A New Progressive Agenda for Public Health and the Environment
A NEW PROGRESSIVE AGENDA
FOR PUBLIC HEALTH
AND THE ENVIRONMENT

A Project of the Center
for Progressive Regulation

August 2004

Edited by
Christopher H. Schroeder and Rena Steinzor

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina
CONTENTS

Preface xiii

Chapter 1 Introduction 1

Chapter 2 The Unfinished Agenda 11

Success Stories 11
The Unfinished Agenda 14
Clean Air 15
Clean Water 19
Product and Workplace Safety 20
Natural Resources 21
A Different Agenda 23
Conclusion 26

Chapter 3 Progressive Principles 27

Progressive History 27
Address the Source, Not the Victim 28
Do the Best We Can 29
Reduce Ignorance 30
Better Safe than Sorry 31
Be Fair 32
Public Resources Belong to Everyone 33
Progressive Principles Do Not Have Borders 34
Democracy Demands Disclosure 35
We Have a Right to Know 36
Make Government Work 37
Use Self-Help 38

Chapter 4 Shifting the Blame 41

The Blame Game 41
The Ghost of Coase 42
Manufacturing Consent 44
Ignoring Public Desires 48
Making People Invisible 49
The Progressive Perspective 51
The Progressive Agenda 53
Change Attitudes 53
Let Children Play Outside 53
Do Not Discriminate Against ‘Statistical People’ 53
Prefer Risk Reduction over Risk Avoidance 54
Protect Workers 54
Redress Harm 54
Conclusion 55

Chapter 5 Do the Best We Can 57

Harnessing Technology 57
How the Best-Efforts Approach Works 57
Best Efforts in the Beginning 58
Best Efforts Expanded 59
Why Best Efforts Work Better 60
The Unfair ‘Command-and-Control’ Critique 62
The Progressive Perspective 65
The Progressive Agenda 68
Pick the Remaining Low-Hanging Fruit 68
Reach Higher 69
Force Technology 69
Conclusion 70
Chapter 6  Rescuing Science from Politics  71
The Role of Science  71
Suppression of Science  72
Capturing the Research Agenda  75
The Progressive Perspective  77
The Progressive Agenda  78
  Preserve Scientific Freedom  79
  Ensure Scientific Transparency  79
  Encourage Scientific Honesty  79
  Expand Public Funding  80
  Use Peer Review Appropriately  80

Chapter 7  Safety First  83
Providing a Safety Net  83
Gaps in Coverage  86
Burdens of Proof  87
Enforcement Loopholes  88
Exemptions  90
‘Sound’ Science  91
Judicial Overreaching  92
The Progressive Perspective  93
The Progressive Agenda  96
  Adopt a Credible Worst-Case Analysis
  for Risk-Based Regulation  96
  Make the Polluter Justify the Pollution  97
  Fix the Broken Statutes  97
  Put the Burden on Risk Creators  98
  Eliminate Paralysis by Analysis  98
  Judges Should Be Judicious  99
Conclusion  100

Chapter 8  Fair Distribution of Environmental Harms and Benefits  101
Environmental Fairness  101
## Chapter 11  Democracy Demands Disclosure 141

- The American Tradition of Open Government 141
- Stealth Secrecy 143
- Choosing Ignorance 146
- The Progressive Perspective 148
- The Progressive Agenda 150
  - Keep Government Open and Transparent 150
  - Stop Stealth ‘Reform’ 151
  - Develop and Gather Knowledge 152
  - Publish Annual State Environmental Indicator Reports 152
  - Score State Performance 152
  - Strengthen SEC Disclosure Requirements 153
  - Expand Corporate Chemical Use Reporting 153
  - Require Corporate Environmental Assessments 153
  - Tell Companies to Inform and Warn the Public 154
  - Expand Toxic Chemical Testing 154
  - Enact a Corporate Freedom of Information Act 155
- Conclusion 155

## Chapter 12  Make Government Work 157

- The Choice of Tools 157
- Condition Precedent: Hollow Government 159
- Useful Tools 160
  - Technology and Design Standards 160
  - Substance Bans 162
  - Liability Provisions 162
- Neutral Tools 163
  - Information Disclosure 163
  - Emissions Trading 163
  - Performance-based Regulation 167
- Harmful Tools 169
  - Pre-decisional Analysis 169
  - Voluntary Programs 170
- The Progressive Perspective 171
- The Progressive Agenda 172
  - Resuscitate Government 172
CONTENTS

Fund the Restoration of Government through Emissions Fees and Fee-for-Service Provisions 173
Make Technology-based Requirements the Default Regulatory Approach 174
Impose Liability in the Right Circumstances 174
Streamline Pre-decisional Requirements 175
Abandon Cost-Benefit Analysis as a Regulatory Litmus Test 175
Only Trade Fair 176
Conclusion 176

Chapter 13  Empower People 177
Complexification and Democracy 177
Citizens and Their Government 178
The Government’s Role 179
Environmental Federalism 180
The Organized Citizen 183
The Average Citizen 184
Citizens as Consumers 185
The Limitations of a Consumers’ Republic 186
Impediments to Progressive Consumerism 187
Free Speech or Deceptive Advertising? 189
The Progressive Perspective 192
The Progressive Agenda 192
Put Government Back in the Driver’s Seat 192
Resuscitate Environmental Federalism 193
Increase Federal and State Budgets for Environmental Protection 193
Encourage Progressive Consumerism through Disclosure 193
Enforce Deceptive Advertising Laws 194
Conclusion 194

Chapter 14  Vision for a Progressive Future 195
The Government’s Moral Role 195
Independence and Autonomy 197
Setting an Affirmative Agenda for Action 198
Doing the Best We Can 199
Preface

This book represents the collective effort of many scholars associated with the Center for Progressive Regulation (CPR). It is fair to say that the perceived need in the progressive community for books like this one is the primary reason for CPR’s existence. CPR is an organization of scholars established in 2002 to provoke public debate on how the government’s authority and resources may best be used to advance the multiple social values that motivated the enactment of our nation’s environmental, health, and safety laws. At the heart of CPR’s mission are the dual convictions that an informed populace is essential to an effective and humane government and that government performs legitimate and essential functions when it serves as a forum for debate and action on social values. Government must act wisely, responsibly, and effectively, but it ought not to abandon these essential functions.

Like most collective efforts, this project required leaders who were willing to devote an added measure of time and effort to ensure that the resulting product flowed together as a coherent whole. CPR Board members Christopher Schroeder and Rena Steinzor, and CPR media consultant Matthew Freeman served as the primary editors for the project. They relied throughout the process on the research and editorial assistance of CPR’s accomplished senior policy analyst Joanna Goger. Theresa Walker copy-edited the manuscript ably.

The work began with an exceedingly productive gathering of CPR scholars at Duke University in May 2003 under Chris Schroeder’s able leadership. It continued throughout the following summer as individual scholars took responsibility for drafting chapters or parts of chapters for the book. The products of these individual efforts were collectively reviewed and debated at a gathering of the authors at Georgetown University in October 2003. Chris assembled the revisions that resulted from this meeting into a thematic whole, and Rena Steinzor edited the entire manuscript for coherence and consistency. In the meantime, Joanna Goger devoted many long hours to preparing the examples in the text boxes and refining the citations and references. Matthew Freeman provided the icing on the cake by making the manuscript more ac-
cessible to audiences who are not as steeped in the technical vernacular as the scholars.

In addition to Chris, Rena, Matthew and Joanna, I would like to thank the following CPR scholars who provided the essential analysis and ideas expressed in this book. Primary authors included Alyson Craig Flournoy, Robert L. Glicksman, Donald Thomas Hornstein, Douglas A. Kysar, Lisa Heinzerling, Thomas O. McGarity, Clifford Rechtschaffen, Sidney A. Shapiro, Robert R.M. Verchick, and David A. Wirth. Other contributing authors included Frank Ackerman, David M. Driesen, Sheila Foster, and Wendy E. Wagner. Introductions to all of the scholars are available on the CPR website at http://www.progressiveregulation.org.

Because this book is a collective effort, it goes without saying that every CPR scholar may not agree with every aspect of the analysis presented here, and not every scholar necessarily supports every prescription offered here. The book does represent a consensus of the CPR leadership, and it forms an essential foundation for future CPR efforts to bring progressive approaches to environmental, health, and safety regulation to the attention of policymakers and the public.

Finally, this book would not have been possible without the generous financial support of the Deer Creek Foundation, which took the initial leap of faith needed to bring CPR into existence and has provided continuing support to all of CPR's educational efforts. The Howard and Anne Gottlieb Foundation provided additional support for the publication of this book and the promotion of the progressive agenda contained therein. In these troubled times, it is institutions like the Deer Creek and Gottlieb foundations that in tangible ways project the optimism that is the essence of the progressive vision.

Thomas O. McGarity
President
Center for Progressive Regulation
A NEW PROGRESSIVE AGENDA FOR PUBLIC HEALTH AND THE ENVIRONMENT