

Gender and Law in American History

by Richard Chused and Wendy Williams

Table of Contents — DRAFT VERSION

Preface

Chapter 1: Women and Citizenship at the Turn of the Nineteenth Century

A. Introduction

B. The Gendered Politics of Citizenship and Suffrage in Early America

1. Enlightenment and the American Revolution

2. Suffrage, Dependency, and Gender: The Adams Correspondence

a. Letter from Abigail Adams to John Adams (March-April, 1776)

b. Commentary and Questions

c. Letter from John Adams to Abigail Adams (April 14, 1776)

d. Commentary and Questions

e. Letter from Abigail Adams to Mercy Otis Warren (April 27, 1776)

f. Commentary and Questions

g. Letter from Abigail Adams to John Adams (May 7, 1776)

h. Commentary and Questions

i. Letter from John Adams to John Sullivan (May 26, 1776)

j. Commentary and Questions

C. Property and Citizenship: The Status of Women During and After the Revolutionary War

1. *Martin v. State of Massachusetts*

2. Commentary and Questions

D. The Brief History of Woman Suffrage in New Jersey After the Revolutionary War

1. The Story

2. Commentary and Questions

Chapter 2: Property Reform and the First Women's Movement

A. Setting the Stage: The Ohio Married Women's Property Act of 1846

1. The Statute

2. Commentary and Questions

3. Marital Property Law's Common Law and Equity Heritage

a. Introduction

b. BLACKSTONE'S COMMENTARIES

c. Commentary and Questions

ELIZABETH BOWLES WARBASE, *THE CHANGING LEGAL RIGHTS OF MARRIED WOMEN, 1800-1861* (1987)

4. Ohio Law Before Adoption of the Married Women's Property Act of 1846

a. Introduction

- b. The Courts and Married Women's Property
 - (1) Early Cases: Ramsdall v. Craighill
 - (2) Commentary and Questions
 - (3) Early Cases: Lessee of Canby v. Porter
 - (4) Commentary and Questions
- 5. Adoption of Early Married Women's Property Acts in Other States
 - a. Mississippi Married Women's Property Act of 1839
 - b. Commentary and Questions
- 6. Gender in Early America
- B. Property Reform and the Ohio Women's Movement after 1850
 - 1. The Salem, Ohio Convention of 1850 and its Immediate Aftermath
 - a. Introduction
 - NANCY F. COTT, THE BONDS OF WOMANHOOD: "WOMAN'S SPHERE" IN NEW ENGLAND, 1780-1835, at 50-59 (1977)
 - b. Seneca Falls as a Model
 - c. Commentary and Questions
 - d. *J. Elizabeth Jones' Salem Oration: "The Wrongs of Woman"*
 - e. Commentary and Questions
 - 2. History of Ohio's 1857 Married Women's Property Act
 - a. The 1854 Legislative Session
 - b. Commentary and Questions
 - c. The 1857 Legislative Session
 - d. The Married Women's Property Act of 1857
 - e. Commentary and Questions
 - 3. Reforms in the Late Nineteenth Century: 1861-1884
 - a. The 1861 Married Woman's Property Act
 - b. The Text of the 1861 Act
 - c. Commentary and Questions
 - Amy Dru Stanley, *Conjugal Bonds and Wage Labor: Rights of Contract in the Age of Emancipation*, 75 J. AMER. HIST. 471-500 (1988)
 - d. A Comparison: The New York Married Women's Property Acts of 1860 and 1862.
 - e. Commentary and Questions
 - f. The Last Reforms: The Married Woman's Separate Estate as Capital for Investment by Women
 - (1) Machir v. Burroughs
 - (2) Commentary and Questions
 - (3) Married Women's Act of 1866
 - (4) Married Women's Act of 1871
 - (5) Commentary and Questions
 - (6) The Final Nineteenth Century Legislative Enactments
 - (7) Commentary and Questions

Chapter 3: Divorce in the Nineteenth Century

- A. Introduction
- B. Setting the Stage

1. The Indiana Divorce Act of 1818
2. Commentary and Questions
- C. Easing Access to Divorce: 1824 to 1852
 1. The Indiana Divorce Reform Statutes
 2. Divorce Reform Debates: Robert Dale Owen and the Growth of Divorce
Elizabeth B. Clark, *Matrimonial Bonds: Slavery and Divorce in Nineteenth-Century America*, 8 LAW & HIST. REV. 25 (1990)
 3. Commentary and Questions
- D. Indiana as a Divorce Mill: Public Controversy and Conservative Reaction
 1. Indiana Legal Developments: From Divorce Mill to Termination of Migratory Divorce
 - a. *McQuigg v. McQuigg*
 - b. Commentary and Questions
 - c. The Divorce Mill's End
 2. The Great National Divorce Debate: Greeley, Owen and Stanton
 - a. Horace Greeley Essay
 - b. Commentary and Questions
 - c. Owen's Response to Greeley
 - d. Commentary and Questions
 - e. Greeley Reply to Owen
 - f. Commentary and Questions
 - g. Another Owen Response
 - h. Greeley's Next Rejoinder
 - i. Commentary and Questions
 - j. Owen Begins to Wind Down the Debate
 - k. Commentary and Questions
 - l. Stanton Enters the Fray
 - m. Commentary and Questions
 3. Schliemann and McFarland: Feminists Split and Divorce Mill Ends
 - a. The Stories
 - b. Commentary and Questions
- E. Divorce and Writing History: Research Methodology, Legal Norms and Judicial Reality in Nineteenth Century Divorce

Chapter 4: Child Custody in the Nineteenth Century

- A. Introduction
- B. Setting the Stage: Parent and Child at the Turn of the Nineteenth Century
 1. Introduction: Early Child Custody Reform
 2. *Barrere v. Barrere*
 3. Commentary and Questions
- C. Shifting Standards: Maternal Preference and the Best Interests of the Child
 1. Introduction to the *Mercein* Litigation
 2. The *Mercein* Litigation
 - a. Opinion of Chancellor Walworth
 - b. Commentary and Questions
- D. Mid-Century Debates About Child Custody

1. The Contours of Early Protests Against Paternal Authority Over Children
 - a. The Marriage Contract of Lucy Stone and Harry Blackwell
 - b. The Seneca Falls Declaration of Sentiments
 2. Precursors to the New York Married Women's Act of 1860
 - a. 1854 Women's Rights Convention in Albany, NY
 - (1) Elizabeth Cady Stanton Convention Speech
 - (2) Woman's Rights Petition to the New York Legislature, 1854
 - b. Commentary and Questions
 - Report of the Select Committee of 1854
 - Report of the Judiciary Committee of 1856
 3. The New York Act of 1860
- E. Child Custody at the Turn of the Twentieth Century
1. Introduction
 2. A Typical Custody Opinion: *Sternberger v. Sternberger*
 3. Commentary and Questions

Chapter 5: Reproduction in the Nineteenth Century: Infanticide, Birth Control, and Abortion

- A. Introduction
- B. Demographic Data
 1. Infant Mortality
 2. Commentary and Questions
 3. Child and Maternal Mortality
 4. Commentary and Questions
 5. Birth Rates
 6. Commentary and Questions
- C. Infanticide
 1. Introduction
 2. Setting the Stage: Concealment of Pregnancy Statutes
 3. Commentary and Questions

JULIE MILLER, ABANDONED: FOUNDLINGS IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY NEW YORK CITY 17-18, 41-42 (2008)
 4. An Infanticide Trial: The *Valpy-Hardy* Case
 - a. Introduction
 - b. The Trial
 - c. Commentary and Questions
- D. Abortion
 1. The Quickening Rule at the Turn of the Nineteenth Century
 - a. Commonwealth of Massachusetts v. Isaiah Bangs (1812)
 - b. Commentary and Questions

MEDICUS, *Facts and Observations on Quickening*, 27 MEDICAL & PHYSICAL JOURNAL 441 (June, 1812)

THEODRIC ROMEYN BECK, M.D., ELEMENTS OF MEDICAL JURISPRUDENCE 197-218 (1823)
 2. The Evolution of Abortion Law in Mid-Nineteenth Century Massachusetts
 - a. Commonwealth of Massachusetts v. Luceba Parker (1845)

- b. Commentary and Questions
- c. Background Information About the Robert Wood Case
- d. Commonwealth of Massachusetts v. Wood (1858)
- e. Commentary and Questions
- f. Background Information About the David R. Brown Case
- g. Commonwealth of Massachusetts v. David R. Brown (1860)
- h. Commentary and Questions
- i. Background to Second Case Against Dr. David R. Brown
- j. Commonwealth of Massachusetts v. David R. Brown (1876)
- k. Commentary and Questions
- 3. Police Gazette: *Wonderful Trial of Caroline Lohman, Alias Restell*
 - a. Introduction
 - b. The *Police Gazette* Report of the Restell Trial
 - c. Commentary and Questions
- 4. Role of the Medical Profession in the Abortion Debate
HORATIO R. STORER & FRANKLIN FISKE HEARD, CRIMINAL ABORTION: ITS NATURE, ITS EVIDENCE, AND ITS LAW 52-57, 60-64, 134-135, 144-146 (1868)
- 5. Abortion Data
- E. Birth Control
 - 1. Introduction
 - 2. Comstockery
 - a. The Comstock Act
 - b. Anthony Comstock
ANTHONY COMSTOCK, TRAPS FOR THE YOUNG (1883)
 - c. United States v. Edward Bliss Foote
 - d. Commentary and Questions
 - 3. Decline of Comstockery
 - a. Introduction
MARGARET SANGER, FAMILY LIMITATION (1917)
 - b. Commentary and Questions
 - c. Prosecution of Margaret Sanger
 - d. New York v. Sanger
 - e. Commentary and Questions
 - f. The End of Comstockery
 - (1) Mary Ware Dennett
MARY WARE DENNETT, THE SEX SIDE OF LIFE (1919)
 - (2) United States v. Dennett
 - (3) Commentary and Questions
 - (4) United States v. One Package
 - (5) Commentary and Questions

Chapter 6: Gender, Race and Violence—Nineteenth Century Visions of Wives, Slaves, and Freed Persons

- A. Introduction
- B. The Wife/Slave Analogy Revisited
 - 1. Newspaper Commentary

W.J.F., *Wives and Slaves: A Bone for the Abolitionists to Pick*, 17 THE UNITED STATES MAGAZINE, AND DEMOCRATIC REVIEW 264 (1845)

2. Commentary and Questions

C. The Law of Violence in Nineteenth Century “Domestic Relations”

1. Introduction

Laura F. Edwards, *Law, Domestic Violence, and the Limits of Patriarchal Authority in the Antebellum South*, 65 J. OF SO. HIST. 733 (1999)

2. The Criminal Law of Violence in Slavery

a. Killing or Battering a Slave

(1) State v. Piver (1799)

(2) Commentary and Questions

(3) State v. Boon

(4) Commentary and Questions

(5) Judge Thomas Ruffin

(6) State v. John Mann

(7) Commentary and Questions

PAUL D. ESCOTT, SLAVERY REMEMBERED: A RECORD OF TWENTIETH-CENTURY SLAVE NARRATIVES 42-50 (1979)

(8) State v. Hoover

(9) Commentary and Questions

b. A Slave’s Ability to Respond to Violence

(1) State v. Caesar

(2) Commentary and Questions

c. Patrollers and State Violence

(1) Tate v. O’Neal

(2) Commentary and Questions

(3) State v. Isham Hailey

(4) Commentary and Questions

d. Controlling Free Blacks

(1) State v. Atlas Jowers

(2) Commentary and Questions

(3) Introduction to the *Howard Case*

(4) Doe on demise of Frances Howard v. Sarah Howard, et. al.

(5) Commentary and Questions

3. The Law of Violence in Marriage

a. Divorce and Battery Cases

(1) State v. Hussey

(2) Commentary and Questions

Anne Firor Scott, *Women’s Perspective on the Patriarchy in the 1850s*, 61 THE JOURNAL OF AMERICAN HISTORY 52-64 (1974)

(3) Joyner v. Joyner

(4) Commentary and Questions

(5) State v. Jesse Black

(6) Commentary and Questions

(7) State v. A. B. Rhodes

(8) Commentary and Questions

- (9) State v. Ridley Mabrey
 - (10) Commentary and Questions
 - (11) State v. Richard Oliver
 - (12) Commentary and Questions
- D. “Jane Crow” to “Jim Crow”: Gender and Race After the Civil War
- 1. Introduction
 - 2. The “Ladies Car”: Class, Gender and Race
 - a. Bass v. the Chicago & Northwestern Railway Company
 - b. Commentary and Questions
 - c. Introduction to Gray v. Cincinnati Southern Railway Company
 - d. Gray v. Cincinnati Southern R. Co.
 - e. Commentary and Questions
 - f. Introduction to *The Sue* Case
 - g. The Sue
 - h. Commentary and Questions
 - THEODORE G. BILBO, TAKE YOUR CHOICE: SEPARATION OR MONGRELIZATION (1947)
 - 3. Separate But Equal in Operation
 - a. Introduction to Smith v. Chamberlain
 - b. Smith v. Chamberlain
 - c. Commentary and Questions
 - d. Introduction to Plessy v. Ferguson
 - e. Plessy v. Ferguson
 - f. Commentary and Questions

Chapter 7: The Temperance Movement—Women’s War on Whiskey and the Founding of the Women’s Christian Temperance Union

- A. Setting the Stage: The Women’s Crusade of 1873-1874
- 1. Introduction
 - Ruth Bordin, *“A Baptism of Power and Liberty”: The Women’s Crusade of 1873-1874*, 87 OHIO HIST. 393 (1978)
 - 2. Commentary and Questions
- B. Reactions to the Crusades
- 1. The Suffragists’ Reactions
 - ELIZABETH CADY STANTON, SUSAN B. ANTHONY & MATILDA JOSLYN GAGE, 3 HISTORY OF WOMAN SUFFRAGE 500-502 (1889)
 - 2. Commentary and Questions
 - E. D. STEWART, MEMORIES OF THE CRUSADE 28-38 (1889)
 - 3. Liberal Commentary
 - THE WOMEN AND THE TEMPERANCE QUESTION, THE NATION 135-136 (FEBRUARY 26, 1874)
 - 4. Commentary and Questions
 - 5. The Temperance Prayer
 - The Prayer
 - 6. Commentary and Questions
- C. Newspaper Reports on the Hillsboro Crusades

1. The Palace Drug Store Controversy
 2. Commentary and Questions
 3. Constitutional Convention Meets Dio Lewis' Speaking Tour
 4. Commentary and Questions
 5. The Hillsboro Injunction Case
 6. Commentary and Questions
- D. The WCTU, Suffrage, and the "Do Everything Movement"
1. Suffrage and "Home Protection"
FRANCES E. WILLARD, HOME PROTECTION MANUAL 6-12 (1879)
 2. Commentary and Questions
 3. The "Do Everything" Agenda of the WCTU
Frances Willard, Address Before the Second Biennial Convention of the World's Christian Temperance Union, and the Twentieth Annual Convention of the National Woman's Christian Temperance Union 1-3, 5-7 (1893)
 4. Commentary and Questions
Jane E. Larson, *"Even a Worm Will Turn at Last": Rape Reform in Late Nineteenth-Century America*, 9 YALE J. L. & HUMAN. 1 (1997)

Chapter 8: Women's Suffrage After the Civil War—Defeat and Disarray

- A. Setting the Stage: 1866 Congressional Debates on the District of Columbia Voting Rights Bill 785
1. Introduction
ADDRESS TO CONGRESS, Adopted by the Eleventh National Woman's Rights Convention, held in New York City, Thursday, May 10, 1866
 2. Commentary and Questions
 3. District of Columbia Franchise Bill Debates
ELIZABETH CADY STANTON, SUSAN B. ANTHONY, AND MATILDA JOSLYN GAGE (EDS.), II HISTORY OF WOMAN SUFFRAGE: 1861-1876 (1882)
 4. Commentary and Questions
- B. The Suffrage Movement Split of 1869
1. Introduction
Andrea Moore Kerr, *White Women's Rights, Black Men's Wrong, Free Love, Blackmail, and the Formation of the American Woman Suffrage Association*, in MARJORIE SPRUILL WHEELER (ED.), ONE WOMAN, ONE VOTE: REDISCOVERING THE WOMAN SUFFRAGE MOVEMENT, 62-78 (1995)
 2. Commentary and Questions
- C. Post-Schism Suffrage Politics and the Minor Resolution
1. The Minor Resolution
Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony, and Matilda Joslyn Gage (eds.), II History of Woman Suffrage: 1861-1876, at 407-410 (1882)
 2. Commentary and Questions
- D. Women's Suffrage in the Courts
1. The *Spencer & Webster* Voting Rights Cases
 - a. Introduction
 - b. Sara S. Spenser v. The Board of Registration
 - c. Commentary and Questions

2. *Bradwell v. Illinois*
 - a. Introduction
 - b. Commentary and Questions
 - c. Bradwell's Appeal to the Illinois Supreme Court
 - d. Commentary and Questions
 - e. Illinois Supreme Court Result
 - f. Commentary and Questions
 - g. Bradwell's Case in the United States Supreme Court
 - h. Myra Bradwell v. State of Illinois, 83 U.S. (16 Wall.) 130 (1872)
 - i. Commentary and Questions
3. The Anthony Voting Rights Case
 - a. Introduction
 - b. Commentary and Questions
 - c. Anthony's Sentencing Hearing
 - d. Commentary and Questions
4. The United States Supreme Court and the Minor Resolution: *Minor v. Happersett*
 - a. Virginia Minor v. Happersett, 88 U.S. (21 Wall.) 162 (1875)
 - b. Commentary and Questions
 - ROSS EVANS PAULSON, LIBERTY, EQUALITY, AND JUSTICE: CIVIL RIGHTS, WOMEN'S RIGHTS, AND THE REGULATION OF BUSINESS (1997)

E. Suffrage Reform in Ohio

1. Introduction
2. The School Voting Legislation of 1894
3. State Suffrage Referenda
4. The Presidential Elector Voting Legislation of 1917
5. Conclusion
 - Address of the President of the United States Delivered in the Senate of the United States September 30, 1918

Chapter 9: Protective Labor Legislation at the Turn of the Twentieth Century—Special or Equal Treatment Under the Law

A. Introduction

B. Massachusetts Protective Labor Legislation

1. Regulating the Workday of Children and Women
 - a. 1866 Legislation
 - An Act in relation to the employment of children in manufacturing establishments
 - b. Commentary and Questions
 - c. Continuing Agitation for Hours Legislation
 - Ira Steward, A Reduction of Hours is an Increase in Wages (1865)
 - d. 1874 Act and Later Legislation
 - An Act to regulate the hours of labor in manufacturing establishments
 - e. Commentary and Questions
2. Wage Legislation in Massachusetts

An Act to establish the minimum wage commission and to provide for the determination of minimum wages for women and minors (1912)

C. The Early Twentieth Century Debate Over Protective Labor Legislation

1. Introduction: The Dorr-Anderson Dialogue

Rheta Childe Dorr, *Should There be Labor Laws for Women? No*, GOOD HOUSEKEEPING (September, 1925)

Mary Anderson, *Should There be Labor Laws for Women? Yes*, GOOD HOUSEKEEPING (September, 1925)

2. Commentary and Questions

D. Protective Labor Legislation and the Supreme Court

1. Male Worker Hours Legislation: *Lochner v. New York*

a. Structure of Freedom of Contract Litigation

b. Commentary and Questions

c. Background to *Lochner v. New York*

d. Supreme Court Opinions: *Lochner v. New York*

f. Commentary and Questions

GAIL BEDERMAN, *MANLINESS AND CIVILIZATION: A CULTURAL HISTORY OF GENDER AND RACE IN THE UNITED STATES, 1880-1917* (1995)

2. Women Workers' Hours Legislation: *Muller and Bunting*

a. Briefs in the *Muller* Case

(1) Muller's Brief

(2) The "Brandeis Brief" for the State of Oregon

(3) Brief of Oregon Attorney General

b. Commentary and Questions

EDWARD H. CLARKE, *SEX IN EDUCATION; A FAIR CHANCE FOR GIRLS* (1874)

Julia Ward Howe, *Sex and Education*, in JULIA WARD HOWE [ED.], *SEX AND EDUCATION. A REPLY TO DR. E. H. CLARKE'S "SEX IN EDUCATION,"* (1874)

c. Supreme Court Opinions: *Muller v. Oregon*

d. Commentary and Questions

Felix Frankfurter, *Hours of Labor and Realism in Constitutional Law*, 29 Harv. L. Rev. 353, 362-368, 372-373 (1916)

e. Supreme Court Opinions: *Bunting v. Oregon*

f. Commentary and Questions

3. Wage Laws

a. Introduction

Joan G. Zimmerman, *The Jurisprudence of Equality: The Women's Minimum Wage, the First Equal Rights Amendment, and Adkins v. Children's Hospital, 1905-1923*, 78 J. AM. HIST. 188, 200-201, 207-208 (1991)

b. Briefs in *Adkins v. Children's Hospital*

(1) Brief for Children's Hospital

(2) Brief for Adkins

c. Supreme Court Opinions: *Adkins v. Children's Hospital*

d. Commentary and Questions

Note (Blanche Crozier), *Constitutional Law—Regulation of Conditions of Employment of Women. A Critique of Muller v. Oregon*, 13 B. U. L. REV. 276 (1933)

e. Supreme Court Opinions: *West Coast Hotel v. Parrish*

f. Commentary and Questions

E. Protective Legislation After World War II

1. Introduction

2. Protecting Male Veterans

a. Background to *Goesaert v. Cleary*

b. Supreme Court Opinions: *Goesaert v. Cleary*

c. Commentary and Questions

3. Military Service and the Protection Rationale

a. Background to *Rostker v. Goldberg*

b. Supreme Court Opinions: *Rostker v. Goldberg*

c. Commentary and Questions

Kenneth L. Karst, *The Pursuit of Manhood and the Desegregation of the Armed Forces*, 38 U.C.L.A. L. Rev. 499 (1991)

Chapter 10: The Legal Uses of History—The *Sears* Case

A. Introduction

B. Equal Employment Opportunity v. Sears Roebuck and Company

1. Summaries of Testimony Offered by Historians

a. Rosalind Rosenberg on Behalf of Sears Roebuck and Company

b. Commentary and Questions

c. Alice Kessler-Harris on Behalf of the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission

d. Commentary and Questions

2. The Trial Level Decision

a. Opinion of the United States District Court for the Northern District of Illinois: *EEOC v. Sears, Roebuck & Co.*

b. Commentary and Questions

3. The Appellate Level Decision

a. Opinions of the United States Court of Appeals for the Seventh Circuit: *EEOC v. Sears, Roebuck & Co.*

b. Commentary and Questions

C. Commentary About the Use of Historians in the *Sears* Litigation

1. Introduction

2. Commentary in the Media

a. Editorial, *Misusing History*, THE WASHINGTON POST (June 9, 1986)

b. Samuel G. Freedman, *Of History And Politics: Bitter Feminist Debate*, THE NEW YORK TIMES B1 (June 6, 1986)

c. Commentary and Questions

d. Jon Wiener, *Women's History on Trial*, 267 THE NATION 161 (Sep. 7, 1985)

f. Commentary and Questions

3. Comments by Rosalind Rosenberg and Alice Kessler-Harris

a. Rosalind Rosenberg, *What Harms Women in the Workplace*, NEW YORK TIMES A23 (February 27, 1986)

b. Commentary and Questions

c. Alice Kessler-Harris, *Equal Employment Opportunity Commission v. Sears, Roebuck and Company: A Personal Account*, 35 RADICAL HISTORY REVIEW 57-59, 72-76 (1986)

d. Commentary and Questions

4. Academic Commentary

a. Eileen Boris, *Looking at Women's Historians Looking at "Difference,"* 3 Wis. Women's L.J. 213, 235-238 (1987)

b. Commentary and Questions

c. Jonathan D. Martin, *Historians at the Gate: Accommodating Expert Historical Testimony in Federal Courts*, 78 N.Y.U. L. REV. 1518 (2003)

d. Commentary and Questions

D. Concluding Problem

Brief of 281 American Historians as Amici Curiae Supporting Appellees in the Case of Webster, Appellant v. Reproductive Health Services, Appellees

Index