the head of the U.S. Antitrust Division); he would later become Major General Donovan, founder of the Office of Strategic Services (the forerunner of the C.I.A.) during World War II. By 1977, Donovan Leisure was considered one of the country’s leading litigation firms, with a specialty in large, complex antitrust cases.

I was a summer associate at the firm in 1976, and had gotten an offer of permanent employment at the end of my summer tenure. I felt honored to be joining this prestigious firm and, after trips to California and France (after the New York Bar Exam), I found a one-bedroom apartment to rent on East 57th Street and showed up early for work on the 39th floor of 30 Rockefeller Plaza on Monday morning, September 26.

This book contains—at its beginning—a number of chapters focused on Donovan Leisure, as well as some of my early experiences there. A few episodes are/were (in hindsight) pretty amusing, and I hope readers will find them so. Others were/are not so amusing, and I hope they will be instructive, especially to young lawyers at the outset of their careers.

One side benefit of my years at Donovan Leisure—besides receiving superb training which would help guide me through 47 years (plus) of my legal career—was that I began to write and publish articles on a wide range of topics. While many of those written addressed complicated legal topics, I also began to write and publish

articles that examined significant episodes concerning the legal history of our country. Many of those articles were published in the *Federal Bar Council Quarterly*; and it is those articles that (in updated form) comprise the majority of this book's chapters. From famous/infamous trials to miscarriages of justice, examining famous historical figures' brushes with the law as well as looking at how well prominent politicians cut the mustard as practicing lawyers, these chapters cover a vast swatch of material that I hope readers will find new and interesting.